Contents

ARTICLES

“Assyrian Clay Hands” in the Architecture of the Ancient Near East
SEBASTIANO SOLDI, 8

A Possible Cypriot Origin for an Assyrian Stone Mixing Bowl in the Cesnola Collection
LUCA BOMBARDIERI, 24

Andrea del Sarto’s Borgherini Holy Family and Charity: Two Intertwined Late Works
ANDREA BAYER AND MICHAEL GALLAGHER WITH SILVIA A. CENTENO, JOHN DELANEY, AND EVAN READ, 34

Benjamin Franklin, Ambassador to France: Portraits by Joseph Siffred Duplessis
KATHARINE BAETJER WITH MARJORIE SHELLEY, CHARLOTTE HALE, AND CYNTHIA MOYER, 56

The Sacred and the Modern: The History, Conservation, and Science of the Madina Sitara
KAREN M. KERN, YAEL ROSENFIELD, FEDERICO CARÒ, AND NOBUKO SHIBAYAMA, 72

“Working My Thought More Perfectly”: Horace Pippin’s The Lady of the Lake
ANNE MONAHAN, ISABELLE DUVERNOIS, AND SILVIA A. CENTENO, 94

RESEARCH NOTES

An Examination of Paolo Veronese’s Alessandro Vittoria
ANDREA BAYER, DOROTHY MAHON, AND SILVIA A. CENTENO, 116

The Roman Maniera: Newly Identified Drawings
FURIO RINALDI, 128

The Madonna and Child with Saints Francis and Dominic and Angels by Giulio Cesare Procaccini: A Masterpiece from the Archinto Collection
MARTINA COLOMBI, 142
The Metropolitan Museum Journal is published annually by The Metropolitan Museum of Art. Its purpose is to publish original research on works of art in the Museum’s collection. Authors include members of the Museum staff and other art historians, conservators, scientists, and specialists.

The Journal publishes Articles and Research Notes. Articles contribute extensive and thoroughly argued scholarship. Research Notes typically present a concise, neatly bounded aspect of ongoing research, such as the presentation of a new acquisition or attribution, or a specific, resonant finding from technical analysis. All texts must take works of art in the collection as the point of departure. Contributions are not limited in length, but authors are encouraged to exercise discretion with the word count and the number of figure illustrations. Submissions should be emailed to: journalsubmissions@metmuseum.org.

Manuscripts are reviewed by the Journal Editorial Board, composed of members of the curatorial, conservation, and scientific departments.

To be considered for the following year’s volume, an article must be submitted, complete including illustrations, by October 15.

Once an article or research note is accepted for publication, the author will have the opportunity to review it after it has been edited and again after it has been laid out in pages. The honorarium for image costs is $300, and each author receives a copy of the printed Journal. The Journal appears online at metmuseum.org/art/metpublications; journals.uchicago.edu/toc/met/current; and on JStor.

Manuscripts should be submitted as double-spaced Word files. In addition to the text, the manuscript must include endnotes, captions for illustrations, photograph credits, and a 200-word abstract.

For the style of captions and bibliographic references in endnotes, authors are referred to The Metropolitan Museum of Art Guide to Editorial Style and Procedures, which is available from the Museum’s Publications and Editorial Department upon request, and to The Chicago Manual of Style. Please provide a list of all bibliographic citations that includes, for each title: full name(s) of author or authors; title and subtitle of book or article and periodical; place and date of publication; volume number, if any; and page, plate, and/or figure number(s). For citations in notes, please use only the last name(s) of the author or authors and the date of publication (e.g., Jones 1953, p. 65; Smith and Harding 2006, pp. 7–10, fig. 23).

When submitting manuscripts, authors should include a separate file with all illustrations. Please do not embed images within the main text document. If the manuscript is accepted, the author is expected to provide publication-quality images as well as copyright permissions to reproduce them in both the print and electronic editions of the Journal. The Journal requires either color digital images of at least 300 dpi at 8 x 10 in. in size, color transparencies (preferably 8 x 10 in. but 4 x 6 in. is also acceptable), or photographic prints (preferably 8 x 10 in. with white borders) of good quality and in good condition. TIFF files are preferable to Jpegs, and RGB color mode is preferable to CMYK.

In a separate Word file, please indicate the figure number, the picture’s orientation, and any instructions for cropping. Reproductions of photographs or other illustrations in books should be accompanied by captions that include full bibliographic information.

The author of each article is responsible for obtaining all photographic materials and reproduction rights.

ABBREVIATIONS

MMA The Metropolitan Museum of Art
MMAB The Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin
MMJ Metropolitan Museum Journal

Height precedes width and then depth in dimensions cited.
The Madonna and Child with Saints Francis and Dominic and Angels by Giulio Cesare Procaccini: A Masterpiece from the Archinto Collection

In 1979, The Metropolitan Museum of Art acquired the *Madonna and Child with Saints Francis and Dominic and Angels*, a major altarpiece by the painter Giulio Cesare Procaccini (1574–1625) (fig. 1). The same year, in an article in this journal, Keith Christiansen published the painting together with documents relating to its commission in 1612, its presumed installation in the church of the Madonna dei Miracoli in the town of Corbetta, just west of Milan, and its eventual replacement by a copy.¹ Christiansen conjectured that the work was installed in the church—in a frame designed by Procaccini—at its completion in 1613, and that it was later removed from its frame and replaced. As it turns out, this account of the picture’s history is partly inaccurate, for Procaccini’s painting never made it to its intended destination.

Let us begin at the end of the story as it can now be reconstructed. On May 18, 1863, at Hôtel Drouot in Paris,
THE MADONNA AND CHILD WITH SAINTS FRANCIS AND DOMINIC AND ANGELS

“The Holy Virgin and Child Jesus, surrounded by angels, between two saints. Canvas. H. 255 cm, L. 143 cm.”

The painting was made for the chapel dedicated to Saints Francis and Dominic in the church of the Madonna dei Miracoli in Corbetta. In November 1612, the deputies of the church gave Filippo Spanzotta and his brother Gaspare the responsibility of providing the chapel’s decoration, including an altarpiece by an esteemed painter that was to be completed within one year. Whether the picture was finished in time is uncertain, but it was not installed in the chapel. This is made clear by two successive wills (dated 1625 and 1637) in which Filippo Spanzotta charged his heirs with placing an appropriate painting on the altar, which was apparently still bare. As this request does not appear in Spanzotta’s final will, drafted in 1640, his obligation must have been fulfilled by then—but not by the work he had commissioned from Procaccini. Instead, the nobleman had a copy made for the chapel and, as we will explain, most probably retained Procaccini’s altarpiece for himself. The painting registered in the 1642 inventory of the church’s possessions must be the copy, which in the mid-twentieth century was transferred to the rector’s office, where it was housed until 2011. It was then restored and placed in the museum of the church, located nearby. That Spanzotta kept Procaccini’s original is supported by the posthumous inventory of Spanzotta’s assets. Drafted in 1641, the inventory mentions a painting depicting “Our Lady with the image of the Saints Francis and Dominic.”

Although the precise moment when the picture entered the Archinto collection is not known, it was possibly a short time after Spanzotta’s death. What can be said with certainty is that there was a close bond between the Archinto family and the church of the Madonna dei Miracoli that can be traced back to Carlo Archinto (1670–1732). A document in the Archinto archives dated May 4, 1717, states that the sanctuary received two hundred lire from Count Carlo acting as the executor of his wife, Giulia Barbiano di Belgioioso, who had died two years earlier. In his own last will, dated December 12, 1732, the count bequeathed to the church his Golden Fleece collar encrusted with diamonds.

Just over a decade earlier, in 1721, the British traveler Edward Wright had visited Count Carlo’s home and noted “two large and fine pieces of Jul. Ces. Procaccini.” One of the two—unfinished—depicted the Massacre of the Innocents; the other, not described, was possibly the painting commissioned for the church in Corbetta. Procaccini’s painting was certainly displayed in Palazzo Archinto by 1772, when it is specifically mentioned by the Bolognese painter and collector Marcello Oretti: “Archinto residence. . . . An altarpiece with the Virgin, Child, S. Dominic and S. Francis by Giulio Cesare Procaccini . . . .”

Documents from the nineteenth century are of great interest as well. In 1844, the historian Cesare Cantù mentioned in a brief description of his tour of the Archinto collection a Virgin Mary in Glory by Giulio Cesare Procaccini—probably the same painting that was to attract the attention of Otto Mündler, who visited Palazzo Archinto in the company of Giovanni Morelli and Clementina Reichmann (Mme Frizzoni) on January 13, 1856. Mündler’s Travel Diaries are the last record of the famous Milanese collection before its dispersal, the most tragic and significant episode of which was the 1863 auction in Paris, referred to above. A copy of the auction catalogue in the Museo Poldi Pezzoli, Milan, contains manuscript annotations indicating that an Italian named Scotti purchased the painting by Giulio Cesare Procaccini, while Otto Mündler scored lot number one: a Head of a Child by Correggio—a study for his Madonna with Saint George now in the Gemäldegalerie Alte Meister, Dresden.

We then lose track of the Metropolitan Museum’s picture until 1978, when it was offered for sale in London, first by Colnaghi’s and then by Matthiesen Gallery, London. By purchasing this splendid altarpiece in 1979, the Museum fulfilled the expectations of the experts at the 1863 sale in Paris: in the catalogue, they described the work as a “really museum-worthy painting.”

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS
The research for this article would not have been possible without the support of Giovanni Agosti and Jacopo Stoppa and the generous help of Manfredo and Rosellina Archinto, Keith Christiansen, Giulia Kimberly Colombo, and Mariasilvia Cortelazzi.

MARTINA COLOMBI
Postgraduate candidate in the Department of Cultural Heritage and Environment, University of Milan
NOTES

1 See Christiansen 1979, in which the author logically assumed that an inventory of church property drawn up in 1642 referred to the museum’s altarpiece; however, as will be shown, it describes the copy, today in the museum of the church. See also Brigstocke 1980, p. 39; Rosci 1993, pp. 84–85; and Brigstocke 2002, pp. 84–85.

2 The original core of the Archinto collection was made up mainly of sixteenth-century Venetian and Lombard works and was assembled by Filippo Archinto (1495–1558). In the following centuries, the collection was augmented by other notable family members, including Ottavio (1584–1656), Carlo (1670–1732), and Filippo (1697–1751). Their acquisitions included not only paintings but also ancient sculpture, drawings, tapestries, books, precious objects, and musical and scientific instruments. An inventory of the paintings in the collection, dated April 10, 1741 (Archivio Archinto, Milan, fascicolo 148), included some five hundred and fifty works (unfortunately without attribution). For further information on the family, see Litta 1843 and Forte 1932.

3 “La sainte Vierge et l’Enfant Jésus, entourés d’une gloire d’anges, apparaissent à deux saints. Toile. H. 2 m. 55 c. L. 1 m. 43 c.” Archinto sale 1863, lot 50, p. 13. The subject, material, and dimensions of the Museum’s painting are a perfect match.

4 The brothers were descendants of Giovanni Ambrogio Spanzotta, who in the second half of the sixteenth century had financed the restoration and enlargement of the church.

5 Archivio di Stato di Milano, Notarile, fascicoli 28174 (March 17, 1625) and 28177 (April 11, 1637).

6 Ibid., fascicolo 29446 (October 11, 1640).

7 The copy was first mentioned in Bona Castellotti 1978, especially pp. 89–90. The painting, which measures 105 1/2 × 58 1/4 in. (268 × 148 cm), was initially attributed to Procaccini but was recognized as a later copy after the original version was discovered.


9 “Nostra Signora con l’immagine dei Santi Francesco e Domenico.” Archivio di Stato di Milano, Notarile, fascicolo 29446 (January 11, 1641). For further information on the history of the two paintings, see Comincini 1999, pp. 150–51, 188. Additional hypotheses about the relationship of these works are provided in the same volume by Cavalieri 1999, pp. 38–39, 184.


15 Mündler [1855–58] 1985, p. 93: “13 January. Sunday. Milan. With Morelli & Mme Frizzoni to Palazzo Archinti, where visitors are very seldom admitted. Besides a large and excellent Procaccini, a Titian, Portrait of a Cardinal seated with a transparent white curtain covering half of his face; and a fine portrait of a man, of Leonardo’s school. There is a precious portrait of a young man, of 20, of the Archinti family, painted in ‘1494,’ and most likely by Leonardo da Vinci, whose beautiful modelling & execution it certainly has.” The four paintings mentioned by Otto Mündler are the one by Procaccini, which is probably the altarpiece in the Metropolitan Museum’s collection; Titian’s Portrait of Archbishop Filippo Archinto, today in the Philadelphia Museum of Art, 204; an unknown male portrait of the “Leonardeschi” school; and Portrait of a Man Aged Twenty (The Archinto Portrait), attributed to Marco d’Oggiono and today in the National Gallery, London (NG1665). Both Titian’s and d’Oggiono’s paintings were auctioned at the Archinto sale in Paris in 1863. The present author’s research into the catalogue of that sale has revealed the provenance of paintings, the history of which was previously unknown. The most important among these are Scipione Pulzone’s Cardinal Ferdinando de’ Medici (Art Gallery of South Australia [985P39]), and, most likely, Giovanni Antonio Boltraffio’s Portrait of a Youth Crowned with Flowers (North Carolina Museum of Art [GL.60.17.40]). The Temptations of Saint Anthony, by Camillo Procaccini, Giulio Cesare’s older brother, is not mentioned in the sale catalogue but was seen in the Archinto mansion by Carlo Cesare Malvasia (1678, vol. 1, p. 285) and Marcello Oretti (1772; see note 13 above). The painting was exhibited by the Milanese Galleria Nobili in 2015.

16 Archinto sale 1863, lot 1, p. 5, and lot 50, p. 13. The names “Mündler” and “Scotti” are handwritten next to the descriptions of the paintings.


18 Colnaghi’s built an international reputation in the field of Italian Baroque painting in the 1970s. Michael Simpson, director of the paintings department, was joined by Patrick Matthiesen at the beginning of the decade. Matthiesen established his own gallery in 1978. See Howard 2010, especially pp. 48–49.

REFERENCES

Archinto sale

Bona Castellotti, Marco

Brigstocke, Hugh

Cantù, Cesare, ed.

Cavalieri, Federico

Christiansen, Keith

Cominincini, Mario

Forte, Francesco

Hall, Nicholas H. J., ed.

Howard, Jeremy

Litta, Pompeo

Malvasia, Carlo Cesare

Mündler, Otto

Rosci, Marco

Stoppa, Jacopo

Wright, Edward
ILLUSTRATION CREDITS


A Possible Cypriot Origin for an Assyrian Stone Mixing Bowl in the Cesnola Collection: fig. 3: from Miglus 1996; fig. 4: from Hrouda 1962; fig. 5: from Bikai 1981; fig. 6: photograph by Olaf M. Teßmer

Andrea del Sarto's Borgherini Holy Family and Charity: Two Intertwined Late Works: figs. 2, 3, 26: Courtesy National Gallery of Art, Washington; fig. 4: Erich Lessing / Art Resource, NY; figs. 5–12, 14, 20, 22: photographs by Michael Gallagher; figs. 13, 19, 24, 25: Gabinetto Fotografico delle Gallerie degli Uffizi; fig. 16: © The Cleveland Museum of Art; fig. 16: Courtesy National Gallery of Art, Washington, photographs by Michael Gallagher; fig. 18: © RMN-Grand Palais / Art Resource, NY; fig. 21: Image © Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford; fig. 23: photograph © The State Hermitage Museum, photograph by Vladimir Terebenin

Benjamin Franklin, Ambassador to France: Portraits by Joseph Siffred Duplessis: fig. 1: Image © Metropolitan Museum of Art, photo by Juan Trujillo; fig. 3: Courtesy of the Diplomatic Reception Rooms, U.S. Department of State, Washington, D.C.; figs. 5, 6, 10, 14: photographs by Evan Read; fig. 12: © Thomas Jefferson Foundation at Monticello

The Sacred and the Modern: The History, Conservation, and Science of the Madina Sitara: figs. 1–4: Image © Metropolitan Museum of Art, photograph by Anna-Marie Kellen; figs. 5–13: photograph by Yael Rosenfield; fig. 6: Courtesy of Sotheby's London; figs. 7, 8: Nour Foundation. Courtesy of the Khalili Family Trust; figs. 14–18: photographs by Federico Carò


An Examination of Paolo Veronese’s Alessandro Vittoria: figs. 3–9: photographs by Evan Read; fig. 10: Cameraphoto Arte, Venice / Art Resource, NY; fig. 11: digital image courtesy of the J. Paul Getty Museum Open Content Program

The Roman Maniera: Newly Identified Drawings: fig. 2: Pandolfini Casa d’Aste, Florence, photograph courtesy Pandolfini; fig. 4: © RMN-Grand Palais / Art Resource, NY, photograph by Michel Urtado; fig. 6: © RMN-Grand Palais / Art Resource, NY, photograph by Jean-Gilles Berizzi; fig. 8: Photograph © Vatican Museums
ARTICLES
“Assyrian Clay Hands” in the Architecture of the Ancient Near East
Sebastiano Soldi

A Possible Cypriot Origin for an Assyrian Stone Mixing Bowl in the Cesnola Collection
Luca Bombardieri

Andrea del Sarto’s Borgherini Holy Family and Charity: Two Intertwined Late Works
Andrea Bayer and Michael Gallagher with Silvia A. Centeno, John Delaney, and Evan Read

Benjamin Franklin, Ambassador to France: Portraits by Joseph Siffred Duplessis
Katharine Baetjer with Marjorie Shelley, Charlotte Hale, and Cynthia Moyer

The Sacred and the Modern: The History, Conservation, and Science of the Madina Sitara
Karen M. Kern, Yael Rosenfield, Federico Carò, and Nobuko Shibayama

“Working My Thought More Perfectly”: Horace Pippin’s The Lady of the Lake
Anne Monahan, Isabelle Duvernois, and Silvia A. Centeno

RESEARCH NOTES
An Examination of Paolo Veronese’s Alessandro Vittoria
Andrea Bayer, Dorothy Mahon, and Silvia A. Centeno

The Roman Maniera: Newly Identified Drawings
Furio Rinaldi

The Madonna and Child with Saints Francis and Dominic and Angels by Giulio Cesare Procaccini: A Masterpiece from the Archinto Collection
Martina Colombi