

PEN AND PARCHMENT



Alcibiades

PEN AND PARCHMENT

Drawing in the Middle Ages

MELANIE HOLCOMB

*with contributions by Lisa Bessette, Barbara Drake Boehm, Evelyn M. Cohen,
Kathryn Gerry, Ludovico V. Geymonat, Aden Kumler, Lawrence Nees, William Noel,
Wendy A. Stein, Faith Wallis, Karl Whittington, Elizabeth Williams, and Nancy Wu*

THE METROPOLITAN MUSEUM OF ART, NEW YORK

Yale University Press, New Haven and London

This catalogue is published in conjunction with the exhibition "Pen and Parchment: Drawing in the Middle Ages," held at The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, from June 2 to August 23, 2009.

The catalogue is made possible in part by The Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.

The exhibition is made possible by the Michel David-Weill Fund.

Additional support is provided by Mrs. Alexandre P. Rosenberg.

The exhibition is supported by an indemnity from the Federal Council on the Arts and the Humanities.

Published by The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

John P. O'Neill, Publisher and Editor in Chief
Gwen Roginsky, General Manager of Publications
Margaret Rennolds Chace, Managing Editor
Carol Fuerstein, Editor
Bruce Campbell, Designer
Peter Antony with Bonnie Laessig, Production Managers
Robert Weisberg, Assistant Managing Editor
Philomena Mariani, Bibliographer

Unless otherwise specified, all photographs were supplied by the owners of the works of art, who hold the copyright thereto, and are reproduced with permission. Photographs of works in the Metropolitan Museum's collection are by the Photograph Studio, The Metropolitan Museum of Art. For additional photograph credits, see p. 188.

Typeset in Dante MT Std and LTC Deepdene

Printed on 130 gsm Gardapatt Kiara

Separations by Professional Graphics, Inc., Rockford, Illinois

Printed and bound by Mondadori Printing S.p.A., Verona, Italy

Jacket illustration: Battle Scene, fol. 5v, *Book of Maccabees I* (cat. no. 5), Saint Gall, Switzerland, second half of 9th–early 10th century
Frontispiece: Portrait of Terence held by two masked actors, fol. 2v, *Six Comedies by Terence* (cat. no. 15), Saint Albans, England, mid-12th century

Copyright © 2009 by The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available from the Library of Congress.

ISBN 978-1-58839-318-0 (hc: The Metropolitan Museum of Art)

ISBN 978-0-300-14894-7 (hc: Yale University Press)

Contents

<i>Director's Foreword</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	viii
<i>Lenders to the Exhibition</i>	xi
<i>Contributors to the Catalogue</i>	xii
<i>Note to the Reader</i>	xii
Strokes of Genius: The Draftsman's Art in the Middle Ages MELANIE HOLCOMB	3
CATALOGUE	35
<i>Bibliography</i>	164
<i>General Index</i>	177
<i>Index of Manuscripts Arranged by Location</i>	186
<i>Photograph Credits</i>	188

Director's Foreword

The Metropolitan Museum of Art is fortunate to house one of the richest collections of medieval objects of art in the world as well as one of the finest assemblages of postmedieval drawings. Thus it is appropriate that we should be the first institution to organize an exhibition that resonates with works from both of these areas. *Pen and Parchment: Drawing in the Middle Ages* ponders the history and definition of drawing in the Middle Ages and, we hope, encourages audiences to expand their notions of what medieval art is and how medieval artists worked.

Drawings were a distinctive mode of expression in the Middle Ages, one integral to the creative process and highly regarded by medieval patrons. For hundreds of years before the Old Masters flourished, medieval artists explored the medium of drawing, producing spontaneous sketches, graphic treatises, and finished drawings of extraordinary refinement. If these works have scarcely been discussed in terms of their identity as drawings until now, it is in part because we know so little about that elusive figure in art history, the medieval draftsman. *Pen and Parchment* offers glimpses of the high quality and wide variety of drawings produced in the medieval West, including examples that range from masterly finished sheets to manuscripts that creatively combine painting and drawing, maps, and diagrams, as well as model books and preliminary sketches. As

we study the drawings ever more closely more and more is revealed: we see centers of artistic production and, indeed, specific artistic personalities emerge and come to life.

The exhibition and publication that accompanies it were planned under the stewardship of Philippe de Montebello, Director Emeritus of The Metropolitan Museum of Art. Thanks are due to Melanie Holcomb, Associate Curator, Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters, who conceived the exhibition and was the principal author of the catalogue. We wish to acknowledge all our lenders, both institutional and private, for their enormous generosity and sustained interest in this project. My gratitude is due to those who have supported this project financially. I express my profound appreciation to Mrs. Alexandre P. Rosenberg as well as to Michel David-Weill. In addition, the Federal Council on the Arts and the Humanities has granted an indemnity for this project through an exceptional program that enables us to present exhibitions that are international in scope. Publication of the catalogue was made possible through the support of The Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.

Thomas P. Campbell
Director
The Metropolitan Museum of Art

Acknowledgments

One of the greatest pleasures in working on this exhibition has been the opportunity to develop relationships with colleagues around the globe. The exhibition would have been impossible to realize without the support and assistance of many individuals and institutions near and far, and these few words of gratitude can scarcely express the extent of my indebtedness to them all.

Many of our most generous loans have come from England, and I thank all the libraries and museums there that have generously opened their doors to me. At the Parker Library of Corpus Christi College, Cambridge, I recognize the efforts of Christopher de Hamel and Gill Cannell. At the Fitzwilliam Museum, also in Cambridge, I thank Timothy Potts, Stella Panayotova, Thryza Smith, David Scrase, Nicholas Robinson, and John Lancaster. My visits to London have confirmed my profound appreciation for the efforts of those at the British Library including Scot McKendrick, Andrea Clarke, Claire Breay, Justin Clegg, Robert Davies, and Barbara O'Connor. At the Bodleian Library, Oxford, my deepest gratitude was earned by Sarah Thomas, Martin Kauffmann, Bruce Barker-Benfield, Dana Josephson, Madeline Slaven, and James Allan. At Saint John's College, also in Oxford, I acknowledge Malcolm Hale and Catherine Hilliard. I extend my thanks as well to Arthur MacGregor of the Ashmolean Museum, Oxford, and Jonathan Harrison at the library of Saint John's College, Cambridge, among other colleagues who offered assistance in England.

The exhibition would be far less rich if it did not include the extraordinary works on loan to us from Germany. I am indebted to Claudia Fabian, Margot Attenkofer, and Brigitte Gulath of the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in Munich. In Wolfenbüttel, I enjoyed a warm welcome from Helwig Schmidt-Glintzer, Christian Heitzmann, and Marina Arnold. My appreciation is due to Jörn Günther and Beatrix Zumbult of Hamburg. The monastic communities of Austria and Switzerland have proven enormously helpful. I thank Pater Petrus Eder and Sonja Führer at the Archabbey of Saint Peter in Salzburg, Pater Odo Lang of the Abbey of Einsiedeln, and Karl Schmuki at the Monastery of Saint Gall for their generosity in sharing treasures from their centuries-old libraries.

My colleagues in France are many and my appreciation for their efforts is profound. I thank Jacqueline Ayrault,

Sévérine Montigny, and Anne-Bérangère Rothenburger of the Bibliothèques d'Amiens Métropole. In Dijon at the Bibliothèque Municipale, I received the welcome assistance of Marie-Paule Rolin, Annick Chalvignac, and Caroline Poulain. At the Bibliothèque Nationale de France in Paris my thanks go to Bruno Racine, Thierry Delcourt, Marie-Pierre Laffitte, Pierre-Jean Riamond, Françoise Simeray, Céline Boudot, and Anne Mary were especially helpful. I am grateful to Jean-Marc Léry and Florian Meunier, who generously assisted me at the Musée Carnavalet in Paris. At the Musée de l'Oeuvre Notre-Dame, Strasbourg, Joëlle Pijaudier-Cabot, Cécile Dupeux, and Barbara Gatineau deserve mention. Elisabeth Taburet-Delahaye of the Musée National du Moyen Âge, Paris, Françoise Lernout at the Musée de Picardie, Amiens, and Sophie Jugie of the Musée des Beaux-Arts, Dijon, are owed my gratitude for their crucial assistance in approaching potential lenders.

It has been a pleasure to collaborate with my Dutch colleagues at the Universiteitsbibliotheek in Leiden, and I extend my appreciation to Kurt de Belder, André Bouwman, Matthijs Holwerda, Karin Scheper, and Simone Kortekaas there. I also thank Michiel Plomp of the Teylers Museum as well as Bas Savenije and Bart Jaski at the Universiteitsbibliotheek, Utrecht, for their kind assistance. In Russia, I extend my appreciation to the National Library at Saint Petersburg. Among Russian colleagues we thank particularly Vladimir Zaitsev, Alexander I. Bukreyev, Natalja Elagina, and Pavel A. Medvedev. We benefited from the assistance of many individuals at the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana in Vatican City. We thank especially Cardinal Tarcisio Bertone, Cardinal Raffaele Farina, Monsignor Cesare Pasini, Monsignor Gabriele Caccia, Ambrogio Piazzoni, Paolo Vian, Barbara Yatta, Amalia D'Alascio, Sister Jacinta Coscia, and Timothy Janz.

I cannot overlook the kindness of the many institutions in the United States that have sent their invaluable manuscripts to our Museum and have graciously allowed us to study their collections. I have depended on the generosity of the Walters Art Museum in Baltimore, and I thank especially Gary Vikan, Danielle Bennett, William Noel, and Kathryn Gerry. The last two contributed to the catalogue in addition to providing assistance at crucial moments. We have a longstanding friendship with the Manuscripts

Department at the Getty Museum in Los Angeles, and I am pleased that this exhibition provided yet another opportunity to work with that institution and its fine staff. Michael Brand, Sally Hibbard, Marc Hamly, and Nancy Turner have earned my gratitude. Thomas Kren, Elizabeth Morrison, Kristen Collins, and Christine Sciacca of the Manuscript Department deserve special commendation for the many instances in which they offered me advice and assistance.

Various sister institutions in New York City have generously allowed us to display some of their finest works. We thank John O'Neill at the Hispanic Society. At the Jewish Theological Seminary Library, David C. Kraemer, Sharon Liberman Mintz, Sarah Diamant, Amy Armstrong, David Sclar, Naomi M. Steinberger, and Jerry Schwarzbard merit my deepest gratitude. I am grateful for the encouragement and generosity of William Griswold, Charles E. Pierce, Jr., William Voelkle, Patricia Courtney, Brian Regan, John D. Alexander, and Christine Nelson at the Pierpont Morgan Library. My thanks as well are conveyed to my counterparts at the New York Public Library: Paul Le Clerc, George Fletcher, and Deborah Straussmann. I also owe gratitude for the good cheer and generosity of an anonymous collector here in New York.

I enjoyed the use of a number of fine research libraries in the preparation of this exhibition. I would like to thank Susan Noakes and Oliver Nicholson of the University of Minnesota Center for Medieval Studies, where I was welcomed as a fellow, as well as the helpful staff of the University of Minnesota libraries. The Getty Research Institute invited me to be Visiting Scholar at a crucial stage in the writing of this catalogue. My profound thanks are conveyed to the many people who helped to make my summer there such a rewarding experience, including David Bomford, Sabine Schlosser, Daniela Ferrari, Gabrielle Azucena, Aynne Kokas, and the staff of the research library, especially Jay Gam. While in Los Angeles I benefited from collegial exchanges with the curators of the Getty's Manuscripts Department, whom I mention above, Lee Hendrix from the Drawings Department, and with other visiting scholars, especially Sylvie Pénichon and David Wheeler. The Watson Library at the Metropolitan Museum is a marvel both in its holdings and level of service. My

thanks are extended to the entire staff, but especially Kenneth Soehner, Linda Seckelson, Lisa Beidel, Robyn Fleming, and David Bressler.

It would not have been possible to organize "Pen and Parchment" without the support of my friends and colleagues at the Metropolitan Museum. I owe an enormous debt to Philippe de Montebello, our Director Emeritus, Peter Barnet, Michel David-Weill Curator in Charge of the Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters, and George Goldner, Drue Heinz Chairman of the Department of Drawings and Prints, for their early and ongoing encouragement of the project. My thanks are due also to our new director, Thomas P. Campbell, for his unqualified embrace of an exhibition he inherited from his predecessor. I am grateful to Mahrukh Tarapor, Associate Director for Exhibitions, for her valuable guidance, and to Doralynn Pines, Associate Director for Administration, for her enthusiastic support.

The installation and planning of the exhibition was expertly overseen by Linda Sylling, as well as Patricia Gilkison. Martha Deese deserves special thanks for her frequent and always astute counsel. The Registrar's Office ably negotiated the many details of shipping, insurance, and customs, and my thanks go to Herbert Moskowitz, Erin Mallay, Aileen Chuk, Nina Maruca, and Mary McNamara of that department. Kirstie Howard and Rebecca Noonan have provided sage legal advice. I offer my appreciation to Nina Diefenbach and her staff in the Development Office, with particular thanks extended to Andrea Kann, Thomas Reynolds, Eileen Destri, and Anna Chiumenti. Harold Holzer, Elyse Topalian, Mary Flanagan, and Egle Žygas directed the publicity for the exhibition. Katherine Dahab of the Photo Studio provided some of the photography. John Barelli coordinated the security, and Brad Kauffman managed the merchandising efforts. Michael Batista and Connie Norkin attended to the design of the exhibition with creativity and professionalism, and Pamela Barr ably edited the labels. Aimee Dixon and Joseph Loh, under the direction of Andrea Bayer and Kent Lydecker, helped organize educational programs associated with the exhibition. Lasley Steever, Teresa Lai, and their colleagues worked to give the exhibition a presence on the Museum's website. I acknowledge the important contributions of Marjorie Shelley, Yana van Dyke, Margaret Lawson, and Martin Bansbach in the Paper Conservation Department

for their outstanding efforts on behalf of this project. I have learned a great deal working with them.

The catalogue would never have come to fruition without the endeavors of the Museum's Editorial Department. My thanks go to the head of that department, John P. O'Neill, who committed the necessary resources to create the substantial publication that he felt this understudied topic deserved. I developed an amiable working relationship with Carol Fuerstein, who served as the book's editor. Margaret Chace shepherded the book administratively, and its production was overseen by Peter Antony, assisted by Bonnie Laessig. Robert Weisberg was in charge of the desktop publishing operation. Mary Jo Mace handled the finances. Philomena Mariani was the bibliographer, and Gwen Roginsky and Jane Tai offered critical advice. The catalogue was handsomely designed by Bruce Campbell. I acknowledge the importance of the contributors both inside and outside the Museum: Lisa Bessette, Wendy Stein, Lawrence Nees, William Noel, Elizabeth Williams, Faith Wallis, Kathryn Gerry, Nancy Wu, Ludovico V. Geymonat, Evelyn M. Cohen, Karl Whittington, Aden Kumler, and Barbara Drake Boehm. They and other scholars, including Jonathan Alexander, Carl Barnes, Sally Dormer, Dorothy Glass, Sandra Hindman, Thomas Kelly, Howard Lay, Christina Nielsen, Michelle O'Malley, Christopher Poke, Nina Rowe, Elizabeth Sears, Kathryn Smith, Elizabeth Teviotdale, Christine Verzar, Yao-Fen You, and Giusi Zanichelli generously lent their expertise and assistance to the project.

I am fortunate to work in an extraordinarily collegial department, in which requests for assistance were never refused. I have benefited particularly from the experience and counsel of Barbara Drake Boehm and Helen Evans.

Charles Little, Timothy Husband, Julien Chapuis, Christine Brennan, Theo Margelony, Thomas Vinton, Andrew Winslow, Nancy Wu, Michael Carter, Lisbeth Castelnuevo-Tedesco, Christine McDermott, Brandie Ratliff, and Richard Tayer have all made valuable contributions to the realization of this project. My thanks are offered to a number of colleagues from other departments of the Metropolitan Museum who were so generous with their support and assistance: Maryan Ainsworth, Stijn Alsteens, Carmen Bambach, Dirk Breiding, Pete Dandridge, Soyoung Lee, Anne Strauss, and Linda Wolk-Simon. Many interns and research assistants have generously given their time and skills. They include Christine Axen, Ehaab Bakeer, Beata Foremna, Alexis Gorby, Allison Nogueira, Eric Ramirez-Weaver, Manon Six, and Liza Terkel. Special thanks are in order for Eric Hupe, who saw the project through its last year with patience and eager curiosity. My appreciation is also due to my fine students in the Institute of Fine Arts Curatorial Studies II class for their insights and comments.

I owe a special debt of gratitude to Elizabeth Williams, the research assistant for this exhibition. Her impressive writing talents, organizational skills, linguistic abilities, combined with her tact and never-failing good humor, saw me through this project. The exhibition quite simply could not have been achieved without her. Finally, my heartfelt appreciation extends to my friends and family, whose encouragement has sustained me. I cannot list them all here, but I must give special mention to Douglas Shapiro, Amelia Holcomb, Sophie Shapiro, and Ida Mae Holcomb, whose patience I fear was sorely tested through the long development of this project and yet who never failed to buoy my spirits.

Melanie Holcomb
Associate Curator
Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters
The Metropolitan Museum of Art

Lenders to the Exhibition

AUSTRIA

Salzburg

Archabbey of Saint Peter, 37

ENGLAND

Cambridge

Corpus Christi College, 11, 14, 30, 41

The Fitzwilliam Museum, 33

London

The British Library, 12, 13, 39

Oxford

Bodleian Library, 7, 15

Saint John's College, 28

FRANCE

Amiens

Bibliothèques d'Amiens Métropole, 1, 17

Dijon

Bibliothèque Municipale, 18

Paris

Bibliothèque Nationale de France, 8, 20, 48

Musée Carnavalet, 40

Strasbourg

Musée de l'Oeuvre Notre-Dame, 38

GERMANY

Hamburg

Dr. Jörn Günther, Antiquariat, 32

Munich

Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, 22–24, 27

Wolfenbüttel

Herzog August Bibliothek, 6

THE NETHERLANDS

Leiden

Universiteitsbibliotheek, 5, 19

RUSSIA

Saint Petersburg

National Library of Russia, 3

SWITZERLAND

Einsiedeln

Stiftsbibliothek, 34

Saint Gall

Stiftsbibliothek, 4, 34.1

UNITED STATES

Baltimore

The Walters Art Museum, 26, 29

Los Angeles

The J. Paul Getty Museum, 42, 43

New York

Anonymous lender, 31

The Hispanic Society of America, 21

The Jewish Theological Seminary Library, 35

The Pierpont Morgan Library, 2, 9, 16, 25, 47

The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 49

New York Public Library, 36

VATICAN CITY

Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, 10, 44–46

Contributors to the Catalogue

- | | | | |
|-----|---|-----|---|
| LB | Lisa Bessette, <i>independent scholar</i> | WN | William Noel, <i>Curator of Manuscripts and Rare Books, The Walters Art Museum, Baltimore</i> |
| BDB | Barbara Drake Boehm, <i>Curator, Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</i> | WAS | Wendy A. Stein, <i>Research Associate, Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</i> |
| EMC | Evelyn M. Cohen, <i>independent scholar</i> | FW | Faith Wallis, <i>Professor, Department of Social Studies of Medicine and Department of History, McGill University, Montreal</i> |
| KG | Kathryn Gerry, <i>Curatorial Assistant, Department of Manuscripts and Rare Books, The Walters Art Museum, Baltimore</i> | KW | Karl Whittington, <i>doctoral candidate, Department of History of Art, University of California, Berkeley</i> |
| LVG | Ludovico V. Geymonat, <i>Visiting Lecturer, University of California, Davis</i> | EW | Elizabeth Williams, <i>Research Assistant, Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</i> |
| MH | Melanie Holcomb, <i>Associate Curator, Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</i> | NW | Nancy Wu, <i>Museum Educator, Department of Medieval Art and The Cloisters, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</i> |
| AK | Aden Kumler, <i>Assistant Professor, Department of Art History, University of Chicago</i> | | |
| LN | Lawrence Nees, <i>Professor, Department of Art History, University of Delaware, Newark</i> | | |

Note to the Reader

Reproducing manuscripts in a catalogue can offer only a partial experience of books as objects. Thus the headings in the entry section of this catalogue attempt not only to describe the drawings that are the subject of our exhibition but also to give a sense of the complexity of the books that contain them. The information provided does not constitute full codicological references for each manuscript, which are often included in the listings of specialized literature accompanying the entries. Rather, these headings should serve as overviews of the manuscripts for the general reader. We include the specific place of the books' manufacture and the dating of their bindings only when they are known with reasonable certainty. Medieval books were often modified as readers added their own notes and appended copies of other texts. The dates provided thus refer to the drawings under discussion and not to any other aspects of the volume. Because all of the works are on parchment and executed in ink, we do not repeat that information in the heading. Where there is paint or gold in a drawing, these materials are discussed in the body of the entry. We have included a general description of the text of each book to convey an idea of the volume as a whole

and to supply a context for the illustrative content. Our brief description of the decoration is meant to offer a sense of the nature and extent of the drawing, painting, and illumination within each manuscript.

Within the entry we indicate whenever a folio under discussion is illustrated (fol. 67, *illustrated*). Comparative works presented in an entry are given figure numbers that include the entry number (fig. 21.1). All illustrations in the essay have simple figure numbers (fig. 12).

References in the selected literature sections of the entries and the endnotes for the entries and the essay are abbreviated. Full citations appear in the bibliography. Libraries are increasingly digitizing their manuscripts, and in the selected literature listings we have indicated instances where the reader can page through the folios of the manuscripts in digital facsimiles or online websites. The addresses of these regularly updated sites are found in a section of the bibliography.

All translations from the Bible are from the Douay-Reims version. All other translations are by the authors unless otherwise cited in the notes. Finally, the catalogue entries are signed with initials; for the full names of these authors, see the listing of contributors above.

PEN AND PARCHMENT