

METROPOLITAN MUSEUM
JOURNAL

VOLUME 49 / 2014



The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

EDITORIAL BOARD

KATHARINE BAETJER
Curator, European Paintings

JULIE JONES
Curator Emeritus, Arts of Africa, Oceania, and the Americas

ELIZABETH MANKIN KORNHAUSER
Alice Pratt Brown Curator of American Paintings and Sculpture

DENISE PATRY LEIDY
Curator, Asian Art

MARCO LEONA
David H. Koch Scientist in Charge, Scientific Research

DOROTHY MAHON
Conservator, Paintings Conservation

JOAN R. MERTENS
Curator, Greek and Roman Art

JOANNE PILLSBURY
Andrall E. Pearson Curator, Arts of Africa, Oceania, and the Americas

LUKE SYSON
Iris and B. Gerald Cantor Chairman, European Sculpture and Decorative Arts

This publication is made possible by a gift from Assunta Sommella Peluso, Ada Peluso, and Romano I. Peluso, in memory of Ignazio Peluso.

The *Metropolitan Museum Journal* is published annually by The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

Mark Polizzotti, Publisher and Editor in Chief

Elizabeth L. Block, Managing Editor

Bruce Campbell, Designer

Paul Booth, Production Manager

Ling Hu, Image Acquisitions Associate

Valeria Cafà's article was translated from the Italian by Lawrence Jenkins; Masako Yoshida's article was translated from the Japanese by Monica Bethe; Cornelia Reiter's article was translated from the German by Russell Stockman. All other translations are by the authors.

The Editorial Board is especially grateful to Sarah McFadden for her assistance with this issue.

Manuscripts submitted for the *Journal* and all correspondence concerning them should be sent to journalsubmissions@metmuseum.org. Guidelines for contributors are given on page 6.

Published in association with the University of Chicago Press. Individual and institutional subscriptions are available worldwide. Please direct all subscription inquiries, back issue requests, and address changes to: University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P. O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637-0005, USA. Phone: (877) 705-1878 (U.S. and Canada) or (773) 753-3347 (international), fax: (877) 705-1879 (U.S. and Canada) or (773) 753-0811 (international), email: subscriptions@press.uchicago.edu, website: www.journals.uchicago.edu

ISBN 978-0-226-21267-8 (University of Chicago Press)

ISSN 0077-8958 (print)

ISSN 2169-3072 (online)

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 68-28799

The Metropolitan Museum of Art endeavors to respect copyright in a manner consistent with its nonprofit educational mission. If you believe any material has been included improperly in this publication, please contact the Editorial Department.

Photographs of works in the Metropolitan Museum's collection are by The Photograph Studio, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, unless otherwise noted.

Copyright © 2014 by The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

Typeset in Optima LT Std

Printed on Creator Silk, 100 lb.

Separations by Professional Graphics, Inc., Rockford, Illinois

Printed and bound by Puritan Capital, Hollis, New Hampshire

Cover illustration: Detail of Tullio Lombardo (Italian, ca. 1455–1532), *Adam*, ca. 1490–95. See Figure 1, page 34.

FOR JULIE JONES

A meticulous and probing reader who significantly
broadened the *Journal's* scope

FOR BRUCE CAMPBELL

An exceptional designer
who lavished his talents on this publication

Contents

Adam by Tullio Lombardo

<i>Adam</i> by Tullio Lombardo LUKE SYSON AND VALERIA CAFÀ	9
Ancient Sources for Tullio Lombardo's <i>Adam</i> VALERIA CAFÀ	33
The Treatment of Tullio Lombardo's <i>Adam</i> : A New Approach to the Conservation of Monumental Marble Sculpture CAROLYN RICCARDELLI, JACK SOULTANIAN, MICHAEL MORRIS, LAWRENCE BECKER, GEORGE WHEELER, AND RONALD STREET	49
A New Analysis of Major Greek Sculptures in the Metropolitan Museum: Petrological and Stylistic LORENZO LAZZARINI AND CLEMENTE MARCONI	117
Hellenistic Etruscan Cremation Urns from Chiusi THERESA HUNTSMAN	141
Redeeming Pieter Coecke van Aelst's <i>Gluttony</i> Tapestry: Learning from Scientific Analysis FEDERICO CARÒ, GIULIA CHIOSTRINI, ELIZABETH CLELAND, AND NOBUKO SHIBAYAMA	151
Trade Stories: Chinese Export Embroideries in the Metropolitan Museum MASAKO YOSHIDA	165
A Greek Inscription in a Portrait by Salvator Rosa MICHAEL ZELLMANN-ROHRER	187
Honoré de Balzac and Natoire's <i>The Expulsion from Paradise</i> CAROL SANTOLERI	193
Another Brother for Goya's "Red Boy": Agustín Esteve's Portrait of Francisco Xavier Osorio, Conde de Trastámara XAVIER F. SALOMON	201
Nature as Ideal: Drawings by Joseph Anton Koch and Johann Christian Reinhart CORNELIA REITER	207
A Buddhist Source for a Stoneware "Basket" Designed by Georges Hoentschel DENISE PATRY LEIDY	225

Manuscript Guidelines for the *Metropolitan Museum Journal*

The *Metropolitan Museum Journal* is issued annually by The Metropolitan Museum of Art. Its purpose is to publish original research on works in the Museum's collection. Articles are contributed by members of the Museum staff and other art historians and specialists. Submissions should be emailed to: journalsubmissions@metmuseum.org.

Manuscripts are reviewed by the *Journal* Editorial Board, composed of members of the curatorial, conservation, and scientific departments. **To be considered for the following year's volume, an article must be submitted, complete including illustrations, by October 15.** Once an article is accepted for publication, the author will have the opportunity to review it after it has been edited and again after it has been laid out in pages. The honorarium for image costs is \$300, and each author receives a copy of the *Journal* volume in which his or her article appears.

Manuscripts should be submitted as double-spaced Word files. In addition to the text, the manuscript must include endnotes, captions for illustrations, photograph credits, and a 200-word abstract. Each part of the article should be in a separate file except the endnotes, which should be linked to and appear at the end of the text file.

For the style of captions and bibliographic references in endnotes, authors are referred to *The Metropolitan Museum of Art Guide to Editorial Style and Procedures*, which is available from the Museum's Editorial Department

upon request, and to *The Chicago Manual of Style*. Please provide a list of all bibliographic citations that includes, for each title: full name(s) of author or authors; title and subtitle of book or article and periodical; place and date of publication; volume number, if any; and page, plate, and/or figure number(s). For citations in notes, please use only the last name(s) of the author or authors and the date of publication (e.g., Jones 1953, p. 65; Smith and Harding 2006, pp. 7–10, fig. 23).

When submitting manuscripts, authors should include a PDF of all illustrations. Please do not embed images within text documents. If the manuscript is accepted, the author is expected to provide publication-quality images as well as copyright permissions to reproduce them in both the print and electronic editions of the *Journal*. We require either digital files of at least 300 dpi at 3,000 pixels wide, color transparencies (preferably 8 x 10 in. but 4 x 6 in. is also acceptable), or glossy black-and-white photographs (preferably 8 x 10 in. with white borders) of good quality and in good condition.

In a separate Word file, please indicate the figure number, the picture's orientation, and any instructions for cropping. Reproductions of photographs or other illustrations in books should be accompanied by captions that include full bibliographic information. **The author of each article is responsible for obtaining all photographic material and reproduction rights.**

ABBREVIATIONS

MMA	The Metropolitan Museum of Art
MMAB	<i>The Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin</i>
MMJ	<i>Metropolitan Museum Journal</i>

Height precedes width and depth in dimensions cited.

METROPOLITAN MUSEUM
JOURNAL

VOLUME 49 / 2014

Honoré de Balzac and Natoire's *The Expulsion from Paradise*

CAROL SANTOLERI

Research Assistant, Department of European Paintings, The Metropolitan Museum of Art

The nineteenth-century French novelist Honoré de Balzac (1799–1850) has a well-documented reputation for drawing on the conventions of art to add depth and nuance to his literary work. Intrigued by a wide range of biblical, mythological, and genre subjects, he peppered his novels with references to scores of paintings that would have been familiar to his audience.¹ He was also a passionate collector, who, like a character in one of his novels, frequented the establishments of art dealers in an effort to fill his home with paintings, drawings, and decorative arts.² Yet, notwithstanding his evident appreciation of art and his ability to conjure up the rich iconography of well-known painters, he seems not to have been a sophisticated collector. Toward the end of his life, he noted in a letter to art critic Théophile Thoré that, although he enjoyed hunting for additions to his “petit musée,” he was not particularly knowledgeable on the subject of paintings.³ While he professed to own pictures by or attributed to such artists as Holbein, Domenichino, and Rubens,⁴ no work by or even after these artists has ever been associated with his collection. To date, only two pieces have been identified: *Bacchante in a Landscape* by Jean-Baptiste Mallet, now in the Louvre, Paris, and *The Expulsion from Paradise* by Charles Joseph Natoire (1700–1777), belonging to the Metropolitan Museum (Figure 1).⁵

Research indicates that Balzac purchased the Natoire in 1846 with his future wife, Eve Hanska (1804–1882), and that it remained in their collection for thirty-six years.⁶ The history of Balzac's engagement with the painting can be traced through the letters he wrote over a period of almost seventeen years to Hanska—a noblewoman of Polish descent who had married Wenceslas Hanski (1782–1841) in 1819 and lived in western Ukraine at Wierzchownia, then part of the Russian Empire.⁷ The two

began corresponding in February 1832, when Hanska sent Balzac an admiring yet critical fan letter, referring to herself simply as “L'Étrangère” (the foreigner).⁸ After an epistolary courtship interspersed with extended periods of shared travel and stopovers in Wierzchownia, the two were married on March 14, 1850. Tragically, Balzac died of ill health on August 18, only five months later.

Balzac and Hanska first saw the Natoire on a trip across Italy, Switzerland, and Germany in 1846.⁹ On March 16 of that year, the writer boarded a mail coach in Paris for Rome, where he met up with Hanska. In mid-April, the two set sail for Genoa, continuing by way of Lake Orta and the Simplon Pass to Switzerland. On May 16, a few days before the writer's forty-seventh birthday, they arrived in Basel, where they stayed at the luxurious Hôtel des Trois Rois to celebrate the feast day of Saint Honoré.¹⁰ At Miville-Krug, a local dealer in antiquities, they saw a number of items of interest, including *The Expulsion from Paradise*, which depicts the liminal moment when Adam and Eve come to terms with the severity of their situation, as an angry God emphatically casts them out of the Garden of Eden. Balzac, describing the work in an 1846 letter to Hanska, recognized its pathos: “Among the serious paintings in my cabinet, the Natoire makes a pitiful sight.”¹¹

At the time, Natoire's legacy was not without controversy in France. On the one hand, he was known as an accomplished painter and teacher, serving as a professor at the Académie Royale de Peinture et de Sculpture and director of the French Academy in Rome, a post he held for nearly twenty-five years. Some of his most esteemed paintings decorated the Château de Versailles, Hôtel de Soubise, and Chapelle des Enfants-Trouvés in Paris, while the Louvre was said to hold three of his mythological compositions: *Juno*, *The Three Graces*, and *Venus Demanding Arms from Vulcan for Aeneas*.¹² On the other hand, the preservationist Alexandre Lenoir revived, in 1837, the longstanding debate on the relative values of Rococo and Neoclassical art, arguing that Natoire and his contemporaries François Boucher,

1. Charles Joseph Natoire (French, 1700–1777). *The Expulsion from Paradise*, 1740. Oil on copper, 26¾ x 19¾ in. (67.9 x 50.2 cm). Signed and dated at lower left: C. Natoire / 1740. The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Purchase, Mr. and Mrs. Frank E. Richardson III, George T. Delacorte Jr., and Mr. and Mrs. Henry J. Heinz II Gifts; Victor Wilbour Memorial, Marquand, and The Alfred N. Punnett Endowment Funds; and The Edward Joseph Gallagher III Memorial Collection, Edward J. Gallagher Jr. Bequest, 1987 (1987.279)



Jean François de Troy, and Carle Vanloo had contributed to a decline in painting.¹³ Balzac, a keen observer of French society who kept abreast of contemporary issues, chose to engage in the dispute. In his 1837 novel *La Maison Nucingen*, he compared Natoire to Raphael, an artist whose work he held in the highest esteem, and whose renowned fresco of Adam and Eve (Raphael Rooms, Vatican Museums, Vatican City) may well have influenced Natoire's work. Alluding, perhaps, to the similarities between the two painters as well as to their differences, Balzac wrote: "While serving time in the ministry, where I was squeezed for eight hours a day among twenty-two-carat simpletons, I saw some characters who convinced me that shade has its asperities and that there are angles in the greatest platitude! Yes, my dear, such a bourgeois is to another as Raphael is to Natoire."¹⁴

Throughout the *Comédie humaine*, begun long before he first saw Natoire's *The Expulsion from Paradise*, Balzac frequently alluded to religious works of art. Yves Gagneux found that, of the one hundred masterpieces mentioned by Balzac in his novels, forty are biblical paintings created by such artists as Raphael, Titian, and Murillo.¹⁵ Addressing a fascination with the liminal realm between mortality and immortality, Balzac conjured up works of art that illuminate the human spirit as it undergoes a transformation. He described, for example, the apotheosis of the eponymous figure in Domenichino's *Communion of Saint Jerome* (Vatican Museums), the mystical glow surrounding Christ as he ascends into the paradisiacal realm of Raphael's *Transfiguration* (Vatican Museums),¹⁶ and the youthful splendor of the Virgin Mary as she receives the gift of eternal life in Titian's *Assumption of the Virgin* (Santa Maria Gloriosa dei Frari, Venice).¹⁷

The story of Adam and Eve's spiritual transformations played a role in at least two of Balzac's works. In the early 1830s, he built the novel *Le Chef-d'oeuvre inconnu* around three painters: Nicolas Poussin, Frans Pourbus the Younger, and Frenhofer, a fictional acclaimed artist.¹⁸ Their reactions to a painting of Adam and Eve by the Netherlandish artist Jan Gossart (called Mabuse)¹⁹ set the tone for a story about a painter who was struggling to achieve immortality through the power of his art. In the novel, Balzac's characters are led to believe that the portrait on which Frenhofer has been furtively working for such a long period of time will prove to be a masterpiece. When they discover that the painting is a tour de force only in the eyes of its author, each character experiences a loss of innocence as he faces the prospect of artistic failure and confronts his own mortality.

Balzac turned again to the story of Adam and Eve while compiling *Les Cent Contes drolatiques* (1832–37). In a vignette called "Naïfveté" (Naivety), he presented a child's perspective on religious imagery in the tale of a young

prince and princess who are taken to see a painting by Titian of the biblical couple:

"You wished to see Adam and Eve, who were our first parents; there they are," [their mother] said./ Then she left them in great astonishment before Titian's picture, and seated herself by the bedside of the king, who delighted to watch the children./ "Which of the two is Adam?" said Francis, nudging his sister Margot's elbow./ "You silly!" replied she, "to know that, they would have to be dressed!"²⁰

Balzac's interest in biblical themes was fostered by his relationship with Eve Hanska. She was born on December 24,²¹ a date celebrated by Roman Catholics as the feast day of Adam and Eve. Notwithstanding the variations on her given name,²² Roger Pierrot argues that Hanska was deliberately called "Eve" in concurrence with the feast day, as was her brother, Adam, born on the same day a year later. Balzac's letters support Pierrot's theory. Tellingly, on June 10, 1846, he wrote to Hanska: "Miville is sending me the Natoire. . . . You will have your pretty patroness."²³ Although patron saints were disappearing from the French national discourse as a consequence of the Revolution, the reduced calendar of feast days heightened the interest in the celebrations that survived. Consequently, many Catholics maintained a rapport with their patron saints. Hanska, a devout Catholic, would have been keenly aware of the many traditions associated with the saints. Balzac himself had been named for Saint Honoré, the patron saint of bakers, whose feast day was celebrated just four days before his birthday. In several of his novels, he explored the culture of patron saints, leaving no doubt that he was intrigued by the attendant contradictions inherent in contemporary religious practices.²⁴

In his letters, Balzac drew parallels between Eve Hanska and the biblical Eve. On January 20, 1838, he responded to Hanska's query: "You have asked me how, knowing everything, knowing everyone, observing and fathoming all, I can be duped and misled? . . . Ultimately, dear and pious Catholic, God knew in advance that Eve would succumb, and he allowed it to happen."²⁵ On November 20, 1843, he wooed Hanska with a dramatic portrayal of Eve, citing what he described as a Hebrew word: "*Lididda* which encompasses notions of paternity—maternity, filial piety, love, divine sweetness, paradise—etc. and celestial voluptuousness. . . . It's the only legacy from terrestrial paradise [left] to the children of Adam: Eve retained it. I am the only one who has had this idea. . . . Thus for us, we have the name of the first woman . . . which is indescribable in the modern languages."²⁶ And on August 12, 1847, he assured her of his devotion: "No, you see, time alone will tell you of the affection of this poor Adam, chased from paradise by circumstances, without Eve."²⁷

2. Jean Gigoux (French, 1806–1894). *The Salon of Madame de Balzac*, ca. 1862. Oil on canvas, 46½ x 72½ in. (118 x 184 cm). Maison de Balzac/Musée de la Ville de Paris (BAL 88-0018). Photograph: © Maison de Balzac/Roger-Viollet



Therefore, it is not surprising that Balzac and Hanska were charmed by Natoire's rendering of Adam and Eve. When the writer returned to Paris in late May 1846 after traveling with Hanska, he immediately commenced negotiations to buy *The Expulsion from Paradise* from Miville-Krug. In a letter to Hanska dated May 30, he voiced his intentions: "You will have [the] Adam and Eve; it will not be said that my desires alone will be fulfilled."²⁸ By June 10, he had settled on a price, and five days later the painting was delivered.²⁹ From the moment it arrived in Paris, *The Expulsion from Paradise* attracted attention. On June 20, Balzac reported optimistically to Hanska, "Chenavard³⁰ found the Natoire [to be] an excellent piece and Cailleux³¹ said it had value, that such things are coming back into fashion."³² A month later, on July 19, he was euphoric: "You cannot imagine what a big deal the Natoire is!"³³

In late May 1846, Balzac learned that Hanska was pregnant,³⁴ and he redoubled his efforts to find a home for them in Paris. On September 28, he bought a house at 14, rue Fortunée (rue Balzac after 1850), near the Arc de Triomphe.

Even before closing on the property, he began to envision how his collection would be distributed throughout the rooms, and the Natoire was a priority. In a letter dated September 19, 1846, he told Hanska that it would hang in her sitting room: "This small green salon will be your boudoir, your room for work, for writing, etc. There, all will be marquetry, Louis XV, and Rococo. There, you will have your Adam and Eve, the Greuze, and other paintings from the era of Madame de Pompadour; there, I want you to have two Watteau[s]."³⁵ A few months later he added, "[The] Adam and Eve will be over your desk."³⁶ In July 1848, he wrote to say that he had found some decorative brackets to flank the painting: "Yesterday Fabre brought four small Venetian consoles, two to hold, on each side of the painting of Adam and Eve, the two lovely compositions of Old Age and Childhood that you know and that make a delightful effect."³⁷

In September 1848, Balzac left Paris to join Hanska at her home in Wierzchownia, where they remained until after they were married. Before leaving Paris, he compiled a

lengthy inventory of the rue Fortunée house, detailing the work that was to be completed in his absence.³⁸ As if setting the scene for a novel, he meticulously sketched his vision for each successive room, describing not only the array of finishes and fabrics, but also the furniture, objects, and other works of art to be installed there. Under the heading “Salon du 1er étage,” he described the *salon vert*:

This room . . . is hung . . . with apple green wool velvet. . . . On each side of the entrance door [are] two beautiful armoires. . . . To the right of the door a desk. . . . On top, a Venetian cabinet. . . . Above the small cabinet from Venice a painting by Natoire representing Adam and Eve in a Louis XV frame very richly carved and gilded. . . . On this side of the room [there are] two corner pieces . . . supporting two grand candelabra . . . [each] topped with a bouquet of fleurs-de-lis with six candles.³⁹

Balzac’s vivid description corresponds closely to a painting by Jean Gigoux, *The Salon of Madame de Balzac*, executed about 1862 (Figure 2).⁴⁰ Here we find Balzac’s widow

with her handiwork seated by the fire in a pale green room, the *salon vert*. The painting reveals that little in the interior had changed. Hanging on the wall above the desk to the right is undoubtedly *The Expulsion from Paradise*. Although a plume of dried flowers blocks part of the picture, the areas of light and shadow in Gigoux’s rendering of Adam and Eve correspond to those in the original composition. After Balzac died, Eve de Balzac never remarried; instead, she spent the remaining thirty-two years of her life in the house that the writer had designed for her, surrounded by his belongings. While she entertained most of her visitors on the ground floor,⁴¹ Gigoux, her family portraitist and close friend after Balzac’s death,⁴² portrays her in the sitting room upstairs. His painting indicates that the widow kept the Natoire close by until her death on April 11, 1882. Two weeks later, on April 25, it was auctioned off in an anonymous sale in Brussels at the Hôtel des Ventes.⁴³ Subsequently, the painting changed hands on a number of occasions without reference to either Balzac or Hanska, arriving at the Metropolitan Museum with a void in its provenance that has only recently been filled.

NOTES

1. Boyer and Boyer-Peigné 1999; Gagneux 2012.
2. See, for example, Balzac’s novels *La Peau de chagrin* and *Cousin Pons*.
3. In a letter to Théophile Thoré, director of L’Alliance des Arts, Paris, dated December 13, 1846, Balzac wrote: “J’aime à aller [sic] à la chasse des tableaux et des objets d’art, et à faire patiemment et péniblement un petit musée. Mais, malheureusement, je ne me connais pas en tableaux.” See Balzac 1882, pp. 555–56.
4. Of the twenty-six works of art that hung in his gallery, Balzac claimed to have held paintings by Domenichino, Sebastiano del Piombo, Guido Reni, Jan Davidsz. de Heem, Anthony van Dyck, and Adriaen Brouwer; portraits by Bronzino, Hans Holbein the Younger, Palma il Vecchio, and Michiel Jansz. van Mierevelt; and other works attributed to Giorgione, Peter Paul Rubens, and Paul Brill. See “Inventaire dressé par Balzac du mobilier de son hôtel de la rue Fortunée,” from about 1848, in Balzac 1990, vol. 2, pp. 1048–49.
5. Inventory numbers RF 3843 and 1987.279, respectively. Roger Pierrot summarizes the results of an exhaustive investigation of Balzac’s personal collection in his preface to Boyer and Boyer-Peigné 1999, pp. 13–14.
6. Danielle Oger lays out the evidence in her catalogue entry for Natoire’s *Adam and Eve* in *ibid.*, pp. 205–6, in which she credits Marie-Martine Dubreuil of the Musée du Louvre for drawing attention to the connection between Balzac and the Natoire. See also Caviglia-Brunel 2012, pp. 57, 300. The complete provenance can be found at www.metmuseum.org.
7. Born Eve Constance Victoire Rzewuska, Hanska grew up in western Ukraine in Pohrebyshe (Vinnytsia region), a village situated southwest of Kiev. Upon marrying Hanski, she moved to his estate nearby at Wierzchownia (Verkhivnya, Zhytomyr region). After she and Balzac were married in 1850 at the Church of Saint Barbara at Berdychiv (Zhytomyr region), she moved to the writer’s home on the rue Fortunée in Paris. Her only surviving child, Anna (1828–1915), was married in 1846 to comte Georges de Mniszech (1823–1881). See Pierrot 1999.
8. *Ibid.*, p. 63.
9. *Ibid.*, pp. 193–206.
10. Balzac 1990, vol. 2, p. 189n3.
11. *Ibid.*, p. 211, June 15, 1846: “Au milieu des solides peintures qui sont dans mon cabinet, le Natoire fait une piteuse figure.”
12. [Jacques] Vincens Saint-Laurent, “Natoire,” in *Biographie universelle, ancienne et moderne* 1843–65, vol. 30, pp. 233–34.
13. See “Mémoire de M. le chevalier Alexandre Lenoir sur cette question: Faire l’analyse des productions des peintres les plus célèbres de l’antiquité, du moyen-âge et des temps modernes; examiner quelles furent les causes de la décadence de l’art à la suite du règne de Louis XIV,” in *Congrès historique* 1839, p. 438, October 17, 1838.
14. Balzac 1844, pp. 36–37: “Durant mon temps de galère ministérielle, où j’étais serré pendant huit heures de jour entre des niais à vingt-deux carats, j’ai vu des originaux qui m’ont convaincu que l’ombre a des aspérités, et que dans la plus grande platitude on peut rencontrer des angles! Oui, mon cher, tel bourgeois est à tel autre ce que Raphaël est à Natoire.”
15. The forty biblical works include eight by Raphael; five by Titian; four by Bartolomé Estebán Murillo; three by Giovanni Bellini; two each by Francesco Albani, Correggio, Anne Louis Girodet-Trioson, and Domenichino; and one each by Cristofano Allori, Philippe de Champaigne, Andrea di Cione (Orcagna), Jacques Louis David, Jan Gossart (called Mabuse), Bernadino Luini, Fra Bartolomeo, Domenico Piola, Nicolas Poussin, Rembrandt, Andrea del Sarto, and Leonardo da Vinci. See Gagneux 2012, pp. 280–86.
16. Vatican Museums 40384 and 40333, respectively. See Gagneux 2012, pp. 188–89 and 40–41.

17. *Ibid.*, pp. 136–37.
18. Balzac 1845.
19. Gossart painted several versions of the biblical couple: *Adam and Eve*, ca. 1510 (Museo Thyssen-Bornemisza, Madrid [1930.26]); *Adam and Eve*, ca. 1520 (National Gallery, London, on loan from the Royal Collection Trust [L14]); and *Adam and Eve*, ca. 1525–30 (Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Gemäldegalerie [661]). See Ainsworth 2010, pp. 114–22.
20. The text was written by Balzac (1837, pp. 310–11) in a pastiche of inauthentic Rabelaisian French: “Vous avez voulu veoir Adam et Eve, qui sont nos premiers parents; les vecy, fiet-elle./Adonques elle les lairra en grant estomirement devant le tableau du sieur Titian, et s’assit au chevet du roy, lequel print plaisir à resgarder les enfans./Lequel des deux est Adam, fiet François en poulsant le coude à sa sœur Marguerite./Ignard, respartit la fille, pour le scavoir, faudroyt que ils feussent vestus.” It was translated as “Innocence” in Balzac 1907, p. 467. Balzac would have been referring to Titian’s *Adam and Eve*, ca. 1550 (Museo Nacional del Prado, Madrid [P00429]).
21. Although Eve Rzewuska’s baptismal certificate has never been found, Pierrot concludes that she was born on December 24, 1803, in the Julian calendar (followed by her family for religious reasons), equivalent to January 5, 1804, in today’s Gregorian calendar. See Pierrot 1999, pp. 12–16.
22. These include Ewelina and Eveline as well as Eve. Balzac (1990, vol. 2, p. 201, June 2, 1846) contributed to the confusion, calling her: “l’Ève, l’Évelin, l’Évelette, l’Éveline, ou le min[ette], l’ange, la fleur, le trésor ou le l[ouplou]p, le bonheur, la force et l’amour.”
23. *Ibid.*, pp. 203–4, June 10, 1846: “Miville m’envoie le Natoire. . . Tu auras ta jolie patronne.”
24. See, for example, Balzac’s *La Peau de chagrin*, *Le Député d’Arcis*, *Ursule Mirouët*, and *Un Début dans la vie*.
25. Balzac 1990, vol. 1, p. 432, January 20, 1838: “Vous m’avez demandé comment, sachant tout, connaissant tout, observant et pénétrant tout, je sois dupé et trompé? . . . Enfin, chère et pieuse catholique, Dieu savait d’avance que Ève succomberait, et il l’a laissée faire.”
26. *Ibid.*, p. 732, November 20, 1843: “*Lididda* qui enferme les idées de paternité,—de maternité, de filialité, d’amour, de suavité divine, de paradis—etc. de volupté céleste. . . C’est le seul legs du Paradis terrestre aux enfants d’Adam: Ève l’a retenu. Je suis [le] seul qui ait eu cette idée. . . Ainsi à nous deux, nous avons le nom de la 1^{re} femme . . . qui est inénarrable dans les langages modernes.”
27. *Ibid.*, vol. 2, p. 670, August 12, 1847: “Non, voyez-vous, le temps seul vous dira l’affection de ce pauvre Adam chassé du paradis par les circonstances, sans Ève.”
28. *Ibid.*, p. 191, May 30, 1846: “Tu auras Adam et Ève; il ne sera pas dit que mes fantaisies seront seules accomplies.”
29. *Ibid.*, pp. 203–4, June 10, 1846: “Miville m’envoie le Natoire et le Holbein pour 350 fr[ancs].”; *ibid.*, p. 211, June 15, 1846: “A 9 h. ½ les rouliers ont apporté *Adam et Ève*. . . Je n’avais, pour payer, qu’un billet de 500 et on a trouvé difficilement la monnaie.”
30. Paul-Marc-Joseph Chenavard (1807–1895) was a painter who studied under Louis Hersent, Jean Auguste Dominique Ingres, and Eugène Delacroix before turning to the German School to nurture his growing philosophical interests.
31. Alphonse de Cailleux (1788–1876) held the position of Directeur général des musées de France from 1841 to 1848.
32. Balzac 1990, vol. 2, p. 218, June 20, 1846: “Chenavard a trouvé le *Natoire* une excellente chose et Cailleux a dit qu’il avait une valeur, que cela redevenait de mode.”
33. *Ibid.*, p. 267, July 19, 1846: “La peinture italienne, c’est l’âme, la Hollande et les Flamands, c’est la nature, la France, c’est l’esprit. En ce moment, l’esprit revient à la mode, et l’on s’occupe de peintres français immenses qui ont été dédaignés. Tu ne te figures pas quelle belle affaire est le *Natoire!*” (Italian painting is the soul; Dutch and Flemish, nature; French, the mind. These days, the mind is back in fashion, and people are paying attention to great French painters who were once disdained. You cannot imagine what a big deal the *Natoire* is!)
34. See “Victor-Honoré,” in *ibid.*, Index, p. 1178. She miscarried before December 1, 1846; *ibid.*, p. 436n2.
35. *Ibid.*, p. 323, September 19, 1846: “Ce petit salon vert sera ton boudoir, ta chambre de travail, d’écriture, etc. Tout y sera marqueterie, Louis XV et rococo. Tu y auras ton *Adam et Ève*, le Greuze et d’autres tableaux du siècle de Mme de Pompadour, je t’y voudrais 2 Watteau [sic].”
36. *Ibid.*, p. 533, January 24, 1847: “*Adam et Ève* sera au-dessus de ton bureau.”
37. *Ibid.*, p. 938, July 29, 1848: “Hier Fabre a apporté 4 petites consoles vénitiennes, 2 pour mettre de chaque côté du tableau d’*Adam et Ève*, les 2 jolies compositions de *La Vieillesse* et de *L’Enfance* que vous connaissez et qui font un effet délicieux.” Fabre was a Parisian artisan who specialized in frame making and marquetry inlay; *ibid.*, p. 549n6.
38. “Inventaire,” in *ibid.*, pp. 1019–51; Jarry 1924, p. 23.
39. “Inventaire,” in Balzac 1990, vol. 2, pp. 1035–37: “Cette pièce . . . est tendue . . . de Velours de laine couleur vert-pomme. . . De chaque côté de la porte d’entrée deux belles *armoires*. . . A droite de la porte un *bureau*. . . Dessus: Un *cabinet vénitien*. . . Au-dessus du petit cabinet de Venise un *tableau* de Natoire représentant *Adam et Ève* dans un cadre Louis XV très richement sculpté et doré. . . Dans . . . la pièce de ce côté deux *encoignures* . . . supportant toutes les deux grands *candélabres* . . . terminés par un bouquet de fleurs de lys à six bougies.”
40. The Maison de Balzac bought Gigoux’s painting at auction on April 15, 1988, from the family of a private collector. *Dessins, aquarelles, bronzes, tableaux modernes*, sale cat., Hôtel Drouot, Paris, April 15, 1988, lot 14. (I am grateful to Yves Gagneux for providing this information in an email dated May 7, 2013.) Alexandre Estignard (1895, p. 71) dated the painting to about 1862, noting that it was owned by Paul Lapret. Lapret (born Paris, 1839) was a portrait painter who studied under Gigoux and published his monograph in 1902. Pierrot (1999, p. 371) refers to a sales catalogue, “Nombreuses Peintures par J. Gigoux,” Hôtel Drouot, Paris, June 14, 1950, which lists four paintings of Eve de Balzac (lots 10, 49, 50, and 51). I have been unable to trace this catalogue.
41. Jarry 1924, pp. 62–64; Pierrot 1999, pp. 421–24.
42. Gigoux exhibited five portraits of Eve de Balzac and her family at the Paris Salons: Salon of 1852, no. 541, “Portrait de Mme de . . . ; pastel”; Salon of 1853, no. 534, “Portrait de Mme la C[omte]sse Georges Mniszech; pastel”; Salon of 1857, no. 1170, “Portrait en pied de Mme la comtesse Georges de Mniszech”; Salon of 1861, no. 1264, “Portrait de M. le comte Georges de Michech [sic]”; see Sanchez and Seydoux 2002–4. Four of these works are at the Maison de Balzac, Paris; the 1852 portrait of Madame de Balzac is at the Musée-Hôtel Bertrand, Châteauroux. For more on her relationship with Gigoux, see Pierrot 1999, pp. 365–71.
43. As: “Charles Natoire, 1740, *Adam et Ève après le péché*, cuivre, H. 0.67– L. 0.47.” In *Catalogue de tableaux et objets d’art, anciens et modernes*, sale cat., Hôtel des Ventes de Bruxelles, Brussels, April 25–26, 1882, lot 13.

REFERENCES

- Ainsworth, Maryan W., ed.
 2010 *Man, Myth, and Sensual Pleasures: Jan Gossart's Renaissance; The Complete Works*. Exh. cat. New York: MMA.
- Balzac, Honoré de
 1837 *Les Cent Contes drolatiques colligés ez abbaïes de Touraine, et mis en lumière par le sieur de Balzac pour l'esbattement des pantagruelistes et non aultres*. Vol. 3. Paris: Ed. Werdet.
 1844 "La Maison Nucingen." In *Oeuvres complètes de M. de Balzac*, vol. 11, *La Comédie humaine: Scènes de la vie Parisienne*, pp. 1–60. Paris: Furne.
 1845 "Le Chef-d'oeuvre inconnu." In *Oeuvres complètes de M. de Balzac*, vol. 14, *La Comédie humaine: Etudes philosophiques*, pp. 283–307. Paris: Furne.
 1882 *Oeuvres complètes de H. de Balzac*, vol. 24, *Correspondance 1819–1850*. Paris: Calmann Lévy.
 1907 *Balzac's Contes drolatiques: Droll Stories Collected from the Abbeys of Touraine*. [London]: Bibliophilist Library.
 1990 *Lettres à Madame Hanska, 1832–1844 and 1845–1850*. Edited by Roger Pierrot. 2 vols. Paris: Robert Laffont.
- Biographie universelle, ancienne et moderne*
 1843–65 *Biographie universelle, ancienne et moderne; ou, Histoire, par ordre alphabétique, de la vie publique et privée de tous les hommes qui se sont fait remarquer par leurs écrits, leurs actions, leurs talents, leurs vertus ou leurs crimes*. Edited by Joseph François Michaud, Louis Gabriel Michaud, and Eugène Ernest Desplaces. New ed. 45 vols. Paris: Desplaces.
- Boyer, Jean-Pierre, and Elisabeth Boyer-Peigné
 1999 *Balzac et la peinture*. Exh. cat. Tours: Musée des Beaux-Arts de Tours/Farrago.
- Caviglia-Brunel, Susanna
 2012 *Charles-Joseph Natoire: 1700–1777*. Preface by J. Patrice Marandel. Paris: Arthena.
- Congrès historique*
 1839 *Congrès historique, réuni à Paris, au siège de l'Institut Historique: Discours et compte-rendu des séances; septembre–octobre 1838*. Paris: Institut Historique.
- Estignard, A[lexandre].
 1895 *Jean Gigoux: Sa Vie, ses oeuvres, ses collections*. Besançon: Delagrangue-Louys.
- Gagneux, Yves
 2012 *Le Musée imaginaire de Balzac: Les 100 Chefs-d'oeuvre au coeur de La Comédie humaine*. Paris: Beaux Arts Editions.
- Jarry, Paul
 1924 *Le Dernier Logis de Balzac: Rue Fortunée, l'Ancienne Chartreuse Beaujon; Documents inédits*. Paris: Sagittaire.
- Pierrot, Roger
 1999 *Eve de Balzac: Biographie*. [Paris]: Stock.
- Sanchez, Pierre, and Xavier Seydoux
 2002–4 *Les Catalogues des Salons*. Vols. 6 (1852–57) and 7 (1859–63). Dijon: L'Echelle de Jacob.