Treasures of a Lost Art
subdant populum
mei subme.

Benedictus
sce

Honi qui est homo
qua innocuit et:
aur filius homis
qua reputas eum.

Uelina sce

Honi haunatiss si
iut

Honi miso
in

Honi inclina celos
qui
tuos et descende:
tinge montes et
sumigabunt.

Mia mea et refugi
mi:
suscepi mis
et liberato meus.

Protector meus et
muso spectar quo
Emittet manus tu

B:
Treasures of a Lost Art
Italian Manuscript Painting of the Middle Ages and Renaissance

Pia Palladino

THE METROPOLITAN MUSEUM OF ART
YALE UNIVERSITY PRESS, NEW HAVEN AND LONDON
This catalogue has been published in conjunction with the exhibition "Treasures of a Lost Art: Italian Manuscript Painting of the Middle Ages and Renaissance," held at the Cleveland Museum of Art (February 23–May 4, 2003), the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco (June 7–August 31, 2003), and The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York (September 30, 2003–February 1, 2004). Exhibition organized by The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

The following works will be exhibited in New York only: cat. nos. 2, 3b–c, e–f, 7–8, 12–14, 16–17, 21a, 24, 26, 30, 34, 35a, 37b, 40–41, 49–50, 51b, 58a, 60–61, 62a, c, 64, 66, 71, 73, 74, 77, 79, and App. 1–2, 16. Not included in the exhibition are works in the Allen Memorial Art Museum, Oberlin; the Houghton Library, Cambridge; the Minneapolis Institute of Arts; as well as cat. nos. 35c, 48a–i, 57, 68–69, App. 17–19.

This publication is made possible in part by The Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.

Published by The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York
John P. O'Neill, Editor in Chief
Joan Holt, Editor
Antony Drobinski, Designer
Peter Antony and Jill Prattson, Production
Minjee Cho, Desktop Publishing
Copyright © 2003 by The Metropolitan Museum of Art

Typeset in Adobe Garamond
Separations by Professional Graphics, Rockford, Illinois
Printed by Brizzolis Arte en Gráficas, Madrid
Bound by Encuadernación Ramos S.A., Madrid
Printing and binding coordinated by Ediciones El Viso, S.A. Madrid

The source for the identification of all liturgical texts pertaining to antiphonaries is Renato-Johanne Hesbert's Corpus Antiphonarium Officii, published in six volumes in Rome between 1965 and 1979.

To reproduce as many examples as possible, many of the manuscript leaves are shown in detail only.

All Rights Reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or information retrieval system, without permission from the publisher.

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOGING-IN-PUBLICATION DATA
Palladino, Pia.
Treasures of a lost art: Italian manuscript painting of the Middle Ages and Renaissance / Pia Palladino.

p. cm.
ISBN 0-300-09879-0 (Yale)

NDC535 .P35 2003
746.6'7'094507473—dc21
2002039597

cover illustration: Detail of Annunciation in an Initial M, by Neri da Rimini (cat. no. 5b). frontispiece: Virgin and Child and God the Father Blessing in a Initial B, by Duccio di Buoninsegna (cat. no.27)
Contents

Acknowledgments vi

Director’s Foreword vii
Philippe de Montebello

Introduction 2
Pia Palladino

Treasures of a Lost Art 5
Pia Palladino
Works in the Exhibition

Appendix 177

Glossary 182

Bibliography 183

Index 191

Photograph Credits 195
Acknowledgments

This exhibition and the research and writing of the present catalogue would not have been possible without the generous assistance of numerous individuals and institutions, in Europe and the United States, who made available their time, knowledge, and resources: the Accademia Etrusca in Cortona, Jonathan Alexander, the Allen Memorial Art Museum, Federica Armiraglio, Alessandro Bagnoli, the staff of the Archivio della Badia di Cava dei Tirreni, the staff of the Archivio di Stato in Gubbio, Maria Cristina Bandera, the staff of the British Library, Cristina De Benedictis, Angela Dillon Bussi, Don Roberto Donghi, Paola Errani, William Faucon and the staff of the Boston Public Library, Dott. Don Andrea Foglia, the staff of the Fondazione Giorgio Cini, the staff of the Frick Art Reference Library, Sandra Hindman, the staff of the Houghton Library, Lyle Humphrey, Martin Kauffman and the staff of the Bodleian Library, Bill Lang and the staff of the Free Library of Philadelphia, Elvio Lunghi, Giordana Mariani Canova, Massimo Medica, the Monastery of San Giorgio Maggiore in Venice, the staff of the Museo dell'Opera del Duomo in Siena, the staff of the Pierpont Morgan Library, Frances Rankine, Jennifer Saville, William Voelkle, and the staff of the Thomas J. Watson Library, Valerie Zell.

A special note of appreciation goes to Suzanne Boorsch and the Yale University Art Gallery; Stephen Fliegel and the Cleveland Museum of Art; and Robert Burke, Lynn Federle Orr, and the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco, for their enthusiastic response to this project.

Among the many individuals involved in this endeavor here at The Metropolitan Museum of Art, I wish to thank the following, in particular: Laurence Kanter, curator of the Robert Lehman Collection, for first conceiving the idea of this exhibition and for his invaluable advice throughout the writing and production of the catalogue; Manus Gallagher and Jeanne Salchli, for sorting out every practical detail of my work with efficiency and good humor; and Marjorie Shelley, Margaret Lawson, Akiko Yamazaki-Kleps, and Alison Gilchrest, in the Sherman Fairchild Center for Works on Paper, for devoting their time and skills to the meticulous examination of each object. The final appearance and readability of this catalogue is due to Joan Holt's expert editing, carried out with unflagging patience and great sensitivity; Eileen Travell's beautiful photography; and Antony Drobinski's design. Peter Antony and Jill Pratzen dealt with the logistics of the volume's production, and John O'Neill provided encouragement from its inception to completion.

I am, of course, deeply grateful for the support of our director, Philippe de Montebello.

Pia Palladino
Assistant Curator
Robert Lehman Collection
Director's Foreword

*Treasures of a Lost Art* presents to the public for the first time one of the largest, most impressive private collections of Italian manuscripts assembled after the First World War and comparable only to the Cini Collection in Venice. Formed by Robert Lehman over the course of three decades, it reflects the full range and achievement of manuscript production in Italy from the thirteenth through the sixteenth century. Included are representative examples of the major schools of illumination in southern Italy, Umbria, Tuscany, Emilia, Lombardy, and the Veneto. Unknown even to specialists and scholars are works by some of the principal figures in the history of Italian painting, such as the illuminated leaf by Duccio di Buoninsegna (cat. no. 27) or the cuttings by Stefano da Verona (cat. nos. 52a–b) and Cosimo Tura (cat. no. 47). Next to these are works by less widely known personalities—Neri da Rimini, Belbello da Pavia, Girolamo da Cremona, the Master B.F., Attavante—who once dominated the field of manuscript production and were sought after by popes and princes alike, but are now familiar only to art historians. Together they provide a rich tapestry of images that broadens our knowledge and appreciation of the creative genius of Italian Renaissance culture.

The Metropolitan Museum of Art takes great pride in organizing this exhibition and in sharing it with our colleagues at the Cleveland Museum of Art and the Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco. We would like to thank the private collectors and institutions—Yale University, Harvard University, Oberlin College, and the Minneapolis Institute of Arts—who have shared information with us or permitted us to borrow illuminations once owned by Robert Lehman, a collector of remarkably informed taste and a benefactor of exceptional generosity.

The exhibition and this publication were conceived by Pia Palladino, assistant curator of the Robert Lehman Collection at The Metropolitan Museum of Art. The cataloguing of this lesser-known aspect of Robert Lehman’s holdings has been made possible by support from the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation. We are deeply grateful to the foundation for its long-standing commitment to scholarship at the Metropolitan Museum.

Philippe de Montebello
Director, The Metropolitan Museum of Art
Treasures of a Lost Art
On May 26, 1825, the first sale of illuminated manuscript leaves and cuttings took place at Christie’s, in London. It was fragments of the Sistine Chapel choir books, dispersed during the Napoleonic invasion of Italy and brought to England by Abate Luigi Celotti. In the auction catalogue’s introduction, William Young Ottley, the English antiquarian and collector who would later become keeper of the Print Room in the British Museum, highlighted not only the beauty and near perfect state of preservation of these works but also noted their importance as “the monuments of a lost Art, the only surviving evidence of the long forgotten technique of the ‘ancient Illuminists.’” Indeed, this sale marked the beginning of a new interest, on the part of nineteenth-century collectors, in manuscript illumination as something of a curiosity but on a level equal with painting. In the Celotti sale, in particular, most of the miniatures were presented as paintings, void of any text, often framed within illusionistic borders or pasted together as collages (see cat. no. 84). It has rightly been noted that, ironically, the Celotti sale and the ensuing appreciation of Italian manuscript illumination could not have happened without the French invasion of Italy and the Napoleonic suppression of monasteries, when entire monastic libraries were dispersed and sold to collectors, very often by the monks themselves. Single leaves and fragments from books that had been cut up flooded the art market and in many cases were acquired to complement an already existing collection of paintings.

Robert Lehman (1891–1969), who may be counted among the greatest twentieth-century collectors of manuscripts, began acquiring single leaves and cuttings as an extension of the collection of early panel paintings formed by his father, Philip Lehman. Notable for its breadth, as well as quality, the collection ranged in date from the thirteenth to the sixteenth century and covered the main centers of manuscript production in Italy. Most of the miniatures were excised from liturgical texts, in particular antiphonaries andgraduals, the two principal choir books of Catholic devotion, containing, respectively, the sung portions of the Divine Office and the mass. Among the most important pieces in the collection are fragments from two prestigious series of fifteenth-century choir books: one commissioned by the Greek cardinal Bessarion for the Franciscan convent of Saint Anthony of Padua in Constantinople (cat. nos. 42–45); the other produced for the Benedictine monastery of San Giorgio Maggiore in Venice (cat. nos. 58–59). Involved in the decoration of these volumes were some of the outstanding personalities in the history of Ferrarese and Lombard illumination.

The art of manuscript illumination, as evidenced by most of the examples collected by Robert Lehman, was born of a desire to highlight the most important feast days in the liturgical cycle of the Catholic Church, from Marian feasts to Christ’s Passion and death. Individual monastic communities emphasized the relevance of their patron saint or others associated with their order. In the most elaborate commissions, not only was the initial introducing the text decorated with a narrative but also the pages’ borders. Two fourteenth-century Bolognese leaves owned by Robert Lehman, once part of a large series of choir books for the Church of San Domenico in Bologna (cat. nos. 9a–b), include, in addition to historiated initials illustrating the feasts of Saints Andrew and John the Evangelist, further scenes from the lives of these saints in the lower border medallions, providing an elaborate, visual commentary on the day’s lesson beyond the sung text.
The technique of manuscript illumination is essentially the same as that for painting on panel, beginning with a primer applied to the parchment, followed by gilding and the laying down of pigment. Thus during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries commissions for illuminations were often entrusted to painters, not just in monastic scriptoria but in some of the major workshops of the period. Included in the collection are two cuttings by the Lombard painter Stefano da Verona (cat. nos. 52a–b), which reflect, in their exquisite technical refinement and fantastic decorative idiom, one of the highest achievements of the International Gothic style in Italy. Also published here for the first time is an antiphonary leaf illuminated by the famous Sienese painter Duccio di Buoninsegna (cat. no. 27). While he was one of the leading figures, along with Giotto and Cimabue, in the history of early Italian art, his activity as an illuminator—though presumed by scholars—has until now remained unknown. The Sienese school of painting, a particular favorite of both Philip and Robert Lehman, is also represented by a remarkably vivid miniature of Saint Bernardino of Siena (cat. no. 77). Essentially a portrait on parchment, probably excised from a book of hymns in honor of the saint, it is the work of Francesco di Giorgio, a painter, sculptor, and architect, as well as an illuminator.

The achievements of the Florentine school of illumination in the fourteenth century are represented in the collection by the two beautiful pages from a laudario, or book of hymns, for the lay confraternity of Sant’Agnese (cat. nos. 21a–b), decorated by the painter and illuminator Pacino di Bonaguida; and by a cutting (cat. no. 78) from the celebrated series of choir books for the Camaldolese monastery of Santa Maria degli Angeli, which were admired by all who saw them from the sixteenth century onward. The cutting was excised from an antiphonary illuminated by Lorenzo Monaco, a monk at Santa Maria degli Angeli, who was also the foremost painter in Florence during the first quarter of the fifteenth century. Subsequent to the purchase of this miniature, Robert Lehman also acquired two panel paintings by the same artist (Metropolitan Museum of Art, Robert Lehman Collection, 1975.1.66, .67).

The progressive changes in the craft of manuscript illumination during the late fifteenth century and early sixteenth century are reflected in the creation of small works such as the beautiful Adoration of the Shepherds (presumed to have been owned by two popes and a Medici grand duke) by the Emilian painter Marmitta (cat. no. 85). Although executed on parchment, it is conceived essentially as an independent painting on a small scale. Completing the exceptional panorama of the history of Italian manuscript illumination offered by the present collection, Marmitta’s work reflects the last glorious moment of the art of the painted page, before its extinction with the rise of modern book illustration.

1. A Catalogue of a Highly Valuable and Extremely Curious Collection of Illuminated Miniature Painting, of the Greatest Beauty, and Exquisite Finishing, Taken from the Choral Books of the Papal Chapel in the Vatican, during the French revolution; and subsequently collected and brought to this Country by the Abate Celotti, sale, May 26, 1925, Christie's, London, May 26, 1825, as cited in Hindman et al. 2001, p. 54.
Central Italian Artist (First Master of the Cortona Antiphonaries?)  
Active third quarter of the thirteenth century

Assumption in an Initial V

Circa 1260–79  
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempora on parchment. Leaf: 19 1/2 × 13 3/4 in. (48.8 × 35 cm).  
Initial: 5 1/8 × 4 1/8 in. (14.3 × 12.3 cm).  
Stave: 2.5 cm


Folio 48 written in ink, in upper right, by later hand

PROVENANCE: John F. Murray, Florence, 1924

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, d.19 (as probably written at Bologna)
The illuminated initial V decorating this antiphonary leaf illustrates the second response (“Vidi speciosam sicut columbam” [I saw her, fair as a dove] for the first nocturn of the Feast of the Assumption of the Virgin (August 15). Inside the exuberantly foliated letter, the Virgin, enclosed in a mandorla supported by two angels, is shown dropping her girdle down to Saint Thomas, who is flanked by six other apostles with uplifted arms.

This page may be associated with four leaves, identical in style, decoration, measurement, and stave height, that were probably excised from the same antiphonary book or set: an initial A with the Three Marys at the Tomb in the National Gallery of Art, Washington (8–18,760); an initial H with the Nativity in the Cini Collection, Venice (12); an initial I with a monk holding an aspersium, in the Free Library, Philadelphia (m68.1); and an initial P with the Ascension of Christ, recently on the art market in London (Mags Brothers Ltd., European Bulletin No. 19, London, 1994, no. 1). The Washington, Venice, and Philadelphia cuttings were first grouped together by Carl Nordenfalk (1975, pp. 18–21) and tentatively ascribed to central Italy during the late thirteenth century. Subsequently, Roberta Passalacqua (1980, pp. 16–17) convincingly identified the three leaves as products of the same, possibly Arese, workshop responsible for the illuminations in a series of choir books in the Archivio Capitolare of the Cathedral of Arezzo and in the Accademia Etrusca of Cortona, a city that until 1253 was in the diocese of Arezzo.

The Lehman cutting and its four sister leaves bear close comparison to some of the illuminations by the so-called First Master of the Cortona Antiphonaries, one of several hands responsible for the decoration of three of the five antiphonary volumes that constitute that series (cod. 4c, 5d, and 6b), as well as of two of the choir books in Arezzo (cod. A, 8). The Cortona illuminations were dated by Marcella Degl’Innocenti Gambuti (1977, pp. 33–57), on the basis of iconographic and stylistic evidence, to between 1260 and 1279. Because of the existence of miniatures closely related to them in choir books in Borgo Sansepolcro (Biblioteca Comunale, cod. 1. 187) and Florence (Santa Maria Novella, cod. 8), as well as in Arezzo, Degl’Innocenti Gambuti viewed the Cortona illuminations as products of a large workshop of manuscript illuminators active during the third quarter of the thirteenth century in the territories of Arezzo and Florence.

In seeking to define the parameters of the style of the Arezzo and Cortona illuminations, both Degl’Innocenti Gambuti and Passalacqua highlighted the influence of the so-called First Style of Bolognese manuscript illumination, generally dated to between 1260 and 1270. Most recently, however, the existence of a Bolognese component in these works has been categorically denied by Maria Grazia Ciardi Dupré Dal Poggetto (1998, pp. 22–23), who instead identifies them as the product of an indigenous central Italian school of illumination and dates them significantly earlier, to the second quarter of the thirteenth century. While Ciardi Dupré Dal Poggetto is correct in her assessment of the main cultural component of these miniatures, her dating of them seems too early. Both stylistic and decorative elements, in fact, appear to support a later date and point to the generation of artists active in Tuscany and Umbria in the third quarter of the thirteenth century, shortly before the advent of Cimabue (ca. 1270).

1. A cutting in the Cleveland Museum of Art (51.549), tentatively associated with this group by Nordenfalk, is by a different hand, though clearly related to the same workshop.
**Umbro-Roman (?)**

Circa 1260–70

2

*Saint Francis in an Initial I*

Cutting from a gradual

Tempera on parchment. 6 3/4 x 3 3/16 in. (16.6 x 9.7 cm). Stave: 3.2 cm

Recto: Sci. xci[rubr.]/ Co. Postuer[n]/ In m[edio Ecclesiae aperuit/ os] / ei[us]. Verso: m ue/ to

**PROVENANCE:** Leo S. Olschki, Florence, 1924

**LITERATURE:** De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, b.28 (as Umbria, ca. 1350)

The initial I illustrates the introit ("In medio Ecclesiae" [In the gathering of the Church]) to the mass for the Common of a Doctor of the Church. Standing inside the letter, which is articulated as an architectural niche, is the full-length figure of Saint Francis of Assisi, who is identified by the Franciscan robe with a knotted cord and the wounds of the stigmata visible on his feet.

The palette and style of the present initial, as well as the blue background accented by white stars, are typical of Umbrian manuscript illumination of the second half of the thirteenth century. However, no other miniatures by the same hand have hitherto been identified. The solidly built figure of the saint, his body enveloped in ample swirls of folds, finds parallels in monumental painting in Umbria and Rome during the third quarter of the thirteenth century. More specifically, it may reflect the particular Umbro-Roman style of painting that developed during this period in Assisi, under the influence of Roman artists working in the Upper Church of the Basilica of Saint Francis.

**Umbrian or Southern Italian**

Circa 1270–80

3a

*Last Judgment in an Initial A*

Leaf from a gradual

Tempera on parchment. Leaf: 18 x 13 3/4 in. (45.6 x 33.3 cm). Initial: 8 3/4 x 6 3/4 in. (22.3 x 17.2 cm). Stave: 2.9 cm


On recto, in top right corner, in black ink: 2. On verso, in center of upper margin, in red ink: 2

**PROVENANCE:** Kalebjanjian, Paris, 1924

**LITERATURE:** De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, a.21 (as written in Umbria)
Christus rex gloriæ

animæ meæ

in æus me

us me cóhi

do non e mi te sem neque

dante mi inimi a mei et enim

unius qui te exspectant non
Saint John the Evangelist in an Initial I

Leaf from a gradual

Tempera on parchment. Leaf: 19 × 13 1/4 in. (48 × 33.7 cm). Initial: 4 × 2 in. (10.2 × 5.5 cm). Stave: 2.9 cm


On recto, in top right corner, in black ink: 12, followed by a smaller 5. On verso, in center of upper margin, in red ink: 10. In top left corner, in black ink: 5.

PROVENANCE: John F. Murray, Florence, 1925
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, b.7 (as written by Berardus de Teramo)

Presentation in the Temple in an Initial S

Leaf from a gradual

Tempera on parchment. Leaf: 19 × 13 1/4 in. (48.2 × 33.2 cm). Initial: 4 1/4 × 3 1/4 in. (11.7 × 8.8 cm). Stave: 2.9 cm


On recto, in top right corner, in black ink: 32, followed by a smaller 15. On verso, in center of upper margin, in red ink: xix. In top left corner, in black ink: 33. In center of left margin, in black ink: 15

PROVENANCE: John F. Murray, Florence, 1925
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, b.6 (as written by Berardus de Teramo)


PROVENANCE: John F. Murray, Florence, 1925
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, b.8 (as written by Berardus de Teramo)

3e
Translation of the Body of
Saint Dominic in an Initial I

3d
Martyrdom of Saint Peter Martyr
in an Initial P

Leaf from a gradual

Tempera on parchment. Leaf: 18 ¾ x 13 ¾ in. (47.5 x 33.5 cm). Initial (with extension): 12 ⅞ x 4 ⅞ in. (32.5 x 12.4 cm). Stave: 2.9 cm

Recto: m[us] et delectati su/mus alle/luya. [rubr.] com. Ego su[m]
Leaf from a gradual
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 43.10

Tempera on parchment. Leaf: 18 1/2 × 13 1/2 in. (47 × 34.3 cm).
Stave: 2.9 cm


Officium. Vero: In medio ecclesie aperuit os eius et im/plevit eu[m] domin[us] spiritu tu sapientia et intellect[us]/ stola glorie induit eu[m]/ alleluya alleluya/alleluya. [rubr.] v. locum/[ditatem]

On recto, in upper right margin, in black ink: 88, followed by 44.
On verso, in center of upper margin, in brown wash: 48. In top left corner, in black ink: 89. In center of left margin, in black ink: 44

Provenance: John F. Murray, Florence, 1935; gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, b.3 (as written by Berardus de Teramo); Hamburger 1995, pp. 10–11 (as central Italy, possibly Umbria, ca. 1290)

3f

Saint Peter in an Initial N

Leaf from a gradual

Tempera on parchment. Leaf: 18 3/4 × 13 3/4 in. (47.7 × 33.5 cm).
Initial: 4 1/4 x 3 3/4 in. (10.7 × 8.7 cm)


Gloria/eouae. [rubr.]. R.LXXXI VIII consit/tues eos./[rubr.] v. Pro pa/tribus tuis. Allelu/a

On recto, in upper right corner, in black ink: 114. On verso, in center of upper margin, in red ink: 121. In top left corner, in black ink: 115. In center of left margin, in black ink: 57

Provenance: John F. Murray, Florence, 1935
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, b.3 (as written by Berardus de Teramo)

These six cuttings are part of a group of ten, maybe eleven, leaves from a lost volume of a gradual, probably a sanctorale, intended for Dominican use. Four other leaves, identical in dimension and stave height, are in the Cini Collection, Venice (26–29), while an eleventh, known only through reproductions, is perhaps identifiable in a cutting formerly on the art market in Amsterdam (sale, Mensing et Fils, Amsterdam, November 22, 1929, lot 64, Saint Dominic and Confirmation of the Rule by Pope Honorius III in an Initial I). The liturgical sequence of the Lehman and Cini fragments may be reconstructed as follows:

1. Cat. no. 3a: Last Judgment in an Initial A (“Ad te levavi animam meam” [I lift up my soul unto thee]). Introtto to mass for first Sunday of Advent

2. Cini 28: Sioning of Saint Stephen in an Initial E (“Et enim sedentur principes” [For princes met]). Introtto to mass for Feast of Saint Stephen (December 26

3. Cat. no. 3b: Saint John the Evangelist in an Initial I (“In medio ecclesie” [In the gathering of the Church]). Introtto to mass for Feast of Saint John the Evangelist (December 27)

4. Cat. no. 3c: Presentation in the Temple in an Initial S (“Suscepimus deus misericordiam tuam” [We have received your kindness, O Lord]). Introtto to mass for Feast of the Presentation in the Temple (February 2

5. Cini 27: Annunciation in an Initial R (“Rotare caeli” [Drop down dew, you heavens]). Introtto to mass for Feast of the Annunciation (March 25)

6. Cat. no. 3d: Martyrdom of Saint Peter Martyr in an Initial P (“Protexisti me deus” [Thou hast protected
me, Lord)). Introit to mass for Feast of Saint Peter Martyr (April 29)
7. Oberlin 43.10: *Translation of the Body of Saint Dominic in an Initial I* ("In medio ecclesie" [In the gathering of the Church]). Introit to mass for Feast of the Translation of the Body of Saint Dominic (May 24)
8. Cini 26: *Saint John the Baptist in an Initial D* ("De ventre matris meae" [From my mother’s womb]). Introit to mass for Feast of the Birth of Saint John the Baptist (June 24)
9. Cat. no. 3f: *Saint Peter in an Initial N* ("Nunc scio vere" [Now I know for certain]). Introit to mass for Feast of Saint Peter (June 29)
10. Cini 29: *Saint Paul in an Initial S* ("Scio cui credidi" [I know whom I have believed]). Introit to mass for the Commemoration of Saint Paul (June 30)

While these leaves are clearly products of a single workshop, their stylistic milieu remains hard to define. The four Cini fragments, formerly in the Hoepli Collection, Milan, were first attributed by Pietro Toesca (1930, pp. 30–31) to central Italy between the end of the thirteenth and beginning of the fourteenth century and compared to late-thirteenth-century Umbrian manuscript illumination influenced by the work of Cimabue. One of the Lehman illuminations (cat. no. 3a), possibly the frontispiece of the missing gradual, was also listed as Umbrian by Seymour De Ricci, who, however, confused the remaining five Lehman leaves with another group of works assembled around catalogue number 19 (by the Abruzzese illuminator Berardo da Teramo).

Toesca’s reference to Umbrian manuscript illumination was based on his comparison of the Cini fragments to the miniatures in a series of choir books from the Church of San Domenico, Spoleto, which are now in Perugia (Biblioteca Comunale Augusta, m2790, 2792, 2795). While some of the decorative elements of the Cini and Lehman illuminations, such as the white filigree ornament, the dotted outline of the halos, and the linear treatment of the draperies, do find their equivalents in the San Domenico miniatures, the differing figural styles set the two groups apart. Whereas the San Domenico illuminations reflect a distinctly Cimabuesque formal and expressive vocabulary, clearly indebted to that artist’s work in Assisi in the 1280s (Todini 1982, pp. 193–95), the Cini and Lehman illuminations share a more archaic figural style and linear emphasis, still closely allied to Byzantine models. Within the context of Umbrian illumination a closer comparison is perhaps to be found in the works associated with an early phase, before 1280, of the so-called Master of the Deruta Missal (Labriola 1997, pp. 108–9), of which the Lehman and Cini fragments may reflect a coarser, provincial derivative.

At the same time, however, the figures in two of the Lehman miniatures that are attributable to a different hand in the same workshop (catalogue numbers 3b and 3c) betray a stylistic relationship to Gothic models north of the Alps and may thus point to a different area of production for this entire group of illuminations, in Swabian southern Italy. Specific decorative elements, such as the elaborately intertwined initials and the small concentric circles of different hues in the halos of some of the figures or in the borders, in particular, may be compared to southern Italian manuscripts of the second half of the thirteenth century associated with the Manfredi Bible in the Vatican (Biblioteca Apostolica Vatican, Vat. Lat. 36).

Possibly by the same hand, or school, as the Cini and Lehman fragments is a closely related, hitherto unpublished leaf from a pontifical (fig. 1) in the Free Library, Philadelphia (m8:12).

Fig. 1 Umbria or Southern Italy, *Initial I* (leaf from a pontifical). Free Library, Philadelphia, m8:12
Elevation of the Host in an Initial A

Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6 x 5 1/2 in. (15 x 14 cm). Stave: 3.6 cm


Provenance: Rappaport, Rome, 1924

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, d.9 (as probably Umbrian, 14th century)

The initial A illustrates the first response (“Adorna thalamum tuum” [Adorn your bridal chamber]) of the first nocturn for the Feast of the Purification of the Virgin (February 2). This feast, which also commemorates that of the Presentation of the Christ Child in the Temple (Luke 2:22), recalls the Jewish rite of the purification of the mother after birth. Also known as Candlemas, it incorporated from earliest times a procession of lighted candles in honor of the Virgin and of Christ and the distribution of them to the faithful (Jacobus de Voragine 1993, pp. 143–51). These various aspects of the feast’s history and its celebration are illustrated by the otherwise unusual scene in the lower half.
of the Lehman initial, where the Virgin, followed by three unidentified haloed figures bearing lighted candles, is shown placing several in the hands of a female worshiper kneeling at her feet.

The Lehman cutting was excised from the present folio 62 of an antiphonary located in the Archivio di Stato, Gubbio (San Domenico cor.f). This volume is part of an eleven-volume series (comprising seven antiphonaries, three graduals, and a kyriale) from the former convent of San Domenico, Gubbio. Many of these books are in fragmentary condition and have been deprived of both leaves and historiated letters (Castelfranco 1929, pp. 529–55). Corale F, one of the most severely mutilated, is a sanctorale, the surviving portions of which cover the period from the Feast of Saint Agnes (January 21) to the Feast of the Chair of Saint Peter (February 22). On the recto of folio 62 appears the second antiphon of the first nocturn for the Feast of the Purification. The missing fragments of this text appear on the back of the Lehman miniature: “Sicut mira electa o/dorem dedisti suavitas/sancta de[ nitrix.] p. Celid/a. Post par]/tum virgo inviolata perman/sisti dei genitrix intercede” (Like precious myrrh you gave forth an odor of

sweetness, holy Mother of God. Even after giving birth, you remained a virgin; Mother of God intercede for us).

In addition to the Lehman miniature, three more missing illuminations from the Gubbio series may be identified with the following cuttings: a previously unpublished initial Q with Saint Agatha in Prison, in the Free Library, Philadelphia (M32:8), excised from Corale F, folio 82 (fig. 2); an initial I with the seven scenes of Creation in the Germanisches Nationalmuseum, Nuremberg (Bredt 1903, no. 53, pl. IX), first tentatively associated with the San Domenico choir books by Luisa Morozzi (1980, p. 63, n. 6) and probably excised from folio 59 of Corale B; and an initial S with the Trials of Job, recently on the art market in London (Sotheby’s, July 6, 2000, lot 37), probably excised from folio 2 of Corale E.

In the most extensive study to date of the San Domenico series, Giorgio Castelfranco (1929) associated their decoration, which he assigned to a single master and his workshop, with the Bolognese school of illumination. Castelfranco dated their execution, on the basis of stylistic and textual evidence, to about 1290, shortly after the consecration of the Church of San Domenico in 1287. The same author drew convincing comparisons between the San Domenico miniatures and the illuminations in two antiphonaries in the Museo Civico Medievale, Bologna (cod. 519, 520), which he viewed as products of a distinct hand but from a common artistic milieu. In addition to their similar borders, typical of Bolognese illumination at the turn of the thirteenth century, the Bologna antiphonaries share with the Gubbio miniatures the same calligraphic approach, defined by large, simplified forms and gestures and summarily outlined facial features; the same palette of brilliant oranges and blues juxtaposed with delicate pinks, grays, and pale flesh tones; and the same Byzantine-inspired decorative and architectural elements.

Most recently, the Bologna antiphonaries have been associated by Fabrizio Lollini (2000, pp. 377–79) with a gradual also in the Museo Civico (cod. 521), as part of a single commission executed about 1300 for the Dominican convent of Sant’Agnesi, Bologna. The style of the anonymous illuminator, appositely christened “Maestro di Sant’Agnesi,” has been characterized by Lollini as a “vulgarization” (2000, p. 279), or vernacu-

Fig. 2 Bolognese, ca. 1290–1300. Saint Agatha in Prison in an Initial Q. Free Library, Philadelphia, M32:8
Recto: Missu/ est/ gabriel angelus ad/ maria[m] virginitem/

desponsatam ioseph/ nu[n]cians ei verbum [et]. Verso: expavesit

virgo de lu/mine ne timesus/ maria invenisti gratia[m]/ apud
dominu[m] ece [con]ci/pies et paries. Ex/ vocabitur altissimi[m]

PROVENANCE: Leonardi, Paris

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, D.5 (as early 14th century,

written at Bologna)

5C

God the Father and Prophet in an Initial I

Circa 1310–13

Leaf from an antiphony

Cambridge, The Houghton Library, Harvard University, 1943.1867

Tempora and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 21 3/4 x 15 3/4 in. (55.5 x

39 cm). Stave: 3.6 cm

Recto: i. [rubr.]. ps. Venite. [rubr.]. R/ln prin/cipio/ fecit deus

celum[m et] tertia[m et] creavit in ea h/o/mine[m]. Ad/ yma. Verso:
ge[n]c[et] similitudinem suas[m]. [rubr.] V/Fort/mavit iugum deus/
hominem[m] de limo tetere/ et inspiravit fac[ium] euius spiraculum[vi

On recto, in upper right corner, in black ink: 67

PROVENANCE: Leonardi, Paris

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, D.28A (as 14th century,

written in Umbria)
Gabriel an ge lus ad manun virtuem nuncius et virbum.
devotion]). First response at vespers for Feast of Saint Vincent (January 22)
("Saulus adhuc spirans minarum" [Saul, still breathing threats]). First response of first nocturn for Feast of the Conversion of Saint Paul (January 25)
4. Cat. no 5a: Saint Agatha in Prison in an Initial D
("Dum ingredenterur beata Agatha in carcerem" [While Blessed Agatha entered prison]). First response of first nocturn for Feast of Saint Agatha (February 5)
5. Cat. no 5b: Annunciation in an Initial M ("Missus est Gabriel Angelus" [The Angel Gabriel was sent]). First response of first nocturn for Feast of the Annunciation (March 25)

The Houghton Library leaf is one of seven related cuttings divided among various collections that were probably included in a second antiphonary volume from the same series, the contents of which would have covered the temporal cycle from Advent to Passion Week. This volume may be partially reconstructed as follows:

6. Milan, Longari Collection: Christ Blessing between the Virgin and Saint John the Evangelist and Apostles in an Initial A ("Aspiciens a longe" [Long had I been watching]). First response at matins for first Sunday of Advent
7. Aalen, private collection: Angel Playing the Horn in an Initial C ("Canite tuba in Sion" [Blow the trumpet in Sion]). First response at matins for fourth Sunday of Advent
8. Houghton Library 1943.1867: God the Father and Prophet in an Initial I ("In principio creavit Deus caelum et terram" [In the beginning God created the heavens and the earth]). First response at matins for Septuagesima Sunday
9. Chicago, Art Institute, 42.553: Joseph and His Sons at the Well in an Initial V ("Videntes Joseph a longe" [Seeing Joseph in the distance]). First response at matins for third Sunday in Lent
10. Cini 2031: God Speaking to Moses in an Initial L ("Locutus est Dominus ad Moysen" [The Lord spoke to Moses]). First response at matins for the fourth Sunday in Lent
11. Philadelphia, Free Library, M73-8: Prophet Kneeling Before God in an Initial I ("In die qua invocavi te" [When I called to you]). First response at matins for Palm Sunday

Except for catalogue numbers 5a and 5b, unpublished since De Ricci’s cursory listing of them, respectively, as “Umbrian” and “Bolognese,” the remaining ten cuttings in this series have generally been considered, either individually or in smaller groups, among the production of Neri da Rimini, one of the leading figures in the history of fourteenth-century Italian manuscript illumination (Rimini 1995; Dauner 1998). Neri’s earliest recorded work, a leaf with Christ in Majesty in the Cini Collection, Venice (2030), signed and dated 1300, reveals a precocious assimilation of Giotto’s expressive and formal vocabulary mixed with linear and decorative elements
derived from Bolognese illumination. With respect to this early work, however, the various fragments grouped with the Lehman illuminations reflect a progressive expansion of the forms and generalization of facial features, as well as a simplification of the compositions. These changes are typical of Neri’s late production, beginning with the leaf with Christ in Majesty in the Cleveland Museum of Art (53.3651), signed and dated 1308, and continuing into the choir books for the Church of San Francesco, Rimini, dated 1314. Thus the date of between 1310 and 1315, proposed by Robert Gibbs (in Rimini 1995, pp. 124–31) for the Dublin and Chicago initials, seems valid for the entire group. 1

1. Volpe 1995 proposed a similar dating, in the “very first years of the second decade of the century,” for Cini 2031, around which he grouped one of the Dublin cuttings (w195–97) and the Stockholm and Philadelphia fragments. The only exception is the earlier date, between 1305 and 1308, assigned by Fabrizio Lollini (in Rimini 1995 pp. 84–85) and Gudrun Dauner (1998, pp. 87–90) to the initial A in the Longari Collection.

Collaborator of Neri da Rimini (Master of the Fulget?)

6

Martyrdom of Saint Peter Martyr in an Initial D

Circa 1300–1308
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 17 3/4 × 14 1/4 in. (45.5 × 36.4 cm). Initial: 5 5/8 in. (12.5 × 13 cm). Stave: 3.8 cm

Recto: Do pe/etre si/dua aureum summi/ vas honoris candore[m]/ servans niveu[m] do/no creatoris. Decus. Verso: habes virgineu[m]/ in/ supersis choris/ alleluya. [rubr.] v/ Tu speculu[m] munditie tu/ custos innocentie tu sanct/i flos pudoris. Decus.[rubr.]

PROVENANCE: Bruscoli, Florence, ca. 1923
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1707, c.3 (as probably written at Bologna, ca. 1400)
The discrepancies in execution between the various illuminations associated with Neri da Rimini’s name have led to the identification of various anonymous collaborators who painted over the master’s design in what must have been a large workshop. The present cutting may be included in a group of works that, while clearly indebted to Neri’s style in form and composition, are distinguished from his autograph production by less volumetric effects, a general stiffness of execution, and a more brilliant palette.

Although the precise text illustrated by the scene of Saint Peter Martyr’s execution remains difficult to identify and may reflect a particular Dominican usage, the leaf is perhaps one of three, possibly four, surviving cuttings, identical in style, decoration, and stave height, that may have been excised from a single volume of a Dominican sanctorale. Two related miniatures, previously linked together by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978a, p. 21), are in the Cini Collection, Venice: an initial D with Saint Helena Adoring the Cross (2181) and an initial D with Clerics Adoring the Cross (2233), illustrating, respectively, the Feasts of the Invention (May 3) and Exaltation of the Holy Cross (September 14). To these may possibly be added a fourth leaf in the Chester Beatty Library, Dublin (w195.96), associated by Alessandro Volpe (in Rimini 1995, pp. 74–77) with the Cini fragments, which shows two Dominican monks and various other figures before a sepulchre in an initial F to illustrate the Common of a Confessor (“Fulget decus ecclesie” [The glory of the Church shines forth]), sometimes also included in a sanctorale.

The Chester Beatty fragment has been attributed by Robert Gibbs (in Rimini 1995, pp. 80–81) to a close collaborator of Neri, christened “Master of the Fulget,” and dated to between 1300 and 1305. The same artist may also have been responsible for the Lehman illumination, the style of which most closely approaches Neri’s in the first decade of the fourteenth century, between the early Cini leaf of 1300 and the Cleveland cutting of 1308.

1. Contrary to Volpe’s assertion (in Rimini 1995, p. 74), the cutting by a collaborator of Neri in the Art Institute of Chicago (inv. 42.531) is unlikely to have come from the same book as the Cini and Chester Beatty fragments, since it was originally part of a temporeale. This does not preclude the possibility, however, that it may have been included in the same choir book series.

Emilian
Circa 1300–1320

7
Monastic Saint Holding a Book in an Initial I
Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and silver (?) on parchment. Leaf: 21 3/4 × 15 3/4 in. (54.8 × 38.8 cm). Initial: 4 3/4 × 7/8 in. (11.9 × 2.4 cm). Stave: 2.9 cm

On verso, in center of bottom margin: quia. In center of left margin, in red ink: xx

PROVENANCE: Leonardin, Paris
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, d.28a (as written in Umbria)

This leaf, excised from an unidentified gradual, illustrates the introit to the mass for the third Sunday after Easter (“Iubilate deo” [Shout joyfully to God]). The identity of the young, haloed monk in a gray robe, who occupies the whole length of the initial I, cannot be determined on the basis of the text or the provenance of the cutting, which at present is unknown.

The style of the illumination reflects knowledge of Neri da Rimini’s mature production, in the drawing of the monk’s head as a perfect oval and in the definition of the features with white highlights, as well as in the pale coloring of the face with its rose-colored cheeks. Absent, however, is the monumental quality that distinguishes Neri’s work and, to a lesser degree, that of his collaborators. The leaf’s closest comparison is a miniature with the Standing Redeemer in an Initial I in the Cini Collection, Venice (2162), that was first attributed by Pietro Toesca (1958, p. 22, no. 64) to “manner of Neri da Rimini” but subsequently placed by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978a, p. 22, no. 39) within the more general context of Emilian or Romagnole illumination of the first decades of the fourteenth century.

8b
King David Playing a Viol in an Initial S
Cutting from an antiphonary

Bolognese (?)
First quarter of the fourteenth century

8a
Last Judgment in an Initial C
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 5 1/4 × 4 1/4 in. (13.5 × 10.8 cm).
Size: 4 cm

Verso: Not visible (cutting glued on cardboard)

PROVENANCE: Madame Fould (sale, Galerie Georges Petit, Paris, December 26, 1926, lot 33)
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, c.9a (as early-14th-century Italian)
TREASURES OF A LOST ART

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 5 × 4 3/4 in. (12.6 × 10.4 cm). Stave: 4 cm

Verso: Not visible (cutting glued on cardboard)

PROVENANCE: Madame Fould (sale, Galerie Georges Petit, Paris, December 26, 1926, lot 33)
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, c.9b (as early-14th-century Italian)

The two cuttings, identical in style, decoration, and stave height, were excised from the same volume or series of an unidentified antiphonary. The initial C, showing Christ Enthroned as Last Judge, illustrates the second response of the first nocturn for the Office of the Dead (“Credo quod Redemptor meus vivit” [I believe that my Redeemer lives]). The initial S with the psalmist King David illustrates the first response at matins for the fourth Sunday after Easter (“Si oblitus fuero tu” [If I ever forget you]), the text of which is derived from Psalm 136 (verse 5).

Although De Ricci listed these fragments generically as “early fourteenth-century Italian,” in the 1926 Paris sale catalogue they were more specifically identified as Bolognese and dated to the first half of the fourteenth century. Early-fourteenth-century Bolognese manuscript production, as exemplified by the famous series of choir books executed for the churches of San Domenico (see below, cat. nos. 9a–b) and Santa Maria dei Servi, Bologna (Conti 1981, pp. 77–79), does, in fact, provide a point of reference for the overall style and border decoration of these fragments. However, while the miniatures in those volumes, with their anecdotal narrative style and concern with spatial definition, reflect the progressive assimilation of Giottesque models by Bolognese illuminators, the Lehman cuttings are distinguished by a schematic approach to storytelling and coarser execution. These characteristics denote a more archaic idiom that suggests an earlier date for the Lehman fragments, although it has not yet been possible to associate them with a specific workshop.

Second Master of San Domenico
Bolognese, active first half of fourteenth century

9a
Calling of Saint Peter and Saint Andrew in an Initial D
1307–24/26
Bifolium from an antiphonary


On recto of first leaf early numeration, in black ink: 3. On second leaf: 4

PROVENANCE: Bruscoli, Florence, 1922
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, c.9 (as ca. 1340, probably written at Bologna); Mariani Canova 1979, p. 377 (as First Master of San Domenico)

9b
Christ and the Apostles Appearing to Saint John the Evangelist and Miracle of the Manna in Saint John’s Grave in an Initial V
1307–24/26
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 24 3/4 × 16 in. (61.5 × 41 cm). Initial: 7 × 4 3/4 in. (17.8 × 12.1 cm). Stave: 4.9 cm


On recto, in right margin, later numeration, in black ink: 78. On verso, in lower margin, catchword: randus
Provenance: Bruscoli, Florence, 1922
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, c.9 (as ca. 1340, probably written at Bologna); Mariani Canova 1979, p. 377 (as First Master of San Domenico)

These two fragments, generically identified by De Ricci as Bolognese, were first correctly associated by Giordana Mariani Canova (1979) with a large series of choir books executed between 1307 and 1324/26 for the Dominican church of San Domenico, Bologna. The single most important cycle of liturgical books executed in that city during the first quarter of the fourteenth century, the San Domenico series originally comprised a fourteen-volume antiphonary set, three books and numerous fragments of which are missing at present (Alce 1961).

According to Mariani Canova, the Lehman pages, which are identical to the San Domenico antiphonaries in measurement, stave height, and decoration, would have been included in the missing volume of a sanctorale that, according to old inventories, covered the liturgical cycle from the Feast of Saint Andrew (November 30) to the Feast of Holy Innocents (December 28). Located near the beginning of this book would have been catalogue number 9a, a bifolium containing on folios 3r–4r the first three antiphons at matins for the Feast of Saint Andrew and on folio 4v the first response at matins for the same feast (“Dum perambularet Dominus iuxta mare Galilae” [As the Lord was walking by the Sea of Galilee]). Inside the initial D is a miniature of the Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew, below which are two bas-de-page roundels with episodes from the life of Saint Andrew: Saint Andrew Preaching from the Cross, and the Miracle of the Resuscitated Drowned Men.

Catalogue number 9b, containing the first response in the first nocturn (“Valde honorandus est beatus Ioannes” [Very highly we must venerate Blessed John]) for the Feast of Saint John the Evangelist (December 27), would have been inserted toward the end of the lost sanctorale. This text is illustrated by a miniature of Christ and the Apostles Appearing to Saint John the Evangelist, in the upper half of the initial V, and the Miracle of the Manna in Saint John’s Grave, in the lower half of the initial. Below are four bas-de-page medallions with the Last Supper, the Attempted Martyrdom of Saint John before the Latin Gate, Saint John on Patmos, and the Miracle of Drusiana.

The author of the Lehman fragments was identified by Mariani Canova as the so-called First Master of San Domenico (also known as the Seneca Master), the leading figure in a team of no less than seven illuminators who appear to have been engaged in the decoration of the entire San Domenico series (Alce 1961, pp. 162–65; Conti 1981, pp. 72–73). In contrast to the miniatures generally attributed to the First Master, however, which are defined by elongated, expressive figural types with small heads and minute proportions, the Lehman illuminations are characterized by stocky types with broad jaws and large features, flatly modeled with broad strokes of color, that are more characteristic of the illuminator known as the Second Master of San Domenico. This artist was responsible for the decoration of at least one volume in San Domenico (cor. 9), to which may be related four out of six (possibly seven) fragments by the same hand, in the Cini Collection, Venice (Mariani Canova 1978a, pp. 3–9), that are identical in style and execution to the Lehman pages.

The Second Master of San Domenico has been viewed as deriving decorative and compositional elements from the First Master, who was possibly his teacher, although he transformed the latter’s elegant vocabulary, still reminiscent of thirteenth-century models, into a more rustic and, at the same time, more Giottesque idiom typical of Bolognese illumination of the first half of the fourteenth century. The San Domenico miniatures appear to represent the earliest phase of the artist’s activity, which, as recent studies have demonstrated, seems to have extended into the 1340s (Brunori 1998, pp. 87–104) and to have included the decoration of secular as well as liturgical texts.1

1. Among the secular commissions convincingly attributed the same hand are the miniatures in two juridic manuscripts located, respectively, in the Biblioteca Capitolare, Padua (MS b.18., Conti 1981, p. 86) and in the Biblioteca Braidense, Milan (a.e.xiv.15., Vanoli 1997, pp. 192–57); and a leaf of the register of the confraternity of Sant’Eustachio, in the Biblioteca Comunale dell’Archiginnasio, Bologna (Gezz. 210, Op. 8, Battiistini 1999, pp. 188–89).
Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna
Bolognese, documented 1353–1401

10

Jacob’s Blessing in an Initial T

Circa 1370–80
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 10 ½ × 8 in. (26.2 × 20.8 cm). Initial: 4 ½ × 4 ¾ in. (10.5 × 10.7 cm). Stave: 2.8 cm

Recto: [as]cendit in mon/tem et transfiguratus est ante/ eos Ad/m/a. Visionem [quam vidistis] nemini dixeri/[tis donec a] m]ortuis resurgat. Verso: suam Quia i… / omnes fin… / To[ll]e alma tua, pharetram / et arcum

PROVENANCE: Kaledjian, Paris, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, a.18 (as Niccolò da Bologna)

This miniature, excised from an unidentified antiphonary leaf, illustrates the first response at matins (“Tolle arma tua pharetram et arcum” [Take your weapons, quiver and bow]) for the second Sunday of Lent. On the back of the illumination, which appeared on the original leaf’s verso, are fragments of the preceding antiphon of the Magnificat at first vespers (“Visionem quam vidistis nemini dixeritis” [Tell no one about the vision you have seen]) for the same feast. Inside the initial T are represented all the salient points of the Old Testament episode of Jacob’s stolen blessing (Genesis 25:19–34: 27; 28:1–5). On the left is Jacob in disguise receiving from his aged father, Isaac, the blessing intended for his brother Esau. In the background, looking on, is Isaac’s wife, Rebekah, who had conspired with Jacob to trick her husband. And to the right is Esau, arriving too late with the venison that his father had requested to eat before bestowing his final blessing upon him.

This illumination is one of five cuttings formerly in the Lehman collection that were correctly attributed by De Ricci to Niccolo di Giacomo da Bologna, the most famous and prolific Bolognese illuminator working in the second half of the fourteenth century. During the long period of his activity, continuously documented between 1353 and 1401 (Filippini and Zucchi 1947, pp. 175–81), this artist appears to have held a virtual monopoly over the production of both secular and liturgical manuscripts in his native city. The vast number of surviving works by his hand, many of them signed, attest to his role as the head of a large workshop, equally involved in the decoration of choir books for churches and convents in and outside Bologna, humanistic texts for cultured patrons affiliated with the famous university, and corporate and communal statutes. Evidence of Niccolò’s financial success and reputation includes the numerous properties he owned in Bologna, along with his various appointments to public office.

Niccolò’s pictorial vocabulary, firmly rooted in a local miniaturist tradition, takes its main inspiration from the intensely expressive and decorative idiom evolved by the so-called Master of 1346, the anonymous artist who dominated Bolognese manuscript illumination in the 1340s and who may have been Niccolò’s teacher (Conti 1981, pp. 94–95; Medica 1999, pp. 126–27). While Niccolò’s earliest production is closely related to that of this illuminator, during the course of his career the meticulousness that characterizes his predecessor’s
production was increasingly sacrificed for a quickness of execution, general simplification of the forms, and brilliant coloristic effects to achieve greater narrative impact. The result is an immediately pleasing but essentially uniform style that makes it difficult to assign a precise date to the many undocumented fragments associated with Niccolò’s maturity, such as the present Lehman cutting and the four others that follow (cat. nos. 11–14).

A dating between 1370 and 1380 for catalogue number 10 is suggested by its affinity with various dated miniatures by Niccolò from this period, beginning with those in the 1373 Pharsalia in the Biblioteca Trivulziana, Milan (cod. 691). These illuminations share the same compressed narrative style as the Lehman fragment and display a similar, tighter execution than his works of the following decade.¹

¹ For a detailed discussion of the works produced by Niccolò during the 1370s see Pasut 1998.

Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna

II

Two Kings in an Initial A

Circa 1370–80
Cutting from an antiphonary (?)
Cambridge, The Houghton Library, Harvard University, 1943.1871

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 3⅛ × 3⅜ in. (8 × 8.5 cm). Stave: ca. 5 cm

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, A.18 (as Niccolò da Bologna)

The subject of this miniature suggests that it may have been excised from an unidentified antiphonary, where it would have illustrated the first antiphon in the first nocturn of Passion Friday ("Asinturunt reges terrae" [The kings of the Earth rise up]). The foliate border and handling indicate a date in proximity to the previous cutting (cat. no. 10) by Niccolò di Giacomo, in the decade between 1370 and 1380.

Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna

12

Saint Denis and His Companions in an Initial I

Circa 1380–90
Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 23 × 16 in. (58.5 × 40.5 cm). Initial: 6 × 3⅛ in. (15.1 × 7.9 cm). Stave: 4.2 cm

Intret in conspectu tuo domine gemitus/ compederator. Verso:
Redde vicinis n[oster] septuplum in/sinu corum/vindica sanguinem/ sanctorum tuo[rum]

On recto, in center of upper margin, in red ink: lxxxix. In upper right corner, in black ink: 99, lxxxix

PROVENANCE: Kaledjian, Paris, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, A.18 (as Niccolò da Bologna, ca. 1350)

Excised from an unidentified gradual, this leaf contains the introit to the Mass for Two or More Martyrs outside of Paschal tide ("Intret in conspectu tuo Domine gemitus compederator" [Let the sighs of the imprisoned come before you, O Lord]). As stated by
Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna

13

Dominican Friar Praying

Circa 1380–90

Border fragment

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment 6 1/2 x 4 1/4 in. (16.5 x 10.9 cm)

Blank verso (cutting mounted on modern imitation-parchment paper)

Provenance: John F. Murray, Florence, 1925

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, b.9 (as Niccolò da Bologna)

The present fragment was excised from the foliate border of an unidentified manuscript leaf. The figure of the praying Dominican friar looking upward, which may reflect a Dominican commission, would have been located in the lower left margin of the page, below the musical notation and text. The foliate border and style compare closely to the preceding leaf by Niccolò di Giacomo, suggesting a contemporary date of execution in the 1380s.

The rubric, the text is used here for the Feast of Saint Denis and His Companions, Rusticus and Eleutherius (October 9), which is illustrated by two saints holding the martyr’s palm, with the heads of several others visible behind them. The broader execution of the figures and foliate border places this fragment slightly later than the previous two Lehman cuttings by Niccolò di Giacomo and among the group of works produced by the artist in the 1380s, such as the leaf from a register of the Bolognese shoemakers’ guild in the Breslauer Collection, New York (Voelkle and Wieck 1992, no. 71, pp. 188–89). Also closely related to catalogue number 12 in both style and foliate border is an antiphonary fragment in the National Gallery, Washington, showing the Birth of Saint John the Baptist in an Initial F (Nordenfalk 1975, no. 16, pp. 53–54).
14

Three Martyr Saints in an Initial S

Circa 1390–1400
Cutting from a gradual (?)

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 4 1/2 x 3 1/6 in. (11.2 x 7.8 cm). Initial: 3 1/4 x 3 1/6 in. (8.3 x 7.7 cm). Stave: 4.2 cm

Recto: a/S. Verso: vos/du ut

Provenance: John F. Murray, Florence, 1924
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, B.11 (as Niccolò da Bologna)

This cutting was probably excised from an unidentified volume of a gradual. Although too little text remains to ascertain the exact liturgical content of the original leaf, the initial S could have illustrated the introit to the Mass for Two or More Martyrs during Paschaltide ("Sancti tui, Domine benedicent te" [Your Saints, O Lord, bless you]). The slightly looser handling of this illumination with respect to the preceding two Lehman cuttings suggests a later date of execution, closer to works produced in the last decade of Niccolò’s career.

Stefano degli Azzi

Bolognese, documented 1363–1400

15

Crucifixion with Saints Mary Magdalen, Homobonus, and Donor

Circa 1390–1400
Frontispiece to a missal for the Tailors’ Guild of Bologna

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 8 1/4 x 6 1/2 in. (21 x 16.5 cm). Miniature: 7 1/2 x 5 3/4 in. (19.2 x 14.5 cm)

Blank verso

Provenance: F. Kleinberger, Paris
Literature: Comstock 1927, p. 49 illus.; De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, D.16 (as Bologna, ca. 1350)

This cutting is the frontispiece to a lost missal executed for the Tailors’ Guild of Bologna. To the right of a traditional Crucifixion scene, with the penitent Magdalen at the foot of the cross, are Homobonus, patron saint of tailors, with his attribute of the scissors, and, kneeling at his side, the manuscript’s lay donor. The latter is identified by a scroll with the following inscription: “questo mesale fe fare maestro grigorio de... de michele sarto” (Master Gregorio di... di Michele, tailor, had this missal made).

The Lehman frontispiece was probably excised from the same volume as an illuminated missal leaf in the Staatlichen Graphischen Sammlung, Munich (Bauer-Eberhardt 1984, pp. 78–79) that shows the coats of arms of the city of Bologna and of the Tailors’ Guild (fig. 3). The text on this folio includes the missal’s incipit, beginning with praises to the Virgin Mary, the Apostles Peter and Paul, and Saint Homobonus, “confessor, protector and defender of the Guild of Tailors of the City of Bologna.” Below the incipit is an initial A with David Lifting up His Soul to God, illustrating the introit to the mass for the first Sunday of Advent (“Ad te levavi animam meam” [I lift up my soul unto thee]). Identical in style to the Lehman cutting, the Munich leaf would have been located immediately after it, or facing it, in the missal’s opening section.

The Munich page was first attributed by Massimo Medica (1987, p. 200) to Stefano degli Azzi, who, after
Niccolò da Bologna, was the most active and sought-after illuminator in Bologna in the second half of the fourteenth century. In contrast to Niccolò’s expressively exuberant narrative style, representative of the newest currents in Bolognese illumination, Stefano’s idiom is characterized by a stiffness of execution and coarseness, which, together with the simple foliate border decorations, reflect an essentially conservative approach that is still tied to examples of the first half of the century.

The rigidly posed figures with darkly outlined features and square jaws that appear in the Lehman and Munich miniatures are typical of Stefano’s later production at the turn of the century. The Munich page was convincingly compared by both Hans-Joachim Eberhardt (1984, p. 79) and Medica (1987, pp. 198–200; 1999, p. 68) to the artist’s last documented work, the Collectario (Book of Orations) dated 1400, in the Museo Civico Medievale, Bologna (ms 638). Both fragments are also closely related to the miniatures in the copy of Petrarch’s Eclogues in the Bodleian Library, Oxford (Bodley 580), first attributed to Stefano by Robert Gibbs (1984, pp. 638–41) with a dating in the latest phase of his activity.
Venetian
Circa 1360–70

16
Christ Blessing in an Initial D
Cutting from a choir book

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 7/8 × 3 3/4 in (9.7 × 9.4 cm).
Stave: 2.9 cm

On verso, partially hidden by remnants of paper backing: G...a/a
do...a

PROVENANCE: Leo S. Olschki, Florence, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, b.26 (as probably Bologna,
ca. 1530)

Although listed tentatively by De Ricci as Bolognese, this fragment may more appropriately be compared to
Venetian illumination in the second half of the four-
teenth century, particularly as reflected in the produc-
tion of the illuminator Giustino di Gherardino da
Forlì. The corpus of this artist was first defined by
Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1967) on the basis of his
signature and the date 1365 in a gradual from the
Scuola di Santa Maria della Carità, Venice (Biblioteca
Marciana, MS Lat. 1119). His hand was subsequently
recognized in a number of both secular and liturgical
manuscripts, ranging in date from the early 1360s to
the 1390s. As noted by most scholars, these works
reflect a simplification of the refined, Byzantine-
inspired vocabulary of Paolo Veneziano (active first
half of the 14th century) into a vernacular narrative
idiom influenced by Bolognese illumination.

Among the miniatures recently attributed to
Gherardino are a series of cuttings divided among vari-
ous collections (De Benedictis 1996, pp. 140–43) that
compare to the Lehman Christ Blessing in style, palette,
and foliate decoration and include the same white
filigree pattern over the initial. The Lehman fragment
is distinguished from these illuminations, however, by
a slightly looser brushstroke and more hurried execu-
tion, making an attribution to Gherardino problematic
and suggesting that it might instead be the product of
an artist in his circle. By the same hand and possibly
from the same manuscript is a previously unpublished
cutting in the Free Library, Philadelphia, showing
Christ Blessing and a Man in Prayer (M25:4; fig. 4).

Fig. 4 Venetian,
circa 1360–70,
Christ Blessing and
a Man in Prayer.
Free Library,
Philadelphia,
M25:4
“Fra Jacobus”
Emilia or Veneto, last quarter of the fourteenth century

17
Last Supper
Leaf from an antiphary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 21 7/8 x 15 3/8 in. (55.7 x 38.9 cm). Miniature: 5 x 5 3/4 in. (12.7 x 12.8 cm). Stave: 3.5–3.6 cm

Verso: nostru[m] y/[n]molatus e(st) cristus./ ita/que/m epulemur [i]/n azimin/ sinceritatis et veritatis. Et. RJ Comede/tis carnes et saturabi/min panibus. Ist est

On recto, slightly above center of right margin, in black ink: 102.
Below miniature, in gold letters: fr[a]. iacobus. fecit

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, 4.37 (as early 15th century, probably written in Venice)

This leaf was excised from an unidentified antiphary. The large miniature of the Last Supper illustrates the second response in the first nocturn for the Feast of Corpus Domini: “Immolabit hedum multitudo filiorum Israel ad vesperam Paschae” (With the whole assembly of Israel present, the young goat shall be slaughtered on the eve of the Passover). The scene is set in an ornate Gothic niche, framed by a square architectural border, at the base of which is the following signature: “Fra Jacobus fecit” (Brother Giacomo made this).

Aside from what may be gathered from the Lehman leaf, his only signed work, nothing else is known of “Fra Jacobus,” presumably a monk in the monastery for which the antiphary was illuminated. Although no other manuscripts by the same hand have so far been traced, general stylistic considerations point to an area of production in either Emilia or the Veneto during the last quarter of the fourteenth century. Both the figural style and composition appear derived from Bolognese prototypes but as represented by monumental painting, not manuscript illumination; while the foliate border and palette recall Paduan manuscripts painted in the 1370s (Padova 1999, pp. 135–37). This would suggest a possible origin in Emilia or one of the regions of the Veneto influenced by the Bolognese school of painting.
Workshop of Vanni di Baldolo
(Master of the Matricole dei Notai)
Perugian, circa 1330–40

18

Pentecost in an Initial S

Leaf from a gradual


On verso, in center left margin, in red ink: xix

PROVENANCE: Kaledjian, Paris, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1707, A,16 (as ca. 1400, written in Umbria)

The illuminated S, which appears on the folio’s verso, illustrates the introit to the mass (“Spiritus domini replevit orbem terrarum” [The spirit of the Lord has filled the whole world]) for Pentecost Sunday, the feast celebrating the appearance of the Holy Ghost to the apostles. Inside the initial are the twelve seated apostles and, above them, the Holy Spirit in the form of a dove radiating beams of light.

This leaf is one of two surviving fragments from an unidentified gradual volume or series. A second page, illuminated by the same artist and identical to the present in size and stave height, is in the Victoria and Albert Museum, London (E. 376–1911). It shows the Annunciation in an Initial V, illustrating the introit to the mass (“Vultum tuum deprecabantur” [They seek your favor]) for the Feast of the Annunciation (March 25).

While the Lehman miniature was generically identified as Umbrian by De Ricci, the London Annunciation was specifically attributed by Filippo Todini (1989, p. 331) to the Perugian painter and illuminator Vanni di Baldolo. This artist has been recognized as one of the first exponents of a distinctly Perugian school of manuscript illumination in the early decades of the fourteenth century, strongly influenced by the models of the painter Meo da Siena, working in Perugia between 1319 and 1333.

The activity of Vanni di Baldolo was first reconstructed on the basis of the signature “VANNES BALDOLI ET SOCHII” (Vanni di Baldolo and Associates), followed by the date 1333, below a miniature of the Annunciation decorating a matricula (register) of the Perugian Guild of Notaries, at present in a private collection (Subbioni 2001, pp. 212–13). As a result of the rediscovery of this manuscript, Vanni di Baldolo was associated with the decoration of a significant number of other illuminations, both secular and liturgical, including those formerly grouped together under the name “Master of the Matricole dei Notai,” after the miniature in a second matricula of the Perugian Guild of Notaries, dated 1343, in the Biblioteca Augustana, Perugia (MS 972). The result
is a large body of works, not always homogeneous in execution, that confirm Vanni di Baldolo’s role as the head of a successful enterprise involving the participation of various assistants and collaborators—a circumstance alluded to by the signature on the 1333 *matricula*.

Most recently, Dillian Gordon (1991, p. 330) has drawn a distinction between the style of the signed 1333 *matricula* and that of the 1343 manuscript. The latter appears characterized by a greater refinement of execution and subtlety of modeling, leading Gordon to convincingly propose that the Master of the Matricole dei Notai was a distinct personality, and perhaps an associate, in Vanni di Baldolo’s workshop. Since the closest comparison for the Victoria and Albert Museum *Annunciation* is the miniature of the same subject in the 1343 manuscript, it is included by Gordon among this master’s production.

Additional comparisons for the Victoria and Albert Museum and Lehman leaves may be found in the illuminations in two volumes of an antiphonary series for the Cathedral of San Lorenzo, Perugia (Biblioteca Capitolare MSS 7, 13), datable to the fourth decade of the fourteenth century, which have also been attributed by Gordon (1991, p. 330) to the Master of the Matricole dei Notai. The correspondence in style, palette, and foliate border between the two leaves and the San Lorenzo miniatures suggests a virtually contemporary date of execution and a possible provenance for these fragments from a hitherto missing gradual series for San Lorenzo that would have complemented the surviving antiphonary volumes.

Although Vanni di Baldolo’s activity as a painter is documented in two payments, dated 1332 and 1333, for works executed in the Church of San Ercolano, Perugia (Gordon 1991, p. 332), no surviving panel paintings or frescoes have thus far been associated with his workshop. On the other hand, Elvio Lunghi (1992, p. 258) has pointed out the stylistic relationship between a dossal from the Abbey Church of Montelabate in the Galleria Nazionale dell’Umbria (inv. 25, 28), attributed to the so-called Master of the Montelabate Dossals, and the miniatures in the San Lorenzo antiphonaries, tentatively proposing that they are by the same hand. The possibility that the Master of the Montelabate Dossals might in fact be the same person as the Master of the Matricole dei Notai, one of the *socii* in Vanni di Baldolo’s workshop, merits further consideration.


2. At present only six antiphonary volumes ( MSS 7, 9, 13, 14, 17, 45) and a breviary ( MS 38, also decorated by the Master of the Matricole dei Notai) survive from the San Lorenzo choir books (Caleca 1969, pp. 91–101).


---

**Berardo da Teramo**

Abruzzese, active first half of the fourteenth century

---

**19**

**Nativity in an Initial H**

Leaf from an antiphonary

*Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 23 x 15 1/2 in. (58.5 x 39.3 cm). Initial: 4 3/4 x 4 3/6 in. (12 x 12.3 cm). Stave: 2.7 cm*

et pri para que Iannus om diam bivinter minn
hieli p pl gen. a. Autem omm felle salutar 11
narr est tae hec repress p. les magni germiis et
pleurar putor unguentans p. dos. a. Neces mar
ungo ure perrit suin toler co salutar sequo rupi
reg agi. sola ungo lactabat ulli tecolo pleno. dos. neo.

Iste 6 nob. te salu to.

Nee nob. seco ter unum
na si v. nar. est. P. lomn
he pout. no se grae c. lesh a
This leaf is one of eleven fragments excised from a lost antiphonary volume decorated by the fourteenth-century Abruzzese illuminator Berardo da Teramo. Nine other leaves from the same book, identical to the present one in size, decoration, and stave height, were formerly in the Hoepli Collection, Milan (Hoepli 1927, nos. 331–32; Toesca 1930, pp. 84–89, nos. xxxiv–xx); four of these are now in the Cini Collection, Venice (2084, 2085, 2087, 2090). A tenth leaf appeared in the 1929 Mensing sale in Amsterdam (Mensing et Fils 1929, lot 66).

The original liturgical sequence of these fragments, excised from a sanctorale, may be reconstructed as follows:

1. Cini 2084: Last Judgment in an Initial A ("Aspiciens a longe" [Long had I been watching]). First response in first nocturn for first Sunday of Advent
2. Ex-Hoepli: Martyrdom of Saint Lucy in an Initial L ("Lucia virgo" [O Virgin Lucy]). First response at matins for Feast of Saint Lucy (December 13)
3. Cat no. 19: Nativity in an Initial H ("Hodie nobis" [Unto us this day]). Second response in first nocturn for Christmas Day (December 25)
5. Ex-Hoepli: Adoration of the Magi in an Initial A ("Afferte domino" [Bring your offerings to the Lord]). First antiphon in first nocturn for Feast of Epiphany (January 6)
6. Ex-Mensing: Baptism of Christ in an Initial B ("Baptizat miles regem" [He baptized a thousand kings]). First antiphon at vespers for the commemoration of the Baptism of Christ (Octave of Epiphany, January 13)
7. Ex-Hoepli: Saint Maurus Rescuing Placidus from

Drowning in an Initial B ("Beatissimus Maurus" [Most blessed Maurus]). First response in first nocturn for Feast of Saint Maurus (January 15)
8. Ex-Hoepli: Martyrdom of Saint Sebastian in an Initial S ("Sebastianus mediolanensium" [Sebastian of Milan]). First antiphon in first nocturn for Feast of Saint Sebastian (January 20)
9. Cini 2085: Presentation in the Temple in an Initial A ("Adorna thalamum tuum" [Adorn your bridal chamber]). First response in first nocturn for Feast of the Presentation (February 2)
10. Cini 2090: Saint Benedict and His Monks in an Initial F ("Fuit vir" [There was a man]). First response in first nocturn for Feast of Saint Benedict (March 21)
11. Ex-Hoepli: Assumption of the Virgin in an Initial E ("Exaltata est sancta Dei genetrix" [The holy Mother of God has been exalted]). First antiphon in first nocturn for Feast of the Assumption of the Virgin (August 15)

The identity of the manuscript’s donor, along with the name of the illuminator, may be ascertained from the inscriptions on the Cini frontispiece with the Last Judgment in an Initial A (fig. 5). At the top of the page, above the miniature, is the following signature: “Dominius Beradus de Teramo fecit hoc opus” (Berardus of Teramo made this). Along the base of the illumination,
in gold letters, is a dedication: "Archipresbyter Jacobus de sancto Flaviano fecit fieri hoc opus pro anima fratri Mathei proppositi Gabiani cuius anima benedicatur" (Archipresbyter Giacomo of San Flaviano had this made for the soul of brother Matteo curate of Gabiano whose soul be blessed). As noted by Pietro Toesca (1930, p. 84), the deceased Brother Matteo is identifiable in the kneeling Benedictine monk shown to the right of the initial A and in the figure lying on a bier in the center of the foliate margin at the bottom of the page; whereas the kneeling prelate on the other side of the initial may represent the donor, Giacomo. Based on the information in the Cini leaf, the provenance of the original volume can be traced to the Benedictine monastery of San Benedetto a Gabiano, near Giulianova in the province of Teramo (Lehmann-Brockhaus 1983, p. 433).

Nothing is known of the supposed illuminator of this lost choir book, Berardo da Teramo, beyond what may be gathered from this signed and only known work. The Cini fragments have been compared in both style and border decoration to the production of other fourteenth-century Abruzzese illuminators, such as Muzio di Francesco di Cambio da Teramo, whose signature appears in a Bible decorated for the Franciscan convent of San Valentino, Abruzzo Citeriore, in the Vatican Library (cod. Vat. Lat. 10220); and Nicolò di Valle Castellana, whose signature, along with the date 1365, is found in a missal in the Biblioteca Capitolare of the Duomo of Atri (MS A2) (Marthiae 1955; Lehmann-Brockhaus, loc. cit.). The roots of these artists’ pictorial idiom have been sought within the context of the stylistic exchanges between Neapolitan and Abruzzese illuminators active at the Angevin court in Naples during the first half of the fourteenth century (Rotili 1972, pp. 19–20).

1. According to Hesbert vol. 2, p. 65, this is a prosula occurring only in southern Italian usage.
2. "Nostre preparationis" should read "novae preparationis." The first "p[r]e" in "preparationis" has been partially erased but not corrected.
3. This is generally interpreted as "Bernardus," though it could also be read as "Bernardus."
4. For this monastery, see Cottineau 1939.

Pacino di Bonaguida
Florentine, active first half of the fourteenth century

Saint Paul in an Initial D
Circa 1335–40
Leaf from a gradual
Cambridge, The Houghton Library, Harvard University, 1943-1868

Tempora and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 21 1/4 x 15 in. (53.5 x 38 cm).
Stave: 3.2 cm

Recto: [rubr.] In conversione si[an]sic[s]i pauli ap(a)n[i]/ Dyo ch[ol] si
modulantes/sint sonori nuntiantes verba sapientie. Omnes/
quidem sollemnicient/ cantent idem corecent s[i]. Verso: cut deæ
hodie. Puesdo/ saules est conversus. doc[tor] paulus est reversus/ ut
ovis ad victimam./ Vulpes ta[m] quan sanson/ capit. Sanetos
qua[m] quam

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, D.9 (as late 14th century, written at Bologna)
This leaf is one of three related fragments from an unidentified Dominican gradual. The initial D illustrates the sequence sung at the mass for the Feast of the Conversion of Saint Paul (January 25). Two other leaves, identical in style and border decoration to the present one, are in the Amati Collection, London (Offner/Boskovits 1987, p. 564, Add. Pl. va–b). They show, respectively, Saint Helena Adoring the Cross in an Initial R and Constantine the Great Adoring the Cross in an Initial L, illustrating two different sequences sung at the mass for the Feast of the Holy Cross. Like the Lehman page, these leaves include the figure of a Dominican nun kneeling in prayer in the border outside the illuminated letter, suggesting a probable provenance from a Dominican convent.

The Amati fragments, first attributed by Federico Zeri and Filippo Todini (in litteris) to the workshop of Pacino di Bonaguida, were most recently published among the artist’s autograph production by Miklós Boskovits (Offner/Boskovits 1987). A slightly younger contemporary of Giotto whose activity is documented between 1303 and 1330, Pacino di Bonaguida was the most important and prolific illuminator active in Florence during the first half of the fourteenth century. His artistic personality was first reconstructed eighty years ago by Richard Offner (1922) on the basis of a single signed altarpiece in the Galleria dell’Accademia, Florence (inv. no. 8668). Around this work Offner grouped a significant number of panel paintings and, in subsequent studies, a large body of illuminations that attest to the artist’s virtual monopoly over the production of manuscripts in Florence during the first four decades of the fourteenth century (Offner 1956; Offner/Boskovits 1987).

While Offner’s attributions have generally been accepted by scholars, the various interpretations of the fragmentary date painted below Pacino’s signature in the Accademia Altarpiece, ranging from 1312 to 1341, have resulted in a lack of consensus regarding the relative chronology of his production and his stylistic development. According to Boskovits, the Amati leaves should be placed close to the beginning of the artist’s career, as early as 1320. Todini, on the other hand (cited in Offner/Boskovits 1987, p. 564, n. 1), proposed a later dating between 1320 and 1330, contemporary with a closely related leaf formerly in the Bruscoli Collection, Florence (Offner 1956, p. 194, pl. lxi). The ex-Bruscoli page has since been associated with the famous Laudario di Sant’Agne, one of Pacino’s most prestigious commissions, convincingly dated by Laurence Kanter to about 1340, toward the end of the artist’s career (Kanter 1994, pp. 45, 62; Ziino and Zamei 1999, pp. 485–505; and see following entry). Closer in style and border decoration to the Amati and Lehman fragments, however, are Pacino’s illuminations in a series of choir books for the Collegiata of Santa Maria all’Impruneta, datable to slightly earlier than the Laudario, between 1335 and 1340 (Offner 1956, pp. 199–211; Kanter 1994; Labriola 1995, p. 4).

Pacino di Bonaguida

21a

The Ascension

Circa 1340

Leaf from a Laudario

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 17 1/2 x 12 1/2 in. (44.4 x 31.8 cm). Illumination: 10 3/4 x 8 3/4 in. (26.3 x 20.9 cm). Stave: 2.7 cm

Recto: Laudate la surrec[tione]. Verso not visible (leaf glued on cardboard)


Literature: Offner/Boskovits 1987, pp. 206–8, pls. lxxvi–lxxvii (with previous bibliography, as shop of Pacino di Bonaguida); Boehm 1994, pp. 62, 70, 48 (as Pacino di Bonaguida); Ziino and Zamei 1999, p. 498 n. 39 (as Pacino di Bonaguida)
The Martyrdom of Saint Bartholomew

Circa 1340

Leaf from a laudario

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 18 1/2 × 13 3/4 in. (47 × 35 cm). Illumination: 7 × 8 1/4 in. (17.8 × 20.6 cm). Stave: 2.7 cm


On recto, in the center top margin, in red and blue ink: cix

PROVENANCE: M. and Mme Avenant Du Plessis (?); M. Mori, Paris, 1924

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, D.22 (as ca. 1350, probably written at Bologna); Offner 1936, pp. 226–27, pl. LXV (as Pacino di Bonaguida and workshop); Nordenfalk et al. 1975, p. 24, n. 9 (as workshop of Pacino di Bonaguida); Boskovits 1984, p. 52, n. 179 (as Pacino di Bonaguida); Offner/Boskovits 1987, p. 71 (as Pacino di Bonaguida); Boehm 1994, pp. 62, 77, 4k (as Pacino di Bonaguida); Ziino and Zamei 1999, p. 499, n. 44 (as Pacino di Bonaguida)

These two leaves are part of a group of twenty-three fragments, divided among various European and American collections, that were excised from a laudario, a book of hymns sung in Italian by the lay members of a confraternity. The first Lehman folio, with the Ascension, illustrates the opening words of the hymn for the Feast of the Ascension: “Laudate la surrectione” (Praise the Resurrection). The second folio, with the Playing and Decapitation of Saint Bartholomew, illustrates the hymn for the Feast of Saint Bartholomew (August 24): “Apostolo beato da gesu cristo amato. Bartholomeo te laudiam” (Blessed apostle beloved of Jesus Christ, Bartholomew, you we praise). In the left border medallions are the Burial of Saint Bartholomew and Saint Bartholomew Preaching to a Crowd.

Based on the inclusion of two Carmelite saints in a fragment in the National Gallery of Art, Washington (1950.1.8) and on the elaborate decoration of a leaf with Saint Agnes Enthroned in the British Library, London (Add. ms 18196), this laudario has been traced to the Compagnia di Sant’Agnese in Santa Maria del Carmine, Florence, a lay religious society founded in 1248 (Boehm 1994, pp. 59–60, with previous bibliography). Members of this confraternity are shown kneeling in prayer in the border medallion below the Lehman Ascension and are also included in the borders of other leaves from the same series.

Following upon Richard Offner’s initial study of several of these fragments, all but five of the twenty-three illuminations thus far associated with the Laudario di Sant’Agnese have been attributed to Pacino di Bonaguida. The remainder have been assigned to the Master of the Dominican Effigies, another dominant personality in Florentine illumination during this period, who collaborated with Pacino on several other commissions (Boskovits 1984, pp. 52–53, n. 179; Boehm 1994, pp. 58–80).

Possibly Pacino’s last major endeavor, the Laudario miniatures have been dated by Laurence Kanter (1994, pp. 44–45) to about 1340, in close proximity to the artist’s signed altarpiece in the Galleria dell’Accademia, Florence. While reflecting an awareness of Giotto’s motifs and figured types, these works betray, in their brilliant coloristic effects, simplicity of design, and focus on the essential elements of the action, the artist’s enduring allegiance to thirteenth-century narrative models. The result is an immediately accessible, “pictographic” style eminently suited to the demands of book illustration.
Apostolo beato Iesu

Christo amato. Bartholomeo

Te laudum dicere.
Master of the Dominican Effigies
Florentine, active second quarter of the fourteenth century

August 29. The miniature may be attributed to the anonymous fourteenth-century Florentine illuminator known as the Master of the Dominican Effigies. Named for a panel showing Christ and the Virgin Enthroned with seventeen Dominican saints and blessed (Archivio di Santa Maria Novella, Florence), this artist was the principal miniatist of the generation immediately following Pacino di Bonaguida (Offner 1930; 1957; Offner/Boskovits 1987).

A frequent collaborator of Pacino, the Master of the Dominican Effigies was responsible for five of the dispersed miniatures from the laudario for the Compagnia di Sant’Agnese (see cat. nos. 21a–b), a commission that he may have inherited after the older master’s death around 1340 (Kanter 1994, pp. 56–80). In contrast to Pacino’s simple, vernacular approach to storytelling, the miniatures by the Master of the Dominican Effigies are distinguished by a meticulous execution, a richer palette, and a deeper concern for anecdotal details that result in a greater decorative effect. The roots of the master’s idiom have been traced to the works of some of Pacino’s contemporaries, such as Lippo di Benivieni and the Master of San Martino alla Palma, in whose workshops, rather than Pacino’s, he may have been apprenticed.

The artist’s masterpiece, and one of his earliest attributed works, is the group of extraordinary illustrations in a manuscript by Domenico Lenzi known as the Biaadiolo (Biblioteca Laurenziana, Florence, cod. Tempiano 3), datable on internal evidence to about 1335. Formerly assigned by Richard Offner to a separate artist, these illuminations, together with another group of manuscripts and paintings, including the Glorification of Saint Thomas Aquinas in the Robert Lehman Collection (acc. no. 1975.1.99), have since been recognized as representing an early stage in the master’s career, preceding the Dominican Effigies panel (Boskovits 1984, pp. 55–56; Kanter 1994, pp. 56–57, 80–83). Executed shortly after the Biaadiolo illuminations are other secular commissions, including the miniatures in a copy of the Divine Comedy in the Biblioteca Trivulziana, Milan, dated 1337, and those in a book of statutes of the Confraternity of Saint Onofrio in the Horne Museum, Florence, dated 1338 (Boskovits 1995, pp. 381–82, n. 5). The artist’s last dated painting is the polyptych of 1345 in the Courtauld Institute

22

Saint John the Baptist in an Initial P
Circa 1335–40
Leaf from a gradual
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 43.12

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 20 3/8 × 13 3/8 in. (51.1 × 33.9 cm). Stave: 3.2 cm

Recto: Precursorum summi regis et preconem nove legis celebreat ecclesia. In hac luce tu[m]/ festiva gaude mater et vo[tiva] deprome[ntum]/ En baptista sanctitatis decus

PROVENANCE: Gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, d.9 (as late 14th century, written at Bologna)

This leaf, excised from an unidentified gradual, illustrates the sequence sung at the mass for the Feast of the Decollation of Saint John the Baptist ("Precursorum summi regis" [The precursor of the highest King]) on
This leaf was excised from an unidentified antiphonary, possibly intended for Dominican use. Although the initial G usually begins the vespers antiphon ("Gaude celum" [Let heaven rejoice]) for the Feast of Saint Elizabeth of Hungary, a Franciscan tertiary, the Dominican habit of the crowned female saint inside the initial, as well as the rubric ("In festo beate helisabeth" [On the Feast of the Blessed Elizabeth]), suggests that the text is here used to celebrate the feast of the Blessed Elizabeth of Hungary, daughter of Stephen V, who was educated in a Dominican convent, married a noble Moravian in 1287, and after his death retired to Naples, where she died in 1320.2

The miniature may be attributed to the Master of the Dominican Effigies and dated to the same period as the Oberlin fragment (cat. no. 22).

2. Edith Pásztor, in Bibliotheca Sanctorum. . . . The reference to a "matron" in the text on the verso excludes the other possibility, that this might be the the Blessed Elizabeth of Hungary, daughter of King Andrew III, who entered a Dominican convent at the age of thirteen and died in 1318.

Master of the Dominican Effigies

23

The Blessed Elizabeth of Hungary in an Initial G

Circa 1335–40
Leaf from an antiphonary
Cambridge, The Houghton Library, Harvard University, 1943.1866

Tempora and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 21 1/4 x 15 3/4 in. (53.5 x 39 cm). Stave: 3.3 cm

Recto: hec discrimina intremus per li/mina claritatis. Amen/[rubr.]

PROVENANCE: Leonardin, Paris; French & Co., New York; Gift of Robert Lehman to the Fogg Art Museum, Harvard University, 1943
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, D.18 (as ca. 1400, probably written at Bologna)
Maestro Daddesco
Florentine, active circa 1320–40

PROVENANCE: Gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, d.28a (as 15th century, written in Italy)

This initial M, excised from an unidentified gradual, illustrates the sequence (“Monti sion dat viorem ros Hermon” [The dew of Hermon makes green the mountains of Zion]) sung at the mass for the Feast of Saint Mary Magdalen (July 22).

Intertwined with the foliate border in the lower left corner is the figure of Saint Mary Magdalen emerging from a rocky landscape, representing her home in the wilderness, to receive communion from an angel.

This miniature, as well as the letter and border decoration, reflects the style of the anonymous painter and illuminator known as Maestro Daddesco. An occasional collaborator of Pacino di Bonaguida and the Master of the Dominican Effigies, the Maestro Daddesco is generally recognized as another major figure in Florentine manuscript painting of the first half of the fourteenth century, although his artistic personality and the parameters of his activity remain hard to define. Mario Salmi (1952, pp. 8–23; 1954, pp. 25–26), who first singled out and named this artist, identified him as a close follower of Bernardo Daddi (d. 1348) and dated his activity to the second third of the fourteenth century. More recent scholarship is divided between those who agree with Salmi’s basic outline of the master’s career (Guidotti 1979; Kantor 1994, pp. 8–9, 106–7) and others who view the artist as a contemporary, if not a precursor, of Bernardo Daddi, who may have been active as early as the second decade of the fourteenth century (Chelazzi Dini 1979, pp. 14–35; Boskovits 1984, pp. 44–48; Boskovits 1995, pp. 382–83, n. 7).

The Oberlin leaf is a typical example of the Maestro Daddesco’s generally uniform production, characterized by gracefully poised figural types with minutely observed features and slender, insubstantial bodies. Specific comparisons for the border decoration and painted initial may be found in a series of graduals from the Badia a Settimo, Florence (now Santa Croce in Gerusalemme, Rome, cor. A, B, C, D), key works in reconstructing the Maestro Daddesco’s activity.


24
Initial M and Communion of Mary Magdalen
Leaf from a gradual
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 43-9

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 21 1/4 × 13 3/4 in. (54 × 38.8 cm). Stave: 3.5 cm

Recto: pravitatis v[est]re solvat po/testatis efficax sententia./ Amen./Monti sion dat viorem[m]/ ros hermon et vior flor[m]/ secund[m] in gratia. Ad. Verso: honorem magdalene roris huius ymbre plene
Maestro Daddesco (?)

This cutting, previously attributed to the Sienese school, the Florentine school, and Pacino di Bonaguida, was first identified as a work of the Maestro Daddesco by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (Robert Lehman Collection files). Although subsequently accepted by Barbara Boehm (1994, pp. 108–9) and Miklós Boskovits (1995, p. 382, n. 7), the attribution is not without problems and was recently questioned by the present author in the 1997 catalogue of illuminations in the Robert Lehman Collection. While the foliate border and dark blue background with white pen work recall the Maestro Daddesco’s oeuvre, both the figure style and execution of the illumination mark a significant departure from the artist’s essentially formulaic idiom, as represented by the miniatures in the Badia a Settimo choir books. In contrast to the latter, the Lehman cutting reflects a decidedly more archaic vocabulary related to the style of an older generation of painters, such as the Master of Saint Cecilia.

A suggested date of about 1310 to 1315 for the Lehman illumination (Levi D’Ancona and Palladino 1997) may not necessarily preclude, however, an association with the Maestro Daddesco, if one accepts an earlier chronology for his activity. Most recently, Boskovits (1984, 1995) suggested placing the beginnings of the artist’s career around 1310, following an artistic formation in the circle of the Master of Saint Cecilia.

Master of San Giovanni Fuorcivitas

Tuscan, active second quarter of the fourteenth century

26

Resurrection and the Three Marys at the Tomb in an Initial A

Leaf from an antiphonary

New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.1

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 3/8 × 15 1/8 in. (56.4 × 39.8 cm). Stave: 3.5 cm

Recto: Surrwnt Domino de sepulcro alleluia. [rubr.] &. Qui pro nobis perpendit in ligno, alleluia. Verso: Angelus domini/ descendit de celo et ac
This leaf is part of a group of nine cuttings, uniform in style, palette, and border decoration, that were probably excised from two antiphonary volumes of a single commission. Five other fragments, three of which are full leaves identical in size and stave height to the present folio, are divided among the Cleveland Museum of Art, the Bernard Breslauer Collection, New York, the Free Library, Philadelphia, and a private collection. Together with the Yale/ex-Lehman page, they were probably included in a temporal volume in the following liturgical sequence:

1. Cleveland 39.677: Christ in Majesty in an Initial A ("Aspiciens a longe" [Long had I been watching]). First response in first nocturn for first Sunday of Advent
2. Breslauer: Saint John the Baptist Preaching in an Initial E ("Ecce agnus Dei" [Behold the Lamb of God]). First response in first nocturn for Octave of Christmas
3. Free Library m74.2: David Kneeling before Christ in an Initial D ("Domine ne in ira tua argus me" [O Lord, reprove me not in thy anger]). First response at matins for first Sunday after Epiphany
4. Free Library m74.3: Christ Appearing to Abraham in an Initial L ("Locutus est Dominus ab Abram" [The Lord spoke to Abraham]). First response at matins for Inquinasima Sunday
5. Private collection (Les Enluminures 1996, cat. 5, no. 1): Christ Healing the Blind in an Initial A ("Attendite popule meus" [Hearken my people]). Third response at matins for Wednesday of fourth Week of Lent (?)

The remaining three fragments from the same series include a leaf formerly in the Eric Korner Collection (Sotheby’s, London, June 20, 1995, lot 25) and two cuttings in the Longari Collection, Milan, and the Wallraf-Richartz Museum, Cologne. These may have been included in a sanctoral volume, as follows:

7. Ex-Korner: Presentation in the Temple in an Initial A ("Adorna thalamum tuum" [Adorn your bridal chamber]). First response in first nocturn for Feast of Purification of the Virgin (February 2)
8. Longari: Martyrdom of Saint Agatha in an Initial D ("Dum torqueretur beata Agatha" [While blessed Agatha was being tortured]). Second response in nocturn for Feast of Saint Agatha (February 5)
9. Wallraf-Richartz Museum m207: Birth of the Virgin in an Initial S ("Sancta Dei Genetrix" [Holy Mother of God]). First response at matins for Feast of Birth of the Virgin (September 8)

The Breslauer, Cleveland, and Philadelphia miniatures were first linked to a single volume by William M. Voelkle and Roger S. Wieck (1992), who attributed them to the same hand as the Yale leaf, variously labeled as Pisan, Florentine, or Senesian with Umbrian influences (Seymour 1970). Subsequently, Ada Labriola (1995) added the ex-Korner, Longari, and Cologne cuttings to this group, and although she related the Yale and Cleveland pages to a different series, she proposed a convincing attribution for all eight fragments to the anonymous author of the illuminations in an antiphonary for the Church of San Giovanni Fuorcivitas, Pistoia (Archivio Capitolare del Duomo, 488/100). This artist, whom Labriola named “Master of the Antiphonary of San Giovanni Fuorcivitas,” had previously been recognized by Richard Offner (1956, p. 201) as the same illuminator who collaborated with the Florentine painters Pacino di Bonaguida and the Master of the Dominican Effigies in the decoration of a volume (cod. v11) of an important antiphonary series for the Basilica of Santa Maria all’Impruneta, near Florence, datable to between 1335 and 1340.

As demonstrated by the various past attributions of the Yale leaf, the cultural components of this master’s idiom have evaded a precise definition. Labriola has highlighted the artist’s debt to contemporary Pisan illumination and the work of the Pisan painter Buffalmacco, while at the same time acknowledging the
impact of Pacino’s work in the Impruneta choir books. Notwithstanding a possible Pisan origin, a specifically Florentine context in which to view the master’s activity is provided by the evidence of his collaboration with Pacino in at least one other Florentine commission beyond the Impruneta illuminations. The same hand was also responsible, in fact, for the miniatures in a little-studied gradual in the Museo Civico, Montepulciano (cor. h.2), possibly part of a set of choir books decorated by Pacino and the Maestro Daddesco for the Augustinian church of Santo Stefano al Ponte in Florence.\footnote{While nothing is known of the original provenance of the Yale cutting and its sister leaves, the inclusion of a group of singing monks dressed in brown habits at the bottom of the Cleveland page suggests a Franciscan commission.}

1. The unusual subject matter of the initial makes it difficult to ascertain what text it might have illustrated. The present suggestion is based on the fact that the response “Attendite” occurs after the reading of the Gospel of John (9:1–38), referring to the Healing of the Blind Man.

2. An initial A with the Presentation in the Temple in the former Mortimer Brandt Collection, also attributed to the same hand by Labriola (1995, p. 16, n. 28), is instead by a distinct, probably Pisan, illuminator. Not included in Labriola’s list, on the other hand, is the private collection fragment with the Healing of the Blind Man, previously published as “Workshop of Pacino di Bonaguida” (Les Enluminures 1996, cat. no. 5, no. 1, pp. 16–17).

3. The decoration of this gradual was attributed to the Florentine school by Mario Salmi (1993, p. 208, no. 316). One of its miniatures was reproduced by Elly Cassee (1980, fig. 97) and identified as fourteenth-century Bolognese/Sienese. It is not included among the Montepulciano volumes listed in Bosković 1984, which focuses only on the illuminations by Pacino and the Maestro Daddesco.

**Duccio di Buoninsega**

Sienese, documented 1278–d. 1318

**27**

*Virgin and Child and God the Father Blessing in an Initial B*

Leaf from an antiphonary

Circa 1285–90

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 14 1/2 × 10 3/8 in. (36.7 × 27 cm). Initial: 3 3/4 × 2 3/4 in. (8.7 × 6.7 cm). Stave: 2.3–2.4 cm

Recto: [rubrics] Plasmator ho[m] ni/ deus. qui cu[n]cta so/lus ordina[n]/ humu[m]/ iubes producere reponsa/ et fere gen[us]…

Verso: Benedictus. seue/ Alleluia. seue/ Bene/dictus u[us]/ d[omi]/ n[u]/ deus/ m[ea]/ qui/ doct/ manus me/as ad preliu[m]; et di/gitos meos ad bellum…

Leaf cut along right edge. On verso, in left margin (slightly above center), in red ink: [sa]bbi[a]t

**PROVENANCE:** Maggs Brothers, London, 1924

**LITERATURE:** De Ricci 1937, p. 1704, D.19 (as probably written at Siena, early 14th century)

This leaf was possibly the frontispiece of an antiphonary. The initial B introduces the antiphon at vespers (“Benedictus Dominus Deus meus” [Blessed be the Lord, my God]) for the Saturday before the first Sunday of Advent, beginning the temporal cycle. The text is illustrated by an exceptionally fine miniature of the *Virgin and Child*, in the lower half of the initial, and of *God the Father Blessing*, in the upper half. Both representations are remarkable for the subtle modeling of the figures, the delicacy and expressiveness of their gestures, and their articulation in depth, despite the small scale and the constraints of the initial.

The main cultural component of the Lehman folio was correctly identified by De Ricci, who listed it as probably early-fourteenth-century Sienese. Decorative elements in the foliate border and the design of the initial do, in fact, find precedents in Sienese manuscript production, in particular as represented by the late-thirteenth-century series of choir books for Siena Cathedral (e.g., Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena, MS 14 b). None of these works, however, approach the sensitive handling or the spatial and formal sophistication
Aulema seuoae. Enedict dhs oes mis quod manus me as adprehii et di
of the Lehman miniature, the most convincing comparisons for which are not found in any examples of Sienese illumination but in monumental painting, as represented by the oeuvre of Duccio di Buoninsegna.

The father of the Sienese school of painting, Duccio was one of the leading figures, along with Cimabue and Giotto, in the history of early Italian art. He transformed Byzantine iconographic and decorative formulas, through spatial and volumetric effects derived from his predecessor Cimabue, into a refined, incipiently modern pictorial idiom that influenced generations of local artists. Among Duccio’s production, it is his early paintings, beginning with the Rucellai Madonna in the Uffizi, Florence, datable to 1285, and the slightly later Madonna dei Francescani in the Pinacoteca Nazionale, Siena (fig. 6), that are brought to mind by the Lehman leaf. Particularly relevant is the close relationship in conception and execution of the Lehman miniature to the precisely executed, small panel of the Madonna dei Francescani or to the tondos with busts of saints painted on the frame of the Rucellai Madonna (fig. 7), which have frequently been cited as evidence of Duccio’s presumed but unrecorded activity as a miniaturist (Previtali 1982, pp. 13–14; Santi, 1984, pp. 17–19).

The early date of the Lehman leaf may be confirmed by iconographic details in the depiction of the Virgin and Child. The gesture of the Christ child extending his hand to touch the hood of his mother’s mantle first appears in Duccio’s art in the Crevole Madonna (Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena), a painting viewed by current scholarship as Duccio’s earliest effort. In this panel, however, the child’s legs are crossed, whereas in the Lehman miniature their position is comparable to that in the Rucellai Madonna and the Madonna dei Francescani. More clearly related to the iconography of the Lehman Virgin and Child is that of a panel by Duccio formerly in the Stoclet Collection, Brussels (now in a private collection), where the Christ child is shown in the same pose, supported in the Virgin’s arms, and reaching for her veil. This painting has generally been viewed as postdating the Rucellai Madonna and the Madonna dei Francescani and as introducing a significant iconographic change in the substitution of the Virgin’s red headdress (the archaic, Byzantine-derived maphorion) with a white veil (Ragonieri 1989, p. 40). The presence of the traditional red headdress on the Lehman Virgin, despite its overall similarities to the Stoclet Madonna, would therefore appear to confirm the earlier date of this miniature, and its importance as marking the first step in Duccio’s development of this particular iconographic theme.

![Fig. 6 Duccio di Buoninsegna, Madonna dei Francescani, Pinacoteca Nazionale, Siena, no. 20](image1)

![Fig. 7 Duccio di Buoninsegna, Rucellai Madonna. Detail of Frame: Saint Zenobius, Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence](image2)
Master of Sant’Eugenio
Sienese, active second quarter of the fourteenth century

28

Adoration of the Cross in an Initial N
Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 23 3/8 x 16 3/4 in. (60.2 x 42.5 cm). Initial: 6 7/8 x 3 4/5 in. (17.3 x 13.3 cm). Stave: 4 7/8 cm


On recto, in center of top margin, in red ink: . XXXIII

Provenance: John F. Murray, Florence, 1924
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1707, b.17 (as ca. 1400, probably written at Siena)

The initial N illustrates the introit to the mass “Nos autem gloriari oportet” (But it is fitting that we should glory) for the Feast of the Invention of the Holy Cross (May 3). This leaf is one of nine surviving fragments from a hitherto unidentified gradual volume or series. Three other leaves, identical to the Lehman folio in style, measurement, stave height, and numeration, are in the Cini Collection, Venice; an initial S with the Birth of the Virgin (2065); an initial I with Saint Augustine (2066); and an initial S with the Pentecost (2067). To these may be added: an initial D with Christ Appearing to the Apostles in the Musée des Beaux-Arts, Bayonne; an initial V with the Annunciation in the Musée du Louvre, Paris (Cabinet des Dessins, inv. 1313); an initial B with Saint Michael Slaying the Dragon formerly in the Kenneth Clark Collection; a leaf with the Burial of Saint Augustine in an Initial R in the Bibliothèque Publique et Universitaire, Geneva; and a leaf with the Apostles Adoring the Virgin in an Initial R in the Free Library, Philadelphia (M74:1).

The Cini, Paris, and Bayonne fragments, previously attributed to Lippo Vanni, were first grouped together as part of the same series by Ferdinando Bologna (1977), who associated them with the fourteenth-century Sienese miniatures pasted into a later antiphonary from the Benedictine abbey of Sant’Eugenio, Siena, now in the Badia di Cava dei Tirreni, near Naples (Biblioteca della Badia, Antifonario Sen. b). The Cava dei Tirreni miniatures were identified by Bologna as the product of two distinct hands to which he assigned the names “First” and “Second” Master of Sant’Eugenio. Each artist purportedly represented a different phase in the evolution of Sienese manuscript illumination from about 1330 to 1340, in the wake of Pietro Lorenzetti’s production and before the advent of Niccolò di Ser Sozzo (cat. no. 29) and Lippo Vanni. According to Bologna, the “Second” Master of Sant’Eugenio was the author of the Cini, Paris, and Bayonne miniatures, as well as of the illuminations in two antiphonary volumes in the Museo d’Arte Sacra, San Gimignano, near Siena, that were otherwise attributed by Cristina De Benedictis (1976, pp. 87–95) to the Sienese painter Niccolò di Segna.

Bologna’s distinction between a “First” and “Second” Master of Sant’Eugenio was accepted by subsequent scholars, from Mario Rotili (1978, pp. 89–94) to Giulietta Chelazzi Dini (1982, pp. 222–28). The latter accepted the Cini–Paris–Bayonne grouping as the work of the “Second Master,” while publishing the ex–Kenneth Clark Saint Michael previously attributed to a follower of Niccolò di Ser Sozzo, as a work of the “First Master.”

Most recently, Gaudenz Freuler (1991, pp. 39–40) added the Geneva leaf to the Cini–Paris–Bayonne fragments and further enlarged the corpus of the “Second” Master of Sant’Eugenio by attributing to the same hand a 1329 biccherna cover in the Kunstgewerbemuseum, Berlin (no. K9222). At the same time Freuler dismissed Bologna’s proposal that these fragments, all excised from a gradual, be associated with the same series as the antiphonary cuttings in Cava dei Tirreni (with which, in fact, they do not correspond in stave height). Based on the subject of the Geneva miniature, he suggested a more convincing provenance from one of the two major Augustinian convents in Siena, Sant’Agostino or San Leonardo al Lago.

While the Cava dei Tirreni miniatures, the fragments listed above, and the San Gimignano illuminations clearly constitute a homogeneous group, the distinction still drawn by scholars between a “First” and
“Second” Master of Sant’Eugenio seems artificial. Close scrutiny of the Cava dei Tirreni illuminations reveals a general uniformity in concept, handling, and execution that suggests a single personality involved in this series and in all the works associated with it. The fluidly elongated, insubstantial limbs, oval heads, and darkly shadowed, narrow features that distinguish the execution of the Saint Michael on folio 54 of the Cava dei Tirreni antiphonary, attributed by Bologna and Rotili to the “First Master,” were, for example, viewed as characteristic elements of the works associated with the “Second Master” by Marie-Claude Léonelli (1983, p. 214), who assigned this miniature to the latter. It is in effect impossible to draw a distinction between this Saint Michael and the elegantly poised, standing figure of Christ on folio 107 of the same volume, assigned by Bologna and Rotili to the “Second Master”; or between the ex-Kenneth Clark Saint Michael, given by Chelazzi Dini to the “First Master,” and any of the figures in the Cini or Bayonne fragments, which despite their reduced scale share not only identical formal elements but also the same lively quality and refinement of execution.
The possible attribution of the 1329 *biccherna* cover to the Master of Sant’Eugenio would appear to support his identification as a slightly older contemporary of Lippo Vanni, whose activity is first documented more than a decade later, in 1344. The master's roots among an earlier generation of miniaturists may ultimately account for the more archaic quality that distinguishes his decorative borders in the San Gimignano antiphonaries from those of Lippo Vanni and Niccolò di Ser Sozzo in other volumes of the same series. Freuler's suggestion (*loc. cit.*) that the often noted stylistic similarities between the artist's production and that of Lippo Vanni be explained in terms of a master-pupil relationship merits further consideration.\(^2\)

1. The only one of the fragments related by Bologna to the Cava dei Tirreni miniatures that may have been excised from the same volume is the initial S with a haloed nun in the Cini Collection (2058), which corresponds to the Cava dei Tirreni group in both measurement and stave height (2.9 cm).

2. A tentative proposal that the master's activity in San Gimignano may actually have preceded that of Lippo Vanni and Niccolò di Ser Sozzo in different volumes of the same series is supported by indications that the books were written in at least three different moments in time. The two antiphonary volumes by the Master of Sant’Eugenio (LVIII 2; LVIII 3), identical in measurement and stave height, contain the sanctorale (the Commons and Proper of the saints), while the three volumes by Lippo Vanni (cod. LVIII 5; LVIII 7; LVIII 6) constitute a temporale complete in three parts. Two of the three volumes of the temporale share the same measurement and stave height with the sanctorale and were presumably written at the same time. The third and final volume of the temporale employs a different stave height and was clearly written later. Since Lippo Vanni's hand appears consistent throughout these three books, it seems likely that they were all decorated at the later date.

A third phase in the writing of these books must be represented by the two gradual volumes by Niccolò di Ser Sozzo, which are completely different from the antiphonaries in both stave height and pagination.

3. More recent efforts to discern the master's hand, next to that of a young Lippo Vanni, in an antiphonary in the Badia a Settimo, Florence (De Benedictis 1994, pp. 23–25), fail, however, to convince. The style of the *Annunciation* on folio 30r, one of three illuminations given by the author to the supposed "Second" Master of Sant'Eugenio, has little in common with that of the Louvre *Annunciation*, for example, and appears more closely related to the workshop of Niccolò di Ser Sozzo.

---

**Niccolò di Ser Sozzo**

Sienese, documented 1348–d. 1363

---

29

**Ascension in an Initial V**

Circa 1342–50

Cutting from an antiphonary


Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 6 1/4 x 6 3/4 in. (15.4 x 16 cm). Initial: 4 3/4 x 3 1/8 in. (10.8 x 9.8 cm). Stave: 2.9 cm

Recto: Viri/ lile. Verso: illum: ecce duo/ xta illos i[n]vesti

**PROVENANCE:** Sale, Maggs Brothers, London, 1921, lot 92; Leo S. Olschki, Florence, 1924

**LITERATURE:** Levi D’Ancona and Palladino 1997, no. 15, pp. 123–27, pl. 15 (as Niccolò di Ser Sozzo, ca. 1342/43–50, with previous bibliography); Palladino 1997b, p. 17, pl. 2 (as Niccolò di Ser Sozzo, ca. 1342–50)

This miniature, excised from an unidentified antiphonary, illustrates the first antiphon at lauds for the Feast of the Ascension: “Viri [ga]lile[i quid aspicitis in caelum?]” (Men of Galilee, why do you stand looking
up to heaven?). On the reverse of the cutting is a fragment of the second antiphon at lauds for the same feast: “[Cumque intuerentur in caelum euntem illum, ecce duo [viri astiterunt in]xta illos investi[bus albis]” (And while they were gazing up to heaven as he went, behold two men stood by them in white garments). Inside the initial V is the Virgin flanked by Saint Peter on the left and an unidentified apostle on the right. Hovering above them is the figure of the Blessing Redeemer.

The illumination is a typical example of the production of the fourteenth-century Sienese painter and illuminator Niccolò di Ser Suzzo, to whom it was first attributed by Sylvie Béguin (1957, no. 179, pp. 119–20). The career of this artist, who is first documented in 1348, has been reconstructed primarily on the basis of his signature below a large illumination of the Assumption of the Virgin inserted at an unknown date in the so-called Calefio dell’Assunta, a register of Sienese public documents transcribed between 1334 and 1336, now in the Archivio di Stato, Siena. On the basis of this work, considered one of the masterpieces of early Sienese painting, Niccolò has been identified as the author of a significant body of manuscript illuminations, in addition to several panel paintings, that attests to his role as one of the preeminent miniaturists in Siena from about the fifth decade of the fourteenth century to his premature death in 1363.

The overriding component in Niccolò’s generally homogeneous miniature production, beginning with the Calefio Assumption, is a clear dependence on the work of Pietro Lorenzetti around 1340–42. Despite efforts to discern an early phase of the artist’s career in the previous decade (De Benedictis 1979, p. 11; Chelazzi Dini: 1982, pp. 236–38), the date 1342 has recently been proposed as a terminus post quem for Niccolò’s activity as both painter and illuminator, following a possible apprenticeship in the Lorenzetti workshop (Levi D’Ancona and Palladino 1997a, pp. 122–23; Palladino 1997b, pp. 13–20, with previous bibliography).

Closely related to the Lehman cutting are Niccolò’s illuminations in two antiphonaries in the Biblioteca Comunale degli Intronati, Siena (cod. 11.8–9), where we find a slightly reduced version of the same composition, inserted in an initial P instead of a V but identical in concept and execution. Also comparable in style are a series of antiphony cuttings in Berlin (Kupferstich-

---

1. The purchase is recorded in a receipt from Olchcki dated October 17, 1924, in the Robert Lehman Collection archives. The date was erroneously reported as 1923 in Levi D’Ancona and Palladino 1997, p. 123.

---

**Master of the Codex Rossiano**

Sienese, active circa 1380–1400

**30**

*The Trinity in an Initial B*

1387 (?)

Cutting from a gradual


Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 10 1/2 × 10 1/16 in. (26.8 × 25.5 cm). Initial: 10 × 9 3/4 in. (25.4 × 24.3 cm). Stave: 3 6 cm

Verso: ce[m] eius ausis al/ sed nescis unde/ aut quo va

**Provenance:** A. S. Drey, Munich, 1924

**Literature:** Palladino 1997a, cat. 16, pp. 128–36 (as Master of the Codex Rossiano, 1387[?]) with previous bibliography; Levi D’Ancona 2000, pp. 149–61 (as Frate Gregorio da Montalcino, 1384–85)

The initial B marks the beginning of the introit to the mass for Trinity Sunday (“Benedicta sit sancta Trinitas” [Blessed be the Holy Trinity]). Inside the exuberantly foliated initial are the three figures of the Trinity seated on a throne of red saranph; below them are ten seated angels. In the two upper corners of the square, gold background are two bust-length prophets gesturing toward the Trinity; partially visible despite losses of pigment in the lower left corner is a bust-length white-clad, Olivetan monk.

This cutting is one of eleven surviving fragments from a lost gradual first identified by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (Robert Lehman Collection files) as possibly related to a commission of 1387 for the Olivetan monastery of San Miniato al Monte, Florence. Nine other fragments from the same volume are pasted in a scrapbook of cuttings,
known as Codex Rossiano 1192, in the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Rome (192.1, 3–10), while a tenth leaf is in the Bernard Breslauer Collection, New York (Kanter 1994, pp. 128–36; Palladino 1997a).

As pointed out by Laurence Kanter (loc. cit.), three different artists were responsible for the decoration of this gradual. The Sienese illuminator Don Simone Camaldolese, who is named in the 1387 payment from San Miniato al Monte, was responsible for the foliated borders in all of the initials and for one of the Vatican miniatures. An anonymous assistant of Don Simone executed three other Vatican miniatures and the leaf with the Adoration of the Magi in the Breslauer Collection, after which he was named by Kanter (loc. cit.) “Master of the Breslauer Epiphany.” A second anonymous illuminator was responsible for the Lehman initial and for the remaining five Vatican miniatures; this artist was christened by Miklós Boskovits (1975, p. 232, n. 120) “Master of the Codex Rossiano.” One of the Vatican cuttings by his hand, which contains fragments of the text begun by the Lehman initial, was originally the bas de page of the same folio.

Variously identified as Florentine, Sienese, or Umbrian, the Master of the Codex Rossiano remains an enigmatic personality in Italian manuscript illumination. His work, as represented by the Lehman and Rossiano illuminations, reflects both Sienese formal and compositional elements and a Florentine decorative vocabulary derived from the school of Santa Maria degli Angeli. As a result he has been viewed either as a Florentine artist trained in Siena (Boskovits 1975) or as a Sienese artist active outside his native city and especially receptive to Florentine and Umbrian influences (Boskovits 1983, pp. 265–67; idem 1995, pp. 379, 384, n. 11).

Most recently, Pia Palladino (1997a), following Kanter (loc. cit.), has highlighted the distinctively Sienese roots of the Rossiano master’s pictorial idiom, pointing specifically to its relationship to Sienese painting after 1350 and the workshop of Bartolomeo Bulgarini. A Sienese context in which to view the artist’s activity, as
well as formation, is suggested by evidence of his collaboration with the Sienese painters Andrea di Bartolo and Bartolo di Fredi on a series of antiphonaries for the Augustinian monastery of Lecceto, outside Siena, at present divided among the Biblioteca Comunale degli Intronati, Siena (cod. III.17), the Biblioteka Jagiellonska, Cracow (I.R. 1855–63), and various other collections (Boskovits 1983; Freuler 1991, p. 83; Boskovits 1995; Palladino 1997a, pp. 133, 135, n. 9). ¹ Efforts to identify the same hand in a choir book from the Abbey of Montemorlino, near Perugia, now in the Archive of Monteoliveto Maggiore, Siena (Boskovits 1983; 1995), are unconvincing (Palladino 1997a, p. 136, n. 13).

¹ All of these works were recently rejected from the master’s corpus by Levi D’Ancona (2000), who identifies the artist as the “Fra Gregorio Murtii de Montalcino” cited in the San Miniato documents in 1384–85. Kanter (1994, p. 213), however, argued persuasively against the possibility of such an identification.

Martino di Bartolomeo
Sienese, documented 1389–d. 1434/35

31
Two Martyr Saints in an Initial P
Circa 1394–95
Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 27 1/2 x 16 1/2 in. (77 x 42 cm). Initial: 11 3/16 x 7 3/4 in. (28 x 18.5 cm). Stave: 4.7–4.8 cm

Verso: Protextisi me/ deus a co[n]ve[n]/tu malignitatum/ alleluya a mul[t]i tine/ dino operantium ini[u]

Leaf cut on all four sides. On verso, in center left border, fragments of original numeration, in red ink: . . . x. In upper left corner, in a later hand, in black ink: . . . 3

PROVENANCE: Bought in Germany, before 1937¹
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1707, c.11 (as late 14th century, probably Florentine)

The initial P, excised from a gradual, illustrates the introit to the mass (“Protextisti me deus” [Thou hast protected me, Lord]) for the Common of One Martyr Saint in Paschaltide. This miniature may be attributed to the painter and illuminator Martino di Bartolomeo, one of the dominant figures in Sienese painting between the last quarter of the fourteenth century and the first quarter of the fifteenth century. Although he is first mentioned in the 1389 registers of the Sienese painters’ guild, the earliest known records of Martino’s activity refer to commissions outside Siena, in Pisa and its surrounding regions, where he appears to have been engaged for some time before returning permanently to his native city in 1405. During the next thirty years he was responsible for several important fresco cycles in the Sienese Duomo and the Palazzo Pubblico, as well as for painted altarpieces and polychrome sculptures, attesting to his prestige as one of the city’s official artists.

The principal evidence for reconstructing Martino’s activity as a miniaturist is the series of illuminations he executed in a five-volume gradual for Lucca Cathedral (Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, cor. nos. 1, 7, 9, 10; Biblioteca Capitolare, cor. no. 8), recently dated to between 1394 and 1395 (Labriola 1998, pp. 208–11). The style of the Lehman cutting, its identical palette, border decoration, and numeration suggest that it was probably excised from one of these volumes, which were rebound in the seventeenth century and deprived of many of their miniatures. More specifically, the text of the Lehman folio implies that it may originally have been included in Corale 1 in Lucca, the last part of the five-volume gradual containing the Commons of the Saints.

Possibly related to another volume in the Lucca series is a hitherto unpublished cutting by Martino in the Art Institute of Chicago (1923.1682), identical to the Lehman and Lucca miniatures in style and border decoration. This illumination, which shows Saint Benedict Distributing His Rule in an Initial O, may have been included in one of the missing sanctoral portions of the gradual covering the Feast of Saint Benedict (March 25).

The Lucca choir books, first attributed to the artist by Luciano Bellosi (1975), are generally considered among Martino’s earliest known production, closely related to but preceding his signed and dated 1398 fresco
cycle in the Church of San Giovanni Battista di Cascina, outside Pisa. These works have been viewed in relation to the production of the Sienese painter Taddeo di Bartolo, in whose workshop Martino was possibly trained, as well as to that of Antonio Veneziano and Spinello Aretino, both of whom were active in Pisa and Lucca.

Aside from the Lucca graduals, the only other evidence of the artist’s activity as an illuminator is provided by the miniatures in a little-known manuscript of the Legend of Saint Agnes in the Biblioteca Comunale degli Intronati, Siena (cod. K.VII.1), tentatively associated with Martino’s name by Giulietta Chelazzi Dini (1982, pp. 338–39) but ignored in the subsequent literature. More closely related to the art of Taddeo di Bartolo than are the Lucca choir books, the Legend of Saint Agnes illuminations may represent the earliest Sienese phase in the artist’s career, preceding his activity in Pisa and Lucca. Possibly part of another commission datable to the same moment as the Lucca graduals is an antiphonary cutting by Martino in the National Gallery of Art, Washington, tentatively identified by Carl Nordenfalk (1975, pp. 47–49) as “Tuscan, around 1400.”

1. Information reported by De Ricci 1937, p. 1707. No confirmation of this purchase has been found in the Robert Lehman Collection files.
Andrea di Bartolo
Sienese, documented 1389–d. 1428

32
Christ Blessing and a Franciscan Monk in an Initial A
Circa 1413–20
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 × 15⅞ in. (55.8 × 39.2 cm). Initial: 6⅞ × 5½ in. (16.8 × 14 cm). Stack: 3.7 cm


&. Deus nostrer/ manifeste veniet. [rubr.] Domi[ca prima de adventu]. &. Verso: Aspsi/ciens a/ longe/ ecce video dei/ potentiam/ venien/rem et nebu

Leaf cut on all four sides. On recto, in upper right corner, in black ink: 3

PROVENANCE: Canessa, Paris, 1923
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, d.18 (as ca. 1400, probably written at Siena)

The initial A, excised from an antiphonary, illustrates the first response at matins (“Aspiens a longe” [Long had I been watching]) for the first Sunday of Advent. Inside the letter a monk in Franciscan habit looks up to the bust-length figure of the Blessing Redeemer, suggesting a Franciscan provenance.

The illumination may be attributed to the Sienese artist Andrea di Bartolo, a contemporary of Martino di Bartolomeo (cat. no. 31). Son of the painter Bartolo di Fredi (doc. 1353–d. 1410), Andrea began his career in his father’s workshop and collaborated with him on several projects during the last decades of the fourteenth century. A significant number of surviving documents record the many commissions received by Andrea in Siena, for panel paintings, painted sculpture, and drawings for stained glass, as well as his important roles in public office until his death in 1428. The artist was also active in Venice and in the last years of his life may actually have resided in the Veneto, where in addition to works on panel he executed some frescoes in the Church of San Francesco, Treviso (Freuler 1987; idem 1992, pp. 486–99).

Andrea’s activity as a manuscript illuminator can be reconstructed on the basis of the miniatures that were first attributed to his hand by Giulietta Chelazzi Dini (1982, pp. 316–26) in four manuscripts preserved in the Biblioteca Comunale degli Intronati, Siena: a codex of the Revelations of Saint Bridget from the Compagnia dei Disciplinati della Madonna di Santa Maria della Scala (cod. iv.25), dated 1399; a Roman missal of unknown provenance (g.111.7); and an antiphonary (cod. h.1.7) and a gradual (h.1.7, g.1.14) from the Augustinian monastery of San Salvatore a Lecceto, outside Siena. The Lehman cutting, however, reflects a later phase in Andrea’s career than any of these works. It is distinguished from them by a precision of execution and elongated figural style, most noticeable in the representation of the Blessing Redeemer, that recall Andrea’s more mature production beginning with the 1413 altarpiece in the Church of the Osservanza, Siena.

The style of the Lehman leaf, its delicate palette, and lively foliate border animated by birds and playful putti closely resemble a series of little-known illuminations recently attributed to Andrea and various anonymous collaborators (Melograni 1995, p. 135; Boldt 1997a, pp. 212–13) in three antiphonary volumes for Franciscan use in the Museum of the Studium Biblicum Franciscanum, Jerusalem (cod. 5[D], 6[K], 7[H]). These books, missing entire leaves as well as painted initials, are all that remain of a multivolume antiphonary set covering the entire liturgical year (Bux 1990, pp. 52–78). Based on an inscription in Antiphonary 5(D) of the set, it may be inferred that the series was donated to the Monastery of Mount Syon by one of the heirs of the English prince John of Gaunt (d. 1399), possibly his son King Henry IV (r. 1399–1413), who may have acquired it in Venice, en route to the Holy Land, or his grandson Henry V (r. 1413–22; Bux 1990, p. 21). Andrea’s involvement in this commission could have resulted from his contacts with the Franciscans in the Veneto.

Among the Jerusalem miniatures, the nearest in quality of execution to the Lehman fragment are those in Codex 5[D], in which Milvia Bollati (loc. cit.) detected the direct participation of Andrea. One of the leaves excised from this antiphonary, covering the period from Advent through Epiphany, is folio 3 (Bux 1990, p. 52), which would have contained the...
frontispiece for the first Sunday of Advent. It is possible to suggest tentatively that this missing page be
identified as the Lehman fragment, which not only corresponds in text and subject matter but also is num-
bered “3” in the upper right corner, in the same location and same Arabic script as on the pages of the
Jerusalem volumes. Identical numbering also occurs on another antiphonary leaf with Christ in the Garden of
Gethsemane in a private collection, convincingly associated by Bollati with the Jerusalem miniatures, though
attributed to a collaborator of Andrea.

1. The latter were decorated by the artist in collaboration with his father and several anonymous illuminators, including the
Master of the Codex Rossiano (cat. no. 30).

2. The inscription on folio 1 of Codex 30 (Bux 1990, p. 55) refers to prayers in memory of the deceased John of Gaunt, for
the well-being of his soul: “Orate pro anima illustriormi principis Dni Johns quondam ducis [L]ancastri filis regis Anglorum
Edwardi tertii, ac patris Henrici quarti (…) factum pro consolatione fratrum sacri montis Sion.”
Master of the Beffi Triptych
Abruzzese, active first quarter of the fifteenth century

33
Temptation of Saint Benedict

Circa 1400–1410
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 6 ¾ × 11 ¾ in. (16.9 × 28.3 cm). Stave: 3 cm

oratio del feria. ad pri/sma[n]. a. Cuma[n]/in spectu pois
su[b]micri pane[m] diabol[u]/ co[n]spiceret iactavit lapide[m] et
ti[n]tina[bulum]

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: Palladino 2001, pp. 70–71 (as Master of the Beffi Triptych)

This cutting is one of seven surviving fragments from an antiphonary decorated by the so-called Master of the Beffi Triptych, the most significant painter active in the Abruzzi in the opening years of the fifteenth century. Six other fragments by the same hand and from the same volume may be identified as follows: a cutting with the Annunciation in the Cini Collection, Venice (2115), illustrating the third response at matins for the first Sunday of Advent ("Missus est Gabriel Angelus" [The Angel Gabriel was sent]); a leaf with the Nativity in the Princeton Art Museum, illustrating the second lesson at matins for the Christmas Vigil (December 24); a leaf with the Vision of Saint Bridget in the Xerox Corporation headquarters, Stamford, illustrating the first nocturn response for Christmas Day (December 25); a cutting with the first episode of the Temptation of Saint Benedict in the Cini Collection, Venice (2116), illustrating the benediction antiphon at matins for the Vigil of Saint Benedict (March 20); a leaf with the Annunciation in a private collection (Palladino 2001, pp. 70–71), illustrating the antiphon at vespers for the Feast of the Annunciation (March 25); and a leaf with the Coronation of the Virgin in the Cleveland Museum of Art (53.24), illustrating the first nocturn response for the Feast of the Assumption of the Virgin (August 15). The common provenance of this group is suggested by their identical style, border decoration, and stave height, and by the appearance of the same coat of arms in the Princeton, Stamford, Cleveland, and private collection leaves.1
The Lehman cutting and Cini 2116 (fig. 8) illustrate, between them, three consecutive episodes in the story of the Temptation of Saint Benedict. In the Cini miniature are represented the first two episodes, as described in the Golden Legend: Benedict chases away a black bird, which had come to annoy him, by making the sign of the Cross; the Devil then brings to the saint’s mind the image of a beautiful woman to arouse his desire and to tempt him to renounce his ascetic life. The concluding episode, describing how Benedict, inspired by God, “put out the fire of lust” by rolling his naked body among the thorn bushes, is represented in the Lehman cutting. The two miniatures, virtually identical in size, would have been located one above the other on a single folio. On the Lehman verso is the conclusion of the antiphon for the Vigil of Saint Benedict, begun on the verso of the Cini fragment, followed by the first nocturn antiphon for the Feast of Saint Benedict (March 21).

While the attribution of several fragments in this series has shifted among Bolognese, Sienese, and Tuscan, the Cleveland leaf, first published by Mario Salmi as Abruzzese (New York 1954b, p. 36), was convincingly attributed by Federico Zeri (1963, no. 61) to the Master of the Beffi Triptych, the anonymous author of a small triptych from the Church of Santa Maria del Ponte, Beffi, now in the Museo Nazionale d’Abruzzo, L’Aquila. This attribution was subsequently extended to the leaves in Stamford and Princeton (Wagstaff 1965, p. 37), the latter of which bears close comparison, in composition as well as in style, to the Nativity painted in the left wing of the Beffi Triptych.

In addition to his activity as a panel painter and illuminator, the Master of the Beffi Triptych appears to have also been engaged in fresco decoration. His hand was first identified by Ferdinando Bologna (1948, pp. 9–10) in a fresco cycle, datable to the first decade of the fifteenth century, in the apse of the Church of San Silvestro, L’Aquila, from which he is also known as Master of San Silvestro (Chierici 1949). Portions of other cycles outside the Abruzzi have also been attributed to him, in the churches of San Giovanni a Celano and of the Sacro Speco, Subiaco (Torlontano 1987).

Most recent authors have defined the Beffi master’s vocabulary in terms of the stylistic crosscurrents that characterized artistic production in central and southern Italy during this period, pointing specifically to the influence of Sienese and Spanish models filtered through Naples and its territory. A Neapolitan context in which to view the artist’s miniatures is suggested by the style of his decorative borders, for which the closest precedent is found in fourteenth-century manuscripts produced for the Angevin court in Naples. A provenance from Naples or the Abruzzi for the Stamford and Princeton leaves was suggested by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (Wagstaff 1965, p. 37), who identified the arms appearing on these pages, repeated in the Cleveland cutting and in the lower border of the private collection leaf, as those of Matteo di Acquaviva, duke of Atri, a member of the Aragonese court in southern Italy who died in 1407. The same arms are painted in the apse of the Cathedral of Atri, decorated by Andrea Deltito for Giulio Antonio D’Acquaviva about 1475 (Benedicenti 2001, pp. 57–64). The unidentified arms in the left border of the leaf in the private collection are identical to those erroneously described as “Armagnac” (Freuler 1991, pp. 174–76) in a psalter decorated by the Neapolitan fourteenth-century illuminator Cristoforo Orimina in the Bibliothèque Publique et Universitaire, Geneva.

The presence of several scenes celebrating the Feast of Saint Benedict in this group of antiphonary fragments suggests an affiliation between the person who commissioned or donated this luxuriously decorated volume and a Benedictine institution.

---

1. A cutting in the National Gallery of Art, Washington (8-14, 961), associated with the Cini and Cleveland fragments by
Carl Nordenfalk (1975, pp. 47–48), is by the Sienese painter Martino di Bartolomeo and has nothing to do with this group.

2. In addition to the Beffi Triptych, the artist was responsible for a second panel in the Museo Nazionale d’Abruzzo, first attributed to him by Enzo Carli in 1943 (Carli 1958 [1943], pp. 218–19, 235–26); and a panel recently on the art market, ascribed to him by Andrea de Marchi (sale, Sotheby’s, London, December 14, 2000, lot 183). Related in style and border decoration to the present antiphony fragments is a Roman missal in the Seminario Arcivescovile, Chieti, commissioned about 1400 by Napoleon II Orsini for his chapel in the Church of San Francesco and attributed to the Beffi master by Maria Andaloro (1990, pp. 313, 320). Markedly less refined in execution than the Beffi Triptych or the present illuminations, this work was more convincingly identified by Chierici (1949, p. 125) as a product of the same culture as that of the triptych but by a different hand.

Master of the Brussels Initials
Bolognese, active circa 1390–circa 1420

34

Christ Blessing in an Initial E
Circa 1410–20
Cutting from a gradual (?)

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 3¼ × 4 in. (13.4 × 10.1 cm). Stave: 3.5 cm

Verso: ... urabitur/ ... bitur om[ne]s

Provenance: Count G. Stroganoff

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1705, D.28A (as probably Siena, 14th century)

This miniature, possibly excised from a gradual, may be attributed to the so-called Master of the Brussels Initials, one of the dominant personalities in Bolognese manuscript illumination between the end of the fourteenth century and the first decades of the fifteenth century. It is identical in execution, palette, and border decoration to six other fragments by the same hand, dispersed among various collections, that were probably excised from a single volume or gradual series: an initial A with a prophet in the Cini Collection, Venice (2048); an initial E with Saint Dominic formerly at Maggs Brothers, London (Bulletin No. 1, 1962, cat. 6); an initial D with Saint Nicholas of Bari recently sold at Christie’s, in London (sale, June 26, 1991, lot 12); an initial S with Saint Stephen, in The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York (Department of Medieval Art, 31.134.1: fig. 9); an initial D with Christ Washing the Feet of the Apostles, formerly in the Holford Collection, London (The Holford Collection, Dorchester House 1927, vol. 1, p. 23, no. 28b); and a Prophet in an Initial I in the Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam (R19–7–1937–1).

The Cini and ex-Maggs cuttings were first linked together by Millard Meiss (1969, p. 245), who recognized their strong resemblance to a manuscript of Lactantius in the library of the earl of Leicester at Holkham Hall, considered a late product of the Master of the Brussels Initials and his workshop. The ex-Christie’s and The Metropolitan Museum of Art cuttings were subsequently determined to be part of the same series by Robert Gibbs (1991, pp. 317–21) and Elliott Nesereman (Metropolitan Museum files), respectively. Following Meiss, Gibbs also dated the cuttings to the last phase of the master’s activity, in close proximity to his frontispiece for the statutes of the Compagnia dei Devoti Battuti di Santa Maria della
Vita, Bologna (Biblioteca Comunale dell’Archiginnasio, Fondo Ospedali 6), dated 1408.

The Master of the Brussels Initials takes his name from a series of illuminations in a Book of Hours in the Royal Library in Brussels (ms 11060–1). He was first identified by Otto Pächt (1948, p. 15, n. 19), followed by Meiss (1969, pp. 229–46), as a Bolognese artist active in Paris from the last decade of the fourteenth century to about 1408, and then in Bologna until at least the middle of the next decade. His formation has been traced to the workshop of Niccolò da Bologna, from whom he derived the broad figural style, incisive, calligraphic approach, and brilliant palette that characterize his early works. Additional sources for his idiom have been found in the production of the Paduan illuminator known as Master of the Novella, with whom the artist may have come in contact during a possible sojourn in the Veneto prior to his departure for Paris (Bollati 1997b).

It is generally accepted that the 1408 book of statutes for Santa Maria della Vita represents the first evidence of the artist’s return to Bologna after his French sojourn and that it introduces a new phase in his development. Compared to the works produced by his Paris workshop, which are characterized by an exuberantly decorative approach and lively narrative style, the 1408 statutes volume and the miniatures grouped around it—such as the present series of cuttings and the Holkham Hall Lactantius—reflect a decorative restraint, summary quality of execution, and general stiffening of the figures sometimes viewed as indicative of increased workshop participation (Meiss 1969, Medica 1999, pp. 190–91). A dating for this last phase in the master’s activity, during the second decade of the fifteenth century, is suggested by Milvia Bollati’s recent attribution to his hand of the illuminations in a manuscript, dated 1416, of the Fioretti of Saint Francis in a private collection (1997b, pp. 135–38). This work is convincingly related by Bollati to the 1408 statutes and, among others, to the ex-Christie’s initial included in the present series.

1. The Stroganoff seal is on the back of the cutting.

Master of 1446
Bolognese, active second quarter of the fifteenth century

35a
Dominican Hymnal
Circa 1430–40

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 124 folios. Page: 22 1/4 × 15 3/8 in. (56.5 × 39.6 cm). Stave: 4.5 cm. Binding: 23 3/4 × 16 1/2 in. (60.5 × 42 cm). Pages are marked according to two different numbering systems: large Arabic numerals in black ink, in center top margin of verso of each leaf; smaller Arabic numerals in black ink, in top right margin of recto of each leaf.

Contents: Temporale (fols. 1–41); Proper (fols. 41r–87); Commons (fols. 88–110). The original volume ends on folio 110v. Subsequent pages are later additions. Five leaves are missing: folios 35, 49, 75 (see cat. nos. 35b–d), 97, 98. Between folio 96 and folio 99 is an eighteenth-century insert (bifolium), replacing the missing leaves.

All but one of the miniatures in this exuberantly decorated hymnal may be attributed to the so-called Master of 1446, an anonymous Bolognese illuminator named after a 1446 book of statutes for the Hospital of Santa Maria del Baraccano, Bologna (Archivio di Stato, cod. min. 156, fol. 28v). A second artist was responsible for the initial and borders on folio 31 recto. These reflect the style of the so-called Master of the Servi Missal, a Bolognese illuminator active in the third decade of the fifteenth century.

The Master of 1446 has been described by Massimo Medica (1987, p. 229; 1992, pp. 22–26) as a representative of a late Gothic tendency in Bolognese manuscript illumination during the second quarter of the fifteenth century whose work was still rooted in the vocabulary of Niccolò di Giacomo and his followers, but also receptive to the example of contemporary painters such as Giovanni da Modena and Michele di Matteo. The large, broadly rendered and brilliantly colored illuminations that distinguish the decoration of the Lehman Hymnal are quintessential examples of his production. Typical of the artist are the massive, broadly rendered figural types and incisive, calligraphic approach, defined by the use of heavy dark outlines to articulate form as well as to describe facial features. These elements and the foliate borders interrupted by geometric forms are identical to those in a leaf from the statutes of the Bolognese Guild of Leather Workers in the Cini Collection, Venice (2119), first attributed to the Master of 1446 by Medica (1992, p. 24; 1999c, pp. 162–63). Given the presence of the coat of arms of Pope Eugene IV in the lower border, the Cini page was dated by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978a, p. 29) to his pontificate, between 1431 and 1447. A more precise date was proposed by Medica, who, based on the type of decorative border, placed this work within the artist's early production, during the fourth decade of the fifteenth century.

A specifically Dominican provenance for the Lehman Hymnal is suggested by the emphasis accorded to Dominical feasts, in particular those of Saints Thomas Aquinas and Peter Martyr (opposite), as well as Saint Dominic. The coat of arms on one of the excised pages, formerly in the Lehman collection (see cat. no. 31d), remains unidentified.

1. The only exception is the first leaf, which is marked 1 in the top margin of its recto and 2 in the top margin of its verso. As a result, the following leaf, actually folio 2, is marked 3 in the top margin of its verso. The second numbering system, in the upper right margin of the leaves' recto, on the other hand, follows consecutively from folio 1.

35b

*Pentecost in an Initial V*

Leaf from Lehman Hymnal

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 3/4 x 16 in. (56.8 x 40.5 cm). Initial: 6 1/4 x 5 1/2 in. (16 x 14 cm). Stave: 4 1/2 cm


On verso, in center top margin, in black ink: 35

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, A.37 (as early 15th century, probably written in Venice)

This leaf and the two that follow (35c–d) were listed by De Ricci as from a single choir book written in Venice. They are actually three of the five missing pages from the Lehman Hymnal (cat. no. 35a)—this volume was apparently unknown to De Ricci—with which they correspond in style, decoration, stave height, and numbering. The present fragment is the missing folio 35.

35c
Virgin and Child in an Initial A
Leaf from Lehman Hymnal

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment

Verso: Ave/Ma/BA/stella dei mater alma/atque semper virgo felix celi.

On verso, in center top margin, in black ink: 49

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, A.37 (as early 15th century, probably written in Venice)

This leaf, published by De Ricci together with pages 35b and 35d as from a single choir book, is the missing folio 49 of the Lehman Hymnal.

35d
Glorification of Saint Dominic in an Initial G
Leaf from Lehman Hymnal

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 1/2 x 16 in. (57 x 40.7 cm). Initial: 9 1/2 x 7 in. (24 x 17.8 cm). Stave: 4.5 cm


On recto, in center top margin, in black ink: 75

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, A.37 (as early 15th century, probably written in Venice)

This leaf, published by De Ricci together with pages 35a and 35b as from a single choir book, is the missing folio 75 of the Lehman Hymnal. Inside the initial G is Saint Dominic ascending a ladder to heaven, at the foot of which is a group of Dominican monks. The coat of arms in the lower border of this page, referring to the patron of the hymnal or the institution for which it was commissioned, remains unidentified.

1. Or "pr[or/i]."
ter ecclesia letam age

memoria qu nonne pli
Bologna or Veneto
Circa 1430–40

36
Investiture of Saint Clare in an Initial F (?)
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 11⅜ × 9 in. (29 × 22.9 cm). Stave: 4.7–4.8 cm


PROVENANCE: Canessa, Paris, 1923
LITERATURE: Comstock 1927, p. 52 (illustration), p. 57 (as Umbrian);
De Ricci 1937, p. 1710, D.27 (as Umbria, ca. 1420)

This cutting is one of two fragments, identical in style and border decoration, that were acquired by Robert Lehman as a pair and were probably excised from the same antiphonary volume or series. The second cutting, the present location of which is unknown (Appendix, no. 7), shows the Nativity in an Initial H (fig. 10), possibly illustrating the first response of the first nocturn (“Hodie nobis caelorum” [Unto us this day from the
heavens]) for Christmas Day (December 25). A Franciscan provenance is suggested by the representation in the present miniature of the investiture of Saint Clare with the habit of the Franciscan order. The episode takes place in front of an altar in a monumental church interior, with Saint Clare kneeling before Saint Francis, shown with the wounds of the stigmata on his chest. Witnessing the event are four Franciscan brothers, dressed, like Francis, in the hooded gray habit with a knotted cord typical of the order.

Although these miniatures were catalogued by Helen Comstock and De Ricci as Umbrian, both their style and decoration reflect late Gothic painting and manuscript production in the Veneto and in Bologna. A Bolognese context is suggested by the exuberantly articulated, thick foliage of the initials, painted in a brilliant palette of greens, blues, and reds, and by the filigree decoration set against a blue background. Similar decorative elements, ultimately rooted in a tradition going back to Niccolò da Bologna, are found in the work of some of the dominant artistic personalities active in Bologna in the first decades of the fifteenth century, such as the so-called Master of the Orsini Missal and the Master of the Servi Missal (Medica 1992).

The figural style and execution of the Lehman miniatures, on the other hand, have little in common with the incisive, expressive vocabulary—influenced by the work of Giovanni da Modena—of these Bolognese illuminators. The present works reflect, instead, compositional and formal elements derived from the production of those painters active in the Veneto in the wake of Gentile da Fabriano, such as Zanino di Pietro (act. 1389–1448) and Niccolò di Pietro (doc. 1394–1427). Zanino’s 1429 Madonna and Child in the Museo di Palazzo Venezia, Rome, in particular, provides a direct source for the plump, softly modeled types, with rounded heads and heavy-lidded eyes, that figure most prominently in the Nativity miniature. The composition of the Investiture of Saint Clare in an Initial F, in turn, may be directly inspired by a work such as the predella scene with Saint Benedict Exercising a Monk, in the Uffizi, Florence, recently attributed to Niccolò di Pietro, after a design by Gentile (De Marchi 1992, p. 105). Gentile’s Venetian production may also be the source for the unusual gold stippling of the Virgin’s mantle in the Nativity miniature, possibly in imitation of the dotted, punched decoration used by Gentile in paintings such as the Virgin and Child in the Philbrook Museum of Art, Tulsa.

No other miniatures by the hand that executed the Lehman fragments are known. A superficial resemblance may be found in a cutting with the Funeral of Saint Francis in the Museo Civico Amedeo Lia (inv. no. 510), which also reveals a combination of Bolognese and Venetian elements and is attributed by Filippo Todini (1996, pp. 148–49) to a Bolognese artist influenced by the Venetian works of Cristoforo Cortese. Although datable to the same moment as the Lehman initials and characterized by similar decorative elements, this initial is nevertheless distinguished by a more meticulous execution and expressive figural style more clearly rooted in a Bolognese milieu.

1. I have not been able to determine what text is illustrated by the investiture scene.
2. The possibility of a common Franciscan provenance for the three fragments, despite their differences in execution, is to be excluded by virtue of the fact that in the Lia initial the Franciscan habit is painted the more traditional brown color instead of gray.

Fig. 10 Bologna or Veneto, Nativity in an Initial H. Location unknown
Cristoforo Cortese
Venetian, active circa 1390–d. before 1445

37a
Resurrection in an Initial A
Circa 1401–7
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempora and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 7 3/4 × 6 3/4 in. (19.8 × 16.8 cm). Initial: 6 × 6 in. (15.7 × 15.7 cm). Stave: 3.9–4 cm

Verso not visible (cutting glued on board)

PROVENANCE: Convent of Corpus Domini, Venice; Madame Fould (sale, Galerie Georges Petit, Paris, December 26, 1926, lot 40)

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1707, c.11 (as Venice or Ferrara, late 14th century)
37b

*Angel with Portative Organ*

Fragment from a decorative border


Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 2 1/8 × 1 3/4 in. (6.1 × 4.4 cm, with border); 1 1/8 × 1 in. (4.9 × 2.4 cm, without border)

Blank verso

**PROVENANCE:** Convent of Corpus Domini, Venice

**LITERATURE:** Palladino 1997a, cat. no. 23, pp. 73–74 (as Veronese-Paduan Artist, ca. 1400–1410); Freuler 2001 (as Cristoforo Cortese, ca. 1401–5)

37c

*Angel with Harp*

Fragment from a decorative border


Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 2 1/8 × 1 3/4 in. (6.1 × 4.5 cm, with border); 1 1/8 × 1 in. (4.9 × 2.4 cm, without border)

Blank verso

**PROVENANCE:** Convent of Corpus Domini, Venice

**LITERATURE:** Palladino 1997a, cat. no. 23, pp. 173–74 (as Veronese-Paduan artist, ca. 1401–7); Freuler 2001 (as Cristoforo Cortese, ca. 1401–5)

Previously published (Palladino 1997a) as products of a Veronese-Paduan artist, the two Lehman angels were recently associated by Gaudenz Freuler (2001, p. 72) with the gold filigree border of a fragmentary antiphonary leaf showing *Christ Enthroned and David Playing the Psaltery in an Initial B* in a private collection (Les Enluminures 2001, no. 29).¹ This miniature (fig. 11) and a second fragment in the same private collection, with *Christ before a Group of Kneeling Worshipers in an Initial D* (Les Enluminures 2001, no. 30, pp. 74–75), were identified by Freuler as the earliest known works of Cristoforo Cortese, the most famous and prolific Venetian illuminator of the first half of the fifteenth century. Based on the presence of a Dominican nun at the feet of King David in the initial B, all four cuttings were convincingly related by the same author to a missing antiphonary commissioned in 1401 for the newly founded Dominican convent of Corpus Domini, Venice. The worshipers in the initial D were identified by Freuler as the patrons of the Church of Corpus Domini, their novice daughters, and its foundress and first prioress.

The Lehman *Resurrection*, previously associated by De Ricci with Venice or Ferrara, but virtually identical in style, execution, and palette to the two cuttings published by Freuler, may be identified as another fragment in the Corpus Domini series decorated by Cortese. The initial A, which illustrates the first response (“Angelus Domini descendit” [An Angel of the Lord came down]) of the Easter nocturn, was probably inserted in the temporale of a multivolume antiphonary set.

In addition to the Lehman fragments and the two
private collection miniatures, three other cuttings variously attributed to Cortese or to his workshop may be associated with the same Corpus Domini series: an initial M with the *Annunciation* in the Martello Collection, Florence (Parenti 1992, pp. 48–50);² and two cuttings, an initial D with *Saint Agatha Enthroned* and a fragment with *Christ in Prayer*, both recently on the art market in London (Sotheby’s, June 20, 1995, lot 31; Christie’s, June 3, 1998, lot 9). To these may be added eight more fragments dispersed among various collections or on the art market, which have been previously listed as fourteenth-century Bolognese, in the style of Niccolò da Bologna, or as fourteenth-century Venetian.

These miniatures are in fact also by Cortese and related to the Corpus Domini series. Four fragments are in the Free Library, Philadelphia: an initial T with the vestiture of an unidentified princess-saint (m25:27);³ an initial O with the *Finding of the True Cross* (m25:28); an initial F with *Saint Dominic and the Translation of Saint Peter Martyr (?)* (m45:11) (figs. 12–14); and an initial M with Saint Dominic surrounded by kneeling Dominican nuns (m26:33). Four more cuttings (present locations unknown) appeared in the same sales as the Lehman and Free Library miniatures: an initial S with the *Conversion of Saint Paul* (Mme Fould sale, 1926, lot 57; ex-Mortimer Brandt Collection¹); an initial V with
the Death of the Virgin (George de Grey Collection, sale, Sotheby's, London, April 29, 1927, lot 712; Sotheby's, London, November 26, 1985, lot 17); an initial L with the Martyrdom of Saint Lawrence (George de Grey Collection, sale, 1927, lot 733); and an initial S with the Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew (George de Grey Collection, sale, 1927, lot 735).

The illuminations for the Corpus Domini choir books, as noted by Freuler (loc. cit.), must be counted among Cristoforo Cortese's earliest known production, in the first decade of the fourteenth century. In both figural style and foliate borders they compare closely to the miniatures by Cortese in a register of possessions of the Monastery of San Mattia of Murano, in the Seminario Patriarcale, Venice (Ms Busta 956), datable to around 1407, and to those in two other manuscripts of about the same time, a copy of Petrarch's Uomini Famosi in the Pierpont Morgan Library, New York (Ms G.36), and a volume of the Life of Saint Catherine of Siena and other Dominican tracts in the Bodleian Library, Oxford (Ms Canon. Misc. 205), also illuminated for the Dominicans of Venice. These works, first attributed to the artist by Carl Huter (1980, p. 13), followed by Giordana Mariani Canova (1989, p. 204; 1993), reflect Cortese's roots in late-fourteenth-century manuscript production in Bologna and the Veneto, as well as his debt to the decorative vocabulary introduced into Venice by the Florentine illuminators associated with the Camaldolese scriptorium of Santa Maria degli Angeli. Freuler has pointed out that in 1401 the nuns of Corpus Domini were advised to base their newly projected series of choir books on those in the Camaldolese monastery of San Michele, Murano, which possessed a celebrated series of choir books decorated in Florence by Don Silvestro dei Gherarducci. Among these may have been a psalter illuminated in Florence by Don Simone Camaldolese and Don Silvestro, now in the Museo Correr, Venice (Ms cl. v.129), since Cortese's initial B with King David in a private collection is an exact copy of the same letter illuminated by Don Simone in that book.  

1. This cutting was at one point in the possession of Pierre Berès, Paris (Livres et Manuscrits, cat. 57, no. 31, as fourteenth-century, North Italian school).
2. This fragment was also included in the Mme Fould sale (lot 50).
3. This unusual representation might relate to a legend surrounding the foundation of the Convent of Corpus Domini, with the initial T introducing the response ("Terribilis est") for the Feast of the Dedication of the Church.
5. Also included in the George de Grey sale were three of the four Free Library cuttings: m45:11 (lot 715); m25:28 (lot 717); m25:27 (lot 721). Except for the Free Library initial T, possibly excised from a common, all of the above fragments were probably excised from a sanctorale. Other cuttings in the George de Grey sale, primarily derived from a tempore and commons, might have been part of the same series, but in the absence of reproductions they have been omitted from the present list. Another possible fragment from a commons in the same series may be an initial B with a martyr saint, whose face appears heavily repainted, that was sold at Sotheby's, London, on December 5, 1989 (lot 40). This miniature could have illustrated the response ("Beatus vir") for the Common of One Martyr in Paschalide.
6. First attributed to Don Simone by Mirella Levi D'Ancona, the initial in the Museo Correr psalter was subsequently given to Don Silvestro by Freuler (1997, pp. 515–21). Levi D'Ancona's original attribution was reiterated by the present author in a review of Freuler's study (Palladino 1999, p. 290).

Cristoforo Cortese

38

Saint Mark the Evangelist and Saint Sinibaldus Venerated by Members of a Lay Confraternity

Circa 1435–34

Leaf from a mariegola


Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 11 3/8 x 8 3/4 in. (29 x 21.1 cm). Miniature: 8 1/2 x 5 3/4 in. (21.6 x 14.6 cm)

Blank verso

PROVENANCE: Kaledjian, Paris, 1924

LITERATURE: Levi D’Ancona, Palladino, Saffiorti 1997, pp. 177–80 (with previous bibliography, as Cristoforo Cortese, ca. 1425–34)

This leaf was one of the opening pages of a mariegola, the register of a Venetian lay confraternity, or scuola, whose members are shown kneeling at the feet of the two standing saints. On the left is Saint Mark, patron
saint of Venice, who is often included in mariegola decorations. On the right is Saint Sinibaldus, patron saint of Nuremberg, depicted with his characteristic attributes of the pilgrim’s staff and a model of the church dedicated to him in Nuremberg.

This fragment was first attributed to Cristoforo Cortese by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (Robert Lehman Collection files, 1986), who convincingly compared it in both style and execution to a miniature of the Virgin of Mercy from the capitolare of the Scuola della Santissima Trinità dei Frati Teutonici in the Wildenstein Collection, Paris (Musée Marmottan, no. 78). With respect to the more controlled execution of the previous series of cuttings (cat. nos. 37 a–c), both these works reflect the looser calligraphic idiom that is the hallmark of Cortese’s mature production. The Wildenstein cutting has been generally dated to about or after 1422, the year recorded in the text on its verso. Accordingly, Levi D’Ancona (Robert Lehman Collection files) suggested a date between 1425 and 1430 for the closely related Lehman miniature.

Based on the identification of the saint next to Mark, previously thought to be Petronius, as Sinibaldus, Pia Palladino (D’Ancona, Palladino, Saffiotti 1997) proposed associating the Lehman fragment with a German scuola dedicated to him in Venice. The headquarters of such a confraternity may have been located in the Church of San Bartolomeo, the official German church in Venice, which had an altar dedicated to Saint Sinibaldus in 1434. This could indicate a date for the Lehman miniature between 1425, the year of canonization of Sinibaldus, and 1434.

---

**Cristoforo Cortese**

**39**

**Prophet in an Initial V**

Circa 1430–35
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 19 × 13¾ in. (48.1 × 34.9 cm). Initial: 3⅛ × 3⅜ in. (9.2 × 9 cm). Stave: 2.3–2.4 cm

a/ Ludeus machabeus et ionatha frater eius tran. Verso: sierunt[ur]/ iordane[m] via[m] trium dier[um] per des[er]num. / eovueae. [rubr.]
R[epousu]n[m]/Vidi dominus[m] sedente[m] sup[ra] soliu[m] ex/celsu[m] et elevatu[m] et plena erat omnis terra maiestate eius. Et ea que. On recto, lower right margin, in red ink: CCCCCXVI.

**PROVENANCE:** Unknown
**LITERATURE:** Unpublished

This leaf was excised from an unidentified antiphonary. As stated in the rubric preceding it, the initial V with a prophet illustrates the antiphon (“Vidi dominum” [I saw the Lord]) for the Saturday before the first Sunday of November.
The decoration of this hitherto unpublished miniature reflects Cristoforo Cortese’s production at a slightly later phase of his activity than the Lehman mariegola (cat. no. 38). The lively foliate border and quicker, more expressive calligraphic idiom most closely approach the works executed by the artist in the fourth decade of the fifteenth century, such as the miniatures in a two-volume gradual from the Certosa of Sant’Andrea al Lido in the Biblioteca Marciana, Venice (MS Lat.311., 18=2283–2284), first published by Giordana Mariani Canova (1970), with a date of between 1430 and 1435. Also closely related to the Lehman leaf and datable to the same period are four cuttings in the Galleria Estense, Modena (inv. nos. 2284–2287; Ferretti 1985); and a series of ten fragments in the Bodleian Library, Oxford (MS Douce a.1).

Cristoforo Cortese

40

Bearded Saint in an Initial C

Circa 1435–40
Cutting from a gradual (?)
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1957.42

Tempora and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 41/2 × 5 1/2 in. (11.4 × 14.1 cm). Stave: 5 cm

Verso: te ora

Provenance: Unknown; gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1957

Literature: Seymour 1970, p. 137, no. 94 (as Florentine school, early 15th century)

This cutting may be included among the works generally associated with the last phase of Cristoforo Cortese’s activity, toward the end of the fourth decade of the fifteenth century. The broadly defined forms and heavily marked features, as well as the increasingly fluid line, closely recall the choir book fragments in the Library of Santa Giustina, Padua (MS inv. gov. 11), first published by Giordana Mariani Canova (1970) with a date of between 1435 and 1440. The correspondence of details such as the punched decoration and white out-line of the halos between the Yale fragment and the Santa Giustina miniatures, as well as their stylistic uniformity, suggests that they may have been part of the same series.

Circle of Leonardo Bellini (?)

Venetian, circa 1476

41

Portrait of Virgil in an Initial V

Leaf from Vergilus Maro, Opera

Tempura and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 11 × 17 in. (27.8 × 17.7 cm). Initial: 11 1/4 × 1 1/4 in. (4.6 × 4.1 cm)


PROVENANCE: Bruscoli, Florence (?)
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1714, A.34 (as Venice, 1476)

This leaf was originally the frontispiece of a lost, printed compilation of Virgil’s works. It was first associated by De Ricci with a fragmentary copy of the same edition, dated 1476 and printed in Venice by Antonio di Bartolomeo da Bologna, in the British Library, London (c.19.e.14). De Ricci tentatively suggested that the Lehman page could be one of the missing leaves of the British Library copy. The latter, however, preserves its original frontispiece, the decoration of which, characterized by graceful putti and elegant, classically inspired architectural motifs, has been attributed to the anonymous Venetian miniaturist known as Master of the London Pliny (Armstrong 1994, pp. 182–83). The Lehman leaf, which reflects a more traditional decorative approach, with floriated borders and a simple historiated initial enclosing the portrait of Virgil, may be compared instead to the production of Leonardo Bellini, cousin of the better-known Venetian painters Giovanni and Gentile Bellini and the dominant miniaturist in Venice between about 1460 and 1480.

Leonardo Bellini’s vocabulary combines figural and compositional elements derived from the paintings of his uncle Jacopo Bellini (in whose studio he was raised) with a decorative style derived from contemporary Ferrarese manuscript illumination. Typical of Leonardo’s production is the flower-and-filigree border surrounding the Lehman frontispiece, as well as the bright palette and general figural style, which recalls the portraits attributed to the artist in a manuscript of Lactantius in the Biblioteca Marciana, Venice (MS Lat. II, 75=2198; Mariani Canova 1969, pp. 142–43). At the same time, however, the subtleties of modeling that normally characterize Leonardo’s figures are missing from the Lehman leaf. If not the result of its present, abraded condition and the losses of pigment in the head of Virgil, the more modest quality of execution of the Lehman fragment would seem to suggest the hand of a follower of Leonardo or artist in his circle.

Nothing is known of the original provenance of the Lehman leaf. Glued to the verso is a sixteenth-century sheet of paper on which a certain Giovanni Vidal di Brescia, resident of the parish of San Tomà, Venice, recorded, in 1586, the birth of his two children: a daughter, born in 1575 and christened by the patriarch of Venice, Giovanni Trevisano; and a son, born in 1579 and christened by the bishop of Trau. In the lower border of the frontispiece is a later, possibly eighteenth-century, seal mark, showing Saint Margaret and the Dragon, perhaps that of the Church of Saint Margaret, Venice.
The Choir Books of Cardinal Bessarion

The following seven cuttings are fragments of a famous series of choir books commissioned by the Greek cardinal Bessarion (ca. 1399/1408–1472), one of the most prestigious and influential church personalities of the fifteenth century during his years as papal legate in Bologna between 1450 and 1455. The series was originally intended as a gift to the Franciscan convent of Saint Anthony of Padua, Constantinople, but as a result of the fall of this city to the Turks in 1453, it did not leave Italy and was eventually bequeathed to the Franciscan church of Santa Maria Annunziata dell’Osservanza, Cesena, founded in 1460 by Novello Malatesta. Following the Napoleonic suppression of this convent in the nineteenth century, most of the choir books in the Bessarion series, which may have included as many as twenty volumes, were dispersed and individual leaves sold to collectors. Of the fifteen volumes listed in 1812 in a partial inventory of the convent’s library, seven, all bearing Bessarion’s coat of arms, survive in the Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena (mss Bessarion 1–7). To these may be added numerous illuminated fragments in private and public collections, many of which were identified by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978b) in a first attempt to reconstruct the entire series.

The decoration of the Bessarion choir books was probably begun around 1452 or 1455, the dates recorded in two of the Malatestiana volumes (mss Bessarion 5, 6) and carried out over a number of years. The commission was entrusted to a team of Lombard and Emilian illuminators, whose work reflects late Gothic manuscript production in Lombardy and the Veneto, as well as the more advanced, early Renaissance vocabulary of painters and illuminators active at the Este court in Ferrara. At least one of the six hands involved in the series, and that of the author of the Lehman frontispiece (cat. no. 43, fig. 15), may be identified with Franco dei Russi, who was engaged between 1455 and 1460 in the decoration of the celebrated Bible of Borso d’Este. The extent to which Bessarion’s project may also have involved the direct participation of Borso d’Este, whose coat of arms appears on two frontispieces generally associated with the series (ex-John Murray Collection, Florence; Cini Collection, Venice, 2124), remains to be ascertained. Iconographic and stylistic evidence, as well as the fact that the Malatesta arms do not appear in any of the surviving volumes or cuttings, suggests that the series was completed in a Ferrarese scriptorium, before entering the Osservanza in Cesena.¹

Based on the description of the fifteen volumes in the 1812 inventory (Mariani Canova 1978b, pp. 13–14), the original content of the Bessarion series may be partially reconstructed as follows:
Gradual in four volumes
Vol. i. Temporale, Advent to Saturday before Passion Sunday
   Cesena, Bibli. Mal., ms Bess. 2
Vol. ii. Temporale, Passion Sunday to Vigil of Ascension
   Cesena, Bibli. Mal., ms Bess. 5 (dated 1452) 2
Vol. iii. Temporale, Ascension to twenty-fourth Sunday after Pentecost
   Cesena, Bibli. Mal., ms Bess. 1
Vol. iv. Sanctorale, Vigil of Feast of Saint Andrew (November 29) to Feast of Saint Joachim (December 9)
   Cat. nos. 42a–c

Antiphonary in nine volumes
Vol. i. Temporale, Saturday before Advent to first Sunday of Lent 1
   Cat. no. 43
Vol. ii. Temporale, second Sunday of Lent to Easter Vigil
   Cat. no. 44
Vol. iii. Temporale, Easter Sunday to Corpus Domini
   Cesena, Bibli. Mal., ms Bess. 3 4
Vol. iv. Temporale, Pentecost to Advent
   Frontispiece: Venice, Cini Collection, 2096, David with God the Father in an Initial L
Vol. v. Sanctorale, Common of Apostles and Propers, Feast of Saint Andrew (November 30)–(?)
   Frontispiece: Venice, Cini Collection, 2122, Trial of the Apostles in an Initial T and Stigmatization of Saint Francis
Vol. vi. Sanctorale, Common of Martyrs and Propers, Feast of Saint Mark (April 25) to Feast of Saint Lawrence (August 10)
   Cesena, Bibli. Mal., ms Bess. 6 (dated 1455) 5
Vol. vii. Sanctorale, Vigil of the Assumption (August 14) to Feast of Saint Clement (November 23)
   Cesena, Bibli. Mal., ms Bess. 4
Vol. viii. Sanctorale, Franciscan Saints
   Cat. nos. 45a–b
Vol. ix. Sanctorale, Commons
   Milan, Biblioteca Ambrosiana, F277 inf. n. 11, Resurrected Christ in an Initial D (?)

Opposite
Fig. 15 Franco dei Russi, Bas de page with Coat of Arms of Cardinal Bessarion (detail of cat. no. 43)

Hymnal
October to First Sunday of Quaresima
   Frontispiece: Venice, Cini Collection, 2124, God the Father in an Initial P
   Folio 3: Philadelphia, Free Library, M703, King David in an Initial B

In addition to these fourteen volumes, the series may also have included a gradual with the Commons of Saints and two additional hymnals covering the rest of the liturgical year, although these do not appear on the inventory and no pages or fragments associated with them have yet been identified. It is equally uncertain whether a Franciscan psalter executed for Cardinal Bessarion in the Vatican Library, Rome (Barb. Lat. 585), was part of the series, as suggested by Mariani Canova (1978b, p. 16), or part of a different commission datable to the same period (Manfredi 1995, pp. 136–41).

1. For the suggestion that the series was a gift of Bessarion to the wife of Novello Malatesta, Violante, who shared the cardinal's devotion to the Franciscans, see Lollini 1989, pp. 23–24.
2. Presently missing from this volume is folio 121, covering Good Friday.
3. The 1812 inventory lists five volumes of an “Antifonario feriale.” The contents of the last three of these (inv. nos. 9, 10, and 11) are continuous, covering the liturgical year from the second Sunday of Lent through the twenty-fourth Sunday after Pentecost. The first volume (inv. no. 7) is described as beginning with the Saturday before Advent and ending with the Christmas Vigil; and the second volume (inv. no. 8) is described as running from the Christmas Vigil through the Octave of Epiphany. It will be shown elsewhere (Palladino, forthcoming) that this second volume, now Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena, Bessarion 7, which contains no historiated initials, is an apocryphal addition to the series, and that the temporale was complete in four not five volumes, the first of which (see cat. no. 43) probably contained all the missing offices for Advent through the first Sunday in Lent.
4. Presently missing from this volume are folio 59 (second Sunday after Easter) and folio 160 (Corpus Domini).
5. Presently missing from this volume is folio 112 (Vigil of Saint Lawrence).
Third Bessarion Master
Lombard, active middle of the fifteenth century

42a

Saint Anthony of Padua in an Initial I
Circa 1455–60
Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 1/4 × 16 in. (56.5 × 40.5 cm). Initial: 6 7/8 × 5 1/2 in. (16 × 14.6 cm). Stave: 3.9 cm


On recto, in center right margin, in red ink: xlvi

PROVENANCE: Kaldjian, Paris, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1799, 426 (as early 16th century, written in northern Italy); Mariani Canova 1978a, p. 32, n. 4 (as Lombard, first to second half of the 15th century); Mariani Canova 1978b, p. 17, fig. 17 (as Third Bessarion Master, ca. 1450–55); Lollini 1989, pp. 104–5 (as Third Bessarion Master); Melograni 1994, p. 293 (as Third Bessarion Master); Lollini 1998a, p. 324 (as Third Bessarion Master)
42b

Saint Clare in an Initial O

Circa 1455–60
Leaf from a gradual
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 43.15

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 3/4 × 16 in. (57.2 × 40.7 cm). Stave: 3.9 cm


On recto, in center right margin, in red ink: bxxv

PROVENANCE: Kalebdjian, Paris, 1924; Gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, A15 (as early 15th century, written in northern Italy); Mariani Canova 1978a, p. 32, n. 4 (as Lombard, first to second half of the 15th century); Mariani Canova 1978b, p. 17 (as Third Bessarian Master, ca. 1450–55); Lollini 1989, pp. 104–5 (as Third Bessarian Master); Melograni 1994, pp. 293, 302, n. 77, fig. 21 (as Third Bessarian Master); Hamburger 1995, no. 30, pp. 30–31 (as Italian, 15th century); Lollini 1998, p. 324 (as Third Bessarian Master)

42c

Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata in an Initial G

Circa 1455–60
Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 3/4 × 16 in. (57.2 × 40.7 cm). Initial: 5 3/4 × 6 1/2 in. (14.6 × 16.5 cm). Stave: 3.9 cm


On recto, in center right margin, in red ink: ciii

PROVENANCE: Kalebdjian, Paris, 1924

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1712, c.1 (as ca. 1460, written in northern Italy); Mariani Canova 1978a, p. 32, n. 4 (as Lombard, first to second half of the 15th century); Mariani Canova 1978b, p. 17, fig. 18 (as Third Bessarian Master, ca. 1450–55); Lollini 1989, pp. 104–5 (as Third Bessarian Master); Melograni 1994, p. 295; Lollini 1998, p. 324 (as Third Bessarian Master)

These three leaves are part of a group of ten surviving fragments from the missing sanctoral volume of a gradual included in the Bessarian series. Seven other fragments from this volume, which, according to the 1812 inventory, began with the Vigil of the Feast of Saint Andrew (November 29) and ended with the Feast of Saint Joachim (December 9), are dispersed among various public and private collections. Together with the Lehman and Oberlin pages, to which they conform in style, stave height, and foliation, these leaves allow for a partial reconstruction of the original sanctorale, as follows:

1. Cleveland, Museum of Art, 43.386 (bifolium):
   Calling of Saint Peter and Andrew in an Initial D
   (“Dominus secus mare Galilei” [The Lord walking by the Sea of Galilee]). Introit for Vigil of Feast of Saint Andrew (November 29). Frontispiece with Bessarian coat of arms. [fol. 1]

2. Cat. no. 42a: Saint Anthony of Padua in an Initial I
   (“In medio ecclesie” [In the gathering of the
Church). Introit for Feast of Saint Anthony of Padua (June 13). [fol. 46]


5. Oberlin 43.15: *Saint Clare in an Initial O* (“O virginale lilium” [O purest lily]). Introit (?) for Feast of Saint Clare (August 12). [fol. 75]


7. Cleveland, James D. Ireland Collection (bifolium): *Virgin of Humility in an Initial S* (“Salve sancta parens” [Hail, Holy Mother]). Introit for Feast of the Birth of the Virgin (September 8). [fol. 85]

8. Private collection: *Saint Michael in an Initial B* (“Benedicite Dominum” [Bless the Lord]). Introit for Feast of Saint Michael (September 29)

9. Cat. no. 42c: *Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata in an Initial G* (“Gaudeamus omnes” [Let us all rejoice]). Introit for Feast of Saint Francis (October 4). [fol. 103]

The Cleveland frontispiece, showing the Bessarion arms in the lower border, was first associated with the gradual listed in the 1812 inventory by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978b, pp. 13, 17), who attributed it to an anonymous, late Gothic Lombard illuminator she christened “Third Bessarion Master.” Mariani Canova identified the same artist as the author of the Lehman, Honolulu, and two remaining Cleveland fragments but divided these between two other volumes in the Bessarion series (see below, cat. nos. 45a–b). Subsequently, Anna Melograni (1994, pp. 293–95) recognized the Oberlin All Saints and the private collection Saint Michael as additional works by the Third Bessarion Master and correctly associated them with the same book as the Oberlin Saint Clare and Cleveland Assumption.

In addition to the present gradual, the Third Bessarion Master was involved in the decoration of three antiphonary volumes in the Bessarion series: vol. iii of the temporale (Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena, Bessarion 3), which he illuminated with the so-called Master of the Franciscan Breviary (Mariani Canova 1978b, pp. 15, 17; Lollini 1998, pp. 324–25); vol. viii of the sanctorale, showing the Este arms and illuminated with Franco dei Russi (cat. nos. 45a–b); and vol. xi of the sanctorale (ex-Hoepli Collection"). These works attest to the artist’s prominent role in this commission, alongside Franco dei Russi, whose activity may be traced in at least six volumes of the series (see below, cat. no. 43).

The production of the Third Bessarion Master was placed by Mariani Canova (1978b, p. 14) within the milieu of late Gothic painting in Lombardy, around the middle of the fifteenth century, and viewed as representative of the artistic exchanges between Lombardy and Emilia during this period. More specifically, Fabrizio Lollini (1989, p. 26) located the master’s activity in Bologna and dated his contribution to the Bessarion series to about 1451 or 1452, during the early years of the cardinal’s posting in that city. A later dating, however, is suggested by the artist’s spatial and formal concerns, which, as often noted, distinguish his style from the more typically decorative late Gothic vocabulary of Lombard illuminators such as Belbello da Pavia (cat. nos. 58a–d). The closest points of reference for the early Renaissance idiom of the Third Bessarion

Master’s production may be found in a series of panels from the Church of San Silvestro, Mantua, now in the Museo Poldi Pezzoli, Milan, which are attributed to an anonymous Lombard painter and unanimously dated to around 1460 (Natale 1982, pp. 70–71). If not actually by the same hand that executed the miniatures, these works may provide evidence of the Third Bessarion Master’s presence in Mantua, the same city from which Franco dei Russi originated. Beyond such stylistic evidence, a later date than the one thus far proposed for the Third Bessarion Master’s illuminations is suggested by the presence of the Este arms in the volume decorated by him in collaboration with Franco. This would appear to indicate that the two artists were contemporaneously engaged in the decoration of the Bessarion choir books in Ferrara between about 1455 and 1460 (see below, cat. no. 43).

1. The Feast of Saint Joachim is presently celebrated on July 26. In the Eastern Church, however, where his cult was strongest, the celebration is recorded on various dates: September 9, July 25, and December 9 (Acta Sanctorum. . . .). Since the sequence of the foliation on the ten fragments discussed here implies that the sanctorale was complete in one volume, the reference to Saint Joachim is most likely to indicate a date for the celebration of his feast on December 9, according to the Eastern calendar—a circumstance probably resulting from the series’ original destination for Constantinople.

2. For the interpretation of the word “natale” in the rubric “In natale beat. fransici,” as a reference to the day of a saint’s death (October 4 in the case of Saint Francis), see Carapelli 1988, p. 119. For another example of the Stigmatization used to illustrate the same text, introduced by the same rubric, see Perugia and other cities 1982, cat. no. 80, pp. 328–29.

3. The five fragments divided between Cleveland and Honolulu were formerly owned by Jacob Hirsch, who, in a letter to Robert Lehman dated December 16, 1931, wrote that they “came from a book I got many years ago in Bologna” (Robert Lehman Collection archives).

4. For a discussion of this volume, attributed to the Master of the Franciscan Breviary by Mariani Canova (1978b, p. 16) and Lollini (1989, pp. 105–6), but inserted among the Third Bessarion Master’s oeuvre by Melograni (1994, p. 295), see Palladino, forthcoming. The manuscript was actually another collaborative effort between the two artists.
Franco dei Russi
Ferrarese, documented 1453–82

43
David Lifting up His Soul to God in an Initial E
Circa 1455–60/65
Frontispiece from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 28 × 20⅛ in. (71.1 × 51.5 cm). Initial: 8 × 7⅛ in. (20.2 × 19 cm). Stave: 5 cm


On recto, in top right margin, in black ink: i
In lower border: Coat of arms of Cardinal Bessarion

PROVENANCE: John F. Murray, Florence, 1925
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1713, 8.4 (as probably Venetian, ca. 1470); Mariani Canova 1973, p. 62, no. 54 (as part of the Bessario series without attribution)

The present leaf, showing the coat of arms of Cardinal Bessarion in the lower border, was originally the frontispiece of the first volume of a four-part antiphonary temporale from the Bessarion series. This volume, already missing by the time of the 1812 inventory (which makes no reference to it), covered the temporal cycle from the Saturday before Advent to, possibly, the first Sunday of Lent. Two other fragments from the same book, identical to the Lehman page in style, overall dimension, stave height, and numeration, may be identified with the following miniatures in the Cini Collection, Venice: a leaf with the Resurrected Christ in an Initial R (2121), introducing the antiphon at lauds ("Rex pacificus" [The King of peace]) for the Christmas Vigil (December 24); and a leaf with the Stoning of Saint Stephen in an Initial L (2122), illustrating the antiphon at lauds ("Lapidavetur Stephanum" [While they were stoning Stephen]) for the Feast of Saint Stephen (December 26; fig. 16).¹

Fig. 16 Franco dei Russi, Stoning of Saint Stephen in an Initial L. Fondazione Giorgio Cini, Venice, 2120
Honorum de et bellum ignis mare et sa
frances. Incipit antiphonarius odis mio
stant. Sedem coluntur nomine romane cune. Salto
ta aduentu renovis. Yv. Gratia celi desip et nubes
pluant uentu. Per est ura ginnar salu. orem.

Ecc no

medi

ue mit regis

et clausis cois rect
who, based on the coat of arms, listed it as a possible fragment from the Cesena series. Beyond its relationship to the Cini fragments, Franco dei Russi’s authorship of the Lehman frontispiece is supported by a comparison to the miniatures unanimously attributed to the artist in the Bible of Borso d’Este. The lively figure of David kneeling against a surreal landscape highlighted in gold may be read as a monumental version of the various small scenes of biblical figures kneeling in prayer or inspired by God, which were executed by Franco in the margins of the first volume of the Bible (Book of Leviticus, fols. 44v–46r). Typical of his style in these works, as in the Lehman miniature, are the unnaturally elongated body types and sinuously flowing draperies, as well as the luminous palette and effects of changeant couleur. These elements, as noted by scholars, demonstrate the artist’s debt, above all, to the Lombard, late Gothic idiom evolved by Belbello da Pavia (cat. nos. 58a–b) and by Pisanello, both active at the Este court in the 1430s and later at the Gonzaga court in Mantua during the years of Franco’s putative formation in that city prior to his departure for Ferrara.2

The exuberantly ornate initial and foliate border set against a gold band in the Lehman frontispiece also find precedents in Franco’s portions of the Bible of Borso d’Este, especially those in the second volume (Gospel of Saint John, fol. 172v), where, as noted by Toniolo (1997, p. 410), the artist’s decorative idiom is increasingly influenced by that of the Ferrarese illuminator Taddeo Crivelli, who, alongside Franco, was the leading illuminator engaged in the prestigious commission for the Bible.3 Entirely typical of Franco, however, are the playful putti climbing in and out of the Lehman border, a signature device that first appears in the Bible and that will remain characteristic of the artist’s later production.

If the Lehman frontispiece and related Cini fragments confirm Franco’s involvement in the decoration of the Bessarion choir books, the full extent of his participation in this commission is attested to by the identification of his hand in four other antiphonary volumes in the series: vol. 11 of the temporale (cat. no. 44); vol. V of the sanctorale, the frontispiece of which may be associated with a leaf in the Cini Collection, Venice (2122), showing the Trial of the Apostles in an Initial T and the Stigmatisation of Saint Francis in the lower border (fig. 17); vol. VI of the sanctorale, dated 1455 (Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena, Bessarion 6); and vol. VIII of the sanctorale, showing the Este arms and also involving the participation of the Third Bessarion Master (cat. nos. 45a–b). To these may be added the decoration of a hymnal that included the frontispiece with the Este arms in the Cini Collection, Venice (2124), and a previously unpublished leaf with King David in an Initial B in the Free Library, Philadelphia (M703; fig. 18).

The attribution to Franco of the miniatures in the above volumes, until now variously considered the products of unidentified Ferrarese illuminators,4 reflects the artist’s central role in the Bessarion series. The direct comparisons that may be drawn between these works and Franco’s illuminations in the Bible of Borso d’Este, as well as the date 1455 recorded in Corale Bessarion 6, suggest a virtually contemporary dating

Fig. 17 Franco dei Russi, Trial of the Apostles in an Initial T and Stigmatisation of Saint Francis. Fondazione Giorgio Cini, Venice, 2122
for his activity on behalf of Cardinal Bessarion, between about 1455 and 1460/63, before his departure from Ferrara. It could be surmised that the same factors that motivated the choice of Franco as one of the leading illuminators of the Bible would have prompted the Este, whose involvement in the Bessarion series is suggested by their coat of arms in two of the volumes decorated by the artist, to recommend him for this other important commission.

1. The Cini leaves are marked, respectively, folio 97 and folio 124. Like the Lehman page, they were formerly included in the John F. Murray Collection.
2. For a full biography of the artist see Federica Toniolo, in Hermann 1994, pp. 211–30 (with previous bibliography).
3. Archival evidence suggests that Franco may actually have been engaged in a business partnership with Crivelli before their collaboration on the Bible. In the earliest mention of his name, in a Ferrarese document of 1453, Franco is cited as a witness to a payment to Taddeo Crivelli for miniatures painted by the latter in a salmista for Antonio da Pesaro (Franceschini 1993, 1, App. 28, p. 832). Two years later, in 1455, Franco and Crivelli were selected by Borso to decorate his two-volume Bible, one of the most important artistic undertakings ever carried out in Ferrara. The contract for this commission states that the two artists are to be given, for the duration of their work, a comfortable house, as sufficient for their needs, “as the one they have at present” (Franceschini 1993, 1, App. 32, pp. 850–51). This would seem to imply that Franco had already been sharing a house with Crivelli (and probably a workshop).
5. In 1460 Franco is last recorded as actively engaged in the illumination of the Bible. The next and last mention of his name in Ferrara is in the general accounts of payments for the Bible in 1465 (Franceschini 1993, doc. 1032, pp. 636–37; Toniolo 1994, p. 221). By this time, however, Franco may already have left for Padua, where between 1463 and 1465 he illuminated a copy of the Oratio of Bernardo Bembo, now in the British Library, London (Mariani Canova 1994, pp. 83–84, with previous bibliography).

Franco dei Russi

44
Isaac and Esau in an Initial T

Circa 1455–60/63
Leaf from an antiphony

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 7/8 × 16 7/8 in. (58.1 × 41.5 cm). Initial: 5 1/2 × 5 1/2 in. (14 × 14 cm). Stave: 3.9 cm


On recto, in upper right corner, in black ink: 1

PROVENANCE: De Clemente, Florence, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1731, D-24 (as 15th century, written in northern Italy). The present leaf, numbered folio 1, may be the frontispiece of the missing second volume of the antiphonary in the Bessarion choir book series. According to the 1812 inventory, this book covered the temporal cycle from the second Sunday in Lent (Quaresima) to Easter and did not include a coat of arms. The Lehman page, as stated by the rubric, contains the invitatory and the first response at matins (“Tolle arma tua” [Take your weapons]) for the second Sunday in Lent. Inside the
initial T is an illustration of the first episode of the Old Testament story of the Stolen Blessing. The old and nearly blind Isaac, sitting up in his bed, is shown dispatching Esau, his eldest son and a hunter, to catch venison and cook it for him, that he may give Esau his last blessing before dying (Genesis 27:1–5). This blessing will be stolen before Esau’s return by his brother Jacob disguised as a hunter.

In style, execution, and border decoration the Lehman miniature conforms to the other illuminations in the Bessarion volumes by Franco dei Russi. Particularly relevant is a comparison between the figures in the present leaf and those by Franco in the signed Cini Collection fragment (2120; fig. 16) and in the Lehman frontispiece (cat. no. 43), here associated with the first antiphonary volume in the series. Also comparable to the above miniatures are the fantastic landscape background and border decoration. The simple architectural prop meant to signify Isaac’s chamber closely recalls the structures painted by Franco and his collaborators in the Bible of Borso d’Este.

1. According to De Ricci, this leaf was obtained from De Clemente “(with the bulk of the Chorale).” Nothing is known of the whereabouts of this volume, possibly unidentified because it was deprived of all the historiated initials.
Franco dei Russi

45a
Saint Clare in an Initial N

Circa 1455–60/63
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 28 3/4 × 21 in. (73 × 53.5 cm). Initial: 7 3/4 × 6 1/2 in. (19.5 × 16.5 cm). Stave: 4.9 cm

Recto: Nam sancte/ clare clia/ ritas splendore mundi/ cardines
mirifices comple/ vit cuius perfecta sanctitas in. Verso: devotas
propagines velo/ cuius excrevit. [rubr.]/pt. Dixit Dominus./[rubr.]/Ant./
Mundi totius glori/ am ut christum luceri faceret/ vile quod orbitata
finibi

On recto, in upper right corner, in black ink: 25

PROVENANCE: Kalebdjian, Paris, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1710, d.13 (together with
cat. no. 45b as possibly Umbrian, ca. 1440. Ascribed to northern
Italy by Robert Lehman)

45b
Saint Louis of Toulouse in an Initial T

Circa 1455–60/63
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 28 3/4 × 21 in. (73 × 53.4
cm). Initial: 7 3/4 × 6 1/2 in. (19.4 × 16.4 cm). Stave: 4.9 cm

Recto: [rubr.]/ In S(anctiu) Li Ludovicus ep./ [et conf.] Antiphon./ Tecum
fu/it principium beatu lude/ vice virutu[m] chr[i]/stri/ omni/um pro
meritori/um vice. Verso: [rubr.]/pt. Dixit dominus. [rubr.]/Ant./M.tra
magi/scentia perfusit virtu/ali cu/ius mansit iustitia cum gra/du
pastoral/ [rubr.]/pt. Confitebor./ [rubr.]/ Ant./ Exortus est in tenebris

On recto, in upper right corner, in black ink: 48

PROVENANCE: Kalebdjian, Paris, 1924
LITERATURE: Comstock 1927, pp. 56–57 (illus., p. 57) (as school of
Pisanello); De Ricci 1937, p. 1710, d.15 (together with cat. no. 45a as
possibly Umbrian, ca. 1440. Ascribed to northern Italy by Robert
Lehman); Béguin, 1957, p. 110, cat. no. 159 (as Ferrarese Master, sec-
ond half of the 15th century); Cincinnati 1959, p. 31 (as Ferrarese
Master, second half of the 15th century)

These two leaves, acquired by Robert Lehman as a pair,
were excised from the missing volume of an antiphonary
sancorale with Franciscan saints that was included in the
Bessarion series. This book was described in the

1812 inventory as an “Antiphonary of St. Anthony, of
St. Clare, of St. Louis Bishop, of St. Francis and the
Stigmata” and listed as one of two volumes in the series
bearing the arms of Borso d’Este. The volume’s fron-
tispiece was correctly identified by Giordana Mariani
Canova (1978b, pp. 13, 17) with a leaf formerly in the
John Murray Collection, Florence (fig. 19). This fron-
tispiece, which includes the Este arms in the lower bor-
der, shows Saint Anthony of Padua, the canonized
Franciscan preacher, in an initial G, introducing the
antiphon (“Gaudeat Ecclesia” [Let the Church rejoice])
for his feast (June 13). The two Lehman fragments
 correspond to the next two sections of the sanctorale,
as listed in the 1812 inventory. The initial N with Saint
Clare begins the antiphon (“Nam sanctae Clarae” [For
Saint Clare]) for the feast of this saint (August 11),
founder of the Franciscan Second Order of Poor
Clares. The initial T with Saint Louis of Toulouse intro-
duces the antiphon (“Te cum fuit principium” [He was
with you in the beginning]) for the feast of the Franciscan
bishop saint Louis of Toulouse (August 19). A
fourth fragment from the sanctorale, corresponding to

Fig. 19 Third Bessarion Master, Saint Anthony of Padua in an
Initial G. Formerly in the John Murray Collection, Florence
Rum lacete
clare clara
tas splendor mundi
cardines mundi apicul
uit cui perfecta sit tua
In Sclau

Loynci ept

70f. Anaph.

Estum su

it principium beate luci

vice virutā rēs omni

um pro mentōrum nīce
the 1812 description, is represented by a leaf in the Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, Kansas City (31–120), showing the *Stigmatization of Saint Francis in an Initial F* (fig. 20) to illustrate the antiphon (“Franciscus, vir catholicus” [Francis, a most Catholic man]) for the Feast of the Stigmatization of Saint Francis (September 17). Although executed by two different hands, all four leaves are identical in size, stave height, and foliation.

Mariani Canova (*loc. cit.*) convincingly attributed the ex-Murray frontispiece to the Third Bessarion Master and associated with it, as parts of the same volume, three leaves by the artist formerly in the Lehman collection and at Oberlin, the subjects of which correspond to those listed in the 1812 inventory. The Lehman and Oberlin leaves, however, were excised from a gradual not a liturgical book and were originally inserted in a different volume in the series (see above, cat. nos. 42a–c). The present antiphonary sanctoral appears instead to have been a collaborative effort between the Third Bessarion Master and Franco dei Russi, who was responsible for the present two Lehman fragments and the Kansas City leaf.

Previously given to the school of Pisanello (Comstock 1927), the Lehman *Saint Louis of Toulouse* was first identified as Ferrarese by Sylvie Béguin (1957), who aptly compared it to the *Stoning of Saint Stephen* in the Cini Collection (1210), Venice, since recognized as a signed work of Franco dei Russi and here included in the Bessarion series (see above, cat. no. 43; fig. 16). Béguin also related the *Saint Louis of Toulouse* to another Cini leaf, showing the *Trial of the Apostles and Stigmatization of Saint Francis* (1212), which was catalogued by Mariani Canova (1978a, p. 33) as Ferrarese, in the circle of Jacopo Filippo Argenta, although it is, in fact, also by Franco and part of another antiphonary volume in the series (see above, cat. no. 43, fig. 17). Clearly related to the Cini leaves and the Lehman *Saint Louis of Toulouse* are the Lehman *Saint Clare* and the Kansas City *Stigmatization*, which share the same figurative style, landscape, and decorative borders. Especially relevant is the close correspondence in both style and execution between the Cini *Stigmatization*—the composition of which is divided between the lower and right borders of the page—and the larger, unified version of the same subject in the Kansas City fragment.

Franco dei Russi’s involvement in each of the two volumes in the Bessarion series bearing the Este arms confirms the suggestion, first advanced by Mariani Canova (1978a, p. 41), that the decoration of the choir books was carried out in Ferrara and completed during the same years that witnessed the illumination of the Este Bible. It seems logical to conclude that Cardinal Bessarion, who entertained close relationships with Borso and the humanists at the Este court, in accepting the Este participation in the series, would entrust its decoration to one of the principal illuminators engaged in the most ambitious artistic project in Ferrara at the time.

1. This is the same provenance recorded for cat. nos. 42a–c, by the Third Bessarion Master.

2. This antiphon begins the Rhymed Office of Saint Anthony written by the Franciscan friar Giuliano da Spira (d. ca. 1350). (See Sharlace 1978 [1921], 11, p. 156). The leaf’s provenance from the John Murray Collection, is recorded on the back of a photograph in the Robert Lehman Collection archives. Also noted in pencil are the dimensions of the leaf (18 × 20½ in.,
Franco dei Russi (?) 

46

Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew in an Initial U

Circa 1455–60/65

Frontispiece from an antiphony

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 25 × 17 1/2 in. (63.5 × 43.6 cm). Initial: 6 1/4 × 5 3/4 in. (16 × 15 cm). Stave: 4.4 cm


On recto, in lower right margin, in brown ink: i

PROVENANCE: Unknown

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, 4.4 (as early 15th century, probably written in eastern Lombardy)

The present leaf, numbered folio 1, was the frontispiece of an unidentified antiphonal volume. The initial U with the Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew illustrates the first antiphon at vespers (“Unus ex duobus” [One of the two]) for the vigil of the Feast of Saint Andrew (November 30), beginning the Advent season.

In both style and border decoration, this leaf closely approximates the work of Franco dei Russi, as reflected in the Bessarion series (cat. nos. 43–45a–b). A certain weakness of execution, compared to the latter, however, makes a direct attribution to Franco only tentative at present. No other related fragments with the same dimensions and stave height have yet been identified.

Museum’s files, the leaf was purchased from A. S. Drey in New York in 1931, by Harold W. Parsons, who acted as an adviser to this institution. Parsons was also a mutual friend of Robert Lehman and Jacob Hirsch and is mentioned in the 1931 letter from Hirsch to Lehman cited above (cat. nos. 42a–c, n. 3). The ex-Hirsch illuminations by the Third Bessarion Master in Honolulu were bought for that museum by Parsons.
Cosimo Tura
Ferrarese, circa 1430–95

Saint John the Baptist in an Initial D
Circa 1470–80
Cutting from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 13 ¾ x 11 ¾ in. (35 x 30 cm). Initial: 7 ¼ x 6 ¾ in. (18 x 17 cm). Stave: 5 cm

Gradual

5. New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, 11.50.4: Presentation in the Temple in an Initial S
6. Cat. no. 47: Saint John the Baptist in an Initial D
7. New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, 11.50.3: Assumption of the Virgin in an Initial G
9. Washington, National Gallery of Art, B-13, 524: Stigmatization of Saint Francis in an Initial G
10. Ex(?)-Berlin, Fritz Pohlmann Collection: All Saints in an Initial G

The Lehman Saint John the Baptist, together with three other fragments, was first attributed to the Ferrarese school, in the circle of Cosimo Tura, by Paul Wiescher (1930). He was followed by Carl Nordenfalk (1975, pp. 78–83), who associated three more cuttings with

Antiphonary

1. New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, 11.50.1: Assumption of the Virgin in an Initial A
2. Berlin, Kupferstichkabinett, Ms 4493: Nativity of the Virgin in an Initial N
3. Ex-Paris, Wildenstein Collection: Saint Francis in an Initial I
4. New York, Metropolitan Museum of Art, 11.50.2: All Saints in an Initial V

On recto, in right hand margin, in red ink: xxxvii

PROVENANCE: Edouard Kann Collection, Paris; Wildenstein and Co., New York, 1927
LITERATURE: Bohner 1926, p. 53, no. XXXIX, pl. XXXVII (as 15th century; school of Ferrara); Wiescher 1930, n. 4, pp. 79–80 (as style of Cosimo Tura); Wiescher 1931, p. 99 (as style of Cosimo Tura, school of Ferrara, ca. 1460–70); De Ricci 1937, p. 1710, b.18 (as probably Ferrara, ca. 1450); Calabi 1938, p. 61 (as Jacopo Filippo Argenta); Nordenfalk 1975, p. 80, fig. 23d (as northern Italy [Ferrara] ca. 14605, close to Cosimo Tura); Boskovits 1978, p. 378, n. 36 (as Cosimo Tura, ca. 1470); Lollini 1989, p. 110, n. 3 (as Ferrarese, around 1465); Bollati 1991, p. 330 (as Ferrarese collaborator of Cosimo Tura, ca. 1470–80); Kanter 1998, pp. 149, 153 (as Cosimo Tura, ca. 1470–80); Lollini 1999, pp. 21, fig. 212 (as Ferrarese miniaturist, ca. 1465); Manca 2000, pp. 71–72 (as anonymous, Ferrarese)

This cutting, excised from a gradual, illustrates the introit (“De ventre matris mea” [From my mother’s womb]) to the mass for the Feast of the Nativity of Saint John the Baptist (June 24). Inside the initial D, the Baptist stands against a barren landscape, holding a scroll with the following text: “EGO VOX CLAMANTIS IN DESERTO” (I am the voice crying aloud in the wilderness, Luke 3:4).

The Lehman fragment was recently associated by Laurence Kanter (1998, pp. 148–56) with nine other cuttings from a lost series of choir books decorated by the preeminent painter at the Este court in Ferrara, Cosimo Tura. According to Kanter, four of these cuttings were excised from an antiphony in the series, while the remaining six, including the Lehman Saint John the Baptist, belonged to one or more volumes of a gradual. The two groups were outlined by Kanter as follows:

Fig. 21 Cosimo Tura, Infrared reflectography of Saint John the Baptist in an Initial D (cat. no. 47)
the same group. An attribution to Tura himself was first proposed by Miklós Boskovits (1978), who recognized the superior quality of execution of all these miniatures and placed them within the artist’s mature production, around 1470. While reiterating Boskovits’s attribution, Kanter (loc. cit.) noted a disparity in execution between the antiphonary and gradual fragments and suggested an interval of a decade or more between the completion of the former, datable to between 1450 and 1460, and the latter, datable toward the middle or end of the 1470s. Among the works compared by Kanter to the gradual fragments are the panels from the predella of Tura’s Roverella Altarpiece, divided between New York (Metropolitan Museum of Art, 49.7.17), Boston (Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum), and Cambridge (Fogg Art Museum, 1905.14); and four small panels by the artist in Washington (National Gallery of Art, 1952.2.6), all of which have been dated to the mid- or late 1470s.

Kanter’s proposal and the attribution to Tura of many if not all of these fragments have subsequently been called into question by several authors, beginning with Fabrizio Lollini (1998, p. 157; 1999, pp. 206, 211). Lollini has dismissed the possibility of an interval in the decoration of the choir books and accepted the attribution to Tura for the Berlin Nativity and possibly the Washington Saint Francis only, dividing the remaining eight fragments between a so-called “Miniature Turiano,” also active in the Bessarion series (Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena, Bessarion 4) and a third, anonymous Ferrarese artist. Most recently, Joseph Manca (2000, pp. 171–72) and Stephen Campbell (2002, pp. 251–52) have gone as far as rejecting Tura’s involvement in any of these fragments, except perhaps the Berlin Nativity, and vaguely assigned their execution to several anonymous imitators of the master’s style.

These objections, and, above all, the distinctions drawn between different hands, appear entirely artificial in light of the close correspondence in concept and execution that has often been noted, for example, between the Berlin Nativity and the New York Assumption (Metropolitan Museum of Art, 11. 50.1), part of the same antiphony grouping; or between the Berlin Nativity and the Washington Stigmatization, the latter included by Kanter in the gradual series. Milvia Bollati (1991, p. 332), in particular, in singling out these three miniatures as autograph works by Tura, aptly recognized the master’s hand in the carefully studied, individual facial expressions and gestures, as well as in the plastic modeling of draperies, and in the compositional sophistication that distinguish the New York Assumption as much as the Berlin Nativity.

With respect to the Berlin Nativity and the other antiphony cuttings, however, the Washington Stigmatization and its related gradual fragments, including the Lehman Saint John the Baptist, betray a simplification of the forms and more somber palette, as well as less exuberantly defined decorative borders. These distinctions may be a function of different stages in execution, although the relative chronology proposed by Kanter is not entirely convincing and a date for the antiphony in the 1450s seems too precocious. Within the limitations imposed by the uncertainties related to dating Tura’s mature production, it seems more plausible to suggest that the commission for these volumes occupied the artist intermittently over the course of the 1470s.

Based on the predominance of Franciscan saints in these cuttings and the possible association between the gourds in the miniatures’ borders and one of the emblems of the Este (the so-called paraduro—a gourd hanging from a fence), Kanter tentatively suggested a provenance for the series from the Franciscan convent of Corpus Domini, Ferrara, sponsored by the Este. Alternatively, Giordana Mariani Canova (1998, pp. 134–35), who identified one of the figures in the Metropolitan Museum All Saints as the Observant friar Blessed John Capistrano, proposed a possible provenance from the Observant Franciscan convent of Santo Spirito, Ferrara.
Jacopo Filippo Medici d’Argenta
Ferrarese, documented 1478–1501

48a
King David in an Initial D
Circa 1490–1500
Cutting from an antiphonary
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.6c

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 ¼ × 3 ½ in. (8.3 × 9.2 cm).
No staves visible

Verso: hic requir em demo (or domo)/ vite mee

PROVENANCE: Acquired in Paris, 1953; Gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954

48b
Angel Playing the Timbrel in an Initial C
Circa 1490–1500
Cutting from an antiphonary
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.6d

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 ½ × 3 ½ in. (7.8 × 8.8 cm).
No staves visible

Verso: ea omniv [m]/ . . . id demo/ quim [ur] ab

PROVENANCE: Acquired in Paris, 1953; Gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954

48c
Initial E
Circa 1490–1500
Cutting from an antiphonary
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.6a

Tempera on parchment. 3 ¼ × 3 ¼ in. (8.2 × 8.2 cm). Stave: 4.5 cm

PROVENANCE: Acquired in Paris, 1953; Gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954
Six Initials: U or V, E, S, G, B, B
Circa 1490–1500
Cuttings from an antiphony
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.8a–f
Tempera on parchment. d. 3 1/4 x 3 3/8 in. (8.2 x 8.6 cm); e. 2 7/8 x 3 1/2 in. (7.3 x 8.8 cm); f. 3 3/8 x 3 3/8 in. (8.4 x 8.6 cm); g. 3 3/4 x 3 3/8 in. (8.6 x 9 cm); h. 3 3/8 x 3 1/4 in. (9.2 x 9.9 cm); i. 3 3/8 x 3 3/8 in. (8.8 x 8.8 cm). Stave: 4.5 cm
Provenance: Acquired in Paris, 1953; Gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954
Literature: Seymour 1970, p. 235 (as North Italian school [?], 15th century)

These nine related fragments were probably excised from the same antiphony volume or series. The initial D with King David may illustrate the first response (“Deus omnium auditor” [God hears everyone]) in the first nocturn for the second Sunday after Pentecost. The initial C with an angel playing a timbrel possibly illustrates another Sunday in the Pentecost cycle, or the first response (“Canite tuba in Sion” [Blow the trumpet in Sion]) at matins for the fourth Sunday of Advent.

The author of these fragments, first catalogued by Seymour (1970) as fifteenth-century “North Italian school,” may be identified as the Ferrarese illuminator Jacopo Filippo Medici d’Argenta, a close follower and perhaps pupil of Cosimo Tura first documented in Ferrara in 1478. The activity of this artist was reconstructed on the basis of his illuminations in a series of choir books for the Cathedral of Ferrara, for which he received payments between 1478 and 1501 (Giovannucci Vigi 1998, pp. 269–82, with previous bibliography). He was subsequently recognized as the principal author of a second important series of choir books for the Church of San Francesco, Brescia, datable on internal and stylistic evidence to between 1490 and 1492 and therefore virtually contemporary to the Ferrarese series (Benetazzo 1998, pp. 282–87, with previous bibliography). Argenta’s idiom as defined by these works, which represent the nucleus of his known production, is defined by a close, possibly firsthand, observation of Tura’s models of the previous decade (cat. no. 47), albeit interpreted in a distinctly more linear, drier calligraphic style and brilliant palette.

The execution of the Yale figures and the style of the painted initials are clearly related to the artist’s illuminations in both Ferrara and Brescia, suggesting a possible provenance from one of these two series. It is worth noting that a provenance from the Ferrara choir books may be securely established for the only other known fragments by Argenta, now in the Cleveland Museum of Art: a leaf with the Office of the Dead in an Initial R (27. 426) and a leaf with a Saint in a Landscape in an Initial M (27. 425). First attributed to Argenta by Michela Benetazzo (1998, p. 285) and recently associated with a missing volume in the Ferrara series by Stephen Campbell (2002, p. 251), these fragments are actually the missing frontispieces of two graduals still in situ in the Ferrara Cathedral Museum.

1. This provenance is recorded by Seymour (1970) for the following eight cuttings as well. No records of the purchase have been found in the Robert Lehman Collection archives.
2. Too little text survives on these cuttings to identify their source with precision. However, the rubric on the verso of 1954.7.8c (cat. no. 48f), referring to first vespers of the Exaltation of the True Cross (September 14), does indicate that they were removed from an antiphony.
3. For a comparable illustration of this text see Codex Corale 8, folio 34r, in the Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Florence, an antiphony illuminated by Lorenzo Monaco.
4. The previous identification of Argenta with the “Jacopo Filipo,” cited in the account books of Taddeo Crivelli in 1456 and 1457, is dismissed in most recent studies (Toniiolo 1994, p. 218, n. 42; Benetazzo 1998, pp. 283–84).
5. Benetazzo (1998, p. 285) excluded the leaves’ provenance from the Ferrara choir books on the mistaken assumption that they duplicated the liturgical contents of the series. Both she and Campbell overlooked the fact that the Cleveland leaf with the Office of the Dead in an Initial R (27. 426) corresponds precisely to Hermann’s description of the currently missing frontispiece of Corale xxx (Hermann 1900, 1994, p. 159; Giovannucci Vigi 1989, p. 109). As for the second Cleveland leaf, it may be identified as the frontispiece of a Common of Apostles, for which Argenta received payment in 1501 (Hermann 1994, p. 275, appendix 276). This volume, in which Argenta reportedly executed two full-page illuminations ("due prizipi"), is possibly identifiable with Corale xxxi, in the Cathedral Museum (Giovannucci Vigi 1989, p. 189), which now begins on folio 5r and is reported as missing folio 6 described by Hermann (1994, p. 159).
Bartolomeo del Tintore (?)
Bolognese, documented 1459–91

49
Temptation of Saint Francis in an Initial B
Circa 1460
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 3/8 x 5 3/8 in. (9 x 14.1 cm)

Verso: [Repelle a servis] tuis quiCcuij[[d/]/[per immunditi]i]am. aut mori[bus]/ [se sugglerit aut actib[us]/ [se interserit.] Da
v[n]cu[la]

No stains on verso

PROVENANCE: John F. Murray, Florence, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1713, b.14 (as probably Umbria,
ca. 1470)

This fragment may originally have been the frontispiece of a Franciscan antiphonary. The initial B
introduces the antiphon at vespers ("Benedictus Dominus Deus meus" [Blessed be the Lord, my God]) for
the Saturday before the first Sunday of Advent. On the
verso are remnants of the hymn for the same feast. The illustration of this text with the *Temptation of Saint Francis*, rather than with a Marian image (see cat. no. 27), suggests that the missing antiphonary volume was specifically intended for a Franciscan congregation.

The author of the Lehman cutting may be tentatively identified as Bartolomeo del Tintore, the preeminent illuminator in Bologna during the third quarter of the fifteenth century, prior to the arrival in 1473 of the Ferrarese miniaturist Taddeo Crivelli. Bartolomeo’s activity was recently reconstructed by Massimo Medica (1997, pp. 71–73; 1999, pp. 104–5, 164–65) on the basis of his only documented work, a miniature of *Saint Thomas Aquinas* in the statutes of the Bolognese notaries for which he received payment in 1459. In contrast to the late Gothic idiom still present in Bolognese manuscripts of the previous decade (see cat. no. 35), this illumination displays a Renaissance figural vocabulary and concern for spatial effects that reflect Bartolomeo’s awareness of the most recent innovations in contemporary Ferrarese and Tuscan painting.

Among the works grouped by Medica around the documented *Saint Thomas Aquinas* are the miniature of *Saint Petronius Enthroned* in the 1454 statutes of the Commune of Bologna (Archivio di Stato, Comune-Governo, Statuti vol. XVII) and the frontispiece of a copy of Petrarch’s *Triumphs* in the Biblioteca Casanatense, Rome (MS 141). These works provide the closest comparisons for the style, palette, and foliate border of the Lehman fragment.

---

**Master of the Libro dei Notai**  
(Domenico Pagliarolo?)

Bolognese, active last quarter of the fifteenth century

**50**

*Nativity in an Initial P*

Circa 1473–76

Bifolium from a gradual  
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.5

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 23 3/8 x 16 3/4 in. (59.7 x 42.6 cm)
On the verso of the first leaf, numbered folio 34, is an initial P with the Nativity, illustrating the introit ("Puer natus est" [A Child is born]) to the mass for Christmas Day (December 25). The second leaf, marked folio 39 and unilluminated, contains the introit ("Et enim sederunt principes" [For princes met]) to the mass for the Feast of Saint Stephen (December 26).

In the only published reference to the Yale Nativity, Charles Seymour (1970) quoted an earlier opinion of Pietro Toesca that it might relate to the miniatures in the choir books for the Piccolomini Library in Siena Cathedral. In both style and foliate border, however, the Yale leaf is actually typical of the Ferrarese school of illumination in the third to last quarter of the fifteenth century, as represented by the late work of the Ferrarese miniaturist Taddeo Crivelli and that of his followers in Bologna, where the artist spent the last years of his activity, between 1473 and 1478. More specifically, the execution of the Yale Nativity recalls Crivelli’s pictorial and decorative idiom as interpreted by his most faithful Bolognese imitator, and perhaps collaborator, the so-called Master of the Libro dei Notai.

Named after the miniatures in the Libro dei Notai, a book of rights and privileges of the Guild of Notaries in Bologna (Museo Civico Medievale, ms. 644), datable to between 1474 and 1482, this master was tentatively identified by Massimo Medica (1993, pp. 121–28; 1999, pp. 166–67, 202–3) as Domenico Pagliarolo, a Bolognese illuminator who was recorded in 1473 as working next to Taddeo Crivelli in the decoration of a lost series of choir books for the Monastery of San Procolo, Bologna. Federica Toniolo (1998, pp. 178–84) subsequently attributed to the same artist several illuminations in a gradual decorated by Crivelli for the Church of San Petronio, Bologna, and a Book of Hours in the Palazzo Schifanoia, Ferrara (inv. OA 1629), the compositions of which are closely derived from those painted by Crivelli in a book of hours in the J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles (MS Ludwig IX 13). Like the Yale Nativity, these works reveal a clear dependence upon Crivelli’s models in terms of facial types, expressions, and gestures, as well as compositions, though they are characterized by a sketchier modeling and, ultimately, less refined execution.

Among the body of works grouped by Medica around the personality of the Master of the Libro dei Notai, the most closely related to the Yale leaf is a miniature dated 1476 in a volume of the Annali della Nazione Germanica in Bologna (Archivio Storico dell’Università, Sez. 111, n.1; Medica 1999, pp. 202–3). The virtual correspondence in pose and execution between the figure of the Virgin in this miniature and the same figure in the Yale Nativity indicates not only an identical hand but also a contemporary date of execution. It is therefore possible to conclude that the Yale bifolium might be the only known surviving fragment from the lost series of choir books illuminated around 1473 by the Master of the Libro dei Notai, alias Domenico Pagliarolo, for the Monastery of San Procolo. No other cuttings or fragments from those volumes, already mutilated of miniatures in the fifteenth century and subsequently dispersed, have been located thus far.

1. This provenance is reported by Seymour 1970, p. 201, no. 131. No records of the purchase have as yet been found in the Robert Lehman Collection archives.

Romagnole Artist

51
King David in an Initial D

Circa 1485–90
Leaf from a psalter

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 20 ¼ × 14 ¼ in. (51.4 × 37.2 cm). Initial: 7 ¼ × 7 ¼ in. (18.2 × 18.5 cm). Stave: 2.4 cm


On verso, in left margin, in black ink: 3

PROVENANCE: Bruscoli, Florence, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1711, c.1 (as probably written in Lombardy, ca. 1460)

This leaf was excised from an unidentified psalter. Inside the initial D, illustrating Psalm 109 ("Dixit Dominus" [The Lord says]) is King David enthroned playing the
harp. The elegant foliate border with putti and other classically inspired decorative motifs is interrupted in the four corners by rectangular inserts with the figures of the Four Evangelists; and in the top and lower border, respectively, by diamond-shaped inserts with the image of the Virgin and Child and of an unidentified bishop-saint. Framed by laurel wreaths in the left and right borders are two monastic saints in Dominican dress, possibly Saints Thomas Aquinas and Dominic.

The Lehman fragment corresponds closely in style, palette, and border decoration to the illuminations in a gradual series from the Duomo in Cesena, currently in the Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena (cor. A, B, C, D, E, F, G). Datable to after 1486, the decoration of these volumes was the product of a team of anonymous illuminators, who were influenced by the developments in Bolognese and Ferrarese painting during the last decades of the fifteenth century (Cucciomini 1989, pp. 37–140). Among them, the artist whose work is most closely related to the Lehman page is the so-called Romagnole Master of Duomo C, responsible for most of the illuminations in Malatestiana Corale C and for part of those in Malatestiana Corale E (Cucciomini 1989, pp. 121–25, 130–33). A slightly coarser version of this master’s style, which also reflects points of contact with the Lehman fragment, is found in a series of volumes from the Cathedral of San Cassiano, Imola, leading scholars (Lollini 1994, pp. 201–5) to suggest that the same team of illuminators was active in various centers of the Romagna in the last fifteen years of the fifteenth century.

The strong similarity between the Lehman fragment and the Cesena choir books may indicate a provenance from the same series, although, lacking documents confirming the existence of a psalter besides the gradual, such a suggestion must remain speculative.

Undoubtedly missing from the gradual series is the final volume of the temporale containing the masses for the twenty-four Sundays after Pentecost. Also missing are several folios from the existing books. One of these, clearly related in style to the Lehman miniature, may be associated with a gradual leaf formerly in the Kann Collection, showing the Nativity in an Initial P (Boinet 1926, p. 31, no. xxxvi, pl. xxxiv). This is the missing folio 44 or 45 of Malatestiana Corale E.

Stefano da Verona
Lombard, circa 1375–1438

52a

Pentecost in an Initial A

Circa 1430–35
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 4 1/16 x 4 3/16 in. (12 x 12.5 cm).
Stave: 2.5 cm

Recto: [u]m alleluia/[rubr.] i/n die ad mat. Invit

52b

Blessing Christ in an Initial B

Circa 1430–35
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 3/16 x 3 3/4 in. (9 x 9.5 cm).
Stave: 2.5 cm

Verso: [E]uo[ue]/ E[uo]ae


Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1755, C.27 and 26 (as Lombardy, ca. 1490); Miner 1949, p. 65, no. 178 (as North Italy, early 15th century); Harriken and Boyce 1953, p. 29, no. 53 (as follower of Michelino da Besozzo); Cipriani 1958, p. 75, no. 235 (as follower of Michelino da Besozzo); Miner and Verdier 1962, p. 77 (as Belbello da Pavia); Mariani Canova 1973, p. 46 ([a]), as Second Master of Antiphonary M in San Giorgio Maggiore); Stefani 1985, p. 847, n. 11 ([a]), as Second Master of Antiphonary M in San Giorgio Maggiore); Lollini 1989, pp. 97, 98, n. 6 (as Veneto, ca. 1435); 1991, p. 227 (as Veronese, ca. 1435–40); Palladino 2002 (as Stefano da Verona, ca. 1430–35)

These two cuttings, remarkable for their refinement of execution and delicate palette, were probably excised from the same antiphonary volume or set. The splendid initial A, formed by the intertwined heads of two dragons—in the lower half of which is the Virgin
surrounded by the Twelve Apostles—illustrates the invitatory antiphon at matins for Pentecost Sunday ("Alleluia, Spiritus Domini" [Alleluia, the Spirit of the Lord]). The initial B with a crowned Christ as Salvator Mundi (Savior of the World), holding a globe in one hand and in the act of blessing with the other, could illustrate a number of antiphonary texts, including the first antiphon at vespers for Trinity Sunday (Hesbert 1968, p. 1708).³

In 1949, when they were included in an exhibition at the Baltimore Museum of Art, the two Lehman miniatures were catalogued by Dorothy Miner (1949, p. 65) as “North Italy, early 15th century” and first associated with a cutting of the Annunciation in the Cleveland Museum of Art (no. 24.431, fig. 22), then attributed to the school of Stefano da Verona, one of the leading exponents of the International Gothic style in Italy in the early fifteenth century. Subsequent authors have highlighted the Lombard and Veronese components of these miniatures, dating them to between 1430 and 1440 and grouping around them, in addition to the Cleveland cutting, three other antiphonary fragments, the attribution of which has shifted between school of Stefano da Verona, follower of Michelino da Besozzo, and Belbello da Pavia: an initial G with the Trinity in the Pierpont Morgan Library, New York (M581D); an initial M with Christ and the Pharisees in the Victoria and Albert Museum, London (MS 991); and an initial D or O with Christ Disputing with the Merchants in the British Library, London (Add. 18196, no. 49).² That these six illuminations constitute a homogeneous group is indicated by their similar palette and figural style, by their identical border decoration, and by their common stave height, suggesting a probable origin from the same antiphonary set. A possible Venetian provenance may be inferred from the nineteenth-century inscription in pencil on the verso of the Cleveland Annunciation, stating that it came from the church of “SS. Pietro e Paolo in Venice.”³

While parallels for individual elements in the style and decoration of these illuminations may be found in the work of Michelino da Besozzo and the young Belbello, it is the art of Stefano da Verona, who has not until now been known as a manuscript illuminator, that reflects all of their characteristics combined, suggesting a direct attribution to him. Entirely typical of Stefano, as demonstrated by a comparison with his painting of the Madonna and Child in the Palazzo...
Colonna, Rome (fig. 23), are the slender, insubstantial figures that inhabit these miniatures, whose elongated limbs, stretched out to impossible proportions, disappear behind the elegant folds of ample draperies. The Cleveland Virgin, with her perfectly oval face and vanishing chin, long, pinched nose and small pouty mouth, is simply a reduced version of the Palazzo Colonna Madonna; while the latter’s brittle, spidery fingers are another hallmark of Stefano’s vocabulary that resurfaces, most noticeably, in the raised hand of the Lehman Christ Blessing.

Further points of reference for the Lehman cuttings may be found in a number of drawings attributed to Stefano, such as those in New York, Dresden, and Florence (Karet 1999, pp. 5–41), which are characterized by the same linear fluidity and freedom from conventional formal requirements that have often been hailed as distinguishing elements in assessing his art. But the strongest argument for Stefano’s authorship must ultimately lie within the exceptional quality of these miniatures, both in their technique and in their visualization—from the meticulous drawing and application of pigment and gold, to the subtle color harmonies of luminous pastels, to the fantastically conceived letters and surreal landscape backgrounds.

1. The same subject is used to illustrate this text in a gradual in the Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena (Bessarion iv, fol. 35r), attributed by Giordana Mariani Canova (1973, p. 46) to the so-called Second Master of Antiphonary M in San Giorgio Maggiore (who is also identified by her as the author of the Lehman cuttings).

2. The Cleveland, Pierpont Morgan Library, and Victoria and Albert Museum cuttings appeared in the same Otley sale as the Lehman fragments (lots 41, 44, 46). Together with the Lehman miniatures, they were listed among a total of 38 cuttings divided between lots 40–48, all thought to be by the same artist.

3. Since the Church of Saints Peter and Paul, no longer extant, was actually a small hospital for the sick and the poor, the present inscription may in fact reflect a confusion with the more famous Dominican convent and church of SS. Giovanni e Paolo, consecrated in 1430, and more likely at that time to have needed a new series of liturgical books (Cornaro 1758, pp. 81–89, 159–60).

Master of the Vitae Imperatorum

Milanese, active second quarter of the fifteenth century

53

Martyrdom of Saint Lawrence in an Initial D

Circa 1430–40
Cutting from a gradual
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 1943.11

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Fragment: 13 1/8 x 8 3/4 in. (33.4 x 22.3 cm). Initial: 2 3/4 x 3 in. (7 x 7.5 cm)


On verso, center left margin: CXLIII

Provenance: Kleinberger, Paris, about 1922; gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943
This fragment was excised from an unidentified gradual following the Ambrosian rite, an archaic liturgy associated with Saint Ambrose, patron bishop of Milan (ca. 340–97). The initial D illustrates the introit to the mass for the Feast of Saint Lawrence (“Dispersit dedit pauperibus” [Lavishly, he has given to the poor]) on August 10.

Listed by De Ricci as “northern Italy, circa 1440,” the Oberlin cutting was convincingly attributed by Anna Melograni (1992) to the so-called Master of the Vitae Imperatorum, one of the most important illuminators active in Milan in the second quarter of the fifteenth century. Melograni included the Martyrdom of Saint Lawrence in the same volume as the following three cuttings by the master: a fragmentary leaf with Saint Mary Magdalen in the Desert in an Initial V in a private collection (sale, Sotheby’s London, December 14, 1977, lot 17); a leaf with Saints Peter and Paul in an Initial D, formerly on the art market in Frankfurt (R. Busch sale, 1921); and a fragmentary leaf with the Visitation in an Initial V in the Kupferstichkabinett, Berlin (4751). To these works may be added, as part of the same Ambrosian gradual, a fragment formerly in the Lehman collection, showing Saint John the Baptist in an Initial S (fig. 24), which was acquired by Robert Lehman with the Oberlin cutting (Appendix, no. 99); and two full leaves formerly on the art market, showing Saint Helena Adoring the Cross in an Initial O and Three Martyrs Saints in an Initial S (Les Enluminures 1994, cat. no. 3, no. 9), which Melograni (1990, pp. 279–80) attributed, respectively, to the Master of the Vitae Imperatorum and to a collaborator but mistakenly associated with an antiphonary.

The activity of the Master of the Vitae Imperatorum was first reconstructed by Pietro Toesca (1912, pp. 528–32), who named him after the illuminations in a manuscript of Suetonius’s Vitae Imperatorum in the Bibliothèque Nationale, Paris (Ms fr.131). This volume, copied in 1431 for Filippo Maria Visconti, duke of Milan (r. 1412–47), formed the basis for Toesca’s attribution to the same artist of a number of other manuscripts decorated for the duke and his court between about 1430 and 1450, confirming his role as the preeminent miniaturist in Milan during these years. Toesca’s outline of the master’s oeuvre was accepted by subsequent scholars, until Alison Stones (1969, pp. 7–12) questioned the attribution to the same hand of a miniature with the Communion of the Apostles in the Cini Collection, Venice (2009), signed “frater mediolanensis ordinis Montis Oliveti” (Milanese brother of the order of Monte Oliveto) and dated 1439. This fragment was viewed by Stones as the product of a related but distinct artist, christened by her “Olivetan Master,” who was supposedly responsible for a number of works formerly assigned to the Master of the Vitae Imperatorum, comprising mostly liturgical manuscript fragments. While the existence of an Olivetan Master has been accepted in most recent studies, the strong resemblance between the two bodies of works and the confusion that still lingers in the attributions to one hand or the other have also prompted some scholars (Mariani Canova 1978a, pp. 37–39; Melograni 1990, p. 296) to view the distinction between the different personalities with some caution.

A date for the Oberlin cutting and its related fragments in the fourth decade of the fifteenth century is supported by their proximity to the master’s
illuminations in the *Vitae Imperatorum*, executed after 1431. While rooted in the International Gothic idiom formulated by artists such as Giovanni di Grassi and Michelino da Besozzo, these works also reflect the master's debt to the harder, more incisive linear vocabulary and bright palette of Tommasino da Vimercate, the illuminator formerly known as Master of the Modena Hours.  

1. Melograni (1990) aptly summarized the full complexities of the problem, by noting the likely existence of a large scriptorium (lay or ecclesiastic) at the service of the Visconti court during the rule of Filippo Maria, which would have employed different artists working in the same style.

2. For this artist see Sutton 1991, pp. 87–90.

**Milanese**

Second quarter of the fifteenth century

**54**

*Christ Holding the Cross in an Initial I*

Leaf from an antiphonary

Minneapolis, The Minneapolis Institute of Arts, 43.20

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 ¾ x 29 ¾ in. (52.7 x 37.5 cm)


In center left of top margin, in red ink: ii

**Provenance:** Drey, Munich, 1934; gift of Robert Lehman to The Minneapolis Institute of Arts, 1943

**Literature:** Stones and Steyaert 1978, cat. no. 25, pp. 108–9, fig. 82 (as Italy, Milan, second quarter of the 15th century); Melograni 1995, p. 22, n. 89 (as Milanese, second quarter of the 15th century)

This leaf, numbered folio 2, may have been the frontispiece of the second volume of an antiphonary temporale beginning with Septuagesima Sunday. Inside the initial I, illustrating the first response (“In principio” [In the beginning]) at matins for Septuagesima Sunday, is the figure of Christ as Salvator Mundi (Savior of the World), holding the Cross in one hand and blessing with the other, before a representation of the world.

Alison Stones, who first published the Minneapolis miniature (1978), associated it with Milanese manuscript illumination in the second quarter of the fifteenth century and more specifically with the work of the so-called Master of the Vitae Imperatorum (see above, cat. no. 53). Classified by her as part of a “subgroup” of illuminations related to, but distinguished from, the autograph production of the master, this fragment was compared by Stones to two other leaves in the Free Library, Philadelphia, showing a *Martyr Saint in an Initial I* (M72:10) and *King David and Monks before God in an Initial E* (M71:12). Of these, however, only the latter may be convincingly compared to the Minneapolis leaf in style and border decoration, although it displays a slightly coarser execution. The first Free Library leaf (M72:10), which bears only a superficial resemblance to the Minneapolis miniature, was convincingly identified by Anna Melograni (1995, pp. 6, 22, nn. 88–89) as a work of Tommasino da Vimercate, alias “Master of the Modena Hours.”
Milanese
Circa 1440–50

55a
Resurrection in an Initial R
Cutting from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 10 7/8 x 7 1/8 in. (27.7 x 20 cm). Initial: 5 3/4 x 5 3/8 in. (14.6 x 14.3 cm). Stave: 3.4 cm

Recto: Re[surrexi et]/ ad[huc tecum suum]/ alleluya posuisti
Verso: [Haec dies quam fecit] dominus exulte/[mus et] letemur in ca]/[rubr.] sic onfitemini do
Saint Lawrence Distributing the Treasures of the Church in an Initial D

Cutting from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 11 3/4 x 8 1/4 in. (29.8 x 20.7 cm). Initial: 5 x 4 3/4 in. (12.5 x 12.4 cm). Stave: 3.4 cm

Verso: [Probast[i domine cost]/[me] um et/[visita] sti noite

Provenance: Kaledjian, Paris, 1924
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, A.22 and 7 (as parts of two folios of the same book, Milanese, early 15th century)

These two fragments, acquired by Robert Lehman as a pair and identical in style, musical notation, and stave height, were excised from the same gradual volume or series. The initial R illustrates the introit ("Resurrexi" [I arose]) to the mass for the Feast of the Resurrection. The initial D illustrates the introit ("Dispersit dedit pauperibus" [Lavishly, he has given to the poor]) to the mass for the Feast of Saint Lawrence (August 10). In addition to the Lehman miniatures, the following three cuttings may be associated with the same gradual: an initial B with the Adoration of the Magi in the Cini Collection, Venice (2100); an initial B with King David, recently on the art market in London (Sotheby's, December 6, 2001, lot 40); and a previously unpublished initial O with a group of ecclesiastics in the Free Library, Philadelphia (m28:9; fig. 23). These works are identical to the Lehman fragments in musical notation and stave height, as well as in style and border decoration.

The Cini illumination was first published by Pietro Toesca (1930, pp. 311–12, pl. xcv), followed by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978a, pp. 50–51), as a Lombard work of the middle to second half of the fifteenth century inspired by the late Gothic idiom of Belbello da Pavia (see cat. nos. 58a–d). While these miniatures include decorative elements derived from Belbello's production, a more specific point of reference for their figural style may be found, as was noted by De Ricci (1937) in regard to the Lehman cuttings, in early-fifteenth-century Milanese manuscript production. In particular, these works reflect an adaptation of the vocabulary of the Master of the Vitae Imperatorum as interpreted by his many collaborators and followers around the middle of the fifteenth century.

Fig. 25 Milanese, ca. 1440–50, Ecclesiastics in an Initial O, Free Library, Philadelphia, m28:9
Lombard
Middle of the fifteenth century

Joseph and His Brothers in an Initial V
Cutting from an antiphary
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 44.38

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 8 ¾ × 8 ¾ in. (22.2 × 22.2 cm)

PROVENANCE: Arnold Mettler of St. Gallen, Switzerland; sale, Sotheby’s, London, April 27, 1937, lot 295; gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943
LITERATURE: Melograni 1994, p. 298, n. 21 (mentioned without attribution); Hamburger 1995, p. 27, cat. no. 25 (as possibly Lombard, ca. 1440)

This cutting is one of five surviving fragments from an unidentified, possibly Lombard antiphary. The initial V introduces the first response at matins (“Videntes Joseph a longe” [Seeing Joseph in the distance]) for the third Sunday in Lent. The scene inside the initial, mistakenly described by previous authors (Melograni 1994; Hamburger 1995) as “Elisha in the Mantle of Elijah,” actually depicts an episode in the Old Testament story of Joseph and His Brothers (Genesis 37:11–27). In a landscape meant to evoke the fields of Dothain, Joseph is shown wandering in search of his jealous brothers, pasturing their flocks in the valley below. When they see him coming, the brothers decide to murder Joseph (“They saw him in the distance, and before he drew near them, they plotted to kill him”).

The Oberlin miniature, published by Jeffrey Hamburger (1995) as possibly Lombard, about 1440, may be associated with the same antiphary volume as two other cuttings, identical to it in style and decorative border, that were first grouped together by Anna de Floriani (1996, cat. no. 9, pp. 53–55) as the work of a Lombard illuminator active between the fifth and sixth decades of the fifteenth century: an initial D with King David in the Museo Civico Amedeo Lia, Todini 1996 (inv. 508), and an initial T with Isaac and Esau in the Cleveland Museum of Art (49.535). To these may be added two more hitherto unidentified fragments by the same hand: an initial I with Christ’s Entry into Jerusalem in the Free Library, Philadelphia (m27:21; fig. 26), published with a generic attribution to the Lombard school by Angela Danesi Lattanzi (1985, pp. 775–76); and an initial M with the Stoning of Christ in the Biblioteca Nacional, Madrid (AB/1923), published by Javier Docampo (1997, pp. 318–19) with an attribution to the Lombard school about 1445–50.

Together these five antiphary cuttings, including the Oberlin initial, form a homogeneous group covering the temporal cycle from the second Sunday in Lent through the second Sunday after Pentecost as follows:

Fig. 26 Lombard, middle of the fifteenth century, Christ’s Entry into Jerusalem in an Initial L, Free Library, Philadelphia, M27:21
4. Free Library M27:21: *Christ’s Entry into Jerusalem in an Initial I* (“In die qua invocavi te” [When I called to you]). First response at matins for Palm Sunday
5. Museo Civico Amedeo Lia inv.508: *King David in an Initial D* (“Deus omnium exauditor est” [God hears everyone]). First response of first nocturn for second Sunday after Pentecost

As noted by Anna Melograni (1994, p. 290) in relation to the Museo Lia fragment, the style of this anonymous artist typifies the developments in Lombard illumination around the middle of the fifteenth century. While compositional and decorative elements recall the production of the Master of the Vitae Imperatorum, the more schematic, flatter rendering of the forms anticipates the work of a later generation of artists, active in the seventh and eighth decades of the century (see below, cat. nos. 62a–d, 63).

1. The unusual subject of this miniature might have illustrated a number of texts. If it is the Feast of the Dedication of the Temple, at which is read the episode of Christ walking in Solomon’s porch and being threatened with stoning by Pharisee extremists (John 10:22–39), the initial M could refer to the beginning of the first antiphon at lauds for that feast (“Mane surgens Jacob” [When Jacob arose in the morning]). The same Gospel passage, however, is also read during Passion Week, in which case the initial could illustrate the texts “Multa bona opera” (Many good things), first antiphon at vespers for Holy Wednesday, or “Multiplicati sunt qui tribulant me” (How many are my adversaries), first response at vespers for the Saturday before Passion Sunday.

---

**Master of the Franciscan Breviary (?)**

Lombard, active middle of the fifteenth century

---

**57 Bishop Saint in an Initial D**

Circa 1450–60
Cutting from an antiphonary (?)
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.6b
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 x 3 3/16 in. (7.6 x 9 cm)

Verso: ign

PROVENANCE: Acquired in Paris, 1953; gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954

This cutting, possibly excised from an antiphonary, was published by Charles Seymour in the same group as cat. nos. 48a–c with a generic attribution to fifteenth-century “North Italian school.” While a more precise attribution is made difficult by the miniature’s small scale and cursory handling, parallels may be found in the production of the anonymous, late Gothic, Lombard illuminator known as Master of the Franciscan Breviary. Named after a Franciscan breviary dated 1446 in the Biblioteca Universitaria, Bologna (MS 337), this artist was first identified by Pietro Toesca (1912, pp. 520–21) as a follower of Michelino
da Besozzo, one of the principal personalities active in Lombardy and in the Veneto during the first decades of the fifteenth century. Subsequent authors further defined the master’s style in relationship to the work of the Lombard illuminator Belbello da Pavia (cat. nos. 58a–d), from whom are derived many of the decorative elements of his mature production.²

Among the increasing number of works attributed to the Master of the Franciscan Breviary, which include numerous cuttings dispersed among various European and American collections, the closest comparison for the Yale fragment is found in the illuminations he contributed to two volumes of an antiphonary in the choir book series of Cardinal Bessarion (Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena, Bessarion 3; Cini Collection Venice, 2096; Mariani Canova 1978a, pp. 40–43; and above, and cat. nos. 42a–c). Datable to the sixth decade of the fifteenth century, these works, like the Yale fragment, reflect a broader execution than the Franciscan breviary and display the same curved-petal motif, derived from Belbello, surrounding the initials.

1. This cutting was listed by Seymour (1970) as sharing the same provenance as cat. nos. 48a–c. As in the case of those miniatures, no records of this purchase have been found in the Robert Lehman Collection archives.
2. For a summary of the extensive literature on the artist, see Stefani 1985, pp. 849–52; and, most recently, Frosinini 1998, pp. 321–33.

The Choir Books of San Giorgio Maggiore in Venice

Between 1467 and 1470, under the abbacy of Cipriano Rinaldini, the Benedictines of San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice, commissioned a new series of choir books for their monastery, entrusting its decoration to a prestigious team of Lombard illuminators headed by Belbello da Pavia, the foremost representative of the late Gothic style in northern Italy. Produced during the last years of the artist’s activity, Belbello’s illuminations for the series, characterized by an almost excessive decorative exuberance and dazzling coloristic effects, have come to be viewed as the crowning achievement of his career.

Belbello’s role in the decoration of the San Giorgio Maggiore choir books was first outlined by Giordana Mariani Canova (1973), who discovered, still preserved in the sacristy of San Giorgio, three surviving volumes and other fragments from this series, believed lost since its last mention in the early nineteenth century. The identification of Belbello’s hand in these volumes provided important evidence of a late Venetian phase in the artist’s career, following the last mention of his name in documents in 1462 and the official termination of his employment at the Gonzaga court in Mantua.

Fig. 37 San Giorgio Maggiore Antiphonary P
Based on a comparison with the artist’s illuminations in the San Giorgio Maggiore volumes, Mariani Canova, followed by subsequent authors, went on to associate with the series many of the surviving fragments by Belbello datable to the same period in his career and dispersed in various collections. The reconstruction of this important commission was recently furthered by the discovery (Palladino 2002), in the storerooms of The Metropolitan Museum of Art, of another missing antiphony volume from San Giorgio, which, together with five other fragments from the series, was formerly included in the collection of Robert Lehman.

Above: Belbello da Pavia, Antiphonary P (fols. 3v–4r)

Belbello da Pavia and Collaborators
Lombard, active circa 1420–70

58a
Benedictine Antiphonary
Circa 1467–70
New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, The Cloisters Collection, 1960 (60.163)

96 folios. Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Page: 22 3/4 x 16 1/4 in. (57.2 x 41 cm). Stave: 4 2 cm. Binding: 23 x 16 3/4 in. (58.5 x 42.5 cm)

Later binding of tooled brown leather. Marking the back cover is a letter P formed of large metal rivets. The volume was rebound in the seventeenth century. An old folio numeration in ink, in the center right margin, has been erased and is inconsistent. It has been replaced by consecutive modern numeration, in pencil, in the upper...
right corner. The first three folios are missing, as well as many other leaves throughout the volume (see cat. nos. 59a–b). The present numeration begins on the former folio 4.

Contents: Temporale (Advent to Lent). The original volume ends on the present folio 76. Folios 77–84 were originally included in a second temporal volume covering Passion and Holy Weeks. Folios 85–91 are random pages from another volume containing the Commons of Saints. Folios 92–96 are later, seventeenth-century additions. Pasted onto folios 93v and 95v, respectively, are two initials from an unidentified fifteenth-century manuscript. Contains numerous painted letters but no historiated initials.

PROVENANCE: San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; Bruscoli, Florence, 1924; gift of Robert Lehman to The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1960

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, A.4 (as early 15th century, written in northern Italy); Palladino 2002 (as Belbello de Pavia, ca. 1467–70)

This book may be identified as the first part of a multivolume antiphonary that was originally included in the San Giorgio Maggiore choir book series. Based on the contents of the three surviving volumes (Antiphonaries M, Q, and R) that were discovered by Giordana Mariani Canova (1973) in the sacristy of San Giorgio, the original content of the antiphonary set may be reconstructed as follows:

Four-Part Temporale
Vol. 1: Advent to Lent. The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Antiphonary P
Vol. II: Passion and Holy Weeks. Missing (see cat. nos. 59a–b)
Vol. III: Easter to Corpus Domini. San Giorgio Maggiore, Antiphonary R
Vol. IV: Pentecost to Advent. Missing
Two-Part Proper
Vol. v: Feast of Saint Andrew (November 30) to Feast of Saints Peter and Paul (June 29). San Giorgio Maggiore, Antiphony M
Vol. vi: Missing

One-Part Common
Vol. vii: San Giorgio Maggiore, Antiphony Q

The provenance of the Metropolitan Museum volume from the San Giorgio Maggiore series is confirmed by the presence on the back cover of a large letter P formed of round metal rivets, identical to the letters that mark the three surviving volumes in Venice. Also corresponding to those choir books are its dimensions, stave height, and decoration.

Like the volumes in San Giorgio Maggiore (Mariani Canova 1973, p. 40), the Metropolitan Museum Antiphony P reflects the restorations that the entire series underwent in the seventeenth century. Already in fragmentary condition when it was bought by Robert Lehman in 1924, it is missing many leaves, including all those with historiated initials. Additionally, it was rebound with many bifolia inserted out of sequence and the inclusion of several leaves from other antiphony volumes in the series. Among the missing sections are the first three leaves in the book, which presently starts on the former folio 4 with the antiphon of the Magnificat for the first Sunday of Advent. The volume’s original contents end on the present folio 76 (ex-fol. 144) with the Saturday of the fourth week in Lent. Beginning on the present folio 77 are remnants of a missing second temporal volume, the frontispiece of which may be identified with a leaf also formerly in the Lehman collection (cat. no. 59a). From folio 85 to folio 91 are random pages from the Common of Martyr Saints, originally included at the beginning of San Giorgio Antiphony Q.

The decoration of Antiphony P at present consists only of large painted letters that may be attributed to Belbello da Pavia and his two anonymous collaborators in the San Giorgio series: the so-called Master of Antiphonary Q (fig. 28) and the so-called Second Master of Antiphonary M (fig. 29). An idea of the volume’s original decorative brilliance, however, may be gleaned from the five surviving cuttings by Belbello that can be securely associated with it, which are divided between the Cini Collection, Venice, and the former Lehman collection (cat. nos. 58b–d). One of the Cini leaves, showing the Annunciation in an Initial M (2093; fig. 30), and previously related to an unidentified missing volume in the San Giorgio series by Mariani Canova (1973, p. 45; 1978a, pp. 44–48), is, in fact, the missing frontispiece of Antiphony P. Such an identification and the volume’s original provenance are confirmed by the rubric “Incipit antiphonarium temporis Sabbato ante prima dominicam de Adventu” (Here begins the antiphony of the season from Saturday before the first Sunday of Advent) on the recto of the Cini Annunciation, accompanied by the later inscription, “Antiphonarium santi georgii maioris de Venetiis signatum numero 2” (Antiphonary marked number 2 from San Giorgio Maggiore of Venice).

Fig. 30 Belbello da Pavia, Annunciation in an Initial M. Fondazione Giorgio Cini, Venice, 2093
Belbello da Pavia

58b

Christ Blessing in an Initial T

Circa 1467–70
Leaf from an antiphary

Tempora and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 × 16 ⅞ in. (55.9 × 41 cm). Initial: 7 ½ × 6 ¾ in. (18 × 15.5 cm). Stave: 4.2 cm


Provenance: San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; Bruscoli, Florence, 1924

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, c-33 (as page from A.4, choir book, early 15th century, written in northern Italy); Levi D’Ancona 1970, p. 55 (as Belbello da Pavia); Mariani Canova 1978a, pp. 47–48, n. 15 (as Belbello, possibly from the San Giorgio Maggiore series); Mariani Canova 1988, p. 114 (as Belbello, from the same San Giorgio Maggiore volume as Cini 2003); Melograni 1995, pp. 8, 24, n. 104, fig. 34 (as Belbello, from the same San Giorgio Maggiore volume as Cini 2003); De Florian 1996, p. 40, n. 12 (as Belbello, from San Giorgio Maggiore Antiphonary M); Toscano 1998, p. 27, n. 93 (as Belbello, from the San Giorgio Maggiore series); Palladino 2002 (as Belbello, from San Giorgio Maggiore Antiphonary P)

Like the following two fragments by Belbello (cat. nos. 58c–d), this leaf was excised at an unknown date from the Metropolitan Museum’s Antiphonary P from San Giorgio Maggiore. The association between these cuttings and the Museum’s volume was first pointed out by De Ricci but has passed unobserved in the subsequent literature. Following Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1970), who attributed them to Belbello, Giordana Mariani Canova (1978a) first recognized a similarity between these miniatures and those by the artist in the surviving volumes in San Giorgio Maggiore and tentatively suggested that they may have been included in a missing volume in the series. More specifically, Mariani Canova (1988) went on to associate all three fragments with the same volume as the Annunciation in the Cini Collection, Venice (fig. 30); which, as noted in the previous entry, is actually the missing frontispiece of Antiphonary P.

The present leaf, showing Christ Blessing in an Initial T, illustrates the first antiphon at second vespers (“Tecum principium” [Yours is princely rule]) for Christmas Day (December 25). It may be identified as one of two or more missing folios originally inserted between the present folio 29 and folio 30 of Antiphonary P, the latter of which contains the fourth antiphon at second vespers for Christmas Day.

The monumental quality of the large, powerful figure of Christ, which dominates the Lehman page, and the broadly rendered foliate border and luminous, acidic palette are typical of Belbello’s efforts throughout the San Giorgio series. These works reflect the final evolution of his style, from the minutely refined elegance of his earliest efforts in the Visconti Hours, datable to between 1420 and 1430 and still tied to the courtly manner of his Lombard predecessors, into an entirely personal and eccentric monumental idiom with an aggressively immediate visual impact.

1. This provenance is recorded on the back of old photographs of this leaf and three others from the same series formerly in the Lehman collection (cat. nos. 58c and 59a–b). There is no record in the Robert Lehman Collection archives to support De Ricci’s statement that they were acquired from Olshki in 1923. An invoice from Olshki, dated 1924, records the purchase of only one leaf by Belbello (cat. no. 58d) among other unrelated manuscripts.

2. Sylvie Béguin (1957, p. 106, no. 156) had previously proposed an attribution to the circle of Belbello for one of these leaves (cat. no. 58d).

58c

Saint Stephen in an Initial T

Circa 1467–70
Leaf from an antiphary

Tempora and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 ¼ × 16 in. (56.5 × 40.7 cm). Initial: 6 ⅝ × 6 ⅜ in. (16.4 × 17 cm). Stave: 4.2 cm


Provenance: San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; Bruscoli, Florence, 1924

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, c-33 (as page from A.4, choir book, early 15th century, written in northern Italy); Levi D’Ancona
The initial T illustrates the first antiphon at first vespers (“Tu principatum tenes in choro martyrum” [You are first among the choir of martyrs]) for the Feast of Saint Stephen (December 26). This leaf is one of two surviving fragments by Belbello, illustrating the same feast, that were originally inserted between the present folios 31 and 32 of the Metropolitan Museum’s Antiphonary P from San Giorgio Maggiore. Above the Saint Stephen is the conclusion of the antiphon of the Magnificat at second vespers for Christmas Day (December 25), the text of which begins on folio 31v.

Following the present leaf and preceding folio 32 in Antiphonary P was a leaf with the Stoning of Saint Stephen in an Initial L, in the Cini Collection, Venice (2094), previously associated with the Annunciation frontispiece by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978a, pp. 48–49). The initial L, located on the Cini leaf’s verso, illustrates the first antiphon at lauds (“Lapidaverunt Stephanum” [They stoned Stephen]) for the Feast of Saint Stephen, the text of which is continued at the top of folio 32r.
58d

Young Christ Blessing in an Initial A

Circa 1467–70
Leaf from an antiphony

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 7/8 x 16 in. (56.3 x 40.7 cm). Initial: 8 x 8 1/2 in. (20.4 x 21.6 cm). Stave: 4.2 cm

Recto: [inquiram] usum et offeram [us]/ ei munera aurum/ thus et miram all[elui]a euoeae / Venie[n]t ad te q[ue] detrahis[m] tibi et. Verso: adorabunt vestigia/ ped[um] tuorum // [rubr.] Ad laudes et per horas a/ Ante luciferum

On recto, in center right margin, in black ink: 82

Provenance: San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; Olshcki, Florence, 1924

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, c.33 (as page from A.4, choir book, early 15th century, written in northern Italy); Béguin 1957, p. 108, no. 156 (as circle of Belbello da Pavia); Cincinnati, 1959, p. 32 no. 332 (as Umbrian Master, 15th century); Levi D’Ancona 1970, p. 55 (as Belbello); Mariani Canova 1978a, pp. 45, 47, n. 15, fig. 82d (as Belbello, from the San Giorgio Maggiore series); Stefanelli 1985, p. 846, n. 105 (as Belbello, from the San Giorgio Maggiore series); Mariani Canova 1988, p. 114 (as Belbello, from the same San Giorgio Maggiore volume as Cini 2003); Melograni 1995, p. 24, n. 104 (as Belbello, from the same San Giorgio Maggiore volume as Cini 2003); De Florian 1996, p. 40, n. 12 (as Belbello, from San Giorgio Maggiore Antiphony P); Palladino 2002 (as Belbello, from San Giorgio Maggiore Antiphony P)

This fragment is one of several missing leaves originally inserted between the present folios 39 and 40 of the Metropolitan Museum's Antiphony P from San Giorgio Maggiore. The initial A, with an unusual depiction of Christ as a youth, illustrates the first antiphon at lauds ("Ante luciferum genitus" [Begotten before the Daystar]) for the Feast of the Epiphany (January 6), the text of which is continued on the top of folio 40.

On the present leaf's recto is an illuminated letter V, introducing the third nocturn antiphon ("Venient ad te" [They come to you]) for the same feast. The decorative vocabulary of this initial, distinct from Belbello's, betrays the intervention of the collaborator known as Master of Antiphony Q in San Giorgio Maggiore, who was also responsible for the following two Lehman fragments from the series (cat. nos. 59a–b).

Master of Antiphony Q in San Giorgio Maggiore

Veronese, active third quarter of the fifteenth century

59a

Kiss of Judas in an Initial M

Circa 1467–70
Frontpiece from an antiphony

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 7/8 x 15 3/4 in. (56.2 x 38.8 cm). Initial: 12 1/2 x 11 1/2 in. (32.4 x 29.5 cm). Stave: 4.2 cm


Provenance: San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; Bruscoli, Florence, 1924

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, c.33 (as page from A.4, choir book, early 15th century, written in northern Italy); Levi D’Ancona 1956, p. 34 (as Veronese); Mariani Canova 1973, p. 63, n. 65 (as Master of Antiphony Q in San Giorgio Maggiore); Mariani Canova 1978a, p. 48, n. 15, p. 50, n. 12 (as Master of Antiphony Q); Palladino 2002 (as Master of Antiphony Q, ca. 1467–70)

The initial M illustrates the first response at vespers ("Multiplicati sunt qui triturant me" [How many are my adversaries]) for the Saturday before Passion Sunday. As noted by the rubric on the recto, this leaf was originally the frontpiece of a missing second volume in the San Giorgio Maggiore antiphony series, covering Passion and Holy Weeks. During the later rebinding of the series a section of this volume was inserted into the Metropolitan Museum's Antiphony P between the present folios 76 and 85 (see cat. no. 58a). This insertion begins on folio 77 with the second nocturn for Passion Sunday and concludes on folio 84 with Wednesday of Holy Week. The evidence of several missing leaves between folios 76 and 77 suggests that the present frontispiece might also have been rebound into this volume.

This fragment was first attributed by Giordana Mariani Canova (1973, 1978a) to the anonymous artist she named "Master of Antiphony Q in San Giorgio Maggiore." In addition to his activity in that volume, this illuminator, who, together with Belbello, appears to have been awarded the main share of the commission,
was also responsible for most of the illuminations in Antiphonary R, as well as being involved in the decoration of at least two volumes of a missing gradual, of which only a few fragments survive (Mariani Canova 1973, p. 50). His authorship of many of the painted initials throughout Antiphonary P suggests, moreover, that he may have been involved with Belbello in the execution of some of the missing historiated initials in that volume. In contrast to Belbello’s eccentric but monumental idiom, the style of the Master of Antiphonary Q is defined, above all, by a fastidious concern with decorative details, at the expense of spatial and formal clarity, and by a caricatural expressiveness that betray a fundamental allegiance to the courtly vocabulary of a previous generation of illuminators active in Lombardy and the Veneto. Based on the identification of his hand in a gradual from the Benedictine Monastery of San Zeno Maggiore, Verona (Biblioteca Civica, ms 738), Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1956, pp. 33–34), followed by Mariani Canova and others (Castiglioni and Marinelli 1986, pp. 47–49, 185–87), first suggested a Veronese origin for the artist. To the body of works grouped around the master’s name by Mariani Canova (1973) and more recent authors (Marcon 1999, pp. 190–91) should be added an antiphonary formerly on the art market in London (Christie’s, June 28, 1995, lot 21), datable to the same period as the San Giorgio volumes.²

1. Two more folios from the same missing volume are at present inserted in Antiphonary Q in San Giorgio Maggiore (fols. 107–8).
2. The illuminations in this volume, mistakenly attributed to the Sienese artist Pellegrino di Mariano, closely reflect the style of the master in the San Giorgio antiphonaries. However, the fact that it duplicates in part the contents of Antiphonary R and that it does not correspond in stave height to any of the San Giorgio volumes would seem to preclude an association with the same series.

59b

Three Marys at the Tomb in an Initial V

Circa 1467–70
Leaf from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 3/16 × 16 in. (56.3 × 40.5 cm). Initial: 6 1/3 × 6 3/4 in. (17 × 16.8 cm). Stave: 4.2 cm

Recto: [alle]lu[a] allelu[a] [rubr.].ps/ Laudate dominum[m]/ om[n]es gestes lauda/e te eum omnes po/puli.[rubr.] ... a. Vespere. Verso: Vespere/ autem/ sabbati que luce/scir in prima sabb[a]/e venit maria mag[dale]ne

PROVENANCE: San Giorgio Maggiore, Venice; Bruscoli, Florence, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1708, c.33 (as page from a.4, choir book, early 15th century, written in northern Italy); Mariani Canova 1978a, p. 48, n. 15, p. 50, n. 12 (as Master of Antiphonary Q); Palladino 2002 (as Master of Antiphonary Q, ca. 1467–70)

This leaf was originally included in the same missing antiphonary volume, covering Passion and Holy Weeks, as the preceding frontispiece by the Master of Antiphonary Q. The initial V, identical in style and execution to the frontispiece, illustrates the first antiphon at vespers (“Vespere autem sabbati” [Now after the Sabbath]) for the Easter Vigil and may have been one of the last illuminations decorating the original volume.
The illuminated letter L (fig. 31) on the leaf’s recto, introducing the psalm (“Laudate Dominum” [Praise the Lord]) at vespers for the Easter Vigil, may be attributed to the anonymous artist who collaborated with Belbello in the decoration of Antiphonary M in San Giorgio Maggiore, the so-called Second Master of Antiphonary M in San Giorgio Maggiore. This illuminator was also active in the series of choir books made for Cardinal Bessarion (Biblioteca Malatestiana, Cesena, Bessarion 1; see above, cat. nos. 42-45). The master’s decorative vocabulary is closely derived from the late Gothic, Lombard models of Giovannino de Grassi and Michelino da Besozzo.

“In die qua invocavi te, Domine” (When I called to you, Lord). Fragments of the succeeding versicle (“In di[e trib]ulationis me[ae]” [In the day of my distress]) are preserved on the verso. The miniature was tentatively associated with the Venetian school, about 1420, by Charles Seymour (1970), who cited an unpublished opinion by Pietro Toesca.

A Venetian context for this fragment is supported by its stylistic proximity to a group of miniatures generally attributed to the so-called Master of the Murano Gradual, named after a series of cuttings divided between various collections, the provenance of which may be traced to a lost gradual from the Monastery of San Michele a Murano, Venice (Edith Kirsch, in Nordenhalk et al. 1975, pp. 70-74, with previous bibliography). Toesca (1930, pp. 93-94), who recognized the same hand in a gradual volume probably from the same series in the Kupferstichkabinett, Berlin (78 f 1), first identified this artist as a follower of Belbello.

**Circle of Master of the Murano Gradual**
Veneto, circa 1470

60

**Prophet in an Initial I**
Cutting from an antiphonary
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.4

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 9 3/4 x 6 3/4 in. (23.2 x 15.7 cm)

Verso: ti me d[omi]ne de/ In di/ ulationis me

**Provenance:** Paris, 1933;* gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1953

**Literature:** Seymour 1970, cat. no. 183, pp. 246-47 (as Venetian school [?], early 15th century)

The initial I, excised from an unidentified antiphonary, illustrates the first response at matins for Palm Sunday:
da Pavia, noting the strong dependence of his works upon the latter’s idiom. Subsequent scholarship, however, has been divided between those who share Toesca’s opinion (Cade 1984, p. 211) and others who either identify the Murano Master with Belbello himself (Levi D’Ancona 1970, pp. 35–39; Boskovits 1988, pp. 14–15) or view him as a precursor of, and dominant influence on, Belbello (Padovani 1978, pp. 24–34).

Despite efforts to confute the Murano Master’s work with an early phase in Belbello’s career (Boskovits 1988), the illuminations grouped around the Murano Gradual reveal a distinct personality, whose style is distinguished from Belbello’s by the frenzied, almost ferocious intensity imparted to his figures through starker contrasts of light and shadow and the more forceful modeling of individual features. These elements do reveal, as first pointed out by Serena Padovani (1978), the strong influence of Emilian painting of the first decades of the fifteenth century, although they do not necessarily imply an early dating for the artist’s production to that period. Obvious points of comparison between the works linked to the Murano Gradual and Belbello’s late miniatures in San Giorgio Maggiore suggest an extension of the master’s activity beyond the first half of the fifteenth century. The extent of the influence of the one artist upon the other, however, remains open to question.

Though closely related to the Murano master’s illuminations in its formal and expressive components, as well as in some of the decorative motifs of the foliate border, the Yale fragment is distinguished by a coarser, caricatural execution that suggests the intervention of a distinct personality active in the same workshop. This artist may also be identified as the author of another initial I with a Prophet, formerly in the Mortimer Brandt Collection, New York, and recently on the art market in London (Sotheby’s, June 20, 1995, lot 32); identical in style and execution to the Yale fragment, it was probably excised from the same antiphonary volume. A similar provenance may tentatively be suggested for a third cutting, possibly by the same artist, in the Staatliche Graphische Sammlung, Munich (Inv. 40158).1

3. This fragment, showing an Unidentified Saint in an Initial N, is listed by Ulricke Bauer-Eberhardt (1984) as “Emilia (?), first half of the 15th century.” The possibility that the present illuminator may have been active in a workshop headed by the Murano Master is suggested by the convincing identification (Franco 1998, pp. 161–68) of several hands working next to the master in the Berlin gradual, one of which may also have been engaged in the decoration of an antiphonary for the Cathedral of Capodistria (Slovenia).

Master of the Graduals of San Salvatore at Pavia

Lombard, active end of the fifteenth century–beginning of the sixteenth century

61

Standing Apostle in an Initial M

Circa 1480–85

Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 18 7/8 x 13 in. (48 x 33 cm). Initial: 5 4/5 in. (12.7 x 12.2 cm). Stave: 2.7 cm

Recto: [rubr.] In natali unius apostoli. Int[i]itus!/Michi autem/ nimirum sunt amici tui de/us nimirum confortatus e[st]/ princ/ patus eorum./ Domine probasti me et. Verso: cognovisti/ me. Tu cognovi(st) sesionem meam et resur/rectio(nem) meam./ Gloria./ Euouae.[rubr.] GR: Con(stitutum est) super/ onmen/ terram memo(rem)

On verso, in center top margin, in red ink: CXXXIII

PROVENANCE: Bruscoli, Florence (?) 1

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1713, b.4 (as late 15th century, made in northern Italy)

The initial M, as stated by the rubric that precedes it, illustrates the introit (“Michi autem nimirum honorati sunt amici tui” [Your friends are greatly honored by me]) to the mass for the Common of an Apostle outside of Paschaltide. This leaf is one of eight surviving folios and cuttings from an unidentified gradual, divided among the Cini Collection, Venice; the Jagiellonski Library, Cracow; the former Hoepli Collection, Milan; and previously on the art market. Identical in style, execution, folio dimension, and numeration, as well as in stave height, these fragments may be associated with

1. This provenance is recorded by Seymour (1970).
2. The volume is sometimes mistakenly described as an antiphonary (Kisch, loc. cit., p. 73, n. 2).
a single volume of the Proper and Commons of the Saints, the contents of which can be partially reconstructed as follows:

1. Cini 2106: *Presentation in the Temple in an Initial S* ("Suscepimus Deus" [We have received, O Lord]). Introit to mass for Feast of the Purification (February 2). [fol. xxxix]

2. Cini 2105: *Saints Philip and James in an Initial C* ("Clamaverunt ad te" [They cried to Thee]). Introit to mass for Feast of Saints Philip and James (May 1). [fol. lxx]

3. Ex-Hoepli: *Saints Peter and Paul in an Initial N* ("Nunc scio" [Now I know]). Introit to mass for Feast of Saints Peter and Paul (June 30)


5. Ex-Hoepli: *Birth of the Virgin in an Initial S* ("Salve sancta parens" [Hail, Holy Mother]). Introit to mass for Feast of the Birth of the Virgin (September 8)


7. Jagiellonski i.r. 1894: *All Saints in an Initial G* ("Gaudeamus omnes" [Let us all rejoice]). Introit to mass for Feast of All Saints (November 1)

8. Cat. no. 61: *Standing Apostle in an Initial M* ("Michi autem nimirum honorati sunt amici tui" [Your friends are greatly honored by me]). Introit to mass for Common of an Apostle. [fol. cxxiii]

The three Cini leaves and the two ex-Hoepli fragments were first identified as parts of a single gradual by Giordana Mariani Canova (1978a, pp. 53–54), who, following an early suggestion by Pietro Toesca (1930), attributed them to a late-fifteenth-century Lombard artist influenced by the Milanese painter Bergognone. More recently, the Cini leaves were convincingly associated by Pier Luigi Mulas (2000, p. 58) with an early phase in the career of the anonymous Lombard illuminator he christened “Master of the Graduals of San Salvatore at Pavia,” after the illuminations in two surviving graduals from a series of choir books for the Benedictine monastery of San Salvatore, Pavia (Musei Civici, cor. c, 11). The San Salvatore volumes, generally dated around 1500, have been thought to represent a mature stage of this artist’s activity, postdating his other illuminations in a gradual and in an antiphonary in the Church of San Michele, Pavia, datable to before 1485, and those in an antiphonary in the Duomo of Pavia (Ottolenghi 1996, pp. 9–15, with previous bibliography).

The Lehman page and its related fragments bear close comparison, in both style and decorative border, to the miniatures in the San Michele volumes, suggesting a virtually contemporary date of execution, in the early 1480s, and a possible provenance from a gradual in the same series. In contrast to the artist’s later production, characterized by a Renaissance decorative
vocabulary consonant with late Lombard manuscript production, these works, as noted by Mulas (loc. cit.), still reflect an allegiance to a late Gothic decorative idiom inspired by Belbello da Pavia, albeit integrated with figural and spatial concepts derived from contemporary monumental painting in Pavia and its environs. All of the works hitherto attributed to this master appear to have been made for Benedictine monasteries that belonged to the congregation of Santa Giustina, Padua (Canova 1984, p. 490), suggesting that the artist might have been a monk of this order. Among his later production must be counted a richly illuminated Benedictine psalter, formerly in the Jacques Rosenthal Collection, Munich, and now in the Boston Public Library (ms pf Med. 97), that was previously listed (in Hindman 1988, p. 31) as “location unknown.”

1. According to a note on the back of an old photograph.
2. I am indebted to Jonathan Alexander for directing me to this volume.

Frate Nebridio
Cremonese, active second half of the fifteenth century

62a
Saint Nicholas of Tolentino in an Initial E
Circa 1460–80
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 3/4 × 4 3/4 in. (9.5 × 10.7 cm). Stave: not visible

Verso: est qui ant [Deum magna/virtu]es operatus [est et omnis terra doctrina/ ejus repleta est ip[se intercedat]. In a later hand, in pencil: “from the Cathedral of Como”

Provenance: William Young Ottley; Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s London, November 16, 1925, lot 123)
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1715, c.20 (as Lombard, ca. 1480)

62b
Saints Maurice and Theofredus in an Initial A
Circa 1460–80
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 4 1/2 × 4 1/2 in. (11.5 × 11.5 cm).
Stave: 3 cm

Verso: Text is covered by the remains of the paper onto which the miniature was previously pasted. In a later hand, in pencil: “from the Cathedral of Como”

Provenance: William Young Ottley; Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s London, November 16, 1925, lot 123)
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1715, c.19 (as Lombard, ca. 1480)
62c
Saint Holding a Casket in an Initial I
Circa 1460–80
Cutting from an antiphony

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 4 × 3 1⁄2 in. (10.1 × 9 cm).
Stave not visible

[rubr.]ps/[...][In universa] t[erra gloria et honore/corona]stic eu[n]
d[omi]ne. In a later hand, in pencil: “from the Cathedral of Como”

Provenance: William Young Ottley, Lord Northwick (sale,
Sotheby’s London, November 16, 1925, lot 118)
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1715, c.24 (as Lombardy, ca. 1480)

62d
Augustinian Nuns in a Church in an Initial I
Circa 1460–80
Cutting from an antiphony

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 4 1⁄2 × 4 1⁄4 in. (11.3 × 11 cm).
Stave not visible

Exaudi]/[rubr.] in in[oc.t. an. No]n est hic aliud/nisi do]mus dei.[etc]
c[as] celos tang[ebat et descendentes/an]gelos. [Et] dixit:[vere
locus]. In a later hand, in pencil: “from the Cathedral of Como”

Provenance: William Young Ottley, Lord Northwick (sale,
Sotheby’s London, November 16, 1925, lot 118)
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1715, c.23 (as Lombardy, late 15th
century)

These four fragments, identical in style, palette, and
foliate border, were probably excised from the same
volume of an unidentified antiphony for Augustinian
use. The first two cuttings illustrate, respectively, the
Benediction antiphon (“Euge, serve bone” [Well
done, good servant]) for the Feast of Saint Nicholas of
Tolentino (September 10) and the first response of the
first nocturn (“Abstergat Deus” [God will wipe away])
Martyr outside of Paschaltide. The last cutting, showing a group of Augustinian nuns crowded inside a church, illustrates the first nocturn response (“In dedicatione templi” [At the dedication of the Temple]) for the Common of the Dedication of a Church.

The first three Lehman fragments were previously published as part of a single choir book by De Ricci, with an attribution to the Lombard school, about 1480. All four cuttings may, in fact, be associated with the same antiphonal volume as a well-known miniature in the Museo Civico, Bologna (Coll. Pal. no. 673), showing Saint Augustine in an Initial E (fig. 32). This cutting is identical in style and stave height to the Lehman fragments and is signed in the scroll held by the saint: “El mio filio Frate Nebridio si me a dipinto ad honorem dci, etc.” (My son, Brother Nebridio, painted me so in honor of God, etc.).

The Bologna Saint Augustine was first published by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1963, pp. 87–92), who identified its author, the Augustinian monk Frate Nebridio, as the same artist responsible for a group of miniatures formerly grouped under the name “Master of the Mainardi Missal,” after a manuscript in the Biblioteca Statale, Cremona (ms Civ. 188). Based on these works, the artistic personality of Frate Nebridio, who appears to have been active primarily in Cremona, was defined by Levi D’Ancona and subsequent authors (Bandera 1977, pp. 34–72; Stefani 1985, pp. 866–70) in terms of the persistence of late Gothic tendencies in Lombardy after the middle of the fifteenth century, as reflected particularly in the production of Bonifacio Bembo (doc. 1444–77), the Cremonese painter and illuminator active at the Sforza court in Milan. The

minute, though generic, articulation of the forms and elegant calligraphic style that distinguish the Bologna Saint Augustine, considered among Frate Nebridio’s earliest works, were specifically compared by Bandera (1977, p. 50) to Bembo’s works between about 1460 and 1470. The same date may be applied to the related Lehman cuttings.

A provenance from Cremona for the Lehman and Bologna fragments, despite the penciled notation referring to “Como Cathedral” (on the back of the Lehman initials), is suggested by the presence of the same inscription on a group of cuttings by the Cremonese illuminator Baldassare Coldiradi, also included in the Otley/Northwick sales and possibly part of the same series, that may be clearly associated with a Cremonese institution (see below, cat. no. 63). The presence of Augustinian nuns in one of the Lehman cuttings suggests a possible affiliation with a female institution of this order in Cremona. The existence of a bas de page attributed to a late follower of Frate Nebridio in the Museo Civico, Cremona (Puerari 1976, cat. 26, p. 92), showing Saint Monica between Saint Augustine and Nicholas of Tolentino and kneeling Augustinian nuns holding up models of a church, may confirm the identification of all of these fragments as part of a lost series of choir books for the Augustinian church and female monastery of Santa Monica in Cremona, founded by Bianca Maria Sforza (1423–1468), wife of Francesco Sforza, duke of Milan.

1. On the verso of the Saint Nicholas of Tolentino are fragments of the third nocturn response (“ Istev est qui ante Deum”) for the Common of a Confessor, not a bishop.
2. On the initial’s verso are fragments of the second nocturn antiphon (“Scuto bone voluntatis”) for the same common.
3. On the verso are fragments of the concluding verses in the first nocturn and of the following antiphons in the second nocturn for the same common.
4. Although listed as late-fifteenth-century Lombard, the initial I with Augustinian Nuns was not included by De Ricci in the same group. A handwritten note next to lot 123 (cat nos. 62a–b), in a copy of the Northwick sale catalogue in the Robert Lehman Collection, reads: “same book as [lot] 138 [cat. nos. 62c–d].”
5. The initial E may illustrate the Benediction antiphon (“Euge serve bone”) for the Feast of Saint Augustine (August 28) or the response (“Ecce sacerdos magnus”) for the Common of a Confessor Bishop. Cutting’s dimensions: 4¾ x 4¾ in. (11 x 12 cm). Stave: 3 cm. Verso: um dei.[rubr.]/salmo./consiliorum //v/enite adoremus// venite exaltemus v[i]/[rubr.]/ a. Beatus.
6. For the suggestion that the inscription on the reverse of these cuttings, including the Lehman fragments, might reflect a confusion between Como and Cremona, see Melograni 1994, pp. 293, 301–2, n. 71.

7. The scene is mistakenly identified by Alfredo Puerari as a “Madonna della Cintola.”

8. For this monastery see Aglio Cremonese 1794, pp. 79–80. According to the author, the church was founded by Bianca Maria in 1470. Since the duchess died in 1468, this date, if not mistaken, may refer to the dedication of the church rather than to the actual beginning of construction.

Baldassare Coldiradi
Cremonese, active third quarter of the fifteenth century

63
Monstrance on an Altar in an Initial C
Circa 1480–90
Cutting from an antiphony
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 43.17

Provenance: William Young Ottley; Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s, London, November 16, 1925, lot 112); gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1714, c. 22 (as northern Italy, probably Ferrara, ca. 1480); Hamburger 1995, pp. 30–31, cat. no. 29 (as North Italian, possibly Como, third quarter 15th century)

The initial C illustrates the third antiphon at vespers (“Calicem salutaris” [The cup of salvation]) for the Feast of Corpus Domini, celebrating the transformation during the mass of bread and wine into the body and blood of Christ. This cutting is one of two fragments from an unidentified antiphonary series that were purchased by Robert Lehman as part of the same lot in the 1925 Northwick sale. The other fragment (location unknown; see Appendix, no. 11) shows Saint Cecilia in an Initial C, illustrating the antiphon at lauds (“Cantantibus organis” [While the musical instruments were playing]) for the Feast of Saint Cecilia (November 22).

The author of the present miniature, and presumably of the related Saint Cecilia, may be identified as the Cremonese illuminator Baldassare Coldiradi, an artist documented in 1482 and 1484 in various payments for miniatures executed in the choir books of Cremona Cathedral. Based on these notices, his name was linked by Felice Zanoni (1936, pp. xix–xxxi) to the illuminations in two antiphonary volumes and a psalter from Cremona Cathedral, now in the Museo Civico, Cremona (cod. vi, x, xii). These miniatures formed the basis for the subsequent attribution to the same hand (Puerari 1976, pp. 80–81, 93; Marubbi 1989, pp. 252–54) of an antiphonary volume from the former convent of Sant’Agostino, Cremona, and various Augustinian fragments in the Museo Civico (cod. xxi; d.42, 43, 44, 46, 47, 48), in addition to several other Augustinian manuscripts, leading to the assumption that Coldiradi was associated with the same Augustinian scriptorium as the Cremonese illuminator Frate Nebridio (see above, cat. no. 62a–d).

The Oberlin initial is identical in style and palette to a series of cuttings by Coldiradi, dispersed among various collections, that have recently been grouped together by Anna Melograni (1995, pp. 21–22) as part of a single antiphonary volume. Among these are three initials in the Free Library, Philadelphia (M.71:1a–c), that were included in the same sale of the Northwick collection (lot 146) as the Oberlin and missing Lehman fragments, confirming, perhaps, their shared provenance: an initial G with Saint Nicholas of Tolentino, and
Girolamo da Cremona
Veneto, documented between 1460 and 1483

64

God the Father in an Initial D (or O)

Circa 1470–74
Cutting from an antiphonary (?)
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.2

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment: 9 11/16 x 7 5/8 in. (23.9 x 19.4 cm)

Verso: donis b[ea]tis mu/ ac par[i]na claritas/ affari ab sit libro/ a[...]is q[uem] actus noxiu/ sit ul[...] lubrica [con]pa/ po[na]is p[er] qua[m] a[...]ni i' acrius. Ob ho...

No staves on verso

PROVENANCE: Paris, 1953; gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954


The present cutting was first published by Charles Seymour (1970) as a work of Girolamo da Cremona, one of the principal Italian illuminators of the second half of the fifteenth century. This identification was subsequently confirmed by Keith Christiansen (1989), who compared the fragment to the illuminations executed by Girolamo in a series of choir books for the Cathedral of Siena, datable to between 1470 and 1474.²

Despite the epithet “da Cremona,” deriving from his father’s origins in that city, Girolamo was probably born in Mantua, where his father was employed as a painter at the Gonzaga court.³ The first record of Girolamo’s activity as an illuminator is a letter dated 1461 from Barbara of Brandenburg, wife of Ludovico II Gonzaga, to her son Francesco; in it the marchioness expresses her decision to entrust the completion of the decoration of a missal begun by Belbello da Pavia in 1442 to a “young man from these parts who illuminates very well.”⁴ Based on the close correspondence between the illuminations in this missal, still in Mantua (Archivio Storico Diocesano, Capitolo della Cattedrale), and the artist’s later documented works, scholars have unanimously identified the nameless “young man”
as Girolamo, who by this early date was already known as one of the best illuminators of his generation. Visual evidence suggests that preceding his engagement at the Gonzaga court, Girolamo was active in Ferrara, illuminating parts of the famous Bible of Borso d’Este, completed between 1451 and 1461. In addition to working in Ferrara and Mantua, Girolamo was also entrusted with major commissions for both secular and liturgical manuscripts in Padua, Siena, Florence, and Venice, where he is last documented in 1483.¹

As most recently emphasized by Andrea De Marchi (1993, pp. 228–37, 522) and Federica Toniolo (1997, p. 447), the single, dominant influence in the evolution of Girolamo’s style was the art of Andrea Mantegna
(1431–1506), the first painter to introduce a modern, classically inspired Renaissance vocabulary in northern Italy. The impact of Mantegna’s art is reflected in the spatial clarity and meticulous attention to detail of the Yale fragment, as well as in the architectural rendering of the initial itself, envisioned as an elaborately carved frame with motifs loosely derived from antiquity. Also derived from Mantegna are the sculptural cherubim and seraphim inside the initial, recalling the early works produced by the painter in Ferrara, which Girolamo would have seen firsthand (Christiansen 1989, p. 288).

At the same time, however, the feeling of quiet, classical restraint that pervades Girolamo’s previous production is disrupted in the Yale cutting by the broken folds and lively flutter of the voluminous draperies on the figure of God the Father. The resulting agitated atmosphere is also characteristic of Girolamo’s illuminations in the choir books of Siena Cathedral and may reflect the influence on the artist of the exuberant, expressionist vocabulary of his collaborator in this commission, Liberale da Verona.

1. As recorded by Seymour (1970).
2. The absence of staves would appear to suggest that the fragment was excised from a psalter, as stated by Christiansen (1989). However, the fragments of text on the verso do not conform to any of the psalms. Like the Frate Neri diodio antiphonary cuttings in this volume (cat. no. 63a–d), clearly excised from an antiphonary for Augustinian use and without staves, the present fragment may also reflect an antiphonary text specific to a particular congregation.
3. For a complete bibliography and summary of the vast literature on the artist, with accompanying biography, see Toniolo 1994, pp. 241–47.
4. Prior to this date, the artist is named in a notarial document of 1460. The date 1451 read by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1964, pp. 49–50) on a miniature by Girolamo in the Wildenstein Collection, Paris, though sometimes reported as the first record of the artist’s activity (Christiansen 1989), was actually proven to be nonexistent by subsequent authors (see Toniolo 1994, p. 246, n. 6, with previous bibliography).
5. As pointed out by De Marchi (1993, p. 228), visual and circumstantial evidence suggests that the two artists probably met in Padua, prior to Girolamo’s engagement at the Gonzaga court in Mantua. It was Mantegna, in fact, who was responsible for acting as an intermediary between Girolamo and Barbara of Brandenburg in the commission for her missal and who later accompanied Girolamo to Florence.

Lombard Artists
Active circa 1460–70

65a
Young Martyr Saint in an Initial E
Cutting from an antiphonary (?)
Blank verso
Provenance: Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s, London, November 16, 1925, lot 144)
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1715, c.28 (as northern Italy, ca. 1480)

65b
Adoration of the Trinity in an Initial D
Cutting from an antiphonary (?)
Verso: Not visible (cutting glued on board)
Provenance: Hammond Smith, New York, 1922
Literature: Comstock 1927, p. 57 (repr. p. 50) (as North Italian, early 15th century); De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, D.2 (as northern Italy, early 15th century)

These two fragments, closely related in style, execution, and palette, may have been excised from different volumes in the same antiphonary series. The blank verso of the initial E suggests that this miniature was originally part of a frontispiece leaf, possibly to a Common of Saints. The initial D, with six kneeling apostles adoring the Trinity, may illustrate the invitatary antiphon at matins for Trinity Sunday (“Deum verum unum in Trinitate et Trinitatem in Unitate venite adoremus” [The true God, One in Three and Three in One, come let us adore]). This cutting would have been included in a separate temporal volume.

Following a recent suggestion by Jonathan Alexander (verbal communication), both cuttings may be related to a group of miniatures attributed to a follower or to the school of Girolamo da Cremona now divided among the Library of the Monastery of Santa Giustina, Padua (cor. 2), the Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge (MS Marlyay 18), and the Colchester Castle Museum (221.32).
The volume in the Monastery of Santa Giustina, an antiphonary from the third Sunday of Lent to the Saturday after Pentecost, is missing many of its illuminations and now contains only painted letters and two large-scale miniatures. These were first published as works of a collaborator of Girolamo da Cremona by Giordana Mariani Canova (1970, p. 43), who noted their dependence in style and decorative vocabulary upon Girolamo’s two well-known cuttings in the Wildenstein Collection, Paris (Musée Marmottan, no. 64), and the Victoria and Albert Museum, London (m. 817), both of which were probably included in another volume of the same series (Toniolo 1999, pp. 257–58).²

The same elements that distinguish the miniatures in the Santa Giustina antiphonary also appear in five related cuttings in the Fitzwilliam Museum, identified by Mariani Canova (1984, p. 480) as missing fragments of the same volume: an initial R with Christ in the Temple; an initial A with the Resurrection; an initial V with the Ascension; an initial D with the Pentecost; and an initial S with the Corpus Christi Procession. These fragments were, in turn, attributed by Alexander (1985, pp. 122–24) to the same hand that executed the miniatures in Colchester, which are included in a gradual volume bearing the ownership inscription of the Benedictine monastery of San Benedetto in Polirone, near Mantua, and the date 1462.

All of the illuminations discussed above, while equally indebted to the vocabulary of Girolamo da Cremona, actually reflect in their execution the participation of several artists working together in a single

workshop. The distinction already drawn between two, possibly three, different hands in the Fitzwilliam Museum cuttings (Giles and Wormald 1982, pp. 80–81) also applies to the Colchester gradual. To a greater or lesser extent the two Lehman fragments reflect elements derived from each group. Both cuttings, for example, share the same strapwork initial style found on folios 9v and 19v of the Colchester gradual. The author of the Enthroned Virgin and Child with Kneeling Saints and Benedictine Monks on folio 19v in Colchester (fig. 33) may, in fact, be identified as the painter of the Lehman Saint. The Lehman Adoration of the Trinity, on the other hand, while recalling the composition of the Colchester miniature, reflects more closely the figural vocabulary of the Fitzwilliam Museum Pentecost (fig. 34) and Ascension, both probably by a different artist. As the subject of the Lehman Trinity corresponds to one of the missing leaves in the Santa Giustina antiphonary, it is possible that, like the Fitzwilliam Museum miniatures, it, too, might have been excised from that volume; the differences in the style and palette of the initial itself, however, make any firm conclusion impossible.

1. The saint cannot be identified by any attributes. The Common of Saints frequently begins with the Common of Apostles, in which case the initial E could introduce the response in the first nocturn (“Ecce ego misero vos” [Behold I am sending you forth]).
2. To the Paris and London miniatures was recently added a third, previously unknown cutting by Girolamo in the Musée Condé, Paris (Toscano 2000, pp. 32–35).

---

Fig. 33 Lombard artist, ca. 1460–70, Enthroned Virgin and Child with Kneeling Saints and Benedictine Monks. Gradual, Colchester Castle Museum, fol. 19v

Fig. 34 Lombard artist, ca. 1460–70, Pentecost in an Initial D. Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge, MS Marley 18
Domenico Morone
Veronese, circa 1442–after 1518

66
David with His Foot in a Noose in an Initial O
Circa 1500
Cutting from a gradual


Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 7 ¾ × 6 ¼ in. (19.6 × 15.5 cm). Initial: 6 ¾ × 6 ¼ in. (17.1 × 15.4 cm). Stave: 4.4 cm

Verso: me et mul[etere me]i. quon[iam]

PROVENANCE: Maggs Brothers, London
LITERATURE: Levi D’Ancona 1997, no. 26, pp. 185–88, with previous bibliography (as Martino da Modena, 1470s)
The initial O illustrates the introit to the mass for the third Sunday of Lent: “Oculi mei semper ad Dominum quia ipse ellevet de laqueo pedes meos” (My eyes are ever toward the Lord: for he shall pluck my feet out of the snare). This text, derived from Psalm 24:15, is continued on the verso of the cutting: “[respic in] me e mi[serere me] [j] quon[iam] unicus et pauper sum ego” (Look Thou upon me, and have mercy on me; for I am alone and poor). Inside the initial is the figure of the psalmist David holding the end of a noose around his foot and looking up to God, whose hand appears out of a cloud to bless him. The fragment was originally inserted in the temporal volume of an unidentified gradual.

This miniature, previously attributed to Benvenuto di Giovanni, Girolamo da Cremona, and Domenico Morone, was most recently catalogued by Mirella Levi D’Ancona as a work of the illuminator Martino da Modena, active in Bologna and Ferrara in the 1470s and 1480s. The similarities between Martino’s production and the Lehman fragment, however, are only superficial and confined mainly to shared iconographic elements. Beyond these, the articulation of the initial itself finds no parallels in the production of Martino da Modena but reflects the fantastic, architectonic, decorative vocabulary typical of late-fifteenth- and early-sixteenth-century illumination in northern Italy (see cat. no. 70).

A more convincing attribution for the Lehman fragment was proposed by Hans-Joachim Eberhardt (1986, pp. 103–13), who included it among a small group of miniatures attributable to the late-fifteenth-century Veronese painter Domenico Morone. In addition to the Lehman initial, the group consists of a Nativity in an Initial H in the Kupferstichkabinett, Berlin (629); an Ascension in an Initial D (or O) recently on the art market in London (Maggs Brothers, European Bulletin No. 18, 1993, no. 14); and a Virgin and Child with Angels in an Initial S, formerly on the art market in Berlin (Graupe, December 12, 1927, no. 63). As pointed out by Eberhardt, these works reflect Domenico Morone’s production in the last phase of his activity, from the late 1490s into the first decade of the sixteenth century.

Although a signed miniature in the Robert Lehman Collection documents his son Francesco’s activity as an illuminator (cat. no. 86), the extent of Domenico Morone’s own involvement in this medium remains unknown. Aside from the cuttings listed above, the artist’s production consists mainly of large altarpieces and small devotional panels, as well as frescoes. Among these the most closely related to the Lehman David are the signed and dated 1502 fresco fragments in the Museo di Castelvecchio, Verona (2070, 2071), and the slightly later predella panels with scenes from the life of Saint Blaise in the Museo Civico Vicenza (A41, A162), where one finds similar figural types and the same plastic rendering of draperies, shown clinging to the body or caught in a voluminous flutter. The arid landscape with rocky outcrops that appears in the background of the Vicenza scenes is also comparable to that of the Lehman miniature. Similarly, the style of the decorative borders and surrounds that appear in other works by Morone from the same period, characterized by inverted candelabra and acanthus-leaf motifs, closely recalls that of the Lehman initial and its related fragments.

Girolamo Dai Libri
Veronese, 1474–1555

67
Ascension in an Initial V
Circa 1495
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 7 ½ x 7 ¼ in. (18 x 18.3 cm).

Verso: veniet alleluia./Cume[ae]

Provenance: A. Sambon, Paris, 1926
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1711, D.5 (as northern Italy, ca. 1460)

The initial V, excised from an unidentified antiphonary, illustrates the first antiphon at lauds for the Feast of the Ascension: “Viri Galilei, quid adspicitis in caelum?” (Men of Galilee, why do you stand looking up to heaven?). In the banner held by two angels above the Virgin and apostles is a variant of this text that usually introduces the introit to the mass for the same feast: “Viri galilei quid admiramini aspiecientes [in caelum?]” That the
fragment is from an antiphonary and not a gradual is confirmed by the remnants of text on the back of the initial, concluding the first antiphon and beginning the second antiphon at lauds: “...veniet, alleluia. [Eouae.] Cumque [intuerentur]” (...will come, alleluia. And while they were gazing).

This fragment was probably excised from the same antiphonary volume as an initial D with the Pentecost in the Breslauer Collection, New York (Voelkle and Wieck 1992, no. 85, pp. 214–15). Identical to the Lehman initial in style, palette, and stave height, the Breslauer Pentecost was convincingly published by Hans-Joachim Eberhardt (1986, pp. 120–21) as an early work of the Veronese painter and illuminator Girolamo Dai Libri, the dominant figure in the production of manuscripts in Verona throughout the first half of the sixteenth century.

Born into a family of illuminators, Girolamo was the son of Francesco Dai Libri (ca. 1452–1505) and grandson of Stefano Dai Libri (doc. 1433–73)—“Dai Libri” meaning “of the books.” According to Vasari (1880, pp. 326–33), Girolamo’s father, Francesco, illuminated choir books for the principal churches and monasteries in Verona, including the important
Benedictine monastery of Santa Maria in Organo, where he was engaged between 1491 and 1502. During this period he may have been assisted by Girolamo, who is named for the first time in a payment record dated 1495 from the monks of Santa Maria in Organo. While Girolamo probably began his career as a miniaturist in his father’s workshop about 1490, the earliest plausible evidence of his activity as a panel painter dates closer to 1500. Vasari’s description of Girolamo as a sort of child-genius, who at age sixteen (in 1490) painted an altarpiece with the Deposition in the Church of Malcesine, Verona, has been contradicted by evidence dating this work to the end of the 1490s (Pietropoli 1986, pp. 278–80).

In the absence of any autographed miniatures by Girolamo, the reconstruction of his activity in this medium has been based on comparisons with his documented panel paintings and with the only signed miniature by his father, Francesco, in a manuscript dated 1503 in the Biblioteca del Seminario, Padua (MS 432). The latter has provided the basis for all attributions to the Dai Libri workshop, as well as for a distinction between Francesco’s and Girolamo’s hands in the large group of stylistically related cuttings from the Santa Maria in Organo choir books, now in the Museo di Castelvecchio, Verona (Castiglioni 1986, cats. nos. 45, 52–53).

The Museo di Castelvecchio miniatures provide firm evidence for both dating and attribution of the Morgan Library and Lehman cuttings. Despite Eberhardt’s suggestion that the Morgan Library Pentecost be placed in the late 1480s, when Girolamo would have been only about fourteen years old, that work and the related Lehman Ascension are actually identical in style and execution to a gradual leaf from Santa Maria in Organo showing the Road to Calvary (Museo di Castelvecchio, inv. no. 1465). This page, attributed to Girolamo and dated to the second half of the 1490s by Gino Castiglioni (1986, pp. 253–55), is distinguished by the same pale tonalities and delicately, almost hesitantly, rendered figural types, as well as by identical architectural motifs in the composition of the initial.

1. For a complete discussion of the Dai Libri workshop and Girolamo, see the essays by Gino Castiglioni (1986, pp. 78–99) and Hans-Joachim Eberhardt (1986, pp. 116–39, with previous bibliography).

Girolamo Dai Dai Libri (?)

68

Nativity in an Initial T

Cutting from a gradual
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.3

Tempura and gold leaf on parchment. 11 x 9 3/4 in. (27.8 x 23.4 cm).
Stave: 4.4 cm


PROVENANCE: Acquired in Paris, 1953; gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954
LITERATURE: Seymour 1970, p. 190, no. 143 (as Guidoccio Cozzarelli); Eberhardt 1986, pp. 219–20, fig. 215 (as Girolamo Dai Libri, second half of the 1490s); Peretti 2000, p. 102 (as Girolamo Dai Libri, last decade of the 15th century)

The initial T, excised from an unidentified gradual, illustrates the introit (‘’Tecum princi”ium’’ [With you the beginning]) for the midnight mass of the Christmas Vigil. This fragment, previously published with an unconvincing attribution to the fifteenth-century Sienese painter Guidoccio Cozzarelli, was first identified as a work of Girolamo Dai Libri by
Hans-Joachim Eberhardt, who inserted it among the artist’s earliest known production.

While aptly recognizing the overall stylistic and decorative components of this fragment in Veronese, rather than Sienese, book illumination, a specific attribution to Girolamo Dai Libri must be left open to question. Both the palette and border decoration of the Yale fragment, in fact, may be compared to early works convincingly attributed to Girolamo in the 1490s, such as the gradual leaf from Santa Maria in Organo in the Museo di Castelvecchio, Verona (inv. no. 1376; Castiglioni 1986, p. 262, no. 62). The figural style, however, sets the Yale cutting apart from this and all of the other miniatures hitherto attributed to the artist; barring the unlikely possibility suggested by Eberhardt, of an unknown, precocious phase of the artist’s activity in the 1480s (see previous entry), it is difficult to ascertain at what moment it could have been painted.

1. Information reported by Seymour (1970).

Lombard
Circa 1500

69  
**Prophet in an Initial D**
Cutting from an antiphonary (?)

*Provenance:* Unknown
*Literature:* Unpublished

The initial D, possibly excised from an antiphonary, may have illustrated one of the twenty-four Sundays after Pentecost. This miniature is identical in style, execution, and foliate decoration to another initial D with the Prophet Zacharias in the British Library, London (Add. 18196, fol. 81), probably excised from the same volume (fig. 35). The British Library fragment is at present pasted into an album of cuttings formerly in the Ottley Collection, suggesting a similar provenance for the Lehman miniature.

Both of these initials may be associated with the same workshop responsible for three fragments in the Wildenstein Collection, Paris, that were first published by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1970, pp. 107–11): an initial A with King Solomon; an initial N with Saint Maurice and the Theban Legion; and an initial B with Saint Michael Slaying the Dragon. The Wildenstein miniatures form the nucleus of a larger group of dispersed fragments, including the Saint Helena Holding the Cross in an Initial R formerly in the collection of Robert Lehman (Appendix, no. 13; fig. 36), which have been viewed (Mariani Canova 1978, pp. 58–59; Lodigiani 1991, p. 297, n. 10; Lodigiani 1992, pp. 98–101) in relationship to the work of the Milanese painter Bergogno (ca. 1453–1523) and to that of the so-called Master of the Arcimboldi Missal, named after a manuscript decorated between 1494 and 1497 for the cardinal archbishop of Milan, Guido Antonio Arcimboldi (Biblioteca Capitolare, Milan, cod.II.D.1.13).

The present miniature and its companion in the British Library share stylistic and decorative elements with the Wildenstein fragments, including the distinctive rinceau pattern painted on top of the gold.
Master B.F. (Francesco Binasco?)
Milanese, active late fifteenth century—beginning of the sixteenth century

70
The Prophet Isaiah in an Initial P

Early 1500s
Cutting from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6 1/2 × 6 3/4 in. (16.5 × 17.2 cm).
Size: 4.5 cm

Verso: Text partially covered by remnants of paper, onto which the cutting was originally glued. The following words are visible: [con-

PROVENANCE: Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s London, Novem-
ber 16, 1925, lot 131)
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1713, C.17 (as Lombard, late 15th
century)

The initial P, excised from a gradual, illustrates the introit to the mass (“Populus Sion” [“O people in Zion”]) for the second Sunday of Advent. This text is derived from the Book of Isaiah (30:19), the prophet depicted inside the initial. Visible on the back of the initial (the recto of the original leaf) are the conclusion of the offertory and beginning of the communion hymn for the first Sunday of Advent.

This miniature was acquired by Robert Lehman in the Lord Northwick sale together with a second related cutting, the present location of which is unknown (Appendix, no. 14). Both fragments may be included among a stylistically homogeneous group of illuminations, divided between European and American collections, the provenance of which has been traced to a lost series of choir books for the Olivetan monastery of Santi Angeli e Niccolò in Villanova Sillaro, near Lodi (Levi D’Ancona 1970, p. 99). The series, originally comprising more than twenty volumes, was dispersed after the monastery’s suppression in 1799, and only a handful of cuttings and a volume remained in Villanova Sillaro (now in the Museo Diocesano, Lodi). Numerous other fragments appeared in the same Lord Northwick sale with the Lehman initial.

Based on the presence of the initials “B.F.” inscribed on several of the Villanova Sillaro miniatures, their

background. On the other hand, they are distinguished from these and other works in the same group, such as the missing Lehman Saint Helena, by a harder and more meticulous execution that might suggest a different hand in the same workshop.

1. The possibility that the Arcimboldi Missal might be a product of the early career of Matteo da Milano, first suggested by Jonathan Alexander (1985, p. 133), is left open to question by Maria Paolo Lodigiani (1992, p. 98).
author is conventionally known as Master B.F., the name first assigned him by Paul Wescher (1931, pp. 133–35). This artist’s production, which also includes works on panel, has been viewed within the context of the Leonardesque school of painting that developed in Milan in the early sixteenth century. In studying the Villanova Sillaro miniatures, scholars have pointed out the precise derivations of both compositional motifs and figural types from Leonardo, who was active in Milan from the late 1480s. Additionally, it has been noted that some of the landscape elements show direct knowledge of specific engravings by Albrecht Dürer datable to the last years of the fifteenth century, possibly confirming a date for the miniatures’ execution in the early 1500s (Strehlke 2001, cat. no. 62, pp. 179–81, with previous bibliography).

In 1960 Wescher (1960, pp. 75–91) first suggested that the so-called Master B.F. was Francesco Binasco, who is recorded as an illuminator and goldsmith at the court of Francesco II Sforza, duke of Milan from 1522 to 1535. This identification has been accepted without reservation by some scholars but rejected by others on the premise that Binasco’s name does not appear in documents before 1513, whereas the earliest works attributed to the Master B.F. would seem to date to the mid-1490s, slightly before the Villanova Sillaro illuminations (Carminati 1995, pp. 111–13, with previous bibliography). Since both sides of the argument are inconclusive, most recent authors (Strehlke, loc. cit.) have chosen to leave open the issue of the master’s identity, while not entirely dismissing the possibility that the Villanova Sillaro miniatures could represent an early phase in the career of Francesco Binasco.
Lombard
End of the fifteenth century—beginning of the sixteenth century

71

King David in an Initial D
Cutting from an antiphonary (?)

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 4 3/4 × 5 3/4 in. (12 × 14.9 cm)

Verso: Not visible (cutting glued on cardboard)

Provenance: Purchased in Rome (?), 1927
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1711, d.24 (as northern Italy, 15th century)

This miniature was purchased by Robert Lehman together with a bas-de-page fragment with Christ as Salvator Mundi and Two Angels, purportedly from the same volume, the present location of which is unknown (Appendix, no. 15; fig. 37).

The nearest comparison for these cuttings is found in late-fifteenth- and early-sixteenth-century Lombard illumination, as represented by the group of miniatures decorating a choir book in the Biblioteca Francescana di Sant’Angelo, Milan (MS 1). These works were recently published by Cristina Quattrini (2000, pp. 201–9) as provincial derivatives of Milanese manuscript production, influenced in particular by the models of the Franciscan illuminator Fra Antonio da Monza (act. 1490s–early 1500s). Specific parallels for the figural style were convincingly identified by Quattrini in examples of monumental painting in Como, suggesting a possible provenance from that area. More than one artist was involved in the decoration of the Sant’Angelo volume. The Lehman cutting is most closely related to the hand that painted the large border friezes on folios 36v and 43v; the latter includes a bas de page with the Virgin and Child in a medallion supported by standing angels that is comparable to the missing Lehman fragment. The cruder execution of the Lehman cuttings and the more archaic decorative elements, such as the late Gothic architectural vocabulary of the present initial harking back to the tradition of the Master of the Vitae Imperatorum (cat. no. 55a), may reflect, however, the work of a distinct, even more conservative hand in the same workshop.

1. According to De Ricci, the cutting was “obtained in Rome.” The notes on the back of a photograph in the Robert Lehman Collection archives, however, state: “From a shop opposite a German bookseller, together with another miniature of the same book. Accompanied by del Signori, 1927.” It is not indicated whether the German bookseller was in Rome.

Fig. 37 Lombard, end of 15th—beginning of 16th century, Christ as Salvator Mundi and Two Angels. Location unknown
Master of Montemorcino
Antiphonary Q
Umbrian, active last decade of the fifteenth century

72
Martyrdom of Saint Agatha in an Initial D
Cutting from an antiphonary


Recto: [i]nter ibat ad ca[cerem]/et quasi ad epulas/ invita[ta agone[m]suum/[domin]o precib[us]com[m]enda[bat]
Verso: Dum/[torque]retur/[beata]agatha in mamill[a]/ gravi[ter] dixit

On recto, in center right margin, in black ink: CXTI

PROVENANCE: Monastery of Montemorcino, Perugia; Bruscoli, San Remo, 1929
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1711, c.2 (as Umbrian, ca. 1460)
The initial D, excised from an antiphonary, illustrates the first response at matins for the Feast of Saint Agatha (February 5): "Dum torqueretur beata Agatha in mamilla graviter dixit ad iudicem impie crudelis et dire tyrannus" (While blessed Agatha was being cruelly tortured in her breasts, she said to the judge, "Godless, cruel, infamous tyrant"). On the back of the initial (the recto of the original leaf) are fragments of the immediately preceding antiphon at matins for this feast.

The cutting may be associated with a group of stylistically related miniatures in a series of choir books produced for the Olivetan monastery of Montemorcino, Perugia, and subsequently transferred to the Monastery of Monteoliveto Maggiore, Siena. The series was first published by Alberto Serafini in 1912 (pp. 41–66, 233–62; Gualdi 1958, pp. 3–26), by which time, however, many of the volumes were already in fragmentary condition and missing numerous miniatures. The Lehman Saint Agatha was excised from Montemorcino Antiphonary M, a sanktoral volume beginning with the Feast of Saint Andrew (November 30) and concluding with the Feast of Saint Scholastica (February 10).

The decoration of the Montemorcino volumes, probably carried out in the last decade of the fifteenth century, was entrusted to a team of anonymous Umbrian illuminators whose style reflects the influence of the early works of Perugino and Pinturicchio. The artist responsible for the Lehman fragment may be identified as the author of the illuminations in Montemorcino Antiphonary Q, who may have been, according to Serafini (1912, p. 260, n. 3), a monk residing in the Monastery of Montemorcino during the late 1490s. His hand has also been identified in a group of other works for Benedictine institutions, including a miniature of Saint Peter Enthroned in the 1497 catasto (register of landed property) of the Benedictine monastery of San Pietro, Perugia (Archivio di Stato di Perugia, Castastini 2, fol. 21), and a miniature of King David in a psalter in the Biblioteca Storico-Francescana of Chiesa Nuova, Assisi (MS 34, fol. 5v), datable to after 1492 (Lunghi 1987, pp. 246–47, with previous bibliography).

A second cutting by the Master of Montemorcino Antiphonary Q, showing Job in an Initial S, is in the Free Library, Philadelphia (M29:6; fig. 38). Closely related to the Lehman Saint Agatha, it clearly belonged to another antiphonary volume from Montemorcino. To these fragments may be added a number of single leaves and cuttings by the master that have appeared recently on the art market. Possibly part of the same series, but by a different artist, are two initials in the Staatliche Graphische Sammlung, Munich (Bauer-Eberhardt 1984, nos. 571–572), showing, respectively, a group of Olivetan monks singing and the funeral of an Olivetan monk.

1. The transfer to Monteoliveto Maggiore took place sometime after 1831, when Pope Gregory XVI ordered the closing of all the Olivetan monasteries in the Papal States (Lugano 1903, pp. 105–6).

2. Antiphonary M was among the many volumes in the Montemorcino series that were recently stolen from Monteoliveto Maggiore. As a result, this information could not be checked and is based on Serafini's summary description of the volume's contents, included in a partial list of other antiphonaries in the series (1912, p. 233, n. 1), and on Todini's (1989, p. 117) description of the subject of the surviving miniatures.

3. Four leaves were formerly in the Pregliasco Collection, Turin (Turin 1984, nos. 18–19; 21–22); two others appeared at Maggs Brothers, London (European Bulletin No. 19, 1994, nos. 21–23); sixteen more at Sotheby's, London (July 6, 2000, lots 42–45); December 6, 2001, lot 43); and one at H. P. Kraus, New York (Isaiah in an Initial P). These have been variously listed as late-fifteenth-century North Italian, Florentine, and Umbrian.

Fig. 38 Master of Montemorcino Antiphonary Q, Job in an Initial S. Free Library, Philadelphia, M29:6

146
Master of the Osservanza
Sienese, active second quarter of the fifteenth century

73
*All Saints in an Initial E*

Circa 1430–40
Cutting from an antiphonary


Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6 3/4 x 5 3/8 in. (17 x 14 cm)

Verso: m pret[er]jita p[ra] a[la] pellitc

PROVENANCE: Maggs Brothers, Paris, 1929
LITERATURE: Levi D’Ancona 1997, cat. no. 17, pp. 138–40, with previous bibliography (as Master of the Osservanza, possibly 1430s)
The initial E, excised from an unidentified antiphonary, introduces the response at first vespers for the Feast of All Saints (November 1): “Exsultent justi in conspectu Dei” (Let the just exult before God). On the cutting’s verso are fragments of the hymn following the first vespers response: “Christe redemptor omnium, conserva tuos famulos... Beata quoque agmina caelestium [spiritu]m pret[e]ra p[resentia, futura m]ala pellite” (Christ, Redeemer of all, preserve your servants... And may the band of celestial souls dispel future evils with their past presence). Inside the initial is the Virgin in prayer, surrounded by saints and apostles; standing next to her in the foreground are Saint Augustine, on the left, and Saint Paul, on the right.

Formerly assigned to Pellegrino di Mariano, this miniature was first recognized by Keith Christiansen (1988, pp. 102–3) as a work of the fifteenth-century Sienese painter known as Master of the Osservanza. This attribution was recently reiterated by Mirella Levi D’Ancona in the 1997 catalogue of the Robert Lehman Collection.

One of the leading Sienese artists of the second quarter of the fifteenth century, the Master of the Osservanza derives his name from a triptych in the Church of the Osservanza, outside Siena, formerly assigned to his better-known contemporary Sassetta (act. by 1423–d. 1450). Based on the disparity in quality and execution among the body of works grouped around the Osservanza altarpiece, which has resulted in a long-standing debate regarding the artist’s identity, Christiansen (loc. cit.) tentatively proposed that these paintings might actually be the product of a Sienese compagnia, or collaborative workshop, involving the participation of two or more painters. He defined the master’s style in terms of a clear dependence on Sassetta’s advanced narrative vocabulary, albeit distinguished by an emphasis on brilliant color harmonies and precious decorative effects denoting a more conservative, late Gothic sensibility.

The Lehman cutting was convincingly associated by Christiansen with two other fragments from the same workshop now in the J. Paul Getty Museum, Los Angeles (90. MS 41), and in the Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge (Marlay cutting 11 12), showing, respectively, the Baptism of Saint Augustine in an Initial L and the Burial of Saint Monica and Saint Augustine’s Departure for Africa. Based on their subjects, he advanced the hypothesis that these fragments might have been excised from a lost set of choir books for the Church of Sant’Agostino, Siena, and dated this commission to shortly after 1430, when Pope Martin V transported the relics of Saint Monica from Ostia to Rome, where they were deposited in the Church of San Trifone (now Sant’Agostino). Christiansen also pointed out the stylistic relationship of the miniatures to the series of small panels by the master showing episodes from the life of Saint Anthony Abbot, which were dated by him to the mid-1430s (loc. cit., pp. 104–23). An equally pertinent if not stronger comparison may be drawn, however, with a series of predella scenes depicting events from the Passion of Christ (Christiansen, loc. cit., pp. 126–35) that have generally been placed later in the artist’s career.

1. For both texts see Antiphonale monasticum pro diurnis horis... Ordinis Sancti Benedicti a Solemnisibus Monachiis restitutum, Tournai, 1934. Although Levi D’Ancona thought that the initial was more likely to be an E, she was unable to find a corresponding text, and therefore proposed that it could instead be an O, introducing the antiphon of the Magnificat for second vespers.

Sano di Pietro

Sienese, 1405–1481

74

Adoration of the Magi in an Initial E

Circa 1462–63

Leaf from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 16 ¾ x 13 in. (42.6 x 33.2 cm). Initial: 5 ⅞ x 5 ½ in. (15 x 15 cm). Stave: 3.8 cm

Christus in raptu immersus ostendit multis diuinum
missale in die. Excepto quod. Gloriosus rex deo.
et festius est. et alleluia, ut. Tunc epiphania sit ostensio
missae de unica pecem evangelii quod de magis.
Definisco herede. Introitus. Dum mediis silentium
peroxidit. In epiphania vnit. Introitus.

Cecro

necunt

Domino: dominus

et regnui in manu e
In epiphany/domi/ni. Intinoitus. Ecce ad/venit/ dominator
dominus/ et regnum. m in manu e
On verso, in center left margin, in red ink: lxxxi

PROVENANCE: Santa Maria della Scala, Siena; bought by Robert Lehman in New York, 1919
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 712, D.25 (as Sano di Pietro, ca. 1460)

The initial E, as stated by the rubric above it, begins the introit to the mass for the Feast of the Epiphany (January 6): “Ecce advenit dominator dominus” (Behold, the Lord, the ruler, is come).

This leaf was correctly attributed by De Ricci to the Sienese painter and illuminator Sano di Pietro, one of the most influential and prolific artists in Siena from the second through the third quarter of the fifteenth century. First recorded in the 1428 register of the Sienese painters’ guild, Sano is thought to have been trained by Sassetti and to have been active in the workshop of the Master of the Observanza (see cat. no. 73), whose production has sometimes been confused with his own (Christiansen 1988, pp. 138–39, with previous bibliography). Sassetti’s sophisticated narrative style was translated by Sano into a more immediately accessible, popular idioms, based on the simplification and repetition of compositional formulas combined with an impeccable technique of execution.

A measure of the success of his activity is the large number of commissions for panel paintings and illuminated manuscripts that he received in Siena and its surrounding regions from both secular and religious patrons.

The Lehman page may be associated with an important series of choir books decorated by Sano, along with the Sienese painter Pellegrino di Mariano, for the Hospital of Santa Maria della Scala, Siena, under the rectorship of Nicolò Ricoveri (1456–76/77). The series included a four-volume gradual, at present divided between the Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena (cod. 95.1, 96.2, 97.3) and the hospital sacristy (cod. x). The Lehman Nativity, numbered lxxxi in its left margin, is one of five missing folios (1, 21, 56, 61, 91) in Codex 95.1, the first part of the gradual covering the liturgical period from the first Sunday of Advent to the third Sunday of Lent. An explicit at the end of this book states that the writing was finished in 1462, during the fourth year of Pope Pius II’s pontificate. This suggests that it was the first volume in the series to be illuminated by Sano—probably between 1462 and 1463, in accordance with the earliest recorded payments, from January 13 to June 2, 1463, that the artist received from the hospital (Cavallero 1985, p. 429, doc. 360).

A date between 1462 and 1463 for the miniatures in Codex 95.1 is also confirmed by their stylistic similarity to other illuminations executed by Sano around the same period, such as those in a three-volume psalter from the Monastery of Monteoliveto Maggiore, Siena, now in Chiusi (Museo della Cattedrale, cod. u, v, x), for which the artist received a first payment in 1459; and those in a series of choir books commissioned by Pope Pius II in 1462 for his newly built cathedral in Pienza (Museo della Cattedrale, Antifonario a.l). Compared to Sano’s later production (see following entry), these works reveal a more schematic approach to composition, defined by compressed spaces and abbreviated architectural structures, as well as a tighter execution of the figures.


Sano di Pietro

75

Martyrdom of Saint Agatha in an Initial D
Circa 1470–73
Cutting from an antiphonary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 10 ¾ × 10 ¾ in. (26.3 × 25.7 cm). Initial: 8 ¾ × 9 ¾ in. (22.1 × 23.5 cm). Stave: 4 2 cm

Verso: Not visible (cutting glued on board)

PROVENANCE: Santa Maria della Scala, Siena; M. Drey, Munich, 1914; Luigi Grassi, Florence; Marczell de Nemes (sale, Frederick Muller et Cie., November 13–14, 1928, lot 103); Anton W. M. Mensing, Amsterdam (sale, November 23–25, 1937, lot 8); acquired by Robert Lehman through Harold Beenhouwer, November 23, 1937
LITERATURE: Palladino 1997, cat. 18, pp. 142–48, with previous bibliography (as Sano di Pietro, ca. 1470)
The initial D illustrates the first response at matins for the Feast of Saint Agatha (February 3): “Dum torqueretur beata Agatha” (While blessed Agatha was being tortured).

This cutting, unanimously attributed to Sano di Pietro, was first identified by Keith Christiansen (1988, pp. 158–59) as the missing folio 3 in Codex 90.1 in the Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena, an antiphonary covering the liturgical period from the Feast of Saint Agatha to that of the Apparition of Saint Michael (May 8). The volume originally included seventeen illuminations by Sano, twelve of which, including the Lehman Saint Agatha, were excised from it at an unknown date before 1900.¹ A reconstruction of its original contents was recently made possible (Palladino 1997) by the identification of eight more missing fragments, divided between an album of miscellaneous cuttings in the Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena (cod. 124–3, pp. 4, 37, 45, 47, 51, 55, 61), and the J. B. Speed Art Museum, Louisville (63.9).

Like the gradual discussed in the previous entry, Codex 90.1 was included in the series of choir books decorated by Sano for the Hospital of Santa Maria della Scala. Compared to the gradual illuminations, however, Sano’s miniatures in this antiphonary reflect a
later stage in his stylistic development, consonant with his protracted involvement in this commission over at least a decade, from about 1463 to his last recorded payment in 1473 (Gallavotti-Cavallero 1985, p. 433, doc. 477). As already noted (Palladino, loc. cit.), the clearly articulated spatial structure of the Lehman Saint Agatha, the elegant figures in classical poses, and the luminous palette find their closest counterparts in the miniatures executed by the artist between 1471 and 1472 in a gradual for Siena Cathedral (Libreria Piccolomini, cod. 27–11), suggesting a nearly contemporary date for the execution of Codex 90.l. The conclusion that this may have been among the last books illuminated by Sano for the hospital, between about 1470 and 1473, is confirmed by the intervention of his collaborator, Pellegrino di Mariano, in the remaining volumes of the antiphony series, beginning about 1471 (see following entry).

1. The illuminations are listed as already missing in a 1900 inventory of the hospital’s art property (Gallavotti-Cavallero 1985, p. 231).

Pellegrino di Mariano

Sienese, active by 1449–d. 1492

76

Trinity in an Initial B

Circa 1471–76/77
Cutting from an antiphony

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6¼ × 3¾ in. (16 × 9.9 cm).
Size: 4.2 cm

Verso: nos de metuant

PROVENANCE: Paris, 1922
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, d.1 (as northern Italy, early 15th century)

The initial B, excised from an antiphony, illustrates the third response in the first nocturn for Trinity Sunday: “Benedictus Dominus” (Blessed be the Lord). On the back of the cutting are fragments of the fourth antiphon in the first nocturn: “[Benedicat nos Deus, Deus noster, bendicat]nos de[us: Eti] metuant [eum omnes fines terrae]” (May God, our God, bless us, may God bless us, And may all the ends of the earth fear him). Inside the initial is a representation of the Trinity according to the traditional iconography that became common in Italy from the twelfth century onward: God the Father, seated on a bank of clouds displaying the crucified Christ before him, and the dove of the Holy Spirit above the Cross.

This fragment, erroneously listed by De Ricci as northern Italian, is a typical work of the Sienese painter and illuminator Pellegrino di Mariano, a slightly younger contemporary of Sano di Pietro. Between 1462 and 1463, the two artists worked next to each other on the choir books for Pius II’s new cathedral in Pienza and subsequently collaborated on the series of choir books produced under the rectorship of Niccolò Ricoveri (1456–76/77) for the Hospital of Santa Maria della Scala, Siena. Pellegrino’s most extensive contribution to this commission is found in the multivolume antiphony set that included Codex 90.l, illuminated by Sano (see cat. no. 75). Ten other volumes of this antiphony are preserved in the Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena, albeit also deprived of their historiated letters in the early nineteenth century (Gallavotti-Cavallero 1985, pp. 228–32). Pellegrino’s hand may be associated with
the decoration of at least five volumes, including Codex 87.G, an antiphonary covering the liturgical year from the vigil of Pentecost to Corpus Domini. The Lehman Trinity probably appeared on the missing folio 48 of this volume. Another fragment from the same book may be associated with an illuminated leaf by Pellegrino in the already cited album of miscellaneous cuttings in the Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena (cod. 124–3, p. 59; fig. 39). It shows an initial C with Christ holding the Cross as blood pours from his wound into a chalice, illustrating the third antiphon at vespers ("Calicem salutaris" [The cup of salvation]) for the Feast of Corpus Domini.

Pellegrino probably began work on the decoration of the hospital antiphonaries between 1471, the date recorded in another fragment from these volumes in the Breslauer Collection, New York (Voelkle and Wieck 1992, p. 211, no. 83), and 1472, the date in the explicit of Codex 81.A in the Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, Siena (Gallavotti-Cavallero 1985, p. 228). The Breslauer fragment, showing the Calling of Saint Peter in an Initial S, is one of three leaves by Pellegrino with the arms of the hospital and of Niccolò Ricoveri that were convincingly associated by Carl Strehlke with different volumes in the antiphonary by (1989, pp. 243–46); a second leaf is also in the Breslauer Collection (Voelkle and Wieck 1992, p. 211, no. 84); while a third is in the Fitzwilliam Museum, Cambridge (ms 197). To these
may be added four more leaves by Pellegrino located in the Museo dell’Opera album of cuttings (cod. 124–3, pp. 7, 35, 39, 53). The first three of these were clearly excised from Codex 84.D and the last from Codex 92.N in the Museo dell’Opera.

Given the generally homogeneous character of Pellegrino’s mature production, it is difficult to establish a relative chronology for his miniatures in the various volumes of the hospital antiphonary beyond the general dating of 1471 to 1476/77, which coincides with the last years of Niccolò Ricoveri’s rectorship. The caricatural figural style and saturated palette that uniformly define these illuminations reflect Pellegrino’s transformation of the eccentric, expressive vocabulary of his presumed teacher Giovanni di Paolo (act. 1417–82) into a more formulaic and essentially decorative idiom.

1. The first three of these were clearly excised from Codex 84.D and the last from Codex 92.N in the Museo dell’Opera.

Francesco di Giorgio
Sienese, 1439–1501/2

77
Saint Bernardino Preaching from a Pulpit

Circa 1470–75

Tempera on parchment. 8 1/4 × 5 5/8 in. (21 × 14.3 cm)
Blank verso

PROVENANCE: Private collection, Munich (?); Leo S. Olschki, Florence, 1929

LITERATURE: Palladino 1997, pp. 130–56, with previous bibliography (as Francesco di Giorgio, ca. 1470–75); Hindman et al. 2001, p. 239, fig. 136 (as Francesco di Giorgio, ca. 1470–75)

This fragment contains a vividly rendered image of the famous Sienese preacher Fra Bernardino degli Albizzieschi (1380–1444), canonized by Pope Nicholas V in 1450. The saint, who may originally have been painted either with a halo or with the rays of a blessed around his head (possibly lost in a later repainting of the blue background), is shown dressed in the habit of the Franciscan order, in the act of preaching from a wooden pulpit. This image recalls the various depictions of Saint Bernardino’s outdoor sermons in Siena painted by local artists through the second half of the fifteenth century, some of which may have been based on the artists’ personal recollections of the popular events. In these works, where the emphasis is on topographical and narrative accuracy, the pulpit is depicted in front of a recognizable Sienese building before a large crowd. The present miniature, on the other hand, is conceived as a portrait intended to capture the immediacy of Bernardino’s presence from the viewpoint of a listener seated just below him.

Whereas other images of Bernardino present an instantly recognizable iconic type, the Lehman figure is characterized by an intensely naturalistic approach that fully conveys the physical aspect of the aging preacher. A sensitive drawing technique and subtle gradations of light and shadow give the figure volume and structure, while the meticulous attention to detail in the rendering of each facial feature conveys age and character: from the delicately painted, individual strands of thinning white hair, surrounding a bald patch with tiny pink veins; to the bulging, red-rimmed eyes with light brown pupils set in deep, dark sockets; to the thinly painted, downturned mouth; to the folds of skin and hollow cheeks. A similar concern for realism lies behind the depiction of the wood grain and every knot and nailhead in the pulpit, as well as in the precise indication of a light source illuminating the image from the left to suggest an outdoor setting.

Previously attributed to the Sienese artist Vecchietta, the Lehman miniature was recently identified (Palladino 1997) as a work of his younger contemporary Francesco di Giorgio, the dominant artistic personality in Siena in the second half of the fifteenth century. Equally accomplished as a painter, manuscript illuminator, sculptor, architect, and military engineer, Francesco di Giorgio may be regarded as Siena’s first Renaissance genius. His paintings, while on the surface indebted to the example of Vecchietta—who is presumed to have been his teacher—are distinguished by a full awareness of the more advanced Renaissance vocabulary introduced into Siena by the Florentine sculptor Donatello and by the illuminator Girolamo da Cremona (see cat. no. 64), both active in the city during the third quarter of the fifteenth century.
The Lehman miniature may be compared to the paintings and illuminations executed by Francesco di Giorgio between about 1470 and 1475 and, in particular, to the frontispiece of a manuscript in the Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Florence (Palatino 211), containing sonnets in praise of the Sienese noblewoman Bianca Saracini. The modeling of the figure of Bianca Saracini painted in this frontispiece is virtually identical to that of the Lehman Saint Bernardino, as are the composition, format, and size of the miniature. This has led to the suggestion (Palladino, loc. cit.) that the Lehman cutting might originally have served as the frontispiece of a manuscript of the same type, possibly a compilation of hymns in honor of Saint Bernardino.
Lorenzo Monaco
Florentine, active circa 1388–d. 1423/24

78

Last Judgment in an Initial C
Circa 1406–7
Cutting from an antiphary

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 12 3/4 x 10 3/4 in. (31.3 x 26.4 cm). Initial: 7 7/8 x 7 7/8 in. (19.9 x 19.8 cm). Stave: 3 cm

Cutting glued on board. Pen work added at a later date (nineteenth century?)
Visible under ultraviolet light above the initial: heredi (the end of a line of text that has been scraped away)

PROVENANCE: Santa Maria degli Angeli, Florence; Bernard d’Hendecourt, Paris, 1920

LITERATURE: Saffiotti 1997, cat. no. 21, pp. 164–68, with previous bibliography (as Lorenzo Monaco, ca. 1406–7)

This cutting was first associated by Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1978, p. 228) with the celebrated series of choir books of the Camaldolese monastery of Santa Maria degli Angeli, Florence. Written and illuminated over a period of 135 years, beginning in 1370, these choir books have been unanimously viewed by scholars as the crowning achievement of the art of illumination in early Renaissance Florence. According to Vasari (1906, II, p. 24), they were so admired by Pope Leo X (r. 1513–21) that he wished to take them for the Basilica of Saint Peter’s, but he refrained from doing so because they were written according to Camaldolese instead of
Roman usage. Vasari himself was amazed by the refine-
ment and size of these volumes, which he apparently saw
many times and described as the largest and most beau-
tiful in all of Italy. It is unclear how many books were
originally included in the Santa Maria degli Angeli series,
although Vasari gave their number as twenty. Following
the suppression of the monastery at the beginning of the
nineteenth century, eighteen codices, most of them
already missing illuminated leaves presumably cut out
and sold to collectors, were transferred to the Biblioteca
Medicea Laurenziana, Florence.

The Lehman fragment was identified by Levi
D’Ancona as one of three missing initials from Corale 7 in
the Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, part of a thirteen-
volume antiphony for Santa Maria degli Angeli.
proposed a partial reconstruction of this series, identified
Corale 7, which is dated 1406, as a supplemental volume
that was added to the original twelve-volume set written
between 1385 and 1397. Its contents include the contin-
uation of the Common of Saints found in Corale 11,
votive offices of the dead and of the dedication of the
church, and offices for certain feasts in April and May
that were omitted from Corale 1. The Lehman initial,
which originally appeared on the missing folio 124 of
Corale 7, introduces the second response of the first
nocturn for the Office of the Dead: “Credo quod
redemptor meus vivit, et novissimo die terra resurrec-
turus sum, et in carne mea videbo Deum, Salvatorem
meum” (I believe that my Redeemer lives, and that on
the last day I shall rise from the earth, and in my flesh I
shall see God, my Savior). A second fragment from the
same codex, excised from the missing folio 45, was
identified by Kanter with an initial D with The Man of
Sorrows between the Virgin and Saint John the Evangelist
in the Musée des Beaux-Arts, Dijon (1474).

Corale 7 is one of five volumes (cor. 1, 5, 7, 8, 13) in
the Santa Maria degli Angeli antiphony set that were
decorated by Lorenzo Monaco, a monk in the same
monastery and the leading painter in Florence during
the first quarter of the fifteenth century.1 The earliest
document pertaining to the artist, dated 1391, records
Lorenzo’s profession of simple vows in Santa Maria
degli Angeli, at which time he exchanged his given
name, Piero di Giovanni, for his religious name, Don
Lorenzo. Although he was probably apprenticed as a

1. For a summary of the literature on the artist, with a specific
focus on his activity as an illuminator, see Palladino 1997,
pp. 162–63.

Bartolomeo di Fruosino
Florentine, circa 1366/69–1441

79
Virgin and Child in an Initial H
1413–24
Cutting from an antiphony
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6 1/4 x 4 7/8 in. (15.8 x 12.4 cm).

Stave: 3 cm

Sicut mi[rha]/ estdis suavita

Provenance: Leo S. Olschki, Florence, 1924

Literature: De Ricci 1931, p. 1711, B.25 (as Umbria, 15th century);
Levi D’Ancona 1970, p. 55 (as Belbello da Pavia); Kanter 1994,
pp. 308–10, cat. no. 42 (as Bartolomeo di Fruosoino, after 1413 and
before 1424).

The initial H introduces the first response in the first nocturn for the Feast of the Birth of the Virgin (September 8): “Hodie nata est beata Virgo Maria” (Today the Blessed Virgin Mary was born). On the cutting’s verso (the recto of the original leaf) are fragments of the two preceding antiphons from the Common of Feasts of the Virgin: “[Benedicta tu in multilibus, et ben]edicctus fructus [ventris tuui]” (Blessed you are among women, and blessed is the fruit of your wombs); “Sicut mirrha [electa odorem d]estisuavita[tuis]” (Like precious myrrh, you gave forth an odor of sweetness).

Previously published as Umbrian or Lombard, this fragment was first associated by Laurence Kanter (1994) with a series of choir books for the hospital church of Santa Maria Nuova, Florence, commissioned in conjunction with the series for Santa Maria degli Angeli (see cat. no. 78). The Lehman Virgin and Child was identified by Kanter as the missing folio 148 from Codex B in Santa Maria Nuova, the fourth part of an antiphonary set containing the nocturnal hours from July to November. This codex is one of five volumes illuminated for Santa Maria Nuova by the Florentine painter Bartolomeo di Fruosoino, a contemporary of Lorenzo Monaco’s whose work has sometimes been confused with the latter’s.

to 1438 Bartolomeo is frequently mentioned in the account books of Santa Maria Nuova, where he was engaged as both a painter and an illuminator. The artist’s participation in the decoration of the Santa Maria Nuova choir books, for which he received his first payment in 1411, coincided with that of Lorenzo Monaco, who in 1413 illuminated one of the graduals in the same series (Museo del Bargello, Florence, cod. H74; Kanter 1994, pp. 287–96). Bartolomeo’s miniatures in two other volumes of the gradual (Museo del Bargello cod. E72, G73) and in two of the three antiphonaries he contributed to the series, including Codex B, all reflect a clear dependance in composition and decoration upon Lorenzo’s illuminations in Codex H 74, suggesting a terminus post quem for their decoration after 1413. A notice of the binding of the antiphonaries in 1424 provides a probable terminus ante quem.

Zanobi Strozzi
Florentine, 1412–1468

80
King David in Prayer in an Initial B
1450
Cutting from a psalter

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 5 3/8 x 5 1/8 in. (14.2 x
13.5 cm). Initial: 4 1/8 x 4 1/8 in. (12.3 x 12.2 cm)


Provenance: John F. Murray, Florence, 1924

Literature: Levi D’Ancona 1997, no. 22, pp. 169–72, with previous bibliography (as Zanobi Strozzi, ca. 1450); Kanter 2001,
pp. 144–46, fig. 4 (as Zanobi Strozzi, 1450); Pasut 2002, pp. 152–53,
no. 4 (as Zanobi Strozzi, ca. 1450)

The initial B, excised from the first pages of a psalter, begins Psalm 1, fragments of which are still legible below the illumination: “B[eatus vir qui non abit in
consilio impiorum et in via peccatorum non] stetit et
in c[athedra pestilentiae non sedit]” (Blessed is the man who walks not in the counsel of the wicked, nor stands in the way of sinners, nor sits in the seat of scoffers).

On the cutting’s verso are remains of Psalm 1:3–5. The illumination shows King David kneeling in prayer, his eyes uplifted toward a vision of the hand of God blessing him from the heavens; lying nearby are his crown and
psaltery. To the right of the initial, as if poised to climb onto it, is an angel; in the upper and lower left corners are the cropped figures of two Benedictine monks.

The Lehman cutting was first attributed by Licia Colloqui Ragghianti (1950, pp. 20, 27) to the Florentine painter and illuminator Zanobi Strozzi, a follower and sometime assistant of Fra Angelico. This identification was accepted by Carl Strehlke (1994, pp. 350–52) and Mirella Levi D’Ancona (1997), who dated the initial, on a stylistic basis, to about 1450.

Most recently, Laurence Kanter (2001) convincingly associated the Lehman miniature with two bas-de-page fragments in a private collection and in the Wallraf-Richartz Museum, Cologne (inv. 189), showing, respectively, Saint Benedict with Saints Mauro and Placidus (fig. 40) and Two Scenes from the Life of Saint Benedict (fig. 41). All three cuttings, identical in style and execution, were identified by Kanter as fragments of two frontispieces, a “Beatus vir” and a “Dixit Dominus,” from a lost psalter for the Benedictine abbey of Florence, for which Zanobi Strozzi received payment in 1450 (Levi D’Ancona 1962, p. 265). The Lehman initial and the private collection bas de page, previously attributed to Fra Angelico himself, were related by Kanter to the “Beatus vir” frontispiece mentioned in the 1450 payment record, while the Cologne bas de page was linked to the “Dixit Dominus.” This last initial, introducing Psalm 109 (“Dixit Dominus Domino Meo” [The Lord says to my lord]), has been subsequently identified by the same author (verbal communication) with a Trinity in an Initial D in the Cini Collection, Venice (2131; fig. 42), that was attributed to Zanobi Strozzi by Pietro Toesca (1930, p. 133, pl. cxxxii), and on the verso of which are remains of Psalm 109:5–6.3
The style of the four cuttings closely reflects Zanobi Strozzi’s mature production, as represented by the series of choir books he illuminated between 1446 and 1454 for the Monastery of San Marco, Florence (Museo di San Marco, 515–18, 520–22, 524–27). The dominant component of all these works is their clear dependence in figural style and composition upon Fra Angelico’s models of the same period.

1. According to an unsigned, undated note in the Robert Lehman Collection files.
2. [Domino a dextris tuus confrigis/in die irae suae regis]/ [judicabit in nationem]bus imple/[bit cadaver conquss]abit cal[pita in terra multorum…]

Battista di Niccolò da Padova
Paduan, active in Tuscany 1425–52

81

Crucifixion with Penitent Saint Jerome
Circa 1448–52
Cutting from a confraternity missal (?)

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Composite ornamental border, comprising nine fragments, glued around miniature at a later date. Miniature: 8 3/8 x 6 3/4 in. (22.5 x 17 cm). With border: 11 3/8 x 8 3/8 in. (28.8 x 21.7 cm)
The present miniature may originally have been the frontispiece to an unidentified volume, possibly a missal, for a confraternity dedicated to Saint Jerome. The image of the penitent saint, dressed in sackcloth and beating his chest with a stone before a Crucifix, first appeared in Tuscan painting about 1400 (Rice 1985, pp. 75–76). This representation reminded viewers of Jerome's ideal of ascetic spirituality and of the value of the mortification of the flesh in imitation of Christ's own suffering on the Cross. Its diffusion was related to the growing popularity of the cult of Saint Jerome since the late fourteenth century, especially in central Italy where numerous lay confraternities were dedicated to him.

The author of this fragment may be attributed to Battista di Niccolò da Padova, a relatively unknown artist whose personality as an illuminator was recently redefined by Angela Dillon Bussi (1997, pp. 89–94; 1998, pp. 105–14). Although his name indicates a Paduan origin, Battista is first documented in Siena in 1425, when he was commissioned to paint the monogram of Christ on the facade of the Palazzo Pubblico (Milanesi, ii, 1854, pp. 128–29). All subsequent notices refer to his involvement in manuscript production in Florence, from about 1438 to his death in 1452 (Levi D’Ancona 1962, pp. 59–60; Dillon Bussi, loc. cit.).

Dillon Bussi’s reconstruction of Battista’s activity involved the reattribution of the entire body of works previously assigned to the Florentine illuminator Giovanni Varnucci (1416–1457), brother and collaborator of the better-known Bartolomeo Varnucci (1410–1479). Both artists are recorded as working alongside Battista in the decoration of a four-volume lectionary for the Cathedral of Florence (Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Edili 144–47) that was commissioned in 1447. Dillon Bussi’s convincing reinterpretation of the documents pertaining to Battista’s role in this undertaking allowed her to attribute to the artist the decoration of the entire second part of this lectionary (Edili 145), previously thought to be by Giovanni Varnucci, as well as many other works stylistically related to it.

Among the body of miniatures now assigned to Battista, the ones in Edili 145, dated by Dillon Bussi to between 1448 and 1449, are closely related in both style and execution to the Lehman Crucifixion. Equally comparable are the miniatures in a manuscript of Virgil’s works, also in the Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Florence (Virgilio, Opere, Plut. 39.7), which were first tentatively attributed to Battista by Maria Grazia Ciardi Dupré dal Poggetto (1976, pp. 72–79) and dated by Dillon Bussi to between 1449 and 1450. Typical of Battista’s production, as represented by these works and by the Lehman fragment, are the solidly built figural types with square faces, coarse but meticulously rendered features, and slightly sorrowful expressions.

The composite foliate border pasted around the Lehman Crucifixion was added at a later date but may have been cut from the same manuscript. Despite the summary execution, it closely reflects Battista’s decorative vocabulary, mostly derived from fifteenth-century Florentine illumination but also recalling his Paduan roots in the inclusion of naturalistic details such as the young deer resting in a landscape in the top margin.

**Bartolomeo di Domenico di Guido**

Florentine, 1430–1521

**82 King David in an Initial A**

Circa 1466–69

Frontispiece from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 22 3/8 x 16 1/2 in. (57.8 x 41 cm). Initial: 7 5/8 x 6 3/4 in. (19.7 x 17 cm). Stave: 3.5 cm


On recto, in center top margin, in blue ink: 1
This leaf, numbered folio 1, was originally the frontispiece of a gradual. The initial A with *King David* introduces the introit to the mass for the first Sunday of Advent: “Ad te levavi animam meam, Deus meus” (To thee, O Lord, have I lifted up my soul. Psalm 24:1–2). At the bottom of the page is the Medici coat of arms, a shield with eight balls enclosed in a diamond ring.

The miniature was first attributed by De Ricci (1937), followed by Laurence Kanter (1994), to Francesco d’Antonio del Chierico (1433–1484), one of the foremost illuminators in Florence in the second half of the fifteenth century. Anna Rossa Garzelli (1985), on the other hand, had more convincingly included it in a group of works assigned to the lesser-known illuminator Bartolomeo di Domenico di Guido, a contemporary and close follower of Francesco d’Antonio. These works, like the Lehman miniature, derive figural and decorative elements from the production of Francesco d’Antonio but are distinguished by a less studied execution and more mechanical approach to ornamental details, suggesting a direct copy of Francesco’s models by an accomplished imitator.

Garzelli proposed associating the Lehman leaf with Bartolomeo di Domenico’s work for the Badia Fiesolana (the Augustinian monastery in Fiesole), where the artist is documented between 1466 and 1468 and where Francesco d’Antonio was engaged between 1461 and 1465 in the decoration of a series of choir books commissioned by the church’s patron, Cosimo de Medici. Among the volumes from the Badia choir books (now in the Archivo della Basilica di San Lorenzo, Florence) is a gradual (M211), covering the first Sunday of Advent to the third Sunday of Lent, which is missing two of its original three miniatures: a *Prophet David* and a *Nativity*. The presence of the Medici arms on the Lehman page and its identical subject might suggest that it is the missing frontispiece of this gradual. However, both the stave height and musical notation of the Lehman folio appear to differ from that of the Badia volumes, and, according to Elisabetta Landi (1977, p. 9), neither the style of the one surviving illumination in M211 nor its decoration or script appears to be consistent with the miniatures by Francesco d’Antonio and his school.

A more compelling argument for the leaf’s provenance is provided by its correspondence in style, execution, and decorative repertory to the illuminations assigned by Garzelli (1985, p. 169) to Bartolomeo di Domenico in another series of choir books commissioned by the Medici—those for the Franciscan convent of San Bonaventura al Bosco ai Frati, in the Mugello, now in the Museo di San Marco, Florence (cod. 581–587, 611). Coincidentally, a provenance from Bosco ai Frati may be established for two other leaves, one showing the Medici arms with the diamond ring and the other, *Saint Francis Holding up the Church in an Initial F*, which were formerly included in the Rosenberg Collection together with the Lehman miniature (De Ricci 1913, p. 28, nos. 83, 84, pl. xii). The Rosenberg *Saint Francis* may be attributed to the Florentine illuminator Bartolomeo Varnucci (1410–1479), who was also responsible for the illuminations in San Marco Corale 583 from Bosco ai Frati. A date for Bartolomeo di Domenico’s participation in these volumes after 1466, under Piero de Medici’s rule (1464–69), is suggested by the presence of the French fleur-de-lis in the arms at the bottom of the Lehman leaf, the use of which was granted by Louis XI to Piero in that year.\(^1\)

---

1. In addition to the San Marco volumes and the Stockholm leaf (Nationalmuseum, B 1213) published by Garzelli (1985, p. 169), an initial S with *Job* in the Nella Longari Collection, Milan (Todini 1999, p. 65, no. xi), which is listed as by Francesco d’Antonio del Chierico but is actually by Bartolomeo di Guido, might also have been part of the Bosco ai Frati series.
Lucchese
Circa 1470–75

83a

**Saint John the Evangelist in an Initial V**

Leaf from an antiphonary
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 43.16

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 25⅞ × 17⅞ in. (65.1 × 45.4 cm)

Recto: [rubr.] R/ Valde honora[n]d[u]s/ est beatus io[h]a[n]/ nes qui supra pectus

On recto, in center bottom margin, in black ink: 34

**Provenance:** Lucca Cathedral; Bruscoli, Florence; gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943

**Literature:** De Ricci, 1937, p. 1709, a.37 (as early 15th century, written in northern Italy)

These two leaves, acquired by Robert Lehman as a pair, were excised from the missing volume of an antiphonary set commissioned for Lucca Cathedral by Stefano Trenta, bishop of Lucca from 1448 to 1477. The commission was part of a program to renovate the liturgical furnishings of the cathedral and complemented the multivolume gradual decorated by Martino di Bartolomeo in the late fourteenth century (see cat. no. 31).

83b

**Massacre of the Innocents in an Initial C**

Leaf from an antiphonary
Oberlin, Allen Memorial Art Museum, 43.14

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 25⅞ × 18⅞ in. (65.1 × 47.3 cm).

Recto: [rubr.] R/ Centum/ quadraginta/ quator milli/a qui empti sunt de/ terra hi sunt qui

On recto, in center bottom margin, in black ink: 47

**Provenance:** Lucca Cathedral; Bruscoli, Florence; gift of Robert Lehman to Oberlin College, 1943

**Literature:** De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, a.37 (as early 13th century, written in northern Italy)
According to a 1492 inventory of Lucca Cathedral (Dalli Regoli 1973, pp. 85–92, 170–77), the new fifteenth-century antiphonary series originally included a temporale in eight parts, seven volumes of which are currently in the Museo dell’Opera del Duomo (MSS 11, 13–18). Missing from the set is Antiphonary MS 12, which included the arms of Stefano Trenta and covered the temporal cycle from Christmas Day (December 25) through the octave of Epiphany. The Oberlin leaves may be identified as the only known fragments of this volume. The first folio, numbered 34, illustrates the antiphon at lauds (“Valde honorandus est beatus Iohannes” [Very highly we must venerate blessed John]) for the Feast of Saint John the Evangelist (December 27). The second folio, numbered 47, introduces the first nocturn response for the Feast of the Holy Innocents (December 28): “Centum quadraginta quator milia, qui empti sunt de terra, his sunt qui [cum mulieribus non sunt coquinatini]” (The hundred and forty-four thousand who have been purchased from the earth, these are they who have not been defiled with women).

The decoration of the Oberlin leaves, and presumably of the missing antiphonary MS 12, may be attributed to the same hand, or workshop, responsible for the miniatures in two other volumes in the same series (a common and a sanctorale; Museo dell’Opera del Duomo, MSS 2, 6), which also bear the arms of Stefano Trenta. These miniatures have been viewed (Massagli 2001, p. 200, with previous bibliography) in relation to Luccese painting in the third quarter of the fifteenth century and compared specifically to the production of Baldassare di Biagio and Matteo Civitali. Based on textual evidence and the presence of the Trenta arms, their execution has been placed between around 1470 and 1475, before the bishop’s death.

1. This provenance, with no date, is recorded on the back of an old photograph in the Robert Lehman Collection archives and is reported by De Ricci (1937).

Attavante degli Attavanti
Florentine, 1452–1520/25

84

Crucifixion with the Penitent Magdalen and Saints Cosmas and Damian and Five Border Fragments

Circa 1520
Six cuttings from a missal

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Crucifixion (with left, top, and bottom borders): 17 3/8 × 10 5/8 in. (43.5 × 26.6 cm); right border fragment: 17 3/8 × 2 5/8 in. (43.5 × 6.7 cm). Window mat: (left border) 17 × 13 3/4 in. (43.2 × 3.5 cm); (right border) 17 × 11 3/4 in. (43.2 × 3.2 cm); (top border) 13 3/4 × 8 3/4 in. (35 × 20.5 cm); (bottom border) 2 5/8 × 7 3/4 in. (7 × 19.6 cm). Stave not visible (cuttings glued on board).

Provenance: Sistine Chapel; Abate Luigi Celotti (sale, Christie’s, London, May 26, 1825, lot 51); W. Y. Ottley (sale, Sotheby’s, London, May 11, 1838); Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s, London, May 21, 1928, lot 6) to Gooden and Fox

Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1717, c.25 (as Attavante, Florence, ca. 1503); Béguin 1957, p. 103, no. 149 (as Attavante degli Attavanti and workshop); Cincinnati 1959, p. 32, no. 334, fig. 334 (as Italian master, 16th century); Garzelli 1985, vol. 1, p. 225, n. 13 (as Attavante); Talamo 1997, pp. 224, 227 (without attribution); Hindman et al. 2001, p. 240 (as Attavante Attavanti, early 16th century).

These six cuttings, mounted and framed to form a single composition, were included in the famous 1825 sale of the collection of Abate Luigi Celotti, which consisted of fragments from the Sistine Chapel choir books dispersed during the Napoleonic invasion of Rome in 1798. As in the present case, many of the miniatures in the collection were presented as collages, which, by eliminating all text, were intended to confer upon them the status of paintings (Hindman et al. 2001, pp. 93–101).

The Lehman cuttings were excised from one or more missal volumes commissioned for the Sistine Chapel by Giovanni di Lorenzo de’ Medici, Pope Leo X (r. 1513–21). His coat of arms, a shield with six balls surmounted by the papal keys and tiara, appears in the lower border of the Crucifixion and in the cutting below it, pasted onto the window mat. Painted in the left and top borders of the Crucifixion and in four of the other fragments are two of Leo’s imprese:
a diamond ring with three feathers and a scroll inscribed “SEMPER” (always); and a yoke interlaced with a scroll inscribed “SUAVE” (sweet), in reference to Matthew 11:30, “For my yoke is sweet and my burden light” (Wieck 1994, p. 4). Other allusions to the pope are found in the composition of the Crucifixion, which includes, behind the figure of Saint John the Evangelist, Saints Cosmas and Damian, patrons of the Medici. In the landscape background is a walled city by a river that can be identified as Florence. Additionally, the presence of Saint John the Baptist between the evangelists Luke and Mark in the left border of the Crucifixion and that of Saint Lawrence in the outer right border fragment may refer to Leo’s baptismal name, Giovanni di Lorenzo.

Listed in two Sistine Chapel inventories recently published by Emilia Anna Talamo (1997, pp. 213, 216–17) are three missal volumes bearing the arms of Leo X. The Lehman miniature may be associated with one of two volumes, a “Papal missal for Saints Peter and Paul” and a “Papal missal for the Nativity” (Archivio di Stato di Roma, Camerale 1, vol. 1560, fasc. 24, A.1.3, A.1.4), which are described as including a Crucifixion with various figures at the foot of the Cross. The third volume, a “Papal missal for the Resurrection” (A.1.2), listed as containing a “Crucifixion with the Three Thieves,” may instead be related to another collage of fragments, identical in style and execution to the present one, which was also included in the Celotti sale (lot 53) and is now in a private collection in England (Ganzelli 1985, 1, p. 225, 11, p. 469, fig. 793). Possibly also connected to these missals are a series of cuttings with the arms of Leo X that appeared recently on the art market in London (Sotheby’s, December 2, 1997, lot 82).

Beginning with De Ricci, all of these miniatures have been unanimously attributed to Attavante degli Attavanti, the most successful and prolific illuminator in late-fifteenth- and early-sixteenth-century Florence. Their execution was probably contemporary with that of another Sistine Chapel manuscript decorated by the artist for Leo X, which is inscribed with the date 1520 (Pierpont Morgan Library, New York, H.6; Wieck 1994, pp. 4–5). This volume, containing the psalms and prayers recited by the pope in preparation for the celebration of the mass, may have been included with the three missals in the same commission.

Attavante’s luxurious pages, overflowing with ornamental details and classical motifs framing monumental compositions, mark the final evolution of manuscript illumination from the simple decoration of the initial toward painting on a small scale. His art reflects the sophisticated tastes of a discerning, literary class of patrons that included some of the most important families and royalty in Europe. The demands placed on the artist’s workshop, however, and the frequent repetition of the same designs ultimately lend his production a uniform character that has often hindered the full modern appreciation of his work and made difficult the distinction between his own hand and that of his numerous assistants.

Francesco di Marco Marmitta da Parma
Emilian, 1462/66–1505

85
Adoration of the Shepherds
Circa 1492–95

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 9 7/8 × 6 in. (24.4 × 15.2 cm)
Blank verso

PROVENANCE: Pope Clement VII (r. 1523–34); Pope Gregory XIV (r. 1590–91); Christine of Lorraine, grand duchess of Tuscany (1591); acquired by Robert Lehman at an unknown date
LITERATURE: Levi D’Ancona 1997, cat. no. 27, pp. 190–94, with previous bibliography (as Francesco Marmitta, ca. 1500)

This exceptionally fine miniature, conceived as a small painting, was purportedly once included among the possessions of Giulio di Giuliano de Medici, Pope Clement VII (r. 1523–34). Formerly glued to the back of the illumination was a long letter dated February 7, 1591, from Pope Gregory XIV (r. 1590–91) to Christine of Lorraine, grand duchess of Tuscany, which stated that the enclosed Adoration of the Shepherds, “painted with wondrous skill,” had been found among the household goods of the Apostolic Palace and was said
to have belonged to Clement VII. Wishing to bestow upon the grand duchess an enduring token of his benevolence, the pope wrote, he thought that this miniature, once the property of a Medici, would be an especially fitting present to her, as wife of the Medici grand duke Ferdinand I (1549–1609). Moreover, the pope concluded, the grand duchess would be granted plenary indulgences every time she offered penance before the image, praying for the triumph of the Church in the struggle against heresy.

The author of the Lehman Adoration was first identified by Beatrice Bentivoglio-Ravasio (1992) as Francesco Marmitta, one of the rarest and most sophisticated artists in the history of late Italian manuscript illumination. Sixteenth-century sources describe Marmitta as a painter, illuminator, goldsmith, and engraver of precious stones; however, in addition to very scanty biographical information, only a few miniatures and panel paintings by his hand have come down to us. Although he was born in Parma, sometime between 1462 and 1466, stylistic evidence suggests that the artist was probably trained in Bologna, where he was influenced by the Ferrarese painters Ercole de Roberti and Lorenzo Costa, active there in the 1480s. A further stimulus was provided by the production of the Bolognese goldsmith-turned-painter Francesco Francia, whose work is recalled in the sweet sentimentality and enamel-like quality of the Lehman Adoration and in its Flemish-inspired landscape background with closely observed atmospheric effects and naturalistic details (Bacchi and De Marchi 1995, pp. 11–59).

Marmitta’s only documented work is a copy of Petrarch’s Rhymes and Triumphs in the Landesbibliothek, Kassel (iv ms poet. et roman. 6.), datable to after 1483 (Bentivoglio-Ravasio 1995, p. 96). On the basis of this manuscript, Pietro Toesca (1948) attributed to Marmitta a small book of hours, known as the Durazzo Hours, in the Biblioteca Civica Berio, Genoa (m.r. Cf. Arm. 1.), and a missal commissioned by Cardinal Domenico della Rovere in the Museo Civico di Arte Antica, Turin (inv. gen. 497, inv. part. 6). The Lehman Adoration, regarded as one of Marmitta’s most refined and technically accomplished creations, has been placed in close stylistic relationship to the della Rovere missal (De Marchi 1995, pp. 316–29; Levi D’Ancona 1997). Silvana Pettenati (1995, pp. 142–43), who convincingly dated that manuscript to between 1490 and 1492, during the artist’s hypothetical sojourn in Rome, suggested that the Adoration might have been executed in the same city before the artist’s return to Parma in 1495.

A clue to the miniature’s original function may be offered by the wording of Gregory XIV’s letter, referring to the image as a “tavoletta” (tablet). This may indicate that the Adoration was never part of a larger leaf in a manuscript but conceived at the outset as an independent object for private devotion—perhaps in the same category as the two “histicor miniati in carta pecorina” by Apollonio Buonfratelli that are listed in a mid-sixteenth-century inventory of the Sistine Chapel.3

1. The miniature is not listed by De Ricci, suggesting that it was acquired sometime after 1937.
3. Archivio di Stato di Roma, camerele 1, vol. 1557, fasc. 8, folio 44v (Talamo 1997, p. 216): “Due historie miniati in carta pecorina l’una serve per principio dela 3a. Messa di Natale, l’altra per il Te igiir del la med.a. Messa fatto da m. Apollonio buonfratelli…” (Two illuminated scenes on parchment, one needed for the beginning of the third mass for Christmas, the other for the Te igiur of the same mass, executed by m. Apollonio buonfratelli). Next to this entry is a later note stating that the miniatures are “now in the possession of Pope Paul IV” (r. 1555–59). From an earlier entry on folio 36v, we gather that on November 18, 1554, the two miniatures were sent to the sacristy by the previous pope, Julius III (r. 1550–55). These documents suggest that the illuminations were made as independent pictures, perhaps mounted in some sort of frame, which could be inserted and removed at will from the missal portions they illustrated.

Francesco Morone
Veronese, 1471–1529

86
Virgin and Child Enthroned between Saints Cecilia and Catherine of Alexandria
Circa 1510–15
Tempera on parchment. 8 × 5⅞ in. (20.2 × 15.4 cm)

Verso not visible (miniature glued on paper)

Inscribed, on the curve of the bottom step of the throne, in black ink: FRANCISCUS/ MORONUS


LITERATURE: Levi D’Ancona, Palladino, Saffiotti 1997, cat. no. 25, pp. 182–84, with previous bibliography (as Francesco Morone, ca. 1515).

This miniature, signed “FRANCISCUS MORONUS” on the bottom step at the base of the Virgin’s throne, is the only known illumination by the artist, son of the Veronese painter Domenico Morone (see cat. no. 66). Like his father, in whose workshop he was trained, Francesco Morone is known primarily as a painter of altarpieces and frescoes. He was, however, a close friend of the leading Veronese painter and illuminator Girolamo dai Libri (see cat. no. 67), with whom he was also involved in a business relationship. Between around 1515 and 1520 they collaborated on various painting commissions, chief among which was the decoration of a set of organ shutters for the important Olivetan monastery of Santa Maria in Organo, Verona (now Chiesa Parrochiale, Marcellise). Both artists had begun their careers working for this monastery—Girolamo as an illuminator and Francesco as a painter. About 1503 Francesco signed and dated a large altarpiece still in Santa Maria in Organo, and between 1505 and 1510 he frescoed some scenes in the church’s sacristy that were greatly admired and discussed at length by Vasari (1880, pp. 311–12).

Like the preceding catalogue entry (no. 85), the Lehman Virgin and Child is conceived as a small independent work, the composition of which emulates paintings by Francesco, such as the signed Virgin and Child Enthroned between Saints Anthony Abbot and Onuphrius, in the Gemaldegalerie Berlin (46b). A date for the miniature’s execution around 1510–15, first advanced by Erica Tietze-Conrat (1943, pp. 85, 87) is confirmed by its stylistic similarity to the Santa Maria in Organo organ shutters, a commission given to Francesco and Girolamo Dai Libri in 1515; and to other works dated by scholars to the same period, such as the Berlin painting and the Virgin and Child in the National Gallery, London (NG 285; Del Bravo 1962, pp. 11, 13; Penny 1996).

It was recently proposed (Levi D’Ancona et al. 1997) that the Lehman Virgin and Child also be associated with the Monastery of Santa Maria in Organo on the basis of the inclusion, in the landscape background, of a white-clad, perhaps Olivetan monk, being led by a female saint to a walled complex in the upper right of the composition. This saint may be identified by her dress and crown of roses as Saint Cecilia, also shown standing in the position of honor to the Virgin’s right. It has therefore been suggested that this scene might allude to the schola sacerdotum dedicated to the Virgin, Saint Agatha, and Saint Cecilia that was attached to Santa Maria in Organo and was responsible for the education of its monks. The Lehman miniature could have been commissioned by a canon or former pupil of that school.

1. Del Bravo’s dating of the Lehman illumination to a decade earlier than these works, around 1498 (Del Bravo 1962, p. 7), seems too early.

Roman School
Circa 1567/68–72

87a
Christ Carrying the Cross in an Initial D
Cutting from a gradual

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6⅞ × 6⅞ in. (16 × 16.7 cm). Stave: 4.3 cm

Verso: itates no/ tribus

PROVENANCE: Santa Croce a Bosco Marengo; Bruscoli, Rome, about 1924.

LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1716, B.2 (as northern Italy, ca. 1500, from same choir book as cat. no. 87b)

87b
Last Judgment in an Initial S
Cutting from a gradual
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6 1/8 x 6 3/4 in. (15.6 x 16 cm).
Stave: 4.3 cm

Recto: bit tibi/ nis eius spe

Provenance: Santa Croce a Bosco Marengo; John F. Murray, Florence, 1925
Literature: De Ricci 1937, p. 1716, b.2 (as northern Italy, ca. 1500, from same choir book as cat. no. 87a)

These fragments were excised from a series of choir books commissioned by the Dominican pope Pius V (r. 1566–72), canonized in 1712. The books were produced for the Dominican convent of Santa Croce, which was founded by the pope in 1566 in his native town of Bosco Marengo, near Alessandria. Recently published by Silvana Pettenati (1998), the entire series originally comprised thirty-four volumes, thirty-one of which, some in fragmentary condition, are now in the Museo Civico, Alessandria, while two others are in the Convent of San Domenico, Chieri. The last volume is missing.

The Lehman cuttings were first associated with the Bosco Marengo volumes by Jonathan Alexander (verbal communication), who related them to two other fragments from the same series in the Brooklyn Museum of Art, New York: an initial I (or L) with the Return of the Prodigal Son and an initial F with Christ and the Samaritan Woman. To these may be added a leaf formerly on the art market that was published by Pettenati (1998, p. 17) and two fragments in the Cini Collection, Venice, showing Jonah and the Whale in an Initial R and Expulsion of the Money Changers from the Temple in an Initial D (Toesca 1938, p. 54, plates 67–68). Except for the art-market leaf, excised from an antiphonary, all of the miniatures were originally included in Corale II in the Museo Civico, Alessandria, a gradual volume from Bosco Marengo, covering the liturgical season from the first to the fourth Sunday of Lent, which has been deprived of all its illuminations (Pettenati 1998, p. 61). The Lehman initial D with Christ Carrying the Cross, probably the missing first illumination from this volume, introduces the tract of the mass for Ash Wednesday: “Domine non secundum peccata nostra, quae fecimus nos” (The Lord does not deal with us according to our sins). This text is continued on the fragment’s verso: “[neque secundum iniuritae nos]stras re]tribuas [nobis]” (nor require us according to our iniquities). The Lehman initial S with the Last Judgment begins the introit to the mass for Monday in the first week of Lent: “Sicut oculi servorum” (Behold as the eyes of servants). On the back of the initial, the original leaf’s recto, are fragments of the communion hymn from the preceding mass for the first Sunday in Lent: “[Scapulis suis oumbra]bit tibi[et sub pen]nis eius spe[rabas]” (He will cover you with his pinions and under his wings you will find refuge). The Cini and Brooklyn miniatures illustrate, in turn, the introit to the masses for Tuesday and Wednesday of the first week of Lent, Saturday of the second week of Lent, and Friday of the third week of Lent in the same volume.

According to Pettenati (1998, p. 9), the choir books were written and decorated in Rome between around 1567/68 and 1572 by a team of illuminators whose style reflects the most recent developments in monumental painting and manuscript production at the papal court. The Lehman initials and their sister leaves compare most closely to the illuminations in Corale Q in the Museo Civico, Alessandria, a gradual that follows Corale II in liturgical sequence and covers the period from the fourth Sunday in Lent to Easter Sunday (Pettenati 1998, pp. 93–94). Considered among the most accomplished works in the series, the miniatures of Corale Q have been viewed by Pettenati in relationship to the work of the foremost illuminator at the papal court, Giulio Clovio, as well as to the paintings of the Flemish artist favored by Pius V, Bartolomeo Spranger, appointed official painter to the pope in 1570.

1. According to a note on the back of a photograph in the Robert Lehman Collection archives, which contradicts De Ricci’s claim that this cutting was acquired from Murray together with cat. no. 87b. The invoice from Murray for cat. no. 87b, in fact, mentions only one miniature.
Appendix
Glossary
Bibliography
Index
Miniature di Monza (?)  
Lombard, last quarter of the thirteenth century

1  
*Virgin and Child in an Initial G*  
Cutting from a gradual  
New Haven, Yale University Art Gallery, 1954.7.9  
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 4 7/8 x 4 1/16 in. (11.2 x 10.6 cm). Stave: 3 cm  
Verso: ego op[er]a mea/ Alleluia  
*Provenance:* Acquired in Paris, 1953; gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1954  
*Literature:* Seymour 1970, p. 23, no. 7 (as Tuscan school, late 13th century)  

Northeastern Italy (?)  
Late thirteenth century

2  
*Christ in Majesty in an Initial B*  
Cutting from an antiphonary  
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 4 1/2 x 3 3/8 in. (11.5 x 9.8 cm).  
Stave: 2.5 cm  
Verso: [san]cto spir/ Benedict  
*Provenance:* Unknown  
*Literature:* De Ricci 1937, p. 1703, D.28 (as probably Bologna, ca. 1300)

Tuscany (?)  
Late thirteenth century

3  
*Pentecost in an Initial S*  
Leaf from an antiphonary  
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Leaf: 18 x 12 3/8 in. (45.6 x 31.5 cm). Initial: 3 3/4 x 5 1/4 in. (14.7 x 13 cm). Stave: 2.8 cm  
Recto: c[um] alleluia/ alleluia./ [rubr.] *In die...Æternum alleluia* et hoc quod continet. Verso: omnia scientiam habet/ vocis alleluia alleluia/alleluia. [rubr.] *Confitebor deus...Glória eouae.* [rubr.] R.
Northern Italy, early fifteenth century (?)

4

*Man Praying in an Initial B*
Location unknown
7½ × 5½ in. (19 × 14 cm)

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1710, a.8

[No image available]

Italy, early fifteenth century (?)

5

*Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata in an Initial G*
Location unknown

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1709, a.37

[No image available]

Northern Italy, fifteenth century (?)

6

*Half-Length Female Saint in an Initial C*
Location unknown

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1711, b.16

[No image available]

Bologna or Veneto

Circa 1430–40

7

*Nativity in an Initial H*
Cutting from an antiphonary
Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. Cutting: 10 1/4 × 9 1/6 in. (26 × 23 cm)

PROVENANCE: Canessa, Paris, 1923
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1710, d.26 (as Umbria, ca. 1420);
Cincinnati 1959, p. 31, no. 324, fig. 324 (as Umbrian Master, first half of the 15th century).

See cat. no. 36, fig. 10

Cristoforo Cortese

Venetian, ca. 1390–d. before 1445

8

*Virgin and Child in an Initial H*
Circa 1430–35
Cutting from an antiphonary
Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 3/16 × 2 1/4 in. (9 × 7 cm)

PROVENANCE: Unknown
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, d.28a (as Bologna, 14th century)
Master of the Vitae Imperatorum
Milanese, active second quarter of the fifteenth century

9
Saint John the Baptist in an Initial S
Circa 1430–40
Cutting from a gradual
Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment
PROVENANCE: Kleinberger, Paris, about 1922
LITERATURE: Unpublished
See cat. no. 53, fig. 24

Baldassare Coldiradi
Cremonese, active third quarter of the fifteenth century

II
Saint Cecilia in an Initial C
Circa 1470–80
Cutting from an antiphonary
Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 2 ¾ x 2 ¾ in. (7.2 x 7.2 cm)
PROVENANCE: William Young Ottley; Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s London, November 16, 1925, lot 112)
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1714, c. 21 (as northern Italy, probably Ferrara, ca. 1480).
See cat. no. 63 [no image available]

Guglielmo Giraldi
Ferrarese, documented 1445–90

10
Pentecost in an Initial S
Circa 1470–75
Cutting from a gradual
Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 5/16 x 3 5/16 in. (9 x 8 cm)
PROVENANCE: Luigi Grassi, Florence, 1928
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1713, d. 12 (as Florence, ca. 1480)
Lombard

Circa 1500

13

Saint Helena Holding the Cross in an Initial R

Cutting from an antiphonary (?)
Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 3 1/4 x 3 1/16 in. (8 x 9 cm)

PROVENANCE: Kalebdjian, Paris, 1924
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1713, a.6 (as Tuscany, ca. 1470); Béguin 1957, p. 110, no. 160, pl. lxxx (as Ferrarese Master, ca. 1470-80); Cincinnati 1959, p. 31, no. 319 (as Ferrarese Master, act. ca. 1470-80); Mariani Canova 1978a, p. 58 (as Master of the Arcimboldi Missal or close follower, 1499-1511); Bauer-Eberhardt 1984, p. 59 (as Milan, beginning of the 16th century); Lodigiani 1991, pp. 297-98, n. 10 (as Lombard, last decade of the 15th century, close to the Master of the Arcimboldi Missal)

See cat. no. 69, fig. 36

Master B. F. (Francesco Binasco?)

Milanese, active late fifteenth–early sixteenth century

14

Half-Length Saint (Prophet?) in an Initial G

Bas-de-page fragment
Cutting from a gradual
Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 6 1/4 x 6 1/4 in. (16 x 15.7 cm)

PROVENANCE: Lord Northwick (sale, Sotheby’s London, November 16, 1925, lot 131)
LITERATURE: De Ricci 1937, p. 1713, c.18 (as Lombardy, late 15th century)

See cat. no. 70 [no image available]

Lombard

End of fifteenth–beginning of sixteenth century

15

Christ as Salvator Mundi and Two Angels

Location unknown
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment

PROVENANCE: Purchased in Rome (?), 1927

See cat. no. 71, fig. 37

Modern Copies

Ernesto Sprega

?–d. 1911

16

Christ’s Entry into Jerusalem in an Initial D

1863–64
Copy of a miniature by Liberale da Verona in the choir books for Siena Cathedral
Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 16 1/4 x 13 1/4 in. (41.2 x 34.9 cm)

PROVENANCE: Edouard Kann Collection, Paris
LITERATURE: Boinet 1926, p. 30, no. XXXIV, pl. XXXVIII (as North Italian School, third quarter of the 15th century); De Ricci 1937, p. 1712, b.20 (as probably by Girolamo da Cremona); Miner 1949, p. 73, no. 199 (as northern Italy, 15th century); Béguin 1957, p. 107, no. 133 (as Girolamo da Cremona); Cincinnati 1959, p. 31, no. 328, fig. 328 (as Girolamo da Cremona)
Unknown

17
*Portrait of Francesco Landini*

Copy of fifteenth-century Florentine miniature in the Squarcialupi Codex (Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Med. Palat. 87)

Tempera on parchment. 5¾ × 4½ in. (14.8 × 12.4 cm)

*Provenance:* Unknown

*Literature:* De Ricci 1937, p. 1706, a.27 (as Italy, late 14th century)

Unknown

18
*Scenes from the Lives of Saint Jerome and Saint James* (recto); *Annunciation* (verso)

Unknown

19
*Pentecost in an Initial S*

Copy of a miniature by Sano di Pietro (in the choir books for Siena Cathedral?)

New Haven, Yale University, Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library, MS 475

Tempera and gold leaf on parchment. 10½ × 7¾ in. (27.6 × 19.9 cm)

*Provenance:* Early provenance unknown; gift of Robert Lehman to Yale University, 1941

*Literature:* Shailor 1987, vol. 2, p. 454 (as modern illumination)
Glossary

ADVENT: Penitential season of four weeks that opens the liturgical year, beginning on the Sunday closest to November 30 and concluding with the Vigil of the Nativity (Christmas Eve), December 24

ANTIPHON: A hymn or psalm sung alternately, with a response, by two sides of a choir

ANTIPHONARY: Choir book containing the sung portions of the Divine Office

BAS DE PAGE: Images, scenes, or decoration that run across the bottom of an illuminated page

BIFOLIUM: A sheet, generally of parchment, folded in half to produce two leaves

BREVARIY: A liturgical book combining all the texts necessary for celebration of the Divine Office

CATCHWORD: Usually written in the lower margin of a verso at the end of a quire, it repeats the first word on the following recto and is intended as an aid to maintaining the proper sequence of quires in binding

COLOPHON: An inscription, usually placed at the end of a book, recording the facts of its production

COMMON OF SAINTS: Liturgical texts common to groups or types of saints (e.g., martyrs, confessors, bishops, apostles, virgins, etc.) invoked in commemorations of saints without established Proper

DIVINE OFFICE: A cycle of daily devotions performed by members of religious orders and the clergy at eight canonical hours: matins, lauds, prime, terce, sext, none, vespers, and compline

EPHYPANY: Memorial of the Adoration of the Magi, January 6

EXPLICIT: The end of a unit of text

GRADUAL: Choir book containing the sung portions of the mass

HYMNAL: Book containing hymns sung in the Divine Office

INCIPI: The opening words of a text

INTROIT: The opening chant of a mass, sung when the celebrant enters the sanctuary

INVITATORY: Opening hymn at matins

LAUDS: The second morning hour of the Divine Office, traditionally sung about 5:00 a.m.

LENT: The forty-day penitential season preceding Easter

MASS: The celebration of the Eucharist, the principal rite of Christian liturgy

MATINS: The first morning hour of the Divine Office, traditionally sung about 2:30 a.m.

MISSAL: A liturgical book containing the texts and ceremonial directions necessary for the performance of the mass

NOCTURN: Part of the first morning hour (matins)

OCTAVE: Eighth day after a major feast, including the day of the feast itself, hence one week

ORDINARY: Those sections of the mass that are constant and not variable with or specific to any given feast

PASCHALTIDE: The seventeen-week Easter season, beginning Sepuagesima Sunday and concluding Trinity Sunday

PENTECOST: Feast commemorating the descent of the Holy Spirit on the apostles, fifty days (seven weeks) after Easter

PROPER OF SAINTS: Liturgical texts specific to the commemoration of individual saints

Psalter: The Book of Psalms

QUARESIMA (Quadragesima): Lent; also the first Sunday of Lent

QUINQUAGESIMA: The Sunday before Ash Wednesday

QUIRE: A gathering of several (usually four or five) bifolia for binding

RESPONSE (RESPONSORY): A hymn or psalm sung alternately with an antiphon by two sides of a choir

RUBRIC: A title or ceremonial instruction written in red ink

SANCTORALE: A choir book containing the texts for the celebration of saints’ feasts (except those falling between December 24 and January 13) held on the same dates every year

SEPTUAGESIMA: The ninth Sunday before Easter (third Sunday before Lent), marking the close of the Christmas cycle and the beginning of Paschaltide

SEQUENCE: An extended melody in a gradual, sung by a soloist between the alleluia and the Gospel lesson at mass

SEXAGESIMA: The second Sunday before Lent

TEMPORALE: A choir book containing the texts for the celebration of Christological feasts, most of which do not recur on the same dates each year (saints’ feasts between Christmas Vigil [December 24] and the octave of Epiphany [January 13] are generally included in the temporal cycle)

TRINITY SUNDAY: The octave of Pentecost and the conclusion of Paschaltide

VESPER: The evening hour of the Divine Office, traditionally sung about 4:30 p.m.
Bibliography

A NOTE TO THE READER:
The following bibliographic style indicates that the author has contributed various texts (catalogue entries, biographies, or essays) within a volume:


AGLIO CREMONESI 1794
Aglio Cremonese, Giuseppe. Le pitture e le sculture della città di Cremona. Cremona, 1794.

ALCE AND D’AMATO 1961

ALEXANDER 1985

ANDALORO 1990

ARMSTRONG 1994

BACCHI AND DE MARCHI 1995

BACCHI ET AL. 1995

BALTIMORE 1949

BALTIMORE 1962

BANDERA 1977

BATTISTINI 1999

BAUER-EBERHARDT 1984

BÉGUIN 1957

BELLOSI 1975

BENEDICENTI 2001

BENETAZZO 1998

BENTIVOGLIO-RAVASIO 1992

BENTIVOGLIO-RAVASIO 1995

BOBER 1970

BOEHM 1994

BOINET 1936

BOLLATI 1991

BOLLATI 1997a

BOLLATI 1997b

BOLLATI 1999

BOLOGNA 1948

BOLOGNA 1977

BOLOGNA 2000
TREASURES OF A LOST ART

BOSKOVITS 1975

BOSKOVITS 1978

BOSKOVITS 1983

BOSKOVITS 1984

BOSKOVITS 1988

BOSKOVITS 1992

BOSKOVITS 1995

BOSTON 2002

BOYCE AND HARRESEN 1993

BREDT 1903
Bredt, E. W. *Katalog der mittelalterlichen Miniaturen des Germanischen Nationalmuseums.* Nuremberg.

BRUNORI 1998

BUSSI 1997

BUSSI 1998

BUX 1990

CADEI 1984

CALABI 1938

CALECA 1969
CALECA 1969

CAMPBELL 2002
Campbell, Stephen J. In *Boston 2002.*

CARAPPELLI 1988
Carapelli, A. *Cronologia, Cronografia e Calendario Perpetuo.* Milan.

CARLI 1998 [1943]

CARMINATI 1995
Carminati, Marco. *Codici miniati del Maestro B.F. Pavia.*

CASSEE 1980

CASTELFRANCO 1929

CASTIGLIONI 1986

CAVALLERO 1985
Cavallero, Daniela Gallavotti. *Lo spedale di Santa Maria della Scala a Siena: vicenda di una committenza artistica.* Pisa.

CHELAZZI DINI 1979

CHELAZZI DINI 1982

CHEVALIER 1892–1912

CHIERICI 1949

CHRISTIANSEN 1988

CIARDI DUPRÉ 1976

CIARDI DUPRÉ 1998

CINCINNATI 1959

CIPRIANI 1958

COLLOBI RAGHIANTISI 1950

COMSTOCK 1927

CONTI 1981
BIBLIOGRAPHY

CORNARO 1778
Cornaro, F. Notizie istoriche delle chiese e monasteri di Venezia e di Torcello. Padua.
COTTINEAU 1939
CUCCIONINI 1989
Cucciomini, Maria Francesca. "La serie dei corali del Duomo nella miniatura dell’ultimo trentenno del quattrocento." In Corali miniati del quattrocento nella Biblioteca Malatestiana, edited by Piero Lucchi, Milan.
DALI REGOLI 1973
D’ANCONA 1904
DAUNER 1998
DE BENEDEITIS 1976
DE BENEDEITIS 1979
De Benedictis, Cristina. La pittura senese, 1550–1700. Florence.
DE BENEDEITIS 1994
DE BENEDEITIS 1996
De Benedictis, Cristina. In Todini 1996.
DE FLORIANI 1996
De Florian, Anna. In Todini 1996.
DE MARCHI 1992
DE MARCHI 1993
De Marchi, Andrea. In Francesco di Giorgio e il Rinascimento a Siena, 1450–1500. Exhibition catalogue, Milan.
DE MARCHI 1995
DE RICCI 1913
DE RICCI 1937
DEGL’INNOCENTI GAMBUTI 1977
DEL BRAVO 1962
DOCAMPO 1997
EBERHARDT 1986

LES ENLIMINURES 1994

LES ENLUMINURES 1996
Illuminations, Gouaches, Drawings from the 13th to the 18th Centuries. Sale catalogue, no. 5. Galerie Les Enluminures, Paris, 12 September–27 October.

LES ENLUMINURES 2001

FERRARA 1998

FERRERI 1985

FILIPPINI AND ZUCCHINI 1947

FRANCESCHINI 1993

FREULER 1987

FREULER 1991

FREULER 1992

FREULER 1997

FREULER 2001

FROSININI 1998
Frosinini, Valeria. In Forgione tardogotica nella Marche. Exhibition catalogue, Milan.

GAREZZI 1985

GIBBS 1984

GIBBS 1991

GIBBS 1995
GILES AND WORMALD 1982
Giles, Phyllis M., and Francis Wormald. A Descriptive Catalogue
of the Additional Illuminated Manuscripts in the Fitzwilliam
Museum. Cambridge.

GIOVANNUCCI VIGI 1998
Giovannucci Vigl, Berenice. “Lo splendore della Chiesa ferrarese: Jacopo Filippo Argenta, Martino da Modena e Giovanni

GORDON 1991
Gordon, Dillian. “Perugian Fourteenth-Century Manuscript
Illumination: Vanni di Baldolo and His Associates.” Apollo 124,
p. 327–32.

GUIDALI 1958
Guidali, Fausta. “I corali di Montemorcino.” Rivista d’arte 33,

GUIDOTTI 1979
Guidotti, Alessandro. “Precisazioni sul Maestro Dadesco in
alcuni codici miniati della Badia a Settimo.” In La miniatura ita-
liana in età romanica e gotica: Atti del I Congresso di storia della
miniatura italiana. Florence, pp. 419–41.

HAMBURGER 1995
Hamburger, Jeffrey. Books of Revelation: Medieval Manuscripts
from Oberlin College Collections. Oberlin.

HERMANN 1994 [1900]
Hermann, Hermann Julius. La miniatura estense, edited by Fed-
erica Toniolo, Modena, 1994. Translated from: Zur geschichte der
Miniaturmalerei am hofe der Este. Ferrara, Vienna.

HINDMAN 1988
Hindman, Sandra. Medieval & Renaissance Miniature Painting.
London.

HINDMAN ET AL. 1997
Hindman, Sandra, Mirella Levi D’Ancona, Pia Palladino, and
Illuminations. The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York
[Princeton].

HINDMAN ET AL. 2001
Hindman, Sandra, et al. Manuscript Illumination in the Modern
Age. Evanston.

HOEPLI 1927
Miniature. Incunaboli. Legature. Libri figurati dei secoli XVI e
XVIII. Milan.

HUTER 1800
Huter, Carl. “Cristoforo Cortese in the Bodleian Library.”
Apollo 111, pp. 10–17.

JACOBUS DE VORAGINE 1991
Jacobus de Voragine. The Golden Legend, vol. 2, translated by

KANTER 1994

KANTER 1998

KANTER 2001
Kanter, Laurence. “Florentine Illuminations at the Wallraf-
Richartz-Museum: Zanobi Strozzi and a Proposal for Matteo di

KARET 1999
Karet, Evelyn. “The Drawings of Stefano da Verona Reconsider-
ered.” Arte Lombarda 115, pp. 5–44.

LABRIOLA 1995
Labriola, Ada. “Aggiunte alla miniatura fiorentina del primo tre-
cento.” Paragone 547, pp. 3–17.

LABRIOLA 1996

LABRIOLA 1997

LABRIOLA 1998
Labriola, Ada. In Sumptuosa tabula picta: Pittori a Lucca tra
Gotico e Rinascimento. Lucca.

LANDI 1977
I: i documenti.” Prospettiva 8, pp. 7–17.

LATTANZI 1985
Lattanzi, Angela Daneu. “La miniatura nell’italia meridionale e
in Sicilia tra il Gotico e il Rinascimento.” In La miniatura Italiana
tra Gotico e Rinascimento: Atti del II Congresso di Storia della

LEHMANN-BROCKHAUS 1983
Lehmann-Brockhaus, Otto. Abruzzien und Molise: Kunst und
Geschichte. Munich.

LÉONELI 1983
Léonelli, Marie-Claude. In L’art gothique siennois. Exhibition
catalogue, Musée du Petit Palais, Avignon, 26 June–2 October.
Florence.

LEVI D’ANCONA 1996
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. “Miniature venete nella Collezione

LEVI D’ANCONA 1961
43, pp. 81–97.

LEVI D’ANCONA 1962
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. Miniature e miniatori a Firenze del XIV

LEVI D’ANCONA 1963
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. “Frate Nebridio, il Maestro del Messale
Mainardi.” Arte Lombarda 8(1), pp. 87–92.

LEVI D’ANCONA 1964
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. “Ponsille a Girolamo da Cremona.” In
Studi di Bibliografia e di Storia in onore di Tammaro De Marinis.

LEVI D’ANCONA 1967
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. “Giustino di Gherardino da Forli e gli
affreschi perduti del Guarnieri nel Palazzo Ducale di Venezia.”
Arte veneta 11, pp. 34–44.

LEVI D’ANCONA 1970
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. The Wildenstein Collection of Illumina-

LEVI D’ANCONA 1978
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. “I corali di Santa Maria degli Angeli,
or na nella Biblioteca Laurenziana e le miniature da essi aportate.”
In Miscellanea di studi in memoria di Anna Saitta Revignus. Flor-
ence, pp. 213–35.

LEVI D’ANCONA 1997

LEVI D’ANCONA 2000
Levi D’Ancona, Mirella. “Fratre Gregorio ‘Murtii’ do Montalcino:
BIBLIOGRAPHY

LEVI D’ANCONA AND PALLADINO 1997
LEVI D’ANCONA, PALLADINO, AND SAFFIOTTI 1997
LIBRERIA ANTICUARIA PREGLISCO 1984
LODIGIANI 1991
LODIGIANI 1992
LOLLINI 1989
LOLLINI 1991
LOLLINI 1994
LOLLINI 1998b
LOLLINI 1998b
LOLLINI 1999
LOLLINI 2000
LONDON 1994
LUCCO 1992
LUGANO 1903
LUNGHIO 1982
LUNGHIO 1987
LUNGHIO 1992
MAGGS BROTHERS LTD. 1994
MANCA 2000
MANFREDI 1995
MARCON 1999
MARIANI CANOVA 1969
Mariani Canova, Giordana. La miniatura veneta del Rinascimento, 1450–1500. Venice.
MARIANI CANOVA 1970
MARIANI CANOVA 1973
MARIANI CANOVA 1978a
MARIANI CANOVA 1978b
MARIANI CANOVA 1979
MARIANI CANOVA 1984
MARIANI CANOVA 1988
MARIANI CANOVA 1989
MARIANI CANOVA 1993
MARIANI CANOVA 1994
MARIANI CANOVA 1998
MARUBBI 1989
MAGGI 2001
Massagli, Riccardo. In Massagli and Romano Silva, Luca città d’arte e i suoi archivi. Venice.
MATTIAE 1959
MEDICA 1987

MEDICA 1992

MEDICA 1993

MEDICA 1997

MEDICA 1999

MEISS 1969

MELOGRANI 1990

MELOGRANI 1992

MELOGRANI 1994

MELOGRANI 1995a

MELOGRANI 1995b

MILAN 1988
Arte in Lombardia tra Gotico e Rinascimento. Exhibition, Palazzo Reale di Milano.

MILAN 1997

MILAN 1991

MOROZZI 1980

MULAS 2000

NATALE 1982

NEW YORK 1988

NEW YORK 1994

NORDENFALK ET AL. 1975

OFFNER 1932

OFFNER 1930

OFFNER 1935

OFFNER 1917

OFFNER/BOSKOVITS 1987

OTTOLENCHI 1996
Ottolenghi, Maria Grazia Albertini. I graduai miniati dell’abbazia del San Salvatore presso Pavia. Edited by E. D. Marni. Pavia.

PÁCHT 1948
Pacht, Otto. The Master of Mary of Burgundy. London.

PADOUA 1999

PADOVANI 1978

PALLADINO 1997a

PALLADINO 1997b

PALLADINO 1999

PALLADINO 2001

PALLADINO 2002
Palladino, Pia. “Ancora sui corali di San Giorgio Maggiore, con qualche opposto su Belbello e Stefano da Verona.” Arte Veneta.
PALLADINO FORTHCOMING

“Further Inquiries into the Choirbooks of Cardinal Bessarion.”

PARENTI 1992


PARIS 1957


PASSALACQUA 1980


PASUT 1998


PASUT 2002


PENNY 1996


PERETTI 2000


PERUGIA AND OTHER CITIES 1982


PETTENATI 1995


PETTENATI 1998


PIETROPOLI 1986


PUERARI 1976


QUATTRINI 2000


RICE 1985


RIMINI 1995


ROTILI 1972

Rotili, Mario. I codici danteschi miniati a Napoli. Naples.

ROTILI 1978

Rotili, Mario. La miniatura nella Badia di Cava, vol. 2: Cava dei Tirreni.

SAFFIOTTI 1997


SALMI 1992


SALMI 1993


SALMI 1994A


SALMI 1994B

Salmi, Mario. La miniatura fiorentina gotica. Rome.

SANTI 1984

Santi, Bruno. “‘De pulcerima pictura... ad honorem beate et glorioso Virginie Marie’: vicende critiche e una proposta di lettura per la ‘Madonna Rucellai’.” In Santi et al. 1984, pp. 11–32.

SANTI ET AL. 1984


SBARLEAE 1978 [1921]


SERAFINI 1912


SEYMOUR 1970

Seymour, Charles. Early Italian Paintings in the Yale University Art Gallery, New Haven.

SHAHLOR 1987


SIENA 1904

Mostra dell’antica arte senese. Catalogo generale. Siena.

STEFANI 1985


STEYVAERT AND STONES 1978

Steyaert, John, and Alison Stones. Medieval Illumination, Glass, and sculpture in Minnesota Collections. Minneapolis.

STONES 1969


STREHLKE 1988


STREHLKE 1994


STREHLKE 2001


SUBBIONI 2001


SUTTON 1991

TALAMO 1997

TIEFZE-CONRAT 1943

TODINI 1982

TODINI 1989

TODINI 1996

TODINI 1999

TOESCA 1922
Toesch, Pietro. La pittura e la miniatura nella Lombardia dai più antichi monumenti alla metà del Quattrocento. Milan.

TOESCA 1930

TOESCA 1948

TOESCA 1958

TONIOLI 1994
Toniolo, Federica. In Hermann 1994 [1900].

TONIOLI 1997

TONIOLI 1998

TONIOLI 1999

TORLONTANO 1987

TOSCANO 1998

TOSCANO 2000

TURA 2002

VAN MARLE 1925

VANOLI 1997

VASARI 1878–85 [1568]

VASARI 1880

VASARI 1906

VERONA 1986

VIGI 1989

VOELKLE AND WIECK 1992

WAGSTAFF 1965

WESCHER 1930

WESCHER 1931

WESCHER 1960

WIECK 1994

ZANONI 1935

ZERI 1963

ZINO AND ZAMMI 1999
Index

Note: Page numbers in italics refer to illustrations.

A

Abruizi, 34–37, 60–62
Adoration of the Cross in an Initial N (Master of Sant’Eugenio), 51–53, 52
Adoration of the Magi in an Initial E (Sano di Pietro), 148, 149, 150
Adoration of the Shepherds (Mammìta), 3, 168, 169, 170
Adoration of the Trinity in an Initial D (Lombard), 154, 155, 156
All Saints in an Initial E (Master of the Osservanza), 147–148, 147
Andrea di Bartolo, 56, 58–59
Christ Blessing and a Franciscan Monk in an Initial A, 58–59, 59
Angelico, Fra., 159
Angel Playing the Timbrel in an Initial C (Argenta), 159
Angel with a Harp (Cortese), 71, 71, 75
Angel with Portative Organ (Cortese), 71, 71, 75
Annunciation in an Initial M (Maestro Daddesco), 45, 45
Annunciation in an Initial M (Neri da Rimini), 15, 17, 18
Antiphonary P (Master of Antiphonary Q), 116, 117
Antonio da Monta, Fra., 144
Argenta, Jacopo Filippo Medici d’, 92, 97–99
Angel Playing the Timbrel in an Initial C, 9, 97, 98, 113
Initial E, I, I, I, I, I, I, 113
King David in an Initial D, 97, 97, 98
Six Initials: U or V, E, S, G, B, B, 98, 99
Ascension, The (Pacino di Bonaguida), 3, 38, 39, 40–42
Ascension in an Initial V (Giotto dei Benci), 158–160, 159
Ascension in an Initial V (Niccolo di Ser Sozio), 53–54, 53
Assumption in an Initial V (Central Italian Artist), 5–6, 5
Attavante degli Attavanti, 2, 166–68
Crucifixion with the Penitent Magdalen and Saints Cosmas and Damian and Five Border Fragments, 166, 167, 168
Augustinian Nuns in a Church in an Initial I (Fratre Nebridio), 119–120, 129

B

Baldassare di Biagio, 166
Bartolo di Fredi, 56, 58
Bartolomeo del Timante (?), Temptation of Saint Francis in an Initial B, 100–101, 100
Bartolomeo di Domenico di Guido, King David in an Initial A, 162, 163, 164
Bartolomeo di Frusino, Virgin and Child in an Initial H, 157–158, 157
Bartista di Niccolò da Padova, Crucifixion with Penitent Saint Jerome, 160, 162, 162
Bearded Saint in an Initial C (Cortese), 76, 76
Belbello da Pavia, 83, 86, 106, 111, 114, 117–122, 124, 126, 132
Christ Blessing in an Initial T, 86, 118, 119
Saint Stephen in an Initial T, 119–120, 120
Young Christ Blessing in an Initial A, 119, 121, 122
Belbello da Pavia and Collaborators, Benedictine Antiphonary, 2, 86, 115–17, 115, 122
Bellini, Gentile, 77
Bellini, Giovanni, 77
Bellini, Jacopo, 77
Bellini, Leonardo, Circle of, Portrait of Virgin in an Initial V, 76–77, 77
Bembo, Bonifacio, 130
Benedictine Antiphonary (Belbello da Pavia and Collaborators), 2, 86, 115–17, 115, 122
Benvenuto di Giovanni, 138
Berardo da Teramo, 12, 34, 36–37
Nativity in an Initial H, 11, 34, 36–37, 37
Bergognone, 127, 141
Bessarion, Cardinal: Choir Books of, 78–81, 86, 114, 125
see also Franco dei Russi; Third Bessarion Master
Binasco, Francesco, 142–43, 180
Bishop Saint in an Initial D (Master of the Franciscan Breviary?), 113–14, 113
Blessed Elizabeth of Hungary in an Initial G, The (Master of the Dominican Effigies), 43, 43
Blessing Christ in an Initial B (Stefano da Verona), 2, 104, 105, 106–7
Bologna, 13–15, 21–30, 62–69, 100–102, 178
Borso d’Este, 78, 87, 88
Bulgari, Bartolomeo, 55
Buonfratelli, Apollonio, 170

C

Calling of Saint Peter and Saint Andrew in an Initial D (Second Master of San Domenico), 2, 22, 23, 24
Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew in an Initial U (Franco dei Russi?), 93, 93
Central Italian Artist (First Master of the Corona Antiphonariet), 5–6
Choir Books of Cardinal Besarion, 78–83, 86, 114, 125; see also Franco dei Russi; Third Bessarion Master
Choir Books of San Giorgio Maggiore in Venice, 114–17, 114
Christ and the Apostles Appearing to Saint John the Evangelist and Miracle of the Manna in Saint John’s Grave in an Initial V (Second Master of San Domenico), 2, 23, 24, 25
Choir as Salvator Mundi and Two Angels (Lombard), 144, 144, 180
Christ Blessing and a Franciscan Monk in an Initial A (Andrea di Bartolo), 58–59, 59
Christ Blessing and a Man in Prayer (Venetian), 31, 31
Christ Blessing in an Initial D (Venetian), 31, 31
Christ Blessing in an Initial E (Master of the Brussels Initials), 62–63, 62
Christ Blessing in an Initial T (Belbello da Pavia), 86, 118, 119
Christ Carrying the Cross in an Initial D (Roman School), 172, 173, 174
Christ Enthroned as Last Judge in an Initial C (Bolognese), 22
Christ Holding the Cross in an Initial I (Milanese), 109, 109
Christ in Majesty in an Initial B (Northeast Italy?), 177, 177
Christ’s Entry into Jerusalem in an Initial D (Spreega), 180, 180
Cimabue, 12
Civitali, Matteo, 166
Clavio, Giulio, 174
Coldiradi, Baldassare: Monstrance on an Altar in an Initial C, 111–12, 111
Saint Cecilia in an Initial C, 131, 179
Cortese, Cristoforo, 69, 70–76
Angel with Harp, 71, 71, 75
Angel with Portative Organ, 71, 71, 75
Bearded Saint in an Initial C, 76, 76
Prophet in an Initial V, 75–76, 75
Resurrection in an Initial A, 70, 76, 71, 75
Saint Mark the Evangelist and Saint Sinibaddu
Venerated by Members of a Lay Confraternity, 72, 74, 75, 76
Virgin and Child in an Initial H, 178, 178
Cremona, 128–32
Civelli, Taddeo, 86, 87, 101, 102
Crucifixion with Penitent Saint Jerome (Battista di Niccolò da Padova), 160, 161, 162
Crucifixion with Saints Mary Magdalene, Homobonus, and Donor (Stefano degli Azzi), 29–30, 30
Crucifixion with the Penitent Magdalene and Saints Cosmas and Damian and Five Border Fragments (Antavante), 166, 167, 168

D
David Lifting Up His Soul to God in an Initial E (Francesco dei Russi), 79, 84, 85, 86–87, 88
David with His Foot in a Noose in an Initial O (Morone), 177–78, 178
Dominican Friar Praying (Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna), 28, 28
Dominican Hymnal (Master of 1446), 63, 64, 65, 101
Donatello, 154
Duccio di Buoninsegna, 3, 48–50
Virgin and Child and God the Father Blessing in an Initial B, lii, 3, 48, 49, 50, 101
Dürer, Albrecht, 143

E
Elevation of the Host in an Initial A (Bolognese), 13–15, 11
Emilia, 3, 20–21, 32

F
Ferrara, 78–79, 83–99
First Master of San Domenico, 24
First Master of the Cortona Antiphonaries (?), Assumption in an Initial V, 5–6
Florence, 3, 37–45, 55–60, 166–68
"Fra Jacobus," Last Supper, 31, 52
Francesco di Giorgio, 1
Saint Bernardino Preaching from a Pulpit, 3, 154–55, 155
Franco dei Russi, 78, 83, 84–93
Calling of Saints Peter and Andrew in an Initial U, 93, 93
David Lifting up His Soul to God in an Initial E, 79, 84, 85, 86–87, 88
Isaac and Esau in an Initial T, 79, 86, 87–88, 88
Saint Clare in an Initial N, 79, 86, 89, 90, 92–93
Saint Louis of Toulouse in an Initial T, 79, 86, 89, 91, 92–93
Francesco Neri, 128–31, 132
Augustin Nuni in a Church in an Initial I, 129–30, 129
Saint Holding a Casket in an Initial I, 129–30, 129
Saint Maurice and Theophilus in an Initial A, 128, 128, 130–31
Saint Nicholas of Tolentino in an Initial E, 128, 128, 129–30

G
Gaddi, Agnolo, 157, 158
Gentile da Fabriano, 69
Giovanni da Modena, 65, 69
Giovanni di Paolo, 154
Giovan Pietro da Cemi, Two Marys at the Tomb in an Initial A, 179, 179
Giraldi, Guglielmo, Penitent in an Initial S, 179, 179
Giroldo da Cremona, 132–34, 136, 138, 154
God the Father in an Initial D (or O), 132–34, 133
Giroldo Dai Libri, 138–41, 172
Ascension in an Initial V, 138–40, 139
Nativity in an Initial T, 140–41, 140
Giustino di Gherardino da Forli, 31
Glorification of Saint Dominic in an Initial G (Master of 1459), 66, 67
God the Father and Prophet in an Initial I (Neri da Rimini), 15, 18, 18
God the Father in an Initial D (or O) (Giroldo da Cremona), 132–34, 133

H
Half-Length Female Saint in an Initial C (Northern Italy), 178
Half-Length Saints (Propert?) in an Initial G (Master B.E.), 180

I
Initial E (Argenta), 97, 97, 98, 113
Initial I (Second Master of Antiphonary M), 125, 125
Initial M and Communion of Mary Magdalene (Maestro Daddesco), 44, 44
Investiture of Saint Clare in an Initial F (?) (Bologna or Venice), 68–69, 68
Isaac and Esau in an Initial T (Francesco dei Russi), 79, 86, 87–88, 88
J
Jacobi, Blessing in an Initial T (Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna), 26–27, 26
Jacopino da Reggio, 15
Joseph and His Brothers in an Initial V (Lombard), 112, 112, 113

K
King David in an Initial A (Bartolomeo di Domenico di Giudicci), 162, 165, 164
King David in an Initial D (Argenta), 97, 97, 98
King David in an Initial D (Lombard), 144, 144
King David in an Initial D (Romagnole Artist), 102, 103, 104
King David in Prayer in an Initial B (Strozzi), 156–60, 159
King David Playing a Viol in an Initial S (Bolognese), 22, 22
Kiss of Judas in an Initial M (Master of Antiphonary Q), 122, 123, 124

L
Last Judgement in an Initial A (Umbria or Southern Italy), 7, 8, 10, 12
Last Judgement in an Initial C (Bolognese), 21–22, 22
Last Judgement in an Initial C (Lorenzo Monaco), 3, 156–57, 156
Last Judgement in an Initial S (Roman School), 177, 173, 174
Last Supper ("Fra Jacobus"), 31, 32
Laudatorio di Sant’Agnesi (Pacino di Bonaguida), 38, 40, 43
Liberalet de Verona, 180
Lippo Vanni, 51, 53
Adoration of the Trinity in an Initial D, 133, 134
Christ as Savior Mundii and Two Angels, 144, 148
Joseph and His Brothers in an Initial B, 112, 112
King David in an Initial D, 144, 144
Prophet in an Initial D, 141–42, 142
Prophet Zacharias in an Initial D, 141–42, 142
Saint Helena Holding the Cross in an Initial B, 141, 142, 142, 180
Young Martyr Saint in an Initial E, 134, 135
Lorenzetti, Pietro, 54
Lorenzo Monaco, 158
Last Judgement in an Initial C, 3, 116–17, 156
Lucia, 165–66
Massacre of the Innocents in an Initial C, 165–66, 165
Saint John the Evangelist in an Initial V, 165–66, 165

M
Maestro Daddesco, 48
Annunciation in an Initial M, 45, 45
Initial M and Communion of Mary Magdalene, 44, 44
"Maestro di Sant’Agnezi," 14–15
Man Praying in an Initial B (Northern Italy), 178
Manetti, Andrea, 133–34
Marmitta da Parma, Francesco di Marco, Adoration of the Shepherd, 3, 168, 169, 170
Martino da Modena, 138
Martino di Bartolomeo, 58, 62n, 165
Two Martyrs Saints in an Initial D, 56–57, 57
Martyrdom of Saint Agatha in an Initial D (Master of Montemoriconi), 145–46, 145
Martyrdom of Saint Agatha in an Initial D (Sano di Pietro), 150–52, 151
Martyrdom of Saint Bartholomew, The (Pacino di Bonaguida), 3, 40, 41, 42
Martyrdom of Saint Lawrence in an Initial D (Master of the Vitae Imperatorum), 107–9, 107
Martyrdom of Saint Peter Martyr in an Initial D (Master of the Fulgri), 19–20, 19
Martyrdom of Saint Peter Martyr in an Initial P (Umbria or Southern Italy), 19, 20, 11–12
TREASURES OF A LOST ART

Saint Anthony of Padua in an Initial I (Third Bessarian Master), 2, 79, 80, 81, 82
Saint Bernardino Preaching from a Pulpit (Francesco di Giorgio), 3, 5, 15, 155
Saint Cecilia in an Initial C (Caldinari), 131, 179
Saint Clare in an Initial N (Francesco dei Russi), 79, 86, 89, 90, 92–93
Saint Clare in an Initial O (Third Bessarian Master), 79, 81, 82, 83
Saint Denis and His Companions in an Initial I (Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna), 27–28, 28
Saint Francis in an Initial I (Umbro-Roman?), 7, 7
Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata in an Initial G (Italy), 178
Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata in an Initial G (Third Bessarian Master), 79, 81, 82, 82
Saint Helena Holding the Cross in an Initial R (Lombard), 141, 142, 142, 180
Saint Holding a Casket in an Initial I (Frate Nebrido), 119–120, 120
Saint John the Baptist in an Initial D (Tura), 94–95, 94, 95–98
Saint John the Baptist in an Initial P (Master of the Dominican Effigies), 42–43, 42
Saint John the Baptist in an Initial S (Master of the Vitae Imperatorum), 108, 108, 179
Saint John the Evangelist in an Initial I (Umbria or Southern Italy), 9, 8, 11, 12
Saint John the Evangelist in an Initial V (Lucchese), 65–66, 65
Saint Lawrence Distributing the Treasures of the Church in an Initial D (Milanese), 111, 111
Saint Louis of Toulouse in an Initial T (Francesco dei Russi), 79, 86, 89, 90, 92–93
Saint Mark the Evangelist and Saint Simon Baldus Venerated by Members of a Lay Confraternity (Cortese), 7, 75, 75, 75, 76
Saint Maurice and Theophanius in an Initial A (Frate Nebrido), 128, 128, 129–130
Saint Nicholas of Tolentino in an Initial E (Frate Nebrido), 128, 128, 129–130
Saint Paul in an Initial D (Pacino di Bonaguida), 57–58, 57
Saint Peter in an Initial N (Umbria or Southern Italy), 11, 11, 12
Saint Peter Martyr in an Initial M (Master of 1445), 64, 65
Saint Stephen in an Initial T (Belbello da Pavia), 119–120, 120
San Giorgio Maggiore Antiphonary P, 114–115, 114, 116
Santo di Pietro, 148–52
Adoration of the Magi in an Initial E, 148, 149, 150

Mariydom of Saint Agatha in an Initial D, 150–152, 151
Scenes from the Lives of Saint Jerome and Saint James (recto); Annunciation (verso) (Modern Copy), 181, 181
Second Master of Antiphonary M, 1076
Antiphonary R, 116, 117
Initial L, 117
Second Master of San Domenico, 22–25
Calling of Saint Peter and Saint Andrew in an Initial D, 2, 22, 23, 24
Christ and the Apostle Appearing to Saint John the Evangelist and Miracle of the Manna in Saint John the Baptist in an Initial V, 2, 22, 24, 25
Seneca Master, 24
Siena, 3, 49–59, 147–54
Silvestro dei Gherarducci, Don, 157
Simone Camaldolese, Don, 55, 73
Six Initials: U or V, E, S, G, B, B (Argenta), 98, 99
Spranger, Bartolomeo, 174
Sprega, Erasmo, Christ’s Entry into Jerusalem in an Initial D, 180, 180
Standing Apostle in an Initial M (Master of the Graduals of San Salvatore at Pavia), 126–128, 127
Stefano da Verona, 3
Blessing Christ in an Initial B, 2, 104, 105, 106–107
Pentecost in an Initial A, 104, 105, 106–107
Stefano degli Angeli, Crucifixion with Saints Mary Magdalene, Homonou, and Donor, 29–30, 30
Strozzi, Zanobi, King David in Prayer in an Initial B, 158–160, 159

T
Taddeo di Bartolo, 57
Temptation of Saint Benedict (Master of the Beffi Triptych), 56–57, 56, 57
Temptation of Saint Francis in an Initial B (Bartolomeo di Tintoretto), 100–101, 100
Third Bessarian Master, 80–81, 86, 92, 93, 135
Saint Anthony of Padua in an Initial I, 2, 79, 80, 81, 82
Saint Clare in an Initial O, 79, 81, 82, 83
Saint Francis Receiving the Stigmata in an Initial G, 79, 81, 82, 83
Three Martyr Saints in an Initial S (Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna), 29, 29
Three Marys at the Tomb in an Initial V (Master of Antiphonary Q), 124, 124
Tommasino da Vincenza (Master of the Modern Hours), 109
Translation of the Body of Saint Dominic in an Initial I (Umbria or Southern Italy), 16, 11, 12

Trinity in an Initial B (Pellegrino di Mariano), 153–154, 153
Trinity in an Initial B, The (Master of the Codex Rossiano), 54–56, 55
Turin, Cosimo, Saint John the Baptist in an Initial D, 94–96, 94, 95, 98
Turin (?) Pentecost in an Initial S, 177–178, 177
Two Kings in an Initial A (Niccolò di Giacomo da Bologna), 27, 27
Two Martyr Saints in an Initial P (Martinino da Bartolomeo), 56–57, 57
Two Marys at the Tomb in an Initial A (Giovan Pietro da Cemmo), 179, 179

U
Umbria or Southern Italy, 7–12
Umbro-Roman (?), Saint Francis in an Initial I, 7, 7

V
Vanni di Baldolo, Workshop of, Pentecost in an Initial S, 35–36, 35
Varnucci, Bartolomeo, 161, 164
Varnucci, Giovanni, 161
Veneto, 32, 69–69, 123–126, 133–134, 178
Venice, 31, 70–77
Verona, 122–143, 158–170
Virgin and Child and God the Father Blessing in an Initial B (Duccio di Buoninsegna), ii, 5, 48, 49, 101, 108
Virgin and Child Enthroned between Saints Cecilia and Catherine of Alexandria (Morone), 138, 170, 171, 172
Virgin and Child in an Initial A (Master of 1446), 66, 66
Virgin and Child in an Initial G (Miniature di Monza), 177, 177
Virgin and Child in an Initial H (Bartolomeo di Fruosino), 175–176, 175
Virgin and Child in an Initial H (Cortese), 178, 178

Y
Young Christ Blessing in an Initial A (Belbello da Pavia), 119, 122, 122
Young Martyr Saint in an Initial E (Lombard), 134–135

Z
Zanino di Pietro, 69
Photograph Credits

Unless otherwise noted, photography of works formerly in the Lehman collection are by Eileen Travell of the Photograph Studio of The Metropolitan Museum of Art or were supplied by the lending institutions. Catalogue number 35c is courtesy of the Robert Lehman Collection archives. Photographs of comparative illustrations are courtesy of the credited institutions, except as follows: figs. 2, 6, Institute of Fine Arts, New York University; fig. 7, from *La maestra di Duccio restaurata* (Florence, 1984), p. 77; fig. 10, Robert Lehman Collection archives; fig. 11, from *Les Enluminures* (Paris and Chicago, 2001), p. 73; fig. 19, Robert Lehman Collection archives; fig. 21, Sherman Fairchild Center for Works on Paper and Photograph Conservation; fig. 23, Arte Fotografica; fig. 24, Robert Lehman Collection archives; fig. 31, Eileen Travell; fig. 33, Jonathan Alexander; fig. 35, Courtauld Institute of Art; fig. 36, Robert Lehman Collection archives; fig. 37, Robert Lehman Collection archives; fig. 39, Fotografia Lensini; fig. 40, courtesy of Laurence Kanter; fig. 41, Institute of Fine Arts, New York University. Photographs of works in the Appendix are by Eileen Travell or lending institutions except as noted. Appendix nos. 8, 10, 12, Robert Lehman Collection archives.