The Entombment of Christ: Addenda

WILLIAM H. FORSYTH

Curator Emeritus, Medieval Art, The Metropolitan Museum of Art


My colleague Dr. Theodor Müller, in a letter to me, is undoubtedly correct in stressing the great importance of the German Holy Grave as an image of devotion (Andachtsbild). Dr. Müller pointed out the corroborative evidence that I had neglected to cite: Gesine and Johannes Taubert, “Mittelalterliche Kreuzifixionen mit schwenkbaren Armen,” Zeitschrift des deutschen Vereins für Kunstwissenschaft 23, 1969, pp. 78–122. My book mentioned this use of the Holy Grave, but I was primarily concerned with its use in the liturgy of Holy Week. Both devotional and liturgical aspects seem to me to be present in the Holy Grave, which I discussed as an important prototype of the French Entombment.

The supposition that the earliest surviving dated Entombment, that at Langres, was a Burgundian monument has been dramatically confirmed by the removing of later paint from the body of Christ by the Monuments Historiques. As a result, Pierre Quarré has been able to relate the Christ, the only surviving part of the monument, to another Christ in the Musée Archéologique of Dijon by Claus de Werve, one of the sculptors working at Champol for the duke of Burgundy. (Pierre Quarré, “Le Christ de la Mise au tombeau de Langres,” Revue de l’art 13, 1971, pp. 68–71, where he dates the Entombment between 1415 and 1419 instead of the traditional 1421.)

I have been able to examine the Entombment at Annecy (Savoy) and to confirm most reluctantly my attribution of it to the first part of the fifteenth century, rather than to the end of the fourteenth as Raymond Oursel had proposed. It is hard to discard Oursel’s ingenious hypothesis that it was carved at the end of the fourteenth century by Perrin Morel, the father of Jacques Morrel. Certainly Oursel is right in seeking an early date for the sculpture and in stressing its Burgundian character. The faces are like others in Savoy, probably under Burgundian influence. Unfortunately, little more than the heads have been preserved.

Pierre Quarré, in his catalogue Antoine Le Moiturier, le dernier des grands imagiers des ducs de Bourgogne, for an exhibition held at the Musée de Dijon in 1973, has proposed (p. 15) that the Entombment at Semur-en-Auxois be attributed to Le Moiturier after his completion of the tomb of Philippe Pot, made a little after 1480. This chronology opens the question whether the date of 1490, recorded for Semur by Maillard de Chambure from an unknown source, may be too late and possibly the result of a misreading of a lost document or inscription. Certainly a date around 1480 or even somewhat earlier could better explain the derivation of the monument from the Tonnere and Dijon Entombments, all datable in the 1450s.

My statement that the Binche Entombment was the only monumental Entombment still existing in Belgium must be amended. Robert Didier has been making a survey and has published others at Ath, Chimay, Bree, Courtrai, Bastogne, Le Huy, Saint-Hubert-en-Ardennes, and Thuin. However, none of these, except the one at Binche, is similar to French examples. (Robert Didier, “Mises au tombeau de l’Entre-Sambre-et-Meuse et Saints-Sépulcres disparus,” Bulletin de la Commission royale et des sites 1, Liège, 1970–71, pp. 177–195.) Didier lists others, but they are not monumental. This Entombment should be added to the catalogue in my book:

Beaubray: Manoir des Minîeres, Chapel (Eure)

Seven figures, half-size, plus three smaller sleeping guardians in relief, in original enfeu enclosed by wooden doors, probably dated between 1521 and 1526, hung on wooden frame as at Biron. See dedication inscription. Given by Thomas Postel, seigneur des Minîères, and carved by a sculptor trained at Verneuil who also

This should be added to the Appendix of Documents: **beaubray: Manoir de Minières (Normandy)**

Dedication inscription above entrance to the chapel: C'est chappelle fondée en l'onneur et mérite de la Passion Notre Seigneur fut consacrée par Monseigneur l'evêque de Veeence [Nicolas de Coquinvilliers, coadjutor bishop of Evreux] de l'auctorité de Monseigneur l'evêque d'Evreux, à la requeste de Maître Thomas Postel, seigneur des Minières, the cinquième jour d'avril l'an 1526 and quarante jours of pardon donnés à ceux qui le jour du vendredi saint par chacune année visiteront la dite chapelle et y donneront les devotions, et autant pour chacun jour à tous ceux qui la visiteront et l'église parochial de Beauberé [Beaubray] le jeudi ensuivant à fester et solemniser le mardi des festes de Pâques la dedicate de ladite église paroissiale. (This inscription is quoted from Cloulas, *Bulletin Monumental* 130:129. Many other Entombments must have been given similar indulgences, for example those for Langres, Neufchâtel, and Salers, quoted in the Appendix of my book.)

Mme. C. Bourden-Marçais kindly informs me of an Entombment of the late sixteenth century at Montgirod in Savoy. L'Abbé J. Choux, in a review of my book in *Le Pays lorrain* (1970), p. 194, lists these additional Entombments in Lorraine: Dieuze, Longeville-devant-Bar, Marsal, Mont-Bonvillers, Pulligny, Sorcy, and Toul. All have disappeared except for fragments of relics at Marsal. For a discussion of these important fragments, see Helga D. Hofmann, *Die lothringische Skulptur de Spätgotik: Hauptströmmungen und Werke (1390-1520)*, Veröffentlichen des Instituts für Landeskunde des Saarlandes, Vol. 7, Saarbrücken: Karl Funk, 1962, pp. 305, 306, 392. It is not certain how many of these were true Entombments and how many were in small scale or were relics. I have not been able to check on two other Entombments, one reported in the *Guide Bleu* for the Vosges (1928), p. 254, to be at Bourslemont, the other at Septfontaines in Luxembourg.

The following several sculptures, mentioned here for the record, were omitted from the book because there was no direct evidence that they once formed parts of monuments. A portly burgher exhibited at The Cloisters, New York (06.1216), and attributed to Burgundy may represent Nicodemus; a shroudlke cloth wrapped over one shoulder and under the opposite arm may imply that he is a shroud-bearer, and his stance suggests that he could have stood at the right end of the group above the body of Christ, the traditional place of Nicodemus. Theodor Müller dates this statue about 1470, but the detailed, fleshy modeling of the face and the swaying posture are more often seen in sculptures of the early sixteenth century (Müller, *Late Gothic Sculpture in the Netherlands, Germany, France and Spain*. Pelican History of Art, 1971, p. 86, pl. 102A. See also Joseph Breck, *Catalogue of Romanesque, Gothic and Renaissance Sculpture*, Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1913, no. 148). Several female heads in the Musée Saint-Jean, Angers, are said to have come from a lost Entombment once in the church of Saint-Georges-sur-Loire (see André Michel, "Les Statues de Sainte-Anne, Saint-Paul et Sainte-Suzanne [Musée du Louvre]," *Fondation Eugène Piot: Monuments et Mémoires*, published by the Académie des inscriptions et belles lettres, 6, Paris, 1899, p. 104; also Paul Vitry and Gaston Brière, *Documents de sculpture française: Renaissance*, première partie, Paris, D.-A. Longuet, 1911, pl. 75, no. 2).

The Chanoine Moussé adds to the history of the Amboise Entombment by reproducing an engraving of it when it was in the church of Notre-Dame-en-Grève, Amboise, between 1802 and 1864 (Moussé, *Le Culte de Notre-Dame en Touraine*, Tours, about 1915, p. 170). M. Anfray reports that the Entombment in the church of Saint-Martin, Langeron (Nièvre) has been restored and reinstalled, and that it originally decorated the tomb of the counts of Langeron in the church's crypt. (M. Anfray, *La Cathédrale de Nevers et les églises gothiques en Nièvers*, Paris, Picard, 1964, pp. 207, 208, pl. 49 A).

Entombments recently cleaned and restored include: Allery, Chaumont-en-Bassigny (in the church), Clermont-en-Argonne, Contre, Le Coudray-Montbault, Dijon (Saint-Michel), Domjulien, Epinal (Saint-Maurice), Langres L'Épine, Lons-le-Saunier, Meru, Pouilly-en-Auxois, Rodez (chapel of cathedral), Semur-en-Auxois, Thouars (from abbey church), Le Trait, Vesoul. The list is incomplete.

These titles should be added to the bibliography: Helga D. Hofmann, "Das Heilige Grab, die Grabele- gung Christi und Christus im Grabe," *Saarheimat. Zeitschrift für Kultur Landschaft*, Volkstum, April 7, 1963,

In a perceptive review of my book (Art Bulletin, LV, 4, pp. 633–635) Helga Hofmann discards my suggestion of Germanic stylistic influence upon the Pont-a-Mousson Entombment of northern Lorraine. Enlarging upon her earlier suggestion that this Entombment is “hypothetically linked with Burgundian trends in the Sluter workshop at Champmol,” she now sees the master “in relation to the great workshops still active in Champagne (especially around Troyes) and particularly in French cathedrals radiating from the Burgundian Sluter style.” She also sees a relation between Sluter and Pont-a-Mousson through lost prototypes in a “Franco-Flemish ambient.” However, the stylistic differences between Pont-a-Mousson and all surviving Burgundian sculpture still seem to me to be too radical to accept this modified hypothesis.