

METROPOLITAN MUSEUM
JOURNAL

VOLUME 49 / 2014



The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

EDITORIAL BOARD

KATHARINE BAETJER
Curator, European Paintings

JULIE JONES
Curator Emeritus, Arts of Africa, Oceania, and the Americas

ELIZABETH MANKIN KORNHAUSER
Alice Pratt Brown Curator of American Paintings and Sculpture

DENISE PATRY LEIDY
Curator, Asian Art

MARCO LEONA
David H. Koch Scientist in Charge, Scientific Research

DOROTHY MAHON
Conservator, Paintings Conservation

JOAN R. MERTENS
Curator, Greek and Roman Art

JOANNE PILLSBURY
Andrall E. Pearson Curator, Arts of Africa, Oceania, and the Americas

LUKE SYSON
Iris and B. Gerald Cantor Chairman, European Sculpture and Decorative Arts

This publication is made possible by a gift from Assunta Sommella Peluso, Ada Peluso, and Romano I. Peluso, in memory of Ignazio Peluso.

The *Metropolitan Museum Journal* is published annually by The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

Mark Polizzotti, Publisher and Editor in Chief

Elizabeth L. Block, Managing Editor

Bruce Campbell, Designer

Paul Booth, Production Manager

Ling Hu, Image Acquisitions Associate

Valeria Cafà's article was translated from the Italian by Lawrence Jenkins; Masako Yoshida's article was translated from the Japanese by Monica Bethe; Cornelia Reiter's article was translated from the German by Russell Stockman. All other translations are by the authors.

The Editorial Board is especially grateful to Sarah McFadden for her assistance with this issue.

Manuscripts submitted for the *Journal* and all correspondence concerning them should be sent to journalsubmissions@metmuseum.org. Guidelines for contributors are given on page 6.

Published in association with the University of Chicago Press. Individual and institutional subscriptions are available worldwide. Please direct all subscription inquiries, back issue requests, and address changes to: University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P. O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637-0005, USA. Phone: (877) 705-1878 (U.S. and Canada) or (773) 753-3347 (international), fax: (877) 705-1879 (U.S. and Canada) or (773) 753-0811 (international), email: subscriptions@press.uchicago.edu, website: www.journals.uchicago.edu

ISBN 978-0-226-21267-8 (University of Chicago Press)

ISSN 0077-8958 (print)

ISSN 2169-3072 (online)

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 68-28799

The Metropolitan Museum of Art endeavors to respect copyright in a manner consistent with its nonprofit educational mission. If you believe any material has been included improperly in this publication, please contact the Editorial Department.

Photographs of works in the Metropolitan Museum's collection are by The Photograph Studio, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, unless otherwise noted.

Copyright © 2014 by The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

Typeset in Optima LT Std

Printed on Creator Silk, 100 lb.

Separations by Professional Graphics, Inc., Rockford, Illinois

Printed and bound by Puritan Capital, Hollis, New Hampshire

Cover illustration: Detail of Tullio Lombardo (Italian, ca. 1455–1532), *Adam*, ca. 1490–95. See Figure 1, page 34.

FOR JULIE JONES

A meticulous and probing reader who significantly
broadened the *Journal's* scope

FOR BRUCE CAMPBELL

An exceptional designer
who lavished his talents on this publication

Contents

Adam by Tullio Lombardo

<i>Adam</i> by Tullio Lombardo LUKE SYSON AND VALERIA CAFÀ	9
Ancient Sources for Tullio Lombardo's <i>Adam</i> VALERIA CAFÀ	33
The Treatment of Tullio Lombardo's <i>Adam</i> : A New Approach to the Conservation of Monumental Marble Sculpture CAROLYN RICCARDELLI, JACK SOULTANIAN, MICHAEL MORRIS, LAWRENCE BECKER, GEORGE WHEELER, AND RONALD STREET	49
A New Analysis of Major Greek Sculptures in the Metropolitan Museum: Petrological and Stylistic LORENZO LAZZARINI AND CLEMENTE MARCONI	117
Hellenistic Etruscan Cremation Urns from Chiusi THERESA HUNTSMAN	141
Redeeming Pieter Coecke van Aelst's <i>Gluttony</i> Tapestry: Learning from Scientific Analysis FEDERICO CARÒ, GIULIA CHIOSTRINI, ELIZABETH CLELAND, AND NOBUKO SHIBAYAMA	151
Trade Stories: Chinese Export Embroideries in the Metropolitan Museum MASAKO YOSHIDA	165
A Greek Inscription in a Portrait by Salvator Rosa MICHAEL ZELLMANN-ROHRER	187
Honoré de Balzac and Natoire's <i>The Expulsion from Paradise</i> CAROL SANTOLERI	193
Another Brother for Goya's "Red Boy": Agustín Esteve's Portrait of Francisco Xavier Osorio, Conde de Trastámara XAVIER F. SALOMON	201
Nature as Ideal: Drawings by Joseph Anton Koch and Johann Christian Reinhart CORNELIA REITER	207
A Buddhist Source for a Stoneware "Basket" Designed by Georges Hoentschel DENISE PATRY LEIDY	225

Manuscript Guidelines for the *Metropolitan Museum Journal*

The *Metropolitan Museum Journal* is issued annually by The Metropolitan Museum of Art. Its purpose is to publish original research on works in the Museum's collection. Articles are contributed by members of the Museum staff and other art historians and specialists. Submissions should be emailed to: journalsubmissions@metmuseum.org.

Manuscripts are reviewed by the *Journal* Editorial Board, composed of members of the curatorial, conservation, and scientific departments. **To be considered for the following year's volume, an article must be submitted, complete including illustrations, by October 15.** Once an article is accepted for publication, the author will have the opportunity to review it after it has been edited and again after it has been laid out in pages. The honorarium for image costs is \$300, and each author receives a copy of the *Journal* volume in which his or her article appears.

Manuscripts should be submitted as double-spaced Word files. In addition to the text, the manuscript must include endnotes, captions for illustrations, photograph credits, and a 200-word abstract. Each part of the article should be in a separate file except the endnotes, which should be linked to and appear at the end of the text file.

For the style of captions and bibliographic references in endnotes, authors are referred to *The Metropolitan Museum of Art Guide to Editorial Style and Procedures*, which is available from the Museum's Editorial Department

upon request, and to *The Chicago Manual of Style*. Please provide a list of all bibliographic citations that includes, for each title: full name(s) of author or authors; title and subtitle of book or article and periodical; place and date of publication; volume number, if any; and page, plate, and/or figure number(s). For citations in notes, please use only the last name(s) of the author or authors and the date of publication (e.g., Jones 1953, p. 65; Smith and Harding 2006, pp. 7–10, fig. 23).

When submitting manuscripts, authors should include a PDF of all illustrations. Please do not embed images within text documents. If the manuscript is accepted, the author is expected to provide publication-quality images as well as copyright permissions to reproduce them in both the print and electronic editions of the *Journal*. We require either digital files of at least 300 dpi at 3,000 pixels wide, color transparencies (preferably 8 x 10 in. but 4 x 6 in. is also acceptable), or glossy black-and-white photographs (preferably 8 x 10 in. with white borders) of good quality and in good condition.

In a separate Word file, please indicate the figure number, the picture's orientation, and any instructions for cropping. Reproductions of photographs or other illustrations in books should be accompanied by captions that include full bibliographic information. **The author of each article is responsible for obtaining all photographic material and reproduction rights.**

ABBREVIATIONS

MMA	The Metropolitan Museum of Art
MMAB	<i>The Metropolitan Museum of Art Bulletin</i>
MMJ	<i>Metropolitan Museum Journal</i>

Height precedes width and depth in dimensions cited.

METROPOLITAN MUSEUM
JOURNAL

VOLUME 49 / 2014

Another Brother for Goya's "Red Boy": Agustín Esteve's Portrait of Francisco Xavier Osorio, Conde de Trastámara

XAVIER F. SALOMON

Peter Jay Sharp Chief Curator, The Frick Collection, New York

The exhibition "Goya and the Altamira Family," held at The Metropolitan Museum of Art from April 22 to August 3, 2014, brought together for the first time four portraits by Francisco de Goya y Lucientes painted about 1787–88. For the occasion, the celebrated "Red Boy" in the Museum's collection was displayed together with likenesses of his parents and two of his siblings in a gallery of the European Paintings Department.

Goya's portrait of the head of the family, Vicente Joaquín Osorio de Moscoso y Guzmán, conde de Altamira (Figure 1), was paid for on January 29, 1787, and was the first of the artist's Altamira paintings.¹ Commissioned by the Banco de San Carlos (renamed Banco de España after 1829), of which Altamira was a director, the portrait is still in the bank's collection. In the succeeding two years, the count commissioned Goya to paint three portraits for the family's palace on the calle de la Flor Alta in Madrid: the Metropolitan Museum's full-length portrait of Altamira's first wife, María Ignacia Álvarez de Toledo, with their infant daughter María Agustina (Figure 2), and their sons Vicente Isabel, conde de Trastámara (Figure 3), and Manuel, señor de Ginés (Figure 4), the "Red Boy."

Inventories of the Altamira collection reveal that family portraits by other artists hung in the palace as well. The postmortem inventory of the conde de Altamira, compiled between January 7 and February 8, 1817, lists a series of portraits of the count and his family, including an image of the count on horseback by Antonio Carnicero (1748–1814) and, in one room, "eight portraits of the family of the Count of Altamira."² A subsequent inventory, compiled on March 13–14, 1864, after the death of Vicente Pío Osorio de Moscoso y Ponce de León (the grandson of the conde de Altamira in Goya's portrait [Figure 1]), lists in detail Goya's portraits of the Altamira family along with those by a number of other painters.³ The equestrian portrait of the count by

Carnicero was still in the palace, as was another portrait of him attributed in the inventory to Luis Egidio Meléndez (1716–1780).⁴ Two of the three Goya portraits—those of the countess with her daughter María Agustina (Figure 2) and the "Red Boy" (Figure 4)—are also listed, while for some unknown reason, the portrait of Vicente, conde de Trastámara (Figure 3), is not mentioned in the document.⁵ Another portrait by Goya, that of the architect Ventura Rodríguez, now in the Nationalmuseum in Stockholm, was also acquired by the Altamira family before 1864.⁶

The Altamiras owned a substantial group of family portraits by the Valencian painter Agustín Esteve y Marques (1753–ca. 1820), who in the 1780s and 1790s collaborated with Goya, especially on portraits, and became a well-known portraitist himself. According to early sources, he produced fourteen portraits for the family of the duke of Osuna and others for the dukes of Alba.⁷ Esteve must also have painted a significant number of portraits for the Altamira family. The Altamira inventory of 1864 documents several of them, including a set of portraits of the count and countess, and another single image of the count.⁸ It is unclear if one of these portraits of the conde de Altamira could be a version of the one signed by Esteve that is at present in the Universidad de Granada (Figure 5), or if the portrait of the countess can be identified with the one that was in the collection of José Calvo in Madrid in 1957.⁹ Five additional paintings of children by Esteve are listed in the 1864 Altamira family inventory. One of these portraits was oval in format and represented the daughter of the duque de Montemar with a small dog.¹⁰ Another portrayed a "girl with a tambourine in her hand, seated on a cushion."¹¹ Three of the canvases clearly represented four of the Altamira children. The first included a double portrait of Vicente, conde de Trastámara, and his sister María Agustina (both children were also portrayed by Goya: see Figures 3 and 2).¹² The second and third were images of Francisco Xavier and Juan María, brothers of Vicente, Manuel (the "Red Boy"), and María Agustina.¹³



1. Goya (Francisco de Goya y Lucientes; Spanish, 1746–1828). *Vicente Joaquín Osorio de Moscoso y Guzmán, Conde de Altamira*, 1787. Oil on canvas, 69 $\frac{5}{8}$ x 42 $\frac{1}{2}$ in. (177 x 108 cm). Banco de España, Madrid. Photograph: Album / Art Resource, NY



2. Goya. *María Ignacia Álvarez de Toledo, Condesa de Altamira, and Her Daughter María Agustina*, 1787–88. Oil on canvas, 76 $\frac{3}{4}$ x 45 $\frac{1}{4}$ in. (195 x 115 cm). The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Robert Lehman Collection, 1975 (1975.1.148). Photograph: Juan Trujillo, The Photograph Studio, MMA

Esteve's portrait of Juan María is the only portrait in the artist's Altamira group that is known to have survived (Figure 6). The canvas was acquired in 1946 by the Cleveland Museum of Art, which bought it as a Goya from Joseph Duveen. It is much damaged and over-restored, and its attribution to Goya was doubted early on.

Recently, scholars have connected the painting to Esteve's work. The inscription at the bottom of the canvas

clearly identifies the sitter as Juan María, Altamira's son who was born on August 28, 1780, and who died on October 18, 1785, at the age of five.¹⁴ The information provided by the inscription on the portrait in Cleveland and by the matching ones on three of Goya's portraits (Figures 2, 3, and 4) allows us to reconstruct the life dates of the Altamira children. Vicente, conde de Trastámara, is thought to have been the eldest. He was born on November 19, 1777, and

after his father's death on August 26, 1816, he became the next conde de Altamira, dying on August 31, 1837. The next in line was Juan María, who was three years younger. Manuel, the "Red Boy," was born in April 1784 and died on June 12, 1792, and María Agustina was born on February 21, 1787, almost ten years after her eldest brother. Documents mention three other children: two boys, Francisco Xavier and Josef Fernando, and a girl, María de la Encarnación, but their dates are unknown.

The mention in the 1864 inventory of Esteve's portrait of Francisco Xavier Osorio, "Conde de Trastamara," is puzzling. The title of Trastámara was habitually given to the eldest son of the conde de Altamira, and since Vicente was the heir, I proposed in the publication that accompanied the exhibition in 2014 that the compiler of the inventory might have confused Vicente (conde de Trastámara) with his younger brother Francisco Xavier.¹⁵ Only a few weeks after the opening of the exhibition "Goya and the Altamira Family," Esteve's portrait of Francisco Xavier Osorio came to light. The previously unpublished canvas allows us to add a further piece to the puzzle of the Altamira family. As the companion to the Cleveland painting, it proves beyond a doubt that the latter work is indeed by Esteve, and it also allows us to revise some of the information about the Altamira children.

The canvas (Figure 7) was acquired by its present owner in Madrid from heirs of the Altamira family and, being unlined, it is in exceptionally good condition. The painting's dimensions are very close to those of the Cleveland portrait, and the sitters in both works are shown standing on an identical tiled floor. That the painting is indeed the one mentioned in the 1864 Altamira inventory is proved by the number 507 painted in white in the bottom right corner, the same number as the one in the document. Francisco Xavier, unlike his brothers, is shown in profile, holding a hat in his left hand and elegantly resting his right hand on a stick. His outfit is similar in design to those of Juan María and Manuel, but different in color; it features a combination of green and pink instead of the blue and pink and the red and white of his brothers' clothing. In style and color Francisco Xavier's costume is almost identical to those of Francisco de Borja and Pedro de Alcántara, the young sons of the dukes of Osuna, in Goya's family portrait of 1788 in the Museo del Prado.

The inscription at the bottom of the painting provides Francisco Xavier's basic biographical data, previously unknown to scholars. He was born on December 3, 1776, and died in November 1785, just short of his ninth birthday. He was, therefore, the eldest of the Altamira children, a year older than Vicente. His name probably derived from the happenstance of his birth on December 3, the feast day of Saint Francis Xavier. The compiler of the 1864 inventory



3. Goya. *Vicente Osorio de Moscoso, Conde de Trastámara*, 1787–88. Oil on canvas, 53 1/8 x 43 1/4 in. (135 x 110 cm). Private collection



4. Goya. *Manuel Osorio Manrique de Zuñiga*, 1787–88. Oil on canvas, 50 x 40 in. (127 x 101.6 cm). The Metropolitan Museum of Art, The Jules Bache Collection, 1949 (49.7.41)



5. Agustín Esteve y Marques (Spanish, 1753–ca. 1820). *Vicente Joaquín Osorio de Moscoso y Guzmán, Conde de Altamira*, ca. 1790–95. Oil on canvas. Universidad de Granada



6. Esteve. *Juan María Osorio*, ca. 1785. Oil on canvas, 47¼ x 33⅛ in. (120 x 84.1 cm). The Cleveland Museum of Art; Gift of the Hanna Fund (1946.431). Photograph: ©The Cleveland Museum of Art

was therefore correct in identifying Francisco Xavier as the “Conde de Trastamara,” and the inscription on the portrait confirms the fact. As the eldest son, he was the heir to the title; Vicente acquired it only after his brother’s death in 1785, a couple of years before Goya painted his portrait.

Juan María and Francisco Xavier died a month apart from each other in October and November 1785, a fact suggesting that they may have been the victims of a contagious illness. The two portraits must therefore predate the sitters’ demise. Judging from the children’s appearances, the works were painted soon before their deaths at the ages of five and eight, respectively. By the time Goya portrayed Vicente and Manuel about 1787–88, the boys in Esteve’s portraits were dead, and it is likely that his paintings of Vicente and the “Red Boy” were conceived to match the preexisting ones by Esteve. The inscriptions on the paintings were probably all added at the same time, between 1785 (Francisco Xavier and Juan María are recorded in the inscriptions as having

died in that year) and 1792, when Manuel died (he is recorded as alive in the inscription).

This newly identified portrait by Esteve is an important addition to the painter’s oeuvre and enhances our developing knowledge of the Altamira family as art patrons. In its pristine condition it also provides an important example of Esteve’s work from about 1785 and gives a good sense of what the portrait of Juan María Osorio in Cleveland would have looked like before its substantial restoration campaigns under Duveen. While the “Red Boy,” his mother and sister, and his brothers Vicente and Juan María have all “emigrated” to the United States, where they were reunited in the spring of 2014 at the Metropolitan Museum, Francisco Xavier is the only member of the Altamira family, together with Goya’s portrait of the count, to have remained in Spain. Even though he was left out of the family gathering in New York, he is here reunited in print with his parents and siblings.



7. Esteve. *Francisco Xavier Osorio, Conde de Trastámara*, ca. 1785. Oil on canvas, 50 x 37½ in. (127 x 95 cm). Private collection, Madrid

NOTES

1. For a full account of the relationship between Goya and the Altamira family, see Salomon 2014.
2. The Astorga, c^a 1817 inventory is in the Archivo Histórico Nacional, Toledo, Sección Nobleza, 2 d. 2, and is transcribed in Pérez Preciado 2008, doc. 18, pp. 916–26. In particular, see p. 918: “Un retrato de tamaño natural q^e rep^{ta} el s^r D. Vicente Joaquin Osorio, Conde de Altamira, Marq^s de Astorga & a caballo (denominado el vidriero) su tamaño quatro var^s casi quadrado, pintado p^r Antonio Carnicero”; and p. 920: “Ocho retratos de familia del S^r Conde de Altamira.”
3. For the 1864 inventory, Archivo Histórico Nacional, Toledo, Sección Nobleza, Baena, 291, see the transcription in Pérez Preciado 2008, doc. 20, pp. 929–49.
4. 1864 inventory, no. 25: “El Exmo D. Vicente Osorio de Moscoso Marques de Astorga Conde de Altamira, Duque de Seea y Baena, Gentilhombre de cámara de S. Ml Caballero gran cruz de la Real y distinguida orden de Carlos 3^o & El caballo es el llamado Viderico celebrado de los facultativos por su buena estampa, nobleza, gallardia, buenos movimientos y demas circunstancias. Es de la pieza que S. E. tiene en la villa de Baena, Reyno de Cordoba con esta marca Lo pintó por el mismo natural y con la posible exactitud Antonio Carnicero año de 1783 Alto 10-8 Ancho 10-5 1/2 Marco dorado” (Pérez Preciado 2008, p. 930), and no. 296: “Retrato del Exmo Marques de Astorga Conde de Altamira. Año de 1775 Original al parecer de Luis Menendez Alto 4-1 1/2 Ancho 3-1 Marco dorado” (ibid., p. 940).
5. 1864 inventory, no. 31: “La Excma Sra D^a Maria Ignacio Alvarez de Toledo Marquesa de Astorga Condesa de Altamira y la Sra D^a Maria Agustina Osorio Alvarez de Toledo su hija nacio en 21 de febrero de 1787. Original de D. Francisco Goya de su primera epoca. Alto 7 pies Ancho 4 1/2 Marco dorado” (ibid., p. 930), and no. 547: “El E. Sr. D. Manuel Osorio Manrique de Zúñiga Señor de Gines. Original y firmado de Francisco Goya. Alto 4-6 1/2 Ancho 3-4 1/2 Marco dorado” (ibid., p. 948).
6. Nationalmuseum, Stockholm, inv. NM4574. 1864 inventory, no. 15 415: “Retrato d D. Ventura Rodríguez medio cuerpo tamaño natural firmado en un targeton de F^{co} de Goya Alto 3-8 Ancho 2-9 1/2 Marco Dorado” (ibid., p. 929).
7. For Esteve, see Soria 1943 and 1957.
8. 1864 inventory, no. 438: “Retrato del E. Sr. Marques de Astorga. Conde de Altamira. Duque de Sessa y de Maqueda. Consejo de Estado y caballerizo mayor de S. M. & original de Agustín Esteve. Alto–9 Ancho 1-11 1/2 Marco dorado” (Pérez Preciado 2008, p. 944), and its pendant, no. 439: “Retato de la E. Sra D^a María Ygnacia Alvarez de Toledo, Gonzaga Marquesa de Astorga condesa de Altamira. Original de Agustín Esteve. Comp^o al anterior” (ibid.). No. 544: “El Exmo. Marques de Astorga conde de Altamira, Duque de Sessa y de Maqueda Consejero de Estado y Caballerizo mayor honorario de S. M. Parece de Esteve. Alto 3-11 Ancho 3-5. Marco dorado” (ibid., p. 948).
9. For these two portraits, see Soria 1957, pp. 99–100, nos. 40, 42.
10. 1864 inventory, no. 33 675: “Una niña con corpiño encarnado con la mano derecha acaricia a su perrito y en la izquierda tiene una rosquilla; hija del Sr. Duque de Montemar. Original de Esteve. Alto 2-11 1/2 Ancho 2-3 Marco Dorado ovalo” (Pérez Preciado 2008, p. 930).
11. 1864 inventory, no. 530: “Retrato de una niña con una pandereta en la mano sentadita en un almohadón. Original de Esteve Alto 2-7 Ancho 1-11 1/2” (ibid., p. 948).
12. 1864 inventory, no. 492: “El E. Sr. Conde de Trastamara y la E. Sra D. Maria Agustina hija del E. Sr. Marques de Astorga. Original de esteve. Alto 2-9 Ancho 1-11 Marco dorado” (ibid., p. 946).
13. 1864 inventory, no. 507: “El E. Sr. D. Francisco Javier Osorio Alvarez de Toledo, Conde de Trastamara, Original de Esteve. Alto 4-6 Ancho 3-5 Marco dorado” (ibid., p. 947), and no. 548: “El E. Sr. D. Juan Maria Osorio Alvarez de Toledo: de Esteve. Alto 4-6 ancho 3-5 Marco dorado” (ibid., p. 948).
14. For the death date of Juan María, see an unpublished letter from Mary Crawford Volk, July 23, 1992, to Alan Chong in the curatorial files of the Cleveland Museum of Art.
15. Salomon 2014, p. 43.

REFERENCES

- Pérez Preciado, José Juan
2008 “El marqués de Leganés y las artes.” Vol. 2. PhD diss., Universidad Complutense de Madrid.
- Salomon, Xavier F.
2014 “Goya and the Altamira Family.” *MMAB* 71, no. 4 (Spring).
- Soria, Martin S.
1943 “Agustín Esteve and Goya.” *Art Bulletin* 25, no. 3 (September), pp. 239–66.
1957 *Agustín Esteve y Goya*. Valencia: Servicio de Estudios Artísticos, Institución Alfonso el Magnanimo.