**Contents**

**ARTICLES**

“Assyrian Clay Hands” in the Architecture of the Ancient Near East  
SEBASTIANO SOLDI, 8

A Possible Cypriot Origin for an Assyrian Stone Mixing Bowl in the Cesnola Collection  
LUCA BOMBARDIERI, 24

Andrea del Sarto’s *Borgherini Holy Family* and *Charity*: Two Intertwined Late Works  
ANDREA BAYER AND MICHAEL GALLAGHER WITH SILVIA A. CENTENO, JOHN DELANEY, AND EVAN READ, 34

Benjamin Franklin, Ambassador to France: Portraits by Joseph Siffred Duplessis  
KATHARINE BAETJER WITH MARJORIE SHELLEY, CHARLOTTE HALE, AND CYNTHIA MOYER, 56

The Sacred and the Modern: The History, Conservation, and Science of the Madina *Sitara*  
KAREN M. KERN, YAEI ROSENFIELD, FEDERICO CARÒ, AND NOBUKO SHIBAYAMA, 72

“Working My Thought More Perfectly”: Horace Pippin’s *The Lady of the Lake*  
ANNE MONAHAN, ISABELLE DUVERNOIS, AND SILVIA A. CENTENO, 94

**RESEARCH NOTES**

An Examination of Paolo Veronese’s *Alessandro Vittoria*  
ANDREA BAYER, DOROTHY MAHON, AND SILVIA A. CENTENO, 116

The Roman *Maniera*: Newly Identified Drawings  
FURIO RINALDI, 128

*The Madonna and Child with Saints Francis and Dominic* and *Angels* by Giulio Cesare Procaccini: A Masterpiece from the Archinto Collection  
MARTINA COLOMBI, 142
The Metropolitan Museum Journal is issued annually by The Metropolitan Museum of Art. Its purpose is to publish original research on works of art in the Museum’s collection. Authors include members of the Museum staff and other art historians, conservators, scientists, and specialists.

The Journal publishes Articles and Research Notes. Articles contribute extensive and thoroughly argued scholarship. Research Notes typically present a concise, neatly bounded aspect of ongoing research, such as the presentation of a new acquisition or attribution, or a specific, resonant finding from technical analysis. All texts must take works of art in the collection as the point of departure. Contributions are not limited in length, but authors are encouraged to exercise discretion with the word count and the number of figure illustrations. Submissions should be emailed to: journalsubmissions@metmuseum.org.

Manuscripts are reviewed by the Journal Editorial Board, composed of members of the curatorial, conservation, and scientific departments.

To be considered for the following year’s volume, an article must be submitted, complete including illustrations, by October 15.

Once an article or research note is accepted for publication, the author will have the opportunity to review it after it has been edited and again after it has been laid out in pages. The honorarium for image costs is $300, and each author receives a copy of the printed journal. The Journal appears online at metmuseum.org/art/metpublications; journals.uchicago.edu/toc/met/current; and on JStor.

Manuscripts should be submitted as double-spaced Word files. In addition to the text, the manuscript must include endnotes, captions for illustrations, photograph credits, and a 200-word abstract.

For the style of captions and bibliographic references in endnotes, authors are referred to The Metropolitan Museum of Art Guide to Editorial Style and Procedures, which is available from the Museum’s Publications and Editorial Department upon request, and to The Chicago Manual of Style.

Please provide a list of all bibliographic citations that includes, for each title: full name(s) of author or authors; title and subtitle of book or article and periodical; place and date of publication; volume number, if any; and page, plate, and/or figure number(s). For citations in notes, please use only the last name(s) of the author or authors and the date of publication (e.g., Jones 1953, p. 65; Smith and Harding 2006, pp. 7–10, fig. 23).

When submitting manuscripts, authors should include a separate file with all illustrations. Please do not embed images within the main text document. If the manuscript is accepted, the author is expected to provide publication-quality images as well as copyright permissions to reproduce them in both the print and electronic editions of the Journal. The Journal requires either color digital images of at least 300 dpi at 8 x 10 in. in size, color transparencies (preferably 8 x 10 in. but 4 x 6 in. is also acceptable), or photographic prints (preferably 8 x 10 in. with white borders) of good quality and in good condition. TIFF files are preferable to Jpegs, and RGB color mode is preferable to CMYK.

In a separate Word file, please indicate the figure number, the picture’s orientation, and any instructions for cropping. Reproductions of photographs or other illustrations in books should be accompanied by captions that include full bibliographic information.

The author of each article is responsible for obtaining all photographic materials and reproduction rights.

ABBREVIATIONS

MMA The Metropolitan Museum of Art
MMAB The Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin
MMJ Metropolitan Museum Journal

Height precedes width and then depth in dimensions cited.
A Possible Cypriot Origin for an Assyrian Stone Mixing Bowl in the Cesnola Collection

The comprehensive publication of the Cesnola Collection of Cypriot stone sculpture in The Metropolitan Museum of Art from 2014 sheds new light on iconographic and ideological aspects of major stone statuary, as well as a variety of other stone objects.¹ Of particular interest is a shallow basalt bowl that had previously remained unpublished (fig. 1). Part of a small group of ten hard-stone vessels purchased by the Museum in 1874–76 from the Cesnola Collection, the basalt bowl appears to be a typical Assyrian mixing bowl.²

The production of different types of stone mixing bowls began in northern Mesopotamia in the Early Iron Age and increased considerably, developing distinctive features, throughout the Neo-Assyrian period and the Post-Assyrian/Neo-Babylonian period (eighth to sixth century B.C.). The most widespread types were primarily shallow bowls made of basalt with a simple base, or a
26 AN ASSYRIAN STONE MIXING BOWL IN THE CESNOLA COLLECTION

occasionally with hieroglyphs that assign them to royal property. Production of the bowls originated from central Assyria and is attested across a vast area comprising southern Mesopotamia, inner Syria, and the Palestinian Levant, extending as far as the central Anatolian plateau and—hypothetically—Cyprus (fig. 2).

At the main city of Ashur, a significant number of mixing bowls come from the sacred area of the Temple of Ishtar, from the levels that can be dated to the reign of Shalmaneser III and Sin-šar-īškun (fig. 3). On the whole, this production was well attested at Ashur at least from the beginning of the eighth century B.C. and throughout the entire Neo-Assyrian and the Post-Assyrian/Neo-Babylonian periods, within a

ring base, or a disk base, which usually have a distinctive form of double rim, or discontinuous rim with bar handle. Pedestal bowls and tripods can also have the same form of rim. Analogous shapes and comparable decoration patterns are documented in contemporary ceramic production.

The lower rim of the Metropolitan Museum’s bowl serves as both a handle and a suitable place for securing a lid. The bowl could be held by placing the finger below the rim to take the weight, while the thumb could be hooked upward through the discontinuous rib and toward the interior of the bowl. Many bowls of this type, deriving from Assyrian palaces, bear inscriptions with royal titles and names of the Neo-Assyrian kings, and occasionally with hieroglyphs that assign them to royal property. Production of the bowls originated from central Assyria and is attested across a vast area comprising southern Mesopotamia, inner Syria, and the Palestinian Levant, extending as far as the central Anatolian plateau and—hypothetically—Cyprus (fig. 2).
In the immediate periphery of the Assyrian empire, the production is well-documented at Carchemish and Tell Halaf as well as in the provincial northern Mesopotamian towns of Tell Ahmar, Tell Barri, and Tell Sheikh Hamad, where Assyrian (and then Neo-Babylonian) governors’ palaces were located (fig. 4). Outside of northern Mesopotamia, the production of mixing bowls has been sporadically traced from southern Mesopotamia (Ur and Nippur) to central Anatolia (Phrygian Boğazköy), in the period between 650 B.C. and the conquest of Croesus in 547 B.C. The production of mixing bowls has been much more widely documented in western Syria (from the royal quarters at Hama), the Levant (from Lachish in a seventh-century B.C. level; and from Megiddo and Hazor, dated before the destruction of 732 B.C.), and in Cyprus.

Based on a definition by L. A. Moritz suggesting that similar containers, named *mortaria*, were used for various purposes related to the preparation of food, especially for small quantities of ingredients, the containers in question may be considered functional mixing bowls. *Mortaria*—which did not function as mortars, despite the name—and the Assyrian mixing bowls were probably employed for rubbing and mixing, rather than pounding, small quantities of easily crushed substances. The mixing bowls were made for royalty and high officials and are strictly connected with royal banquet ceremonies in Neo-Assyrian palaces. Analogous forms of the bowls would have served the same purpose at meals taken by peripheral and Assyrianized elites.

The Assyrian menu for royal banquets was celebrated far outside Assyria and contributed to the wide appeal of Assyrian culture, its impact lasting long after the fall of the empire, attested by the topos of Assyrian decadence in Greek literature. The role of food as a means to disseminate royal culture is well exemplified by the Banquet Stele of Ashurnasirpal II. The famous text emphatically lists the food served at the inauguration of the royal palace at Nimrud in 869 B.C., probably the most exquisite and enormous Assyrian feast, to which sixty-nine thousand guests from diverse provinces and surrounding regions were invited. The text reveals the wide variety of ingredients and dishes served by the cooks of the Assyrian royal kitchens, especially the assorted meat-based courses seasoned with aromatic condiments. The stele lists the following common spices of royal cuisine: cardamom, watercress, spicy salts, onion, garlic, cumin, thyme, and fennel, along with herbs and unidentified ingredients such as *karkartu*, *ḥabbaqūq*, and *ṣalṭunu*.®
Meat and spices figured prominently in elite food, but were absent in the daily diets of commoners, which were based on cereals (bread and beer), vegetables, and dairy products. Sheep, goats, calves and steers, fishes, ducks, doves, and other winged animals were cooked in ovens, roasted over the fire (šube/šume), or on spit roasts (gabbubu). Special joints of meat were salted (midlu) long before being cooked or boiled in large bronze cauldrons. The boiling of meat appears to be represented in a relief scene from the Southwest Palace of Sennacherib at Nineveh, in which a large bronze open vessel is transported on a wood raft together with a beheaded steer ready to be cooked.

Mixing bowls were customarily placed on the table during meals, and it seems possible that bowls such as the one in the Metropolitan Museum may have been utilized to grind aromatic ingredients like salt and herbs. The two items, used in small quantities, sometimes required light crushing at the table, and would be kept covered to preserve the fragrance during the banquet.

The stone mixing bowls bear a clear Assyrian character, and convey new information about how that culture prepared and consumed food. The widespread diffusion of exclusive objects demonstrates how Assyrian elements were adopted and assimilated by peripheral and foreign elites, in particular, the Cypriot ruling classes. The complexity of cultural relations between Cyprus and Assyria and the role of the island in the Neo-Assyrian and Post-Assyrian economic and ideological system are still being debated. The traditional view of an Assyrian domination in Cyprus in the eighth to seventh century B.C., as initially argued by Einar Gjerstad in the 1940s, has been reconsidered by most scholars, who reject the former emphasis on the disruptions brought about by military incursions from outside the island. It seems beneficial to approach this controversial issue not by exclusively focusing on possible evidence of direct cultural interactions between Cyprus and Assyria, but by evaluating more complex phenomena of assimilation and adoption of cultural elements from a wider Eastern Mediterranean perspective. It is important to consider that the contacts between Cyprus and Assyria were mostly mediated through the influence of the Phoenicians, particularly through Kition. A ceramic Phoenician import from the sacred area at Kition Kathari (Area II, Temple 1) provides a relevant point of discussion (fig. 5).
hearing of the deeds of Sargon, and sent a series of appeasing gifts.28 Examples of imported Assyrianizing objects in Cyprus are the stamp seals in the Pierides Museum in Larnaca and in the Cesnola Collection of the Metropolitan Museum, cut in both elaborate and common styles that can be associated with Neo-Assyrian and Neo-Babylonian glyptic (fig. 7).29 Perhaps the clearest evidence of demand for Assyrianizing prestige objects by Cypriot elites is represented by the decorated ivory inlays imported to the island during the Archaic period. For example, the majority of ivory panels from the Royal Cemetery at Salamis belongs to the “ornate” style, of which the main centers of production were likely located in Phoenicia, and shows an Assyrianizing character, with iconographic elements widely shared in contemporary Mesopotamia and the Levant.30 The mixed provenance of the ivory panels resulted in the hybrid style that is most characteristic of a wide Eastern Mediterranean shared cultural milieu.

In addition to imported objects, the imitation of Assyrian motifs in Cypriot figurative art is evident, especially in the stone sculpture of male votaries. The significance and prestige ascribed to these representations of dignitaries and officials during the Archaic period are conveyed by their colossal size, as attested by the limestone head of a bearded man in the Cesnola Collection in the Metropolitan Museum (fig. 8).31 While the identity of the figure, his rank in religious ceremonies, and probable military role remain uncertain, the elaborate dress with conical helmet indicates high social status. The dress code adopted by such members of the Cypriot elite again strongly suggests an Assyrian-style model evenly diffused since the end of the eighth century b.c. from the Levantine coast to Cilicia and Cyprus.32

Although the Assyrianizing elements in Cypriot art appear evident, the presence of Assyrian objects imported to the island remains sporadic and questionable. Unfortunately, the provenances of the stamp seals from both the Pierides Museum and the Metropolitan Museum are unclear. Both Pierides and Cesnola were actively involved in the antiquities market, and we must allow for the possibility that the objects could have been brought to the island in modern times.33 One of six Neo-Babylonian–style stamp seals from Cyprus that are datable to the seventh to sixth century B.C. has a firm attribution, however. The seal bears a Cypro-Syllabic inscription and epigraphic analysis confirmed that it was certainly imported to the island and re-engraved during the Cypro-Archaic I period.34

shallow bowl in gray and black polished ware has an everted rim with a horizontal depression at its midpoint, forming two rolls—features that are also characteristic of the Metropolitan Museum’s Assyrian stone mixing bowl. The co-presence of this type of bowl in both ceramic and basalt in Phoenicia and Assyria has been proven previously.24 Furthermore, it has been argued that in Cyprus the repertoire of gray and black polished ware imitates stone prototypes, especially basalt vessels, and the depositing of these vessels in funerary and sacred areas can be attributed to their use for food and liquid offerings.25 Contacts between Assyria and Cyprus, mediated by Phoenicians, could have provided the common underlying network for the introduction of such objects to the island.

Whereas Assyrianizing works of art were presumably imported to the island or imitated by local artists during the Archaic period (as is most evident with seals, ivory inlays, and stone sculpture), the only truly Assyrian object found in Cyprus is a royal Neo-Assyrian stele (fig. 6).26 This well-known victory stele, which is attributed to Sargon II (721–705 B.C.), was found in 1845 at Kition, and is now in the Vorderasiatisches Museum in Berlin.27 The iconography of the king on the stele connotes Assyrian manufacture and a strictly royal ritual context; the position of the arms and cudgel clearly points to a kingship ceremony witnessed by the gods, represented in front of the king. The cuneiform inscription along the sides of the stele records that seven kings of Cyprus took fright upon
Caution must be taken when attempting to draw a conclusive hypothesis about the unprovenanced and unique Assyrian stone mixing bowl in the Metropolitan Museum. If we accept that the provenance from Cyprus is genuine, the bowl may provide further significant evidence of an elite, Assyrian-style object at the island during the period from the eighth century to the first half of the sixth century B.C. Without question, however, the function, dating, and geographic associations of the Metropolitan Museum’s stone mixing bowl support the notion that Cyprus took part in a wide Eastern Mediterranean cultural network. This active participation may have resulted in the progressive assimilation of ideological and cultural elements from Assyria, the most influential political and cultural entity in the Eastern Mediterranean at the time. The Cypriot elite appear to have fashioned their image of power through the adoption of Assyrian-style status objects and behaviors, such as codified dining practices.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful to Annie Caubet, Antoine Hermary, Markus Hilgert, and Adriano Orsingher for their support, helpful comments, and suggestions.

LUCA BOMBARDIERI
Researcher, Department of Humanities, Università di Torino
NOTES

1 Hermary and Mertens 2014.
2 Ibid., p. 411, no. 618; MMA 74.51.5054; H. 2 in. (5 cm); Diam. 8 in. (20.3 cm).
7 Schmidt 1957, pls. 60.4, 61.3; Searight, Reade, and Finkel 2008, pp. 52–53.
9 For southern Mesopotamia (Ur and Nippur), see Woolley 1965, pl. 35, and Zettler 1993, p. 137. For central Anatolia (Phrygian Boğazköy), see Bossert 2000, pl. 93.103, 104.
10 For western Syria, see Riis and Buhl 1990. For Megiddo and Hazor, see Lamon and Shipton 1939, pl. 113.2, 4, 14; Loud 1948, pl. 263.21; Tufnell 1953, pl. 65.8; and Yadin et al. 1958, p. 51.
12 Bombardieri 2010, p. 119.
13 As exemplified in Diodorus Siculus, Bibliotheca Historica 2.23.2.
16 Gaspa 2012, p. 183.
17 Ibid., p. 180.
21 Gjerstad 1948, pp. 449–52. See also Tatton-Brown 1989, p. 73.
23 Bikai 1981, p. 27, no. 70, pls. XXII.11, XXVI.9. The main assemblages of gray and black polished ware come from Kition and its territory during the Cypro-Geometric III to Cypro-Archaic I periods; see Bikai 2003 (Kition Kathari); Fourrier 2015 (Kition Bamboula); Papageorghiou 1990 (Aradippou, tomb 1); Flourentzos 2008, p. 102, fig. 101 (from a rescue-excavated tomb in the area of the Larnaca International Airport).
REFERENCES

Barnett, Richard D., Erika Bleibtreu, and Geoffrey Turner

Bikai, Patricia M.


Bombardieri, Luca


Börker-Klähn, Jutta

Bossert, Eva-Maria

Bottéro, Jean

Bunnens, Guy, ed.

Cannavò, Anna


Caubet, Annie

Cecchini, Serena Maria, Stefania Mazzoni, and Elena Scigliuzzo, eds.

Crowfoot, J. W., and Grace M. Crowfoot

Egetmeyer, Markus

Fiorina, Paolo, Luca Bombardieri, and Lucia Chiocchetti

Flourentzos, Pavlos

Fourrier, Sabine

Gaspa, Salvatore

Georgiou, Giorgos, and Vassos Karageorghis

Gjerstad, Einar

Grayson, A. Kirk

Hadjisavvas, Sophocles
2007 “The Phoenician Penetration in Cyprus as Documented in the Necropolis of Kition.” Cahiers du Centre d’Études Chypriotes 37, pp. 185–95.

Hermery, Antoine

Hermary, Antoine, and Joan R. Mertens

Herrmann, Georgina
1986 Ivories from Room SW 37, Fort Shalmaneser. 2 vols. London: British School of Archaeology in Iraq.

Hrouda, Barthele

Iacovou, Maria

Karageorghis, Vassos


Kreppner, Florian Janoscha
Lamon, Robert S., and Geoffrey M. Shipton


Loud, Gordon


Mallowan, M. E. L.

1966 Nimrud and Its Remains. Vols. 1, 2. London: British School of Archaeology in Iraq; Collins.

Masson, Olivier


Merrillees, Robert S.

2016 “Studies on the Provenances of the Stele of Sargon II from Larnaca (Kition) and the So-called Dhali (Idalion) Silver Bowls in the Louvre.” Cahiers du Centre d’Études Chypriotes 46, pp. 349–86.

Miglus, Peter A.


Morandi, Daniele


Moritz, L. A.


Morpurgo Davies, Anna


Nenna, Marie-Dominique


Orsinger, Adriano

n.d. “A Stopover along the Journey of Elissa: Kition between Tyre and Carthage.” In The Many Face(s) of Cyprus: 14th Meeting of Postgraduate Cypriot Archaeology. Forthcoming publication of paper delivered November 15, 2014.

Papageorghiou, Athanasios


Pappalardo, Eleonora

2006 “Avori dagli scavi italiani a Forte Salmanassar (Nimrud): Figure umane, elementi vegetali, leoni.” Mesopotamia 41, pp. 57–156.

Radner, Karen


Reyes, Andres T.


2001 The Stamp-Seals of Ancient Cyprus. Monograph 52. Oxford: Oxford University, School of Archaeology, Institute of Archaeology.

Riis, P. J., and Marie-Louise Buhl


Schmidt, Erich F.


Searight, Ann, Julian Reade, and Irving Finkel


Tatton-Brown, Veronica A., ed.


Trokey, Madeleine


Tufnell, Olga


Tuplin, Christopher


Woolley, Leonard


Yadin, Yigael, Yohanan Aharoni, Ruth Amiran, Trude Dothan, Emanuel Dunayevsky, and Jean Perrot, eds.


Zettler, Richard L.

ILLUSTRATION CREDITS


A Possible Cypriot Origin for an Assyrian Stone Mixing Bowl in the Cesnola Collection: fig. 3: from Miglus 1996; fig. 4: from Hrouda 1962; fig. 5: from Bikai 1981; fig. 6: photograph by Olaf M. Teßmer

Andrea del Sarto's _Borgherini Holy Family and Charity: Two Intertwined Late Works_: figs. 2, 3, 26: Courtesy National Gallery of Art, Washington; fig. 4: Erich Lessing / Art Resource, NY; figs. 5–12, 14, 20, 22: photographs by Michael Gallagher; figs. 13, 19, 24, 25: Gabinetto Fotografico delle Gallerie degli Uffizi; fig. 16: © The Cleveland Museum of Art; fig. 16: Courtesy National Gallery of Art, Washington, photographs by Michael Gallagher; fig. 18: © RMN-Grand Palais / Art Resource, NY; fig. 21: Image © Ashmolean Museum, University of Oxford; fig. 23: photograph © The State Hermitage Museum, photograph by Vladimir Terebenin

Benjamin Franklin, Ambassador to France: Portraits by Joseph Siffred Duplessis: fig. 1: Image © Metropolitan Museum of Art, photo by Juan Trujillo; fig. 3: Courtesy of the Diplomatic Reception Rooms, U.S. Department of State, Washington, D.C.; figs. 5, 6, 10, 14: photographs by Evan Read; fig. 12: © Thomas Jefferson Foundation at Monticello

The Sacred and the Modern: The History, Conservation, and Science of the Madina Sitara: figs. 1–4: Image © Metropolitan Museum of Art, photograph by Anna-Marie Kellen; figs. 5–13: photograph by Yael Rosenfield; fig. 6: Courtesy of Sotheby’s London; figs. 7, 8: Nour Foundation. Courtesy of the Khalili Family Trust; figs. 14–18: photographs by Federico Carbó

"Working My Thought More Perfectly": Horace Pippin’s _The Lady of the Lake_: fig. 17: © 1936 and renewed 1964 by Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Publishing Company

An Examination of Paolo Veronese’s _Alessandro Vittoria_: figs. 3–9: photographs by Evan Read; fig. 10: Cameraphoto Arte, Venice / Art Resource, NY; fig. 11: digital image courtesy of the J. Paul Getty Museum Open Content Program

The Roman Maniera: Newly Identified Drawings: fig. 2: Pandolfini Casa d’Aste, Florence, photograph courtesy Pandolfini; fig. 4: © RMN-Grand Palais / Art Resource, NY, photograph by Michel Urtado; fig. 6: © RMN-Grand Palais / Art Resource, NY, photograph by Jean-Gilles Berizzi; fig. 8: Photograph © Vatican Museums
ARTICLES
“Assyrian Clay Hands” in the Architecture of the Ancient Near East
Sebastiano Soldi

A Possible Cypriot Origin for an Assyrian Stone Mixing Bowl in the Cesnola Collection
Luca Bombardieri

Andrea del Sarto’s Borgherini Holy Family and Charity: Two Intertwined Late Works
Andrea Bayer and Michael Gallagher with Silvia A. Centeno, John Delaney, and Evan Read

Benjamin Franklin, Ambassador to France: Portraits by Joseph Siffred Duplessis
Katharine Baetjer with Marjorie Shelley, Charlotte Hale, and Cynthia Moyer

The Sacred and the Modern: The History, Conservation, and Science of the Madina Sitara
Karen M. Kern, Yael Rosenfield, Federico Carò, and Nobuko Shibayama

“Working My Thought More Perfectly”: Horace Pippin’s The Lady of the Lake
Anne Monahan, Isabelle Duvernois, and Silvia A. Centeno

RESEARCH NOTES
An Examination of Paolo Veronese’s Alessandro Vittoria
Andrea Bayer, Dorothy Mahon, and Silvia A. Centeno

The Roman Maniera: Newly Identified Drawings
Furio Rinaldi

The Madonna and Child with Saints Francis and Dominic and Angels by Giulio Cesare Procaccini: A Masterpiece from the Archinto Collection
Martina Colombi